

Sida Support to the Education Sector in Ethiopia

1992-1995

**Jan Valdelin
Michael Wort
Ingrid Christensson
Gudrun Cederblad**

**Department for Democracy
and Social Development**

Sida Support to the Education Sector in Ethiopia

1992-1995

**Jan Valdelin
Michael Wort
Ingrid Christensson
Gudrun Cederblad**

**Sida Evaluation 96/27
Department for Democracy
and Social Development**

Authors: Jan Valdelin Michael Wort Ingrid Christensson Gudrun Cederblad

The views and interpretations expressed in this report are those of the authors and should not be attributed to the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Sida

Sida Evaluation 96/27

Commissioned by Sida, Department for Democracy and Social Development,

Copyright: Sida and the author

Printed in Stockholm, Sweden

ISBN 91 586 7404 7

ISSN 1401-0402

SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY

Address: S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden. Office: Sveavägen 20, Stockholm

Telephone: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Telefax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64

Telegram: sida stockholm. Telex: 11450 sida sthlm. Postgiro: 1 56 34-9

Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

When an evaluation team has completed its report, it would seem a simple task to thank those who have helped them in its preparation. In fact the task is not a simple one. This report is a project of the concerted efforts and contributions of many persons, ministries and organisations, whose collaboration, both individually and collectively, has contributed to this evaluation. In particular, the team would like to thank all those who gave so readily of their time and effort in meeting with the evaluation team. The team is also grateful to those who participated in group discussions and interviews and to those officials who took time from their busy schedules to meet with us.

Stockholm and Uppsala, March 1966

Jan Valdelin and Michael Wort

CONTENTS

| | |
|--|-----|
| List of Acronyms and Abbreviations | I |
| A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY | i |
| 1. Background Information..... | i |
| 2. Major Review Findings | i |
| 3. Project Identification and Recommendations | iii |
| B. INTRODUCTION | 1 |
| 1. Background..... | 1 |
| 2. Objectives of the Mission | 1 |
| 3. The Review/PIM Team..... | 2 |
| 4. Method of Work | 2 |
| 5. The Quality of the Data..... | 3 |
| 6. Constraints..... | 3 |
| 7. The Report..... | 4 |
| C. REGIONALISATION AND THE EDUCATION SECTOR | 4 |
| 1. Sphere of Control over Learning Institutions..... | 5 |
| 2. Relationship between Central and Regional Education Bureaux | 5 |
| 2.1. Curriculum Development | 5 |
| 2.2 Educational Material Production and Distribution | 5 |
| 2.3. Educational Planning and Project Preparation..... | 6 |
| 2.4. School Construction..... | 6 |
| 2.5. Teacher Recruiting, Training and Assigning | 6 |
| 3. Experience and Problems | 7 |
| D. SWEDISH SUPPORT TO THE EDUCATION SECTOR | 7 |
| E. REVIEW OF THE SUB-PROGRAMMES | 9 |
| 1. Education Planning and Information | 9 |
| 1.1 Summary | 10 |
| 2. Curriculum Development and Research..... | 11 |
| 2.1 Summary | 12 |
| 3. Teacher In-Service Training | 12 |
| 3.1. Head teacher programme | 12 |
| 3.1.1. Summary..... | 15 |
| 3.2 In-service training for untrained primary school teachers through distance education | 15 |
| 3.2.1 Summary..... | 18 |
| 4. Environmental education..... | 18 |
| 4.1. Summary | 20 |
| 5. AIDS/STD health education | 21 |
| 5.1. Summary | 22 |
| 6. Non-formal Adult Education | 23 |
| 7. Textbook Production | 25 |
| 7.1 Summary | 27 |

| | |
|---|----|
| 8. Instructional Equipment and Furniture Production | 27 |
| 8.1 Summary | 29 |
| 9. Primary School Construction and Maintenance | 30 |
| 9.1 Summary | 31 |
| 10. Summary Review of the Support Programme | 31 |
| F. DONORS AND THE EDUCATION SECTOR | 34 |
| 1. Donor Programmes and Strategies..... | 35 |
| 2. Donor Funding..... | 37 |
| 3. Donor Co-ordination | 37 |
| 4. Moving towards future support | 38 |
| G. PROGRAMME IDENTIFICATION | 39 |
| 1. Introduction..... | 39 |
| 2. Complementary Priorities and Policies of Sida..... | 41 |
| 3. Regionalisation and Ethiopian Government Education Policies..... | 42 |
| 4. Focus of Primary Education Reform | 43 |
| 5. Recommended Overall Strategies for Sida Support..... | 45 |
| 6. Sector Programme Support..... | 46 |
| 7. Graduated Support and Preparatory Phase | 47 |
| 8. Technical Assistance..... | 48 |
| 9. Programme Benchmarks and Performance Indicators..... | 49 |
| 10. Recommendations for Sector Programme Support..... | 49 |
| H. LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS..... | 51 |
| I. APPENDICES | 54 |
| A. Terms of Reference | 54 |
| B. Documents reviewed..... | 60 |
| C. People met and itinerary | 63 |
| D. Donors in the Education Sector..... | 66 |

List of Acronyms and Abbreviations

| | |
|-------|--|
| EDGE | Education Discussion Group for Education |
| EICMA | Educational Institutes Construction and Maintenance Agency |
| EMIS | Education Management Information System |
| EMPDA | Educational Materials Production and Distribution Agency |
| ESRF | Ethiopian Social Rehabilitation Fund |
| MoE | Ministry of Education |
| MSEK | Million SEK (Swedish kronor) |
| MUSD | Million US Dollar |
| PAT | Preparatory Assistance Team |
| Sida | Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency |
| TTI's | Teacher Training Institutions |

A. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This is the Executive Summary of the Final Report of the combined *Review of the Sida support to the education sector in Ethiopia 1992-1995 and Project identification mission for the period beginning in July 1996*. The Final Report has been revised in final editing after a workshop with the Ministry of Education and Sida, held in Addis Abeba, January 1996. The authors greatly appreciate the contributions of the participants of the workshop for the final editing of the report¹.

1. Background Information

Ethiopia and Sweden have been co-operating in the development of the education sector in Ethiopia for a long time. Presently, the Swedish support programme to the education sector in Ethiopia consists of nine nation-wide sub-programmes. The current agreement period started in July 1992 and ends in June 1996. The Ministry of Education and Sida have agreed to prepare the education support programme starting in July 1996 by a combined review of the Sida support under the present agreement and a project identification mission for the coming agreement period.

According to the Terms of Reference, the objectives of the mission are twofold:

- a. to review the programmes supported by Sida in the current education agreement period, analysing their appropriateness to present circumstances in Ethiopia, and the progress and problems experienced in their implementation, and
- b. to identify those areas of education which are most appropriate for Swedish-Ethiopian co-operation in the new agreement period, taking into due consideration the respective policies for education of the Government of Ethiopia and Sida.

As a preliminary exercise to this mission a desk study was undertaken based upon studies and reports on the education sector in Ethiopia since 1991. It was therefore not necessary for the mission team to make additional and more extensive descriptions of the sector. However, where we feel that some explanation and qualification is necessary which adds to the general understanding, we have included brief backgrounds descriptions.

2. Major Review Findings

All activity of the programme has taken place under the same specific agreement, starting July 1, 1992. This agreement states overall as well as specific objectives of the support to the education system in Ethiopia, which are not very operational. This is one of the reasons for the isolation of each sub-programme from each other, because the education sector support programme can only be guided by the specific objectives of each sub-programme, specified in the annual plans.

¹ The Development Co-operation Office of the Swedish Embassy also presented comments in writing, dated 1996-01-28, which have been of great value for the report.

These objectives are generally loosely worded and are described at the level of activities, rather than objectives, which are linked to operational and achievement levels. As a consequence, they are short-term in nature. With activities instead of objectives, the monitoring and reporting of each sub-programme has to take place at activities level.

The overall objectives for the Sida assisted programme and sub-programmes in Ethiopia are basically not in contradiction with the development needs (school construction, teacher education, text book production, etc.) Nevertheless, many of the sub-programmes have faced difficulties over the review period due to policy changes (regionalisation), lack of relevance and a lack of well thought-out and clear project objectives. In the school construction, the conditions under which they should be built were clear, but the willingness to build local chika schools has dramatically waned whilst local community charges have increased, which places doubts over relevance and effectiveness of the project. A closer look at the support for the production of text-book reveals a contradiction between the supply and demand side of producing text-books. The head teachers project was a carry over programme and the conditions under which training would take place were never reviewed and its inappropriateness was not raised until very recently.

Meanwhile, Sida has started a process, together with consultants and the MoE, to improve reporting from the sector. Planning and reporting formats have been worked out, supplemented by guidelines for their use. This is a good starting point for future monitoring and reporting, but has of yet not led to improved reporting from all sub-programmes.

As may be deduced from the preceding paragraphs the education support programme consists of several vertical sub-programmes. The nine sub-programmes have no meaningful horizontal links and are isolated from each other. Convergence is not achieved at any level. The current programmes are diverse in what they are trying to achieve. Whilst it is sometimes possible to measure the quantitative outputs (for example, 1,200 head teachers trained in summer course) many questions are left unanswered as to the qualitative outcomes of such training and at what price.

The support to the programme is used to finance hard ware procurement and recurrent cost amounting to two thirds of the total support. Technical assistance makes up about one third of the programme. In some sub-programmes recurrent costs make up for the whole amount. The sustainability of such sub-programmes must therefore be considered to be basically non-existent. It may therefore be questioned whether the present support programme has anything to do with long-term development.

At present, the incapacity to absorb the support funds has led to a de facto halt of the co-operation. The planning capacity at the Ministry of Education should be improved.

This being said, it should be added that the merger of the Swedish international development co-operation agencies in July 1995, also has contributed to reduced planning capacity in Sida headquarters during last year.

According to the Swedish government's new budgeting system, international develop-

ment programming should be based on past performance rather than budgetary frames. Among the new policies of Sida, the sector programme support policy just decided upon is important for future project design and among the emerging policies concentration of projects and increasing application of time limits deserve mentioning.

The programming of future support should further consider the following elements:

- A focus of objectives is needed: the projects should be guided and kept together by an overall programmes objective. The projects objectives should be outputs in the programme in the sense used in the Logical Framework Approach. The overall development objective should be tied to a long term commitment from Sida, which should be linked to a realistic time estimate. This could for example be a ten year commitment. During the long term programme implementation clear cut project objectives should be linked to time limits and performance monitoring.
- The preceding aspect requires that continuous monitoring systems are built into the projects. The monitoring should focus on the level of objectives, not activities. Internal monitoring could when necessary be combined with annual or semi-annual external monitoring teams who regularly follow a project from start to termination.
- The programme should not only be in harmony with Ethiopia's and Sida's education policies, but also in harmony with the Ethiopian strive for market reforms. The projects should be designed in such a way that market distortions are avoided.
- The programme should consciously combine impact on several levels, e.g. research, policy development, capacity building and service delivery.
- Increased inputs of technical assistance by expertise supplied by long-term experts, short and long term consultants as well as institutions.

From the present low level of actual funding the future programme should be based on a graduated provision of funds, marked by triggering benchmarks in the form of conditions and time limits related to performance. The project inputs at the different stages should be timely in the process of development: currently capacity building is needed before service delivery can be effectively implemented.

Examples of such milestones for eligibility of increased funding are benchmarks to be identified along the following trends — developments over time — that must be established in order to achieve development impact:

- from plans to actual implementation
- from staff reshuffling to managerial and organisational stability
- from work overload to increased absorptive capacity
- from operational costs to long-term development inputs
- from donor caprice to co-ordination of donors

3. Project Identification and Recommendations

Improving the quality and relevance of education of primary education through curricula reform is central to the new education policy and strategy and the five year plan.

The policies outline that education will be promoted through concentrating on *Access and Equity, Quality and Relevance*. In this respect, there are plans to reduce current drop out and repetition ratios in primary schools by 50% and 90% respectively by the end of the twenty year plan period. This will be achieved by the provision of much improved educational inputs - assigning qualified, trained and motivated teachers, by improving access and relevance to educational materials and facilities and by improving the management and administration of human, material and financial resources.

Responding to this challenge, firstly we have proposed a move towards graduated and interdependent *sector programme support package* which aims at improving the overall way in which Sida support will become more effective and efficient. This sector programme support is a natural outcome of the present sub-programme review and other support material where we have built upon the experiences gained. We have confidence that the proposals will lay the foundation for a much improved coherent policy and a greater focus of programme support which are consistent with needs expressed by Sida 'to focus on a smaller number of sub-programmes' and importantly, through consideration of the government priorities and the needs of the education sector.

The programme aims at providing umbrella type support for decentralisation, progress from centre to regionalisation and through to sector and implementor levels. Secondly, we have proposed a *graduated approach to programme support* for both policy and institutional reforms which will boost quality and relevance of the primary education sector at regional and school levels.

The three key sub-programmes identified include:

1. support for the improvement of the quality and provision of qualified and trained teachers through *in-service training methods*
2. increased effectiveness and relevance of learning and teaching inputs through support for *curriculum and educational material development* and
3. the closely linked provision, availability and logistics of supplying *textbooks, and teaching and learning resources*.

A critical factor in improving the quality and relevance of primary education will be the provision of programme assistance aimed at providing the necessary technical support at all levels for effective and efficient implementation. We also see a real and progressive move away from supporting operational costs towards long term development and attaching importance to supplementary investment in local research activities, institutional support through technical assistance.

These three interdependent sub-programmes will quite naturally be supported at all levels of the primary school system: central to regional to zone to woreda levels and to the schools. With the new policy of regionalisation and decentralisation, Teacher Training Institutions will have more autonomy and responsibility for the training function of teachers and will be a major focus within the sector programme support.

The new education and training policy has promoted two cycles of primary education

which places new demands on the training of primary school teachers. To meet this challenge and improve the quality, relevance and accessibility of in-service training methods the support will necessarily include both up-grading and professional components supported by mixed media approaches.

Two other sub-programme areas are to be supported but through a more disciplined approach to project identification. *Firstly, we have made special provision for programmes which address the equity and access priorities of government policy.* This would include identification of special needs for school construction and rehabilitation. However, we propose a much more focused approach to this sub-programme whereby support will be through well defined needs. We have been influenced here by the potential contribution to school building and rehabilitation programme of the ESRDF in which Sida is a likely funding partner and therefore its role in school building is maintained through co-ordinated donor input.

The final identified sub-programme addresses important support to the participation by the private sector in line with the governments plans for economic development. We envisage that this sector should include, in part support for non-formal education programmes which conform to the governments policy of increasing access to basic education, including local community needs through the flexible use of schools and institutions.

B. INTRODUCTION

This section of the report of the combined *Review of the Sida support to the education sector in Ethiopia 1992-1995 and Project identification mission for the period beginning in July 1996*, presents a brief background to the mission as well as an account of the basic information about the study as such. In section C, the impact of regionalisation on the education sector is discussed, followed by brief presentation of the programme context, i.e. the Swedish support to the education sector in section D. The major review findings are presented in section E, for each sub-programme. The finance of the public education sector is summarised in section F, leading to programme identification in section G. The final section H contains lessons learned and recommendations.

The targeted readership of this report is assumed to be knowledgeable in terms of Ethiopia and its education sector. In order to keep the report as short as possible, available background and sector context data which can be found in other reports are not repeated here. This may cause a problem for other readers: as was pointed out during the seminar in Addis Abeba in January 1996 many conclusions may seem less convincing to readers who are not familiar with the historical background of 17 years of war and the post-war transition to a new administrative organisation of the country, including the regionalisation policy. Still, this report does not repeat this necessary contextual information but rather recommends readers to consult the list of reviewed documents for further reference.

1. Background

Ethiopia and Sweden have been co-operating for development of the education sector in Ethiopia for a long time. Presently, the Swedish support programme to the education sector in Ethiopia has a scope of nine nation-wide sub-programmes. The current agreement period started in July 1992 and ends in June 1996. Ethiopia has presented a new policy and planning documents for the education sector in the future. Meanwhile, all sectors in Ethiopia are affected by major reforms and change processes, such as the transition from a planned economy to a market based economy and the on-going devolution of powers and responsibilities from the central government to regional governments. The Ministry of Education and Sida have agreed to prepare the education support programme starting in July 1996 by a combined review of the Sida support under the present agreement and a project identification mission for the coming agreement period. Meanwhile, the review was supported by a desk study commissioned by Sida/MoE and available to the review mission².

2. Objectives of the Mission

The mission has been guided by Terms of Reference, as presented in Appendix A. According to the Terms of Reference, the objectives of the mission are twofold³:

² Noonan, R. (1995), *Desk study of the Educational Sector in Ethiopia*, Sida/MoE, Stockholm.

³ Sida/Ministry of Education (October 1995): *Terms of Reference*. Combined Review of the Sida sup-

"a. to review the programmes supported by Sida in the current education agreement period, analysing their appropriateness to present circumstances in Ethiopia, and the progress and problems experienced in their implementation, and

b. to identify those areas of education which are most appropriate for Swedish-Ethiopian co-operation in the new agreement period, taking into due consideration the respective policies for education of the Government of Ethiopia and Sida."

The two tasks are of a different nature in that the review is backward looking (1992/93-1994/95), while the programme identification mission is forward looking. Ideally they are strongly interrelated: past performance may serve as a basis for the design of the future programme. Nevertheless, the Team has had to strike a balance between these two perspectives within the given budget and timing constraints.

The Terms of Reference go into some detail regarding the objective to provide recommendation for future sub-programmes: Sida's need to "focus on a smaller number of sub-programmes" and "the question of concentration to central level / regional level programmes" should be taken into account. In other words: a number of sub-programmes should be phased out and there should be concentration in terms of administrative levels.

3. The Review/PIM Team

The Review and Project Identification Mission Team has been selected by Sida. It includes three international consultants (Ms. Ingrid Christensson, financial analysis, Dr. Jan Valdelin, development economist and Mr. Michael Wort, educationalist) and one Swedish consultant procured locally (Ms. Gudrun Cederblad, non-formal education). Further the Ministry of Education and Sida have appointed two resource persons to the Team, Mr. Alemayehu Minas of the Ministry's Planning and Projects Department and Ms. Adeye Befekadu, Programme Officer at the Swedish Embassy in Addis Abeba, respectively. The Team has further benefited from the support of Mikael Palme, who collected data for this study while visiting places (Assossa and Assaita) for the review of curriculum development. He has also contributed to the report by sharing with the Team the preliminary results of the curriculum review.

The authors of this report are Valdelin, Wort, Christensson and Cederblad. The full responsibility of the conclusions and recommendations is shared by these authors alone. The final draft editing of the text has been done in Stockholm by Valdelin and Wort.

4. Method of Work

Some of the data generation methods used by the Team are outlined in the Terms of Reference: analysis of previous reviews, evaluations, reports and other documents (for a list of documents, cf. Appendix B, Documents reviewed), interviews with staff of the

port to the education sector in Ethiopia, Agreement period 1992-07-01 — to date, and Project Identification Mission for the period beginning 1996-07-01.

Ministry of Education and Sida and other donors as well as field visits to programme related institutions in Ethiopia and questionnaires were sent to a number of regions not visited. The field visit to Ethiopia for the international consultants lasted three weeks (two weeks in one case) and included visits at regional, zonal and woreda levels. People met and the itinerary of the field visit are found in Appendix C.

In line with Sida policy the analysis of past and future sub-programmes is carried out in terms of the Logical Framework Approach, but without any explicit references to specific tools of that approach⁴.

For the composition of the future co-operation package Ethiopian and Swedish policies have served as important criteria as well as the adjustment of the co-operation programme to the economic and education reforms and the regionalisation in Ethiopia.

5. The Quality of the Data

Much of the analysis of the study is based on secondary data. The Team is not in a position to evaluate the quality of secondary data, unless the sources include sufficient information to allow an assessment, which is not often the case. On a general level, it may be observed that most macro data on Ethiopia have always been less than reliable and it will take some time yet until reliability will be significantly increased. Due to the recent changes of administrative divisions the disaggregation of past and current data does not easily lend itself to comparison over time and localities, but adds to the problems of reliability.

The reports produced by the programme also demonstrate that the quality of data on the micro level still may leave a bit to be desired before the analyst can rest assured⁵. The underlying monitoring systems and even accounting models have not been designed to safeguard a continuous flow of high quality data, but rather to produce a report after the end of the reporting period.

The primary sources of the present study are interviews, questionnaires and field visits, together with the format for financial sector data used by the Team (cf. Appendix E) to collect financial data from donors and Ministry of Education. The Team has double-checked data to the largest extent possible. But interviews and field visits always involve high risks in terms of both reliability and validity, when the ambition to collect as much data as possible has to be balanced with time restrictions and logistics.

6. Constraints

The present study relies on the data that were available to the Team. The quality of data is one constraint that has been discussed above, but also the quantity of data sets limit to what the Team may achieve. Our findings are based upon data that have been avail-

⁴ Previous evaluations and reviews of sub-programmes in the sector are found in *Annex B*.

⁵ Cf. for example as regards financial data, Embassy of Sweden Development Cooperation Office (February 1994): *Draft Report on the Review of Accounting and Financial Management Systems and Audit of Accounts of Sida-funded projects/programmes* (WAAS).

able to us only. The time available for field visits and interviews is therefore another serious constraint to the study, as well as the time available for discussion and reflection.

A drawback for the assessment of past performance is the lack of the 1994/95 report on the programme. The effect of this may well be that the Team remains unaware of some of the recent changes in the programme and that we cannot of course assess performance over the last year⁶. An imminent danger of this is that the most recent changes of programme implementation may not properly influence the Team's project identification.

The Terms of Reference do not spell out the need for a study of the private sector in education (including NGO's), nor has the mission had enough time to look into the private supply of for example adult education. This is felt as a constraint in the sense that the private sector must be considered as a supplement to the public sector in order to achieve impact in the non-formal education.

Within the limits set by the mentioned constraints, the Team has used past experience and Sida's set of instruments of co-operation in order to identify a proposal for future co-operation to the benefit of development of education in Ethiopia. This points at another constraint: it proves difficult to look into the future and predict with any certainty the development of the ongoing change processes in Ethiopia. This situation calls for flexibility and close monitoring of any future programme, that must anyway start from the present level of implementation capacity and pursue of graduated path of provision of funds with milestones triggering higher levels when reached.

7. The Report

The report follows, to a large extent, the major issues addressed in the Terms of Reference. Regionalisation features prominently in the discussions since this is seen to effect the whole education system and for any adjustment to Sida supported programmes there must be a major question as to the stability at all levels of decentralisation.

The section concerning the review of the sub-programmes is presented in a shorter version than in the Draft Report. The authors have benefited from the discussion at the seminar with Sida and the Ministry of Education in Addis Abeba in January 1966. The outcomes contribute to the final section where we have attempted to lay the foundations for future Sida support to the education sector.

C. REGIONALISATION AND THE EDUCATION SECTOR

Following the adoption of federal system of administration, the regional states were established along ethnic/linguistic line. The power of the regional states and their relation-

⁶ As an example of important on-going changes one could point at the strong emphasis of funds to regions that started over the last year. This has been noted from regional plans and reports. The Team also had access to a six month progress report covering the first six months of 1995.

ship with the centre has already been established through the constitution. Accordingly, the regional states have full rights and powers regarding all developmental sector activities including education formerly concentrated at the central government. The following is a brief description of the working relationship that currently exist between the central Ministry of Education and the Regional-State Education Bureaux.

1. Sphere of Control over Learning Institutions

The Regional-States have administration and management control over all levels of general education and training. They have the responsibility to plan and execute all educational development activities with educational finance allocated by the Regions as well as budget from the Federal government. However, external support for educational finance is solicited by the Ministry of Education. In addition, the regions do not have a direct mandate over tertiary education which is administrated through the Higher Education Academic and Research Department.

The Regional State Education Bureaux are directly responsible to the Regional-State Council. While they are not obliged to make implementation reports of the sector to the Ministry, they can provide information to the former upon request. However, activities undertaken by external funds must, first and foremost be reported to the Ministry.

2. Relationship between Central and Regional Education Bureaux

2.1. CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT

The Regional Education Bureaux have full authority over the primary education curricula at the school and teacher training level. Nevertheless, the national standard is maintained through ICDR which is given the mandate to develop working documents and flow charts to be discussed centrally at national workshops. Once the national standard has been established (that includes determining the profile of the students of the particular cycle and level of performance and the like) the Educational Bureaux take over the work of instructional material preparation. Parallel to this, the ICDR gives orientation and other technical support to Regional Curriculum experts by calling them to the centre and occasionally at the Regional level.

2.2 EDUCATIONAL MATERIAL PRODUCTION AND DISTRIBUTION

The central co-ordinating agency for the activity is the EMPDA. This agency works as both a publishing agency as well as agency for co-ordinating the printing needs of Regional Education materials. It is also the sole source of other educational materials such as chalk and primary science kits. In addition, it is the agency that procures other teaching-learning materials from the local and external market.

The working relationship between the regions and the EMPDA is both a client-customer type as well as a dealer. In the former case, the EMPDA, because of the long period of involvement as national publishing enterprise for educational materials, provides publishing services at nominal cost because of the government and external

subsidy it receives. It is a dealer because it provides advise and identifies local printing houses at the centre which can print instructional materials. It seems that the experience from the last three years following Regionalisation indicates that the policy of subsidising EMPDA is impeding the growth of private publishing agencies that can specialise in educational material production and provision.

2.3. EDUCATIONAL PLANNING AND PROJECT PREPARATION

The Ministry of Education prepares overall indicative plans taking into account national indicators and general economic development targets. The planning covers all spheres of educational development, i.e., number of schools, participation rates, educational material acquisition, curricula, teacher training, educational finance, etc.. Once the plan has been developed, it is discussed on bi-annual, national educational conference. On the basis of the decision made at the conferences, the planning and program specialists work on it further and then it is submitted to the MoE Policy committee. If endorsed, it becomes the National Educational and Training Plan on which the Regional Education Bureaux make their local implementation plans.

The educational projects are similarly prepared at the Centre and submitted to the government and/or external funding agencies on the basis of the plan prepared by the Centre, discussed and approved by Regional Bureaux and endorsed by the Ministry of Education Policy Committee. *The implementation of those projects that have national impact are co-ordinated by the Centre while those with region specific benefit are executed by the Regional Bureaux.* In addition to the centrally prepared projects, the regions also have the mandate to prepare projects to be implemented locally and financed by federal budget allocation, regional financial source, or external funding agencies.

2.4. SCHOOL CONSTRUCTION

The estimate of the number of schools to be constructed at the national level is determined on the basis of improving accessibility and equity as well as the need for meeting the national enrolment targets. In addition, the Centre determines the standard of the learning institutions, However, the types of construction materials are decided by he regions in terms of local needs. Parallel to this, the prototype of the design is prepared at the central level. However, the actual number and types of schools to be constructed is decided by the Regional Education Bureaux.

2.5. TEACHER RECRUITING, TRAINING AND ASSIGNING

The MoE through the Department of Teacher Education and Educational Staff Development co-ordinates technical aspects of training curricula and training facilities. It is assisted in this respect by the ICDR which has a Primary Teacher Training Curriculum Panel. The department makes proposals for the setting of recruitment criteria to the TTIs, carrying out evaluation of the performance of Teacher Training Institutions as well as upgrading TTI instructors. These proposals can be modified to relate to regional differences in recruitment requirements. In addition, it co-ordinates the in service teacher training and head teacher training.

The Regional Education Bureaux have administration and financial responsibility over

TTIs. The certification, assignment and transfer of teachers, as well as the recruitment and training of in service teachers, head teachers is done through the REBs in collaboration with the Centre.

3. Experience and Problems

The decentralisation of sectoral activities in Ethiopia has been the most challenging endeavour. Major initiatives were undertaken to train staff at the centre in the new role to assist the regions' Regional Education Bureaux. However, the turn over of government staff to correct the limitations created by regionalisation has been conducted frequently, this has negatively affected project implementation and monitoring. Whilst considerable efforts (through regional support) have been made to cope with the problems incurred through transfers and movements of key staff due to the regionalisation process, there remain considerable weaknesses at all levels. In addition, the low number of staff and poor technical and managerial competence at the centre and regions have complicated the matter; the centre cannot give adequate technical support to the regions due to these limitation. The planning department in the Ministry is constrained in its current activities because it does not have a monitoring and evaluation unit. There are plans to rectify this problem in the near future.

D. SWEDISH SUPPORT TO THE EDUCATION SECTOR

This section presents a brief financial review of the Swedish support to the education sector in Ethiopia from 1992/93 to the present. The purpose is to illustrate the magnitude of support to the nine respective sub-programmes. In the following section, each sub-programme is reviewed in evaluative terms, followed by a review of the whole programme.

The *overall* objectives of the Swedish support have been⁷

- to support the development of the primary school system and adult education system;
- to assist in the endeavour to reach universal primary education;
- to improve the quality and the relevance of the education supported.

Further, the agreement includes *specific* objectives of the Swedish support:

- to support the rehabilitation, maintenance and construction of primary schools
- to provide furniture and equipment to primary schools
- to support the production of text books for primary schools
- to support adult education programmes
- to support an increased planning, research and information capacity of the Ministry.

The total Ethiopian government budget for 1987 Ethiopian Calendar (1994) was

⁷ *Specific Agreement between the Government of Sweden and the Transitional Government of Ethiopia on Education Sector Support 1992/93-1993/94.*

9964.6 million Birr, out of which education received 13% (1297 million Birr)⁸. About half of that amount, or 632.5 million Birr (48.77%), was for primary education. Of the total budget for primary education more than 55% was the recurrent budget, out of which in turn 92% were salary and allowances.

In a division by funding source and beneficiary for 1995/96, the Ethiopian government education capital budget was shown to derive from government sources and loans at about the same share (47.55% and 47.98%, respectively), while grants accounted for 4.48%. The federal state used about one third of the capital budget (32.59%), while the remaining two thirds were allocated to the regional states (67.41%).

During the review period the Swedish support programme consisted of nine sub-programmes. The original plan was to have ten sub-programmes, including a support to Higher Education, that was never started. Further, during the agreement period of the review no additional funds were allocated to Instructional Equipment and Furniture or Primary School Construction. As a consequence the number of sub-programmes has actually been decreased from the originally planned ten programmes to only seven.

The total Swedish support from 1992/93 to 1996 was the largest single contribution from a bilateral donor and constituted more than 10% of the total donor support⁹. In the specific agreements between the two countries, including the extensions of the agreement periods, the total amount of support agreed from 1992/93 to 1995/96 was 118 MSEK. The first agreement covering 1992-93-94 specified the amount of 82 MSEK, while the following one covering 1994/95-1995/96 (after one year's extension of the original 1994/95 period) brought a considerable reduction to 36 MSEK¹⁰. This change seems to imply an experience of low utilisation rates during the 1992-93/94 period.

The annual plans of operation determine the planned amount to be utilised each year. During the review period the planned amounts were:

| Years | Planned (MSEK) |
|------------|----------------|
| 1992/93 | 48.00 |
| 1993/94 | 30.83 |
| 1994/95/96 | 35.40 |
| Total | 114.32 |

In the planning of the support the largest sub-programme by far was textbook production followed by educational management information system, non-formal education, and environmental education. Interestingly, it should be pointed out the surprisingly low levels of support (relative to the other programmes) for teacher-in-service and curriculum development in relation to the core of the programme objectives.

The actual Swedish contribution in a given year will depend on the implementation rate of the sub-programmes. From a given allocation cash transfers are made for which the

⁸ Ministry of Education, handout from January 1995.

⁹ Cf. the section on donors below. The sources are the Team's study.

¹⁰ Data for this section provided by the Financial Officer of the Development Co-operation Office, Swedish Embassy. The written comments of the DCO have guided the final editing.

Ministry should account in its reporting. The utilised cash together with funds expended for technical assistance and international procurement make up the actually used support.

As an indicator of the implementation rate, the DCO applies the actual utilisation rates. In January 1996, the cash transferred to the Ministry of Education from the planned amount for 1994/95 (35.4 MSEK) was 9.5 MSEK. At that date, the reports had confirmed 2.32 MSEK as utilised in 1994/95, while 23.58 MSEK of the planned amount had been carried over to 1995/96. By the available reporting, then, the utilisation rate would be less than 7%.

Similarly, at the reporting period of July 1995-December 1995, the available financial report¹¹ from the Ministry of Education in January 1996 stated an unutilised balance of 82% of the total funds available from the fiscal year (out of which only 150 000 SEK were additional cash receipts, the remainder being carry-overs from 1994/95); e.g. the first six months' reported utilisation rate was 18% of the whole year's funds.

Later reporting, including accounts for further expenditures of past periods may raise the actual utilisation rates. Assuming that all the cash transferred in 1994/95 would have been spent, but not just yet reported at the beginning of 1996, the utilisation rate for that year will still not be more than a third of planned funds.

We may conclude that the last two years of the development co-operation in the education sector in Ethiopia have been characterised by a sluggish implementation speed. This must be reflected in the future project identification for the sector.

E. REVIEW OF THE SUB-PROGRAMMES

This section contains a discussion of each sub-programme based on the Team's study and the comments received at the January seminar in Addis Abeba. To conclude the section, a summary of common features of the sub-programmes is presented, thus suggesting a review of the programme as a whole.

1. Education Planning and Information

The first sub-programme reviewed is a support whose name has changed over time. It is often referred to as Education Management Information System (EMIS).

The support to education planning and information corresponds to the specific objective "to support an increased planning, research and information capacity of the Ministry" according to the Specific Agreement. This sub-programme dates back to the mid-1980s, when SIDA started to support the production of educational statistics for planning purposes, based on computers¹². It has contained components of hardware, software, consumables, training, repair and maintenance as well as system development.

¹¹ In January, 1996 the Ministry of Education delivered the Annual Report of 1994/95, but without the financial reports. Parts of the forthcoming reports were available, however.

¹² Noonan, R., January, 1993.

Originally, training was supplied by expatriate staff, but presently in-house training is provided by the Ministry of Education, including training of regional staff.

In 1993/94, a considerable part of the support had been allocated to the regional offices and departments of the Ministry of Education. This is the result of the decentralisation policy and the capacity building of the regions and therefore represents a major task for the Ministry.

The EMIS division of the Ministry of Education is currently a division of the Planning and Projects Department. Recent Swedish support has included the production and distribution of regional publications, workshops and follow-up training to regions. In terms of computer development, Sida has supported the local network and network training.

In terms of information outputs and training activities it is the impression of the Team that the sub-programme has been reaching its targets relatively well. The effectiveness in terms of objectives cannot be assessed in detail¹³, but in relation to the specific objective of "increased planning, research and information capacity", focus so far has been on information capacity. The research and planning capacity has to be addressed differently in the future.

Up to now, the division has been producing statistics in rather crude form, i.e. without in-depth analysis. The present ambition is to turn the regional centres also into data users — not only input providers — including the publication of regional data. A minimum standard for each region has been suggested by the division and is expected to be finalised in a year's time.

Future priorities for the division are to train the regional level in order to arrive at higher levels of scope and analysis of the statistics; to develop a customised software (with the assistance of hired experts); and to produce national statistics until the regions are able to do so.

1.1 SUMMARY

The sub-programme seems to be efficient in its implementation activities.

The sub-programme design and the monitoring system do not permit assessment of effects and impact. As regards sustainability, it may be noted that the high share of recurrent costs in the expenditures should be taken as a warning for the future. It may mean that no development impact is achieved as funds are used for operations only. It also implies low financial sustainability. On the other hand, it seems that the sub-programme has achieved a high level of managerial and technical sustainability for the production of educational statistics.

Referring to the desk study¹⁴, we feel that the sub-programme should now emphasise a broader strategy, for example a shift towards support to regional capacity building.

¹³ This is related to project design, cf. section 10 below.

¹⁴ Noonan, R., 1995

Most effectively, however, such a support should be part of a general support to the capacity building at the Ministry, including the regional units.

2. Curriculum Development and Research

The sub-programme for Curriculum Development and Research is at the core of the present efforts of working out a new curricula for the Ethiopian primary education¹⁵.

In relation to the specific objectives for the support programme, this sub-programme has been justified by the objective in terms of "increased planning, research and information capacity of the Ministry". In the last reported year, the activities included research, curricula development (primary and junior secondary school), production of curriculum materials, teachers' training and capacity building at regional level.

Proposals from ICDR are presented to the Ministry of Education Policy Committee for approval and the MoE consults the regions. This also applies for the sub-programme plan before it is submitted to the donor. After regional approval of syllabus it becomes a standard and the respective regions write the textbooks. The central curricula is intended for standardisation and for the national identity of students.

The Swedish funds have been used for syllabus development (primary and junior second) and work shops for regions. It has not been possible to assess to what extent the funds have served the purpose of increasing capacity as there are no established indicators for measuring capacity and its changes. It seems, however, that — regardless of the Swedish support — capacity building is still needed.

In the past, SIDA supported ICDR for upgrading the staff at the centre. Currently, there is still a need for capacity building at the centre. The present centre has about 60 experts, but in many subject areas only a few or only one expert is left. Although we have no way of assessing impact of the support to any reliable extent, we are in a position to note that past support has not led to sufficient capacity presently available at the centre. Furthermore, the reduced staff at the centre now also should support capacity building in the regions.

Since the beginning of decentralisation in Ethiopia a great need for capacity building at the regions has been observed. Historically, the curricula development was always at the centre and this explains partly why a huge amount of assistance to regions now is needed for capacity building. The centre is not in a position to meet all the demands for staff support, as the regional demand is rapidly increasing. The future emphasis of the curricula development and research will therefore be to further implement the regionalisation process.

The main master plan (one out of four master plan documents presently known to the regions) is now to develop syllabus for grades one to eight for eight subject areas.

Finally, it should be mentioned that the present and future tasks of curricula develop-

¹⁵ The present assessment remains a modest contribution compared to the study of ICDR conducted by Mikael Palme et. al., 1996 (Draft).

ment and capacity building at the centre need a focal point of integration. In the ICDR all the panels for curricula and TTI curricula are found, which is an indication that the integration and convergence of central support possibly should be at ICDR.

The input of technical assistance and support for contact with foreign institutions have decreased over the years and currently ICDR does not have the necessary international network to keep up with developments in the fields.

The annual reports have included some of the planned activities, with mixed result in terms of implementation, while others have not been reported.

2.1 SUMMARY

The general impression of the ICDR sub-programme is that ICDR has access to a workable machinery of resources and management. Its functions are the traditional curricula work, assistance to the Regional Education Bureaux, supervision and the production of teaching materials. The main problem at present is the development of the new curricula, with increased quality and relevance, given the tight time constraints. Manpower and equipment are scarce resources in the present situation.

Partly as a result of the focus of the support and partly as a result of project design and monitoring system, impact and side-effects of the Swedish support may not be assessed within the present study. As indicated above, however, it is noted that grounds have been laid for a sustainable activity in terms of a workable system.

As part of a national effort to improve access, quality and relevance of education in the country, continued support to ICDR seems necessary. The detailed design of such a support should be based on the recent in-depth study commissioned by Sida.

3. Teacher In-Service Training

The importance of in-service strategies for upgrading and professionally training primary school teachers is set out clearly in the Educational and Training Policy and in conjunction with the five year master plan (1994/1995-1998/1999) through the establishment of strategies to implement the strengthening the quality of the teachers. The current emphasis is to concentrate on the existing teaching stock through in-service training for preparation of the new first cycle primary schooling¹⁶.

3.1. Head teacher programme

The long term objectives of the programme for Primary School Headmaster Training are to significantly improve and support the educational administration, planning and relevant school activities of the primary school head teachers. This is in line with the

¹⁶ Transitional Government of Ethiopia (April 1994): *Education Policy and Strategy*. (p.24). It is intended to use complementary methods of short training courses with continuous distance learning methods.

governments educational policy and MOE's directives which, in particular, is to transform the educational system into a 'decentralised, efficient and professionally co-ordinated participatory system in administration and management of education'¹⁷.

It is worth mentioning here that the head teacher programme began in 1981 through co-operation and support from UNICEF¹⁸. It has continued to admit around 1100 trainee head teachers into the programme each summer for 46 days (summer course). The major centres for the summer course have been Awassa and Debre Berhan TTI's although at times six institutes were used¹⁹. The selection of trainees is through a quota system based upon the number of primary schools and the demand for head teachers in each region. Since 1992, 2,491 trainees have been awarded certificates and since the beginning of the programme there have been 16,300 certified trainees²⁰.

Generally, target groups have been teachers who have completed Grade 12 schooling and graduated from a TTI, completed at least 2 years teaching experience and have served as acting heads without formal training. The training takes place in selected TTI's for 46 days during the summer vacations. A total of 921 head teachers from eleven regions (nearly 84% from Regions 1,3,4 and SEPR) were trained in the summer in-service programme for 1992/93 and of these only 1% were female heads.

During 1993/94, 1072 head teachers participated at four TTI's (Adwa (83), Debre Berhan (178), Nekempte (595) and Awasa (216)) with female participation increasing to 5% from previous years and with the same regions dominating with similar attendance patterns. Interestingly, Debre Berhan's summer programme expected 466 candidates for training, but due in part to an additional TTI (Nekempte) in the programme only 178 turned up (interview sources and Annual Report, 1993/1994).

The programme for FY 1994/1995 has been affected by a recent evaluation and gradual implementation of Osterling et. al (1994) recommendations²¹. There has been some activity resulting in the teacher training section of MOE submitting an outline strategy for implementing the expected revised head teachers curriculum. Other planned activities concerned orientation workshops for tutors from the REB's, ZEB's and TTI's. However this activity has been postponed to the half year beginning January 1996. There was no utilisation of Sida funds for the reported activities for FY 1994/1995.

The attrition rate is high on graduating, with many of the trained heads reportedly being recruited for the newly established WEO's whilst the regionalisation process has left some regions short of head teachers through transfers²² and not all of the teachers are

¹⁷ MOE (October 1993): *Ethiopian Educational Policy Implementation Strategy* and Transitional Government of Ethiopia (1994): *Education Policy & Strategy*.

¹⁸ UNICEF withdrew support to the programme in 1992 since when Sida gave support.

¹⁹ It should be understood that eight of the TTI's are in just two regions; Amhara and Oromo and that the long term government policy will see three additional TTI's built in other regions to promote a more equitable and expanded system. See the *Economic Development Strategy for Ethiopia*, February 1994.

²⁰ MOE: *Education Statistics* 1992/1993, 1993/1994 (1995).

²¹ Osterling, O. & Shibeshi, A. (1994): *Report on the Evaluation of the Ethiopian Primary School Headmaster Training Programme*, 5-29 April. Ministry of Education, Addis Ababa.

²² It is predicted that there will be a need for just over ten thousand head teachers for the new three levels of schools in the future see MOE, (Nov. 1995): *Highlights on the Proposed Strategy on School*

appointed to heads posts but take up deputy heads. The programme target group appears to be 1,200 irrespective of whether it was before or after regionalisation policies and is, in part it seems, governed by the capacities of the TTI's participating in the programme. In the last decade the programme has trained over 11,000 teachers which easily exceeds the number of primary schools in the country. Despite this effort, there are reportedly untrained head teachers in most regions, but the overall figure is not known.

Previous government policies of transferring the teachers to rural areas after graduation obviously discourages many of the better candidates (and female teachers) from applying. The attendance patterns outlined above, illustrate the extremely poor gender balance in selection, but this not only reflects on the insignificant number of female heads in the country but, also on the lack of policy to remedy this situation. Further, there are currently no incentives or career paths for the head teachers which differentiates them from ordinary teachers²³.

There has been a real decline in the number of trainees during the years 1991 — 1993 and the trend continues even though the total has increased in 1994 when Nekemte TTI enrolled over half of the total enrolments. Regionalisation which ensures the use of mother tongue as the medium of instruction is the major cause for the decline in numbers. Quota allocations and selection process seem to disadvantage the weaker regions. A recent survey was carried out in the Amhara region²⁴ which pointed out that during 1994/95 this region could only recruit 37% of the quota given to it because of the lack of applicants!

The 1994 evaluation²⁵ paints a picture of a programme which is out of control with serious weaknesses throughout. The major findings of the evaluation were that the operational objectives were irrelevant and inappropriate to the training needs of the head teachers. The six week, summer workshop activities were generally non-participatory and the objectives concerned with attaining skills and knowledge of school administration, planning and related activities in supporting teachers untenable, given the academic nature of the curriculum. They also found that the quality of the TTI trainers to be poor. It is also worth quoting Shibeshi's sample survey here in that 'most head teachers (sampled) indicated that they lack skills in management, planning, supervision, monitoring and evaluation, resource management, community relations, record keeping etc.'. These views were confirmed by the few REB's, ZEB's and other officials we met.

The MOE have been responsible for the design of the training programme, but in the current regionalisation process the role of the MOE changes to that of providing services, training when necessary and technical support to the regions. This has wide ranging implications for any continuation of the programme and rationale which is more concerned with addressing regional needs. In this respect, the future will be consoli-

Directors, In-Service Training in Ethiopia. Teaching & Educational Management Staff Development Department.

²³ We were informed that this situation is likely to change now that a new head teachers terms of service has been submitted for approval to the council.

²⁴ Shibeshi, A (1994): *Participatory Training Needs Assessment of Head teachers in the Amhara National Regional State.* Government of Ethiopia & Finland, Addis Ababa.

²⁵ Osterling, O. et al (1994) op. cit.

dated by the introduction of the new teachers career structure and complementary guidelines to woreda's and school administrations and new strategies for short duration training programmes. Since the 1994 programme evaluation, the major recommendations have been submitted to the government but no major decisions have yet been made. Amongst these are proposed changes to curricula, attention to gender disparities, selection criteria, extension to a two summer programme (12 weeks) and importantly, career and transfer conditions.

3.1.1. SUMMARY

The outcomes of both the evaluations cited, both indicate that any new programme must be restructured around the accepted policy changes and better foundations for planning and recruitment. Generally speaking very few of the output goals have been achieved over the long life of the programme and especially during the period of this review. The programme problems are deep and complex where considerable capacity building at all levels is required²⁶.

The inappropriateness of the current head teachers curricula is the most serious concern, but this situation has largely arisen because of the lack of any monitoring and follow-up. The curricula has been criticised because it does not sufficiently address the needs of school administration, management and leadership skills and school community relations etc. There is also shortage of suitable resource material and complaints of poor tutoring. Importantly, there has been a complete absence of programme monitoring and reporting other than end of course evaluations from the participants which do not seem to have any real relevance for an inappropriate programme.

The programme has been allowed to run with Sida support without major interventions, monitoring or follow-up studies whilst the training given during this time has been inappropriate to the needs of the target group. It reinforces the need for effective monitoring and programme reporting — but reporting that goes beyond just the listing of actual quantitative outputs against proposed activities.

3.2 In-service training for untrained primary school teachers through distance education

The Division of Distance Education is a part of the Education Mass Media Unit of MOE and is responsible for national programmes. The division currently operates a distance education programme for serving primary school teachers concerned with academic up-grading supported by radio programmes. The programme has so far assisted 1,600 under qualified primary school teachers to upgrade themselves successfully to school leaving certificate level (Grade 12). The current enrolment is just over 200 entrants who enter the programme requesting up-grading programmes from Grade 9 to 12²⁷.

²⁶ TTI tutors and recruited tutors need up-grading in adult learning techniques together with training for the expected new head teachers curriculum.

²⁷ Ministry of Education: *Education Statistics* 1993/1994 (1995). There is considerable doubt concerning the cost effectiveness of the current active programme for up-grading teachers because of the very small numbers of teachers applying for the course each year. Cost recovery is made through

Since early 1993, the division has also planned to create a programme for professional (pedagogical) training for a target group of 6,000 primary school teachers. In this respect, there have been a number of workshops organised by the division for its recruited course writers and tutoring staff. Training of course writers and editors, drawn from the TTI's was a major achievement (33 course writers were trained through a number of workshops in 1993²⁸ and follow-up training).

Importantly, the production of correspondence text was consistent but subsequent output rates have been affected by a multiplicity of problems at the division largely concerning lack of key technical staff at critical production times and regionalisation policies effecting teacher training tutor (course writers) transfers²⁹. As a consequence, slow progress has been made in meeting targets as outlined in the annual plans. This has resulted in just 37 units of the planned 130 study units for 1993/1994 that will cover the full range of teacher training curriculum submitted by the course writers for editing to the division. Most of the training that has been carried out appears to be relevant and effective but sustaining the professional contacts with the course writers has proved difficult, again largely due to under-staffing levels at the division.

The MOE have been slow to recognise the importance and potential of well organised distance education which can support upgrading and professional training of its primary school teachers. In the past, the Ministry's ambivalence towards supporting distance education led to a decline in the performance and morale of the division. Nevertheless, we were assured by MOE of the long term commitment towards supporting in-service training for the teachers through both short in-service and complementary emphasis on distance education.

It is encouraging to report that a chief editor has been in post for 3 months and during 1994/1995³⁰ there have been appointments to four of the eight posts (Amharic, English, biology and chemistry) whilst the other four posts are currently being advertised (physics, mathematics, geography and history). There are in-house training activities currently taking place for these appointments. Thirty-five study units were edited and returned to the course writers for improvements and comments, whilst a total of 61 radio support lessons³¹ for some of the courses were scripted by the division experts (and partly through workshop activity). A lack of editing capacity and staffing levels though continues to restrict the divisional activities.

The payments to the twenty contracted course writers has been slow, mainly because the lack of editing at the centre has led to large backlogs of draft material awaiting edit-

tuition fees whereby non-teachers who study the programme pay 143 Birr per Grade whereas the teachers undergoing the programme as an in-service initiative pay only 11 Birr.

²⁸ See Wort, M.A.A. (1993): *Report(s) on Distance Education Workshops*, Sida & MOE.

²⁹ During field trips to Nazareth and Awassa TTI's it was reported that only two out of a total of eleven contracted tutors remained in post.

³⁰ Activities undertaken up to July 1995 - *Quarterly Reports* Nov. 1994 - April 1995 and through to July 1995.

³¹ It remains unclear (even through interviews and records) whether this figure is accumulative since 45 radio lessons were reportedly scripted by December 1995. The completed lessons were in pedagogic, social science and Amharic whilst part-time producers are being sought for psychology, science and music — (interviews with division).

ing and therefore no decision has been made concerning acceptance of the material and consequent payment. Interviews with a few course writers point to the need for improving the support to the contracted writers through increasing the number of regional visits by the division experts.

Long term planning and programme development has been piece meal and target levels have fallen well below those anticipated for both programmes. In retrospect, the division has been struggling to achieve target levels of material production but it is making advances towards completion of the 10 courses even though the division has and still suffers from a lack of expertise at critical times. However, in a period of policy transition and major changes to curricula the divisions activities have been overtaken by developments in education. Only 10% of the Sida funds for FY 1994/1995 have been utilised and the majority of the activities planned for this period have been postponed to the coming half year period up until June 1996.

The current programme has had many delays in its activities aimed at preparing professional material for the primary school teachers and has now been overtaken by developments in teacher training curriculum. Steps must be taken to determine what proportion (if any) of this material can be adapted to the new curriculum. The division is confident that in some subjects, content can be salvaged with little re-writing. Nevertheless, it all points to further delays and new problems of training suitable writers, and editors for the new teacher training curricula.

The division has plans to re-write the material according to the new secondary curriculum. The Plan of Operation which addresses the aims and objectives laid out in the Education and Training Policy and the Strategy document emphasising in-service training has recently been prepared, but not presented to Sida through MOE³². In the past, programme development has also suffered from the lack of support from MOE which led to weakening of the management and the uncertainty of continuity. However, the distance education division has recently come under the more supportive umbrella of the Educational Mass Media Agency of MOE and has been restructured into two main sections; 'academic course development' and 'student support services'.

The complementary teacher training programme still remains in its development stage and has made sporadic, but slow progress. The programme has been hit by a number of developments in primary education; the division of primary schooling and the concurrent requirement for two levels of primary school teachers, the review of the primary and secondary curricula and importantly, changes to the teacher training curriculum. The lack of editing staff has been a continued and major factor inhibiting the performance of this department which has led to an ever-growing backlog of course material waiting to be edited. The long terms objectives of the programme have been delayed in terms of implementing the pilot studies and testing strategies for the development material.

³² Division of Distance Education, EMMU. (1995) *Plan of Operation: Upgrading First & Second Cycle Primary School Teachers*. MOE, Addis Ababa.

3.2.1 SUMMARY

Even though the proposed new programmes are poised to take account of the new education policy for primary education³³ the division will need considerably more support and strengthening in many of its activities. Still very much in a state of transition which without considerable and well timed technical assistance and an increase in qualified, competent and committed staff the division will likely continue to struggle to fulfil its potential. It is essential that long term policies and strategies be well thought out if distance education will contribute to in-service education of the teachers as outlined by the government policies.

The most important constraints have been disrupted activities outlined in the operational plan, a shortage of staffing levels at critical development stages (especially in the shortage of course editors and other essential positions which first were acknowledged in 1992)³⁴. Doubts about programme sustainability remain and concern the levels and breakdown of Sida support and the provision of quality. A major lesson learnt concerns the level of funding for a major educational input. A well run and effective distance education programme which is to meet national target groups must be considered an important investment for the government and therefore must reflect considerable levels of support, both in expertise and finance.

4. Environmental education

Plans to develop and integrate environmental education into the existing curriculum are included in the Education and Training Policy and Strategy document and in the National Population Policy³⁵ and Plan of Action. In particular, the necessity for environmental concerns is made explicit in the general objectives 'to cultivate the cognitive, creative, productive and appreciative potential of its citizens (is by) relating education to environmental and societal needs'. The strategy to achieve this is through the setting up of curriculum advisory councils in specific disciplines at all administrative levels to provide various educational inputs relative to varying needs³⁶.

The Environmental Education Project operates under the Ministry of Education and began as a pilot study in Wollo region in 1985. The pilot programme was extended to four regions to address an urgent need to raise peoples *awareness and understanding* of the regions and famine situation. The project has developed from being a pure conservation education project related to the Ministry of education activities towards addressing wider issues of health, sanitation and population issues through the education system³⁷.

³³ In this respect, the programme aims to target both categories of under qualified teachers for the first cycle (Grade 1-4) and the under trained teachers in the second cycle (5-8) schools through distance education (Plan of Operation, October 1995 — not submitted).

³⁴ See sector reviews. Interestingly, this problem is highlighted in subsequent yearly sector reviews but with little consequence until the appointments in the middle of 1995.

³⁵ Population & Development Planning Unit (1994): *National Population Policy*.

³⁶ Transitional Government of Ethiopia (April 1994): *Education Policy and Strategy*. p. 8 and p6. respectively.

³⁷ Aregay, A. et. al. (June 1992): *The Environmental Education Project of Ethiopia - Six Years of Experiences as a Pilot Project*. Environmental Education Project Co-ordinating Office. Ministry of Education. Addis Ababa.

The programme focuses on raising awareness and promoting community involvement through formal and non-formal education techniques in rural areas.

The current programme evolved from the evaluation of the pilot study (Sept. 1992) and has developed into a national programme. The rationale and focus has moved away from rural and urban target groups towards creating awareness for key personnel at Ministry and Regional levels and recently a focus on teacher trainers and teachers. The Ministry of Education provides technical advice and support activities for the regions.

The development of the pilot phase through to the national programme has had close support from Sida advisors since 1989. The aim of working towards the sustainable use of resources and changes in behaviour is addressed through programme activities such as seminars and training workshops. Workshops are used widely and are complemented through delivery of support material in the form of newsletters, bulletins and information leaflets from the centre to all administration levels and many institutions.

In 1992/1993 Environmental Education seminars were held for 1070 teachers and 598 head teachers in 4 TTI's. Other activities included a workshop for 40 school environmental education club sponsors for one week, 36 environmental experts met at MOE for half day seminar, a methodology workshop for 12 TTI principals and 24 TTI tutors and a six day seminar for 130 teachers, school directors and education officers³⁸.

1993/1994 saw a movement towards the training of regional and ministry staff. 46 Regional curriculum directors and TTI tutors attended a 7 day workshop on environmental education with an external consultant. Also, 25 regional radio programme producers from four regional radio studios together with TTI tutors attend 7 day workshop in Dessie TTI on environmental communication techniques in conjunction with Educational Mass Media Agency staff.

A number of overseas visits were supported; four regional staff from Region 14 and Oromia attended conference in UK in June and two people from MOE and Region 12 attended short course in UK. In addition procurement of 1500 copies of environmental brochure from Kenya purchased. 100,000 copies of environmental magazine distributed to regions. A number of activities were still under preparation and funds carried over to 1994/1995³⁹.

In 1994/1995 emphasis again changed through programme rationale to creating awareness and knowledge building at the centre and regional levels. In this respect, workshops and out-of-country studies have been undertaken. 33 Regional Education Bureau staff took place in an 8 day workshop and two more workshops are planned at Kotabe and Bahar Dar TTI's for December 1995. Four centre staff visited Sweden in November. Production of environmental magazine for distribution to regions continued at same levels as 1993/1994 although a number of planned activities were delayed.

Regionalisation policies, as evidenced by transfers, has effected the staffing levels and weakened the expertise at some of the TTI's and Regional Bureaux's. There is also a concern for the excessive demand made on the Environmental Education Office at the

³⁸ MOE (September 1993): *Report on Sida assisted Education Programmes (1992-1993)*.

³⁹ MOE (September, 1994): *Report on Sida Assisted Education Programme (1993-1994)*.

centre in fulfilling the support roles to the region and MOE responsibilities. In addition, reported build up of problems with co-ordination at all levels is now a major concern.

Top-down management of the Environmental Committees at the TTI's visited made up of the Director and Senior teaching staff did not appear to promote active participation from student teachers. Of major concern at Nazareth TTI was the absence of the environmental co-ordinator who had been transferred to teach biology at a high school. However, we were impressed with the activities at Awasa TTI (an original pilot centre) where environmental activities were becoming successful income generating sources. We were unsure though that networks with the communities to exchange experiences and promote environmental education had been effectively set-up.

The programme has been heavily reliant upon external advisors from the early development through to recent activities. There is a major concern that the Environmental programme suffers from a dependency problem at the centre in terms of funding and advisor input which raises questions concerning long term sustainability of the programme.

4.1. SUMMARY

The early years of the EEP have been effective in raising the awareness of students, teachers and communities on environmental issues through a variety of transfer mechanisms⁴⁰. The provision of information and resource material at all levels and the establishment of Environmental Clubs were obvious successes at the beginning although there is now a concern that the environmental clubs (in the regions visited) are less active as funds were not forthcoming from the region.

It is evident that the pilot schools and TTI's have benefited greatly in different degrees from environmental projects concerned with forestation, tree planting to the creation of environmental resource centres at the TTI's. The potential of income-generating activities were well exploited in line with the Education Strategy paper at one TTI visited but was much less evident in the other TTI's. The potential for self-financing of these programmes is great since the successful tree planting projects at the TTI's yield high and regular incomes.

Although we had limited opportunity for field visits it is difficult to be as positive as the 1992 evaluation about the continued success and impact of the whole programme. There were obvious success stories in the visible and practical projects such as tree planting, but there were also signs of decline and neglect in these and other projects. It therefore becomes difficult to continue to endorse the very positive findings from the 1992 evaluation. The decline we believe is, in part, due to the transfer of many of those teachers who have a good understanding of environmental education through the efforts of the training programmes. However, we judged that the awareness of environment was wide spread but that the continued success of the projects are very much dependent upon the dynamics of the teachers and leaders who need to feel they have continual support from the regions and centre.

⁴⁰ MOE/Sida (September 1992): *Evaluation of the Environmental Education Project in Ethiopia. Final Report of a Joint Evaluation Team.*

5. AIDS/STD health education

The new economic development strategy is committed to family health care and recognises the urgent need for the health system to transform from a focus on curative to preventive health care strategies⁴¹. An important challenge for the health sector will be to complement its health service by promoting preventive measures through education. The Education and Training Policy though, does not specifically indicate the importance of AIDS/STD health education but, more generally health education is emphasised as an important focus of *basic education*⁴².

Aids/STD health education programmes began in March 1992 and have been supported by Sida and since 1994, through AIDSCAP-Ethiopia⁴³. The aims of the programme are to disseminate AIDS/STD information that will help in the prevention and control of HIV/STD transmission to secondary school children⁴⁴. The programme also aims to up-grade head teachers and educators skill and knowledge in developing and using material and how to organise activities at school level in conjunction with ICDR and to establish anti-aids clubs in senior secondary schools. Further, it aims to enhance student's skills to communicate health messages on AIDS to the community using a variety of means. The programme strategies specifically target the greater part of its activities at the secondary schools through the efforts of the Regional Education Bureaux's. Nevertheless, we have problems with matching the aims/objectives with appropriate operational strategies.

It would appear that the programmes are successful when they 'disseminate information' through the effectiveness of its information system but falls short in its efforts to 'train teachers in developing, facilitating activities and enhancing students' skills' because of the lack of attention to the teachers in the programme which has largely been neglected throughout the life of the programme⁴⁵. The programme would also appear to concentrate heavily on achieving widespread awareness of AIDS, but less so on sexually transmitted diseases (STD) and other related health problems which are to be part of the integrated curriculum.

During the early life of the programme (1992/1993) activities were directed at curricula changes and the establishment of school environmental clubs in senior secondary schools. 1993/1994 activities were divided into three major areas of support: regional staff training, material production and strengthening support to the schools and region.

⁴¹ Government of Ethiopia Economic Strategy (1994).

⁴² Transitional Government of Ethiopia (April 1994): *Education Policy & Strategy*. p. 26.

⁴³ USAID/AIDSCAP control programme in seventeen selected secondary schools operating in five regions (1,3,4,14 & SEPR). Approved budget for eighteen months is approximately 94,000 USD. Source: MOE interviews.

⁴⁴ The original target groups were junior secondary school children of grades 7-8. However, in the new primary structure, grades 7-8 are now incorporated into second cycle primary system (grades 5-8). There are therefore questions concerning re-definition of the target group and appropriateness of material to new curriculum's and recommended teaching methods.

⁴⁵ See various Plans of Operation and Quarterly Reports outlining programme objectives and activities. *Annual Plans of Action and Activity Plans* (1992/1993/1994/1995) & various *Sida/MOE Sector Reviews and Quarterly Reviews* (1992/1993/1994).

Whilst these activities address particular objectives of the programme there were no activities accomplished which addressed the need to target teachers for special training in AIDS/STD.

During 1994/1995, twenty six media and public relations experts selected from the Regional Education Bureaux's and from Educational Mass Media Agency attended 4 day orientation workshops at MOE in May. Commissioning and completion of Impact Study (June) and Needs Assessment Studies (September). Planned but not carried out was a workshop for 30 Regional participants to discuss outcomes of the two research reports. 100,000 leaflets, 20,000 booklets and 50,000 Newsletters were prepared and distributed to regions for secondary schools⁴⁶. All 31 pilot schools were reported to have established active anti-aids clubs.

There were no reported activities carried out (Annual report 1994/1995) which addressed the important objective to up-grade teachers and educators in appropriate teaching methods and resource development in order to bring about positive behavioural changes in the students. The section has also indicated that it intends to use resources from UNESCO⁴⁷ to produce a 'Life Skills Activity' student book for a 20,000 print run for distribution to the regions.

Traditional teaching methods reportedly dominate the classroom learning instead of ensuring problem oriented and experiential methods more appropriate to the stated objectives (and recommended in the Education Policy). This makes the neglect of specifically targeting teachers even more serious. New curriculum and resource materials have been prepared in conjunction with ICDR for the senior secondary pupils and issues such as sexually transmitted diseases in addition to aids are to be integrated with carrier subjects such as science and home economics.

The effects of the programme in both a national and regional perspective are difficult to judge. But, perhaps the greatest impact has been in successfully beginning a process of attitude forming at the school level which has been the major emphasis within the programme objectives. The major achievement is that through the different media approaches and school activities (see field notes) the programme is contributing to the effort made towards making the target group aware of the spread of aids. The high regional spending reflects the aim of communicating about Aids to the wider community although most activities seem to be centred at the schools (and not so much in the community) and therefore communities must rely on the anti-Aids clubs being active within the community⁴⁸.

5.1. SUMMARY

The major problems reported span across all levels from administration and implementation. School interest has been seen to be less and less effective, whilst the teachers are in need support teaching material, whilst many schools are not getting up-to-date mate-

⁴⁶ If we consider an equitable distribution to the regions based upon secondary school figures then there are eight students per leaflet.

⁴⁷ The material will be adopted from Uganda and Zimbabwe UNESCO programmes.

⁴⁸ A number of NGO's operate AIDS/STD information programmes at community levels (see later note).

rial. There are also reported lack of teaching materials at the school level and a lack of specifically trained teachers. The teachers also reported that their was also poor follow-up of the programme⁴⁹. In all regions visited we did not manage to contact the responsible officers either because of recent transfers or because of absence from duty.

Some good indicators as to the impact of the programme come from the recent impact study⁵⁰ and needs assessment study⁵¹ although caution must be made in generalising to other regions. Most students in the senior secondary schools sampled in the impact study were assessed to have adequate knowledge of the nature, spread and prevention of HIV/Aids virus. But, they were less knowledgeable about other sexually transmitted diseases and (worryingly) lack the behavioural change to control the spread of Aids⁵². However, the review team were unable to see the anti-aids clubs on the field visits but the study found that the sampled anti-aid clubs have not been as instrumental as expected in its awareness campaign⁵³.

Interestingly, of the different media approaches utilised in the programme the most effective were the radio and television programmes⁵⁴ which were more interesting and effective (they also perhaps reach relatively more appropriate target groups in the communities) than most formal teaching methods used in the classroom when working with the school curricula⁵⁵. This outcome gives a pointer to future strategies if the programme rationale remains the same, although the definition of target groups then becomes problematic. It would seem that the objective concerned with awareness can be achieved through the mass school campaign but that the more serious aim of prevention is more difficult to achieve because of the lack of broad success with anti-aids clubs and also less emphasis on training the teachers.

With this background, it should be questioned whether it remains appropriate or affordable to give continued support to a programme which continues to emphasises awareness concentrated at the secondary school level. Also, the programme fails to pay enough attention to the training and support to the teachers (a major objective and an important group) and does not effectively address other important objectives.

6. Non-formal Adult Education

The programme rationale and objectives are in accordance with current educational policy, according to which non-formal education will be provided parallel to formal education. Basic education will focus on literacy, numeracy, environment, agriculture,

⁴⁹ Ibid. p.

⁵⁰ The impact study sampled 929 students, 283 teachers, 31 head teachers and 54 anti-Aids club co-ordinators from 31 sample schools. The report sometimes generalises these results in its reporting.

⁵¹ ICDR/MOE (September 1995): *Needs Assessment on Aids Education for Ethiopian Primary Schools*. Addis Ababa.

⁵² A major aim of the programme is the prevention and control of HIV/STD transmission through dissemination of information and education.

⁵³ ICDR/MOE (June 1995): *Impacts of Aids/STD Education in Ethiopian Senior Secondary Schools*. Addis Ababa. p. 82.

⁵⁴ Ibid. p. iv.

⁵⁵ The impact study recommends that anti Aids organisations should used mixed media techniques for 'passing relevant messages in a continued and sustainable manner' p.84 op. cit.

crafts, home science, health services, and civics⁵⁶.

Given the present educational situation of very low participation rate for primary school and high drop out rates at all levels, the need for non-formal education cannot be underestimated. The Education and Training Policy aims to provide non-formal education in line with the needs, but mentions the impediment: within the "capacity of the country". Unfortunately the education capacity is very low. There are not enough resources, manpower, schools and educational materials etc. for formal education, and less for non-formal.

Adult non-formal education and literacy campaigns have been going on for many years as a development tool of the country. The Dergue conducted 24 rounds of literacy campaigns, which won much appraisal from abroad, but which were detested by the illiterates, because of the oppressive manner in which they were conducted, and the forced recruitment. The education of the Dergue time has been rejected and many schools and CSTCs were destroyed. Regional differences in utilising non-formal education are wide. For example, in Ogaden, only 151 adults participated in non-formal literacy education this year as compared to region 3, Amhara, where 146 457 adults participated. Region 4 is amongst the rather strong regions with a 28 per cent recruitment rate, against 23 per cent in Ethiopia at large. 52 646 adults participated in non-formal education in region 4. Out of those 36 232 were male and 16 413 were female.

Reshuffle of staff has effected non-formal programmes at Ministry level. In non-formal Adult Education bureau a staff of 150 was reduced to 4 persons constituting a Panel and their function is reduced to an advisory role.

Some training programs are conducted by the Ministry. A number of workshop were held in 1992 and concerned Management and Evaluation and technical services to regions. In 1994 workshops were conducted on curriculum development and the Ministry is about to print a manual on how to write textbooks for adult education, which is to be distributed to all regions, zones and woredas. Educational officers at Zonal and Woreda level are trained, but many seem to be new in office and the organisation structure seems to be lacking in budget, manpower and equipment. There are plans for textbook writing, but in most regions the old educational material is used. Members of the Team visited one CSTC near Nekemte, Region 4. It had been built in 1988 and was looted after the overthrow of the Dergue. Windows, doors, furniture, and tools were gone, and the houses were empty and in very poor condition. 85 CSTCs in this region were looted during the war ; 36 were operational, and 49 needed new tools.

The zonal office of Nekemte had managed to allocate 19,000 Birr for reconstruction, and the school this year offered 7 courses: How to produce mud blocks, Planting trees, Metal works, Animal fattening, Weaving, Designing clothes and Sowing. They had no student applications, except for the sowing group, where some 10 women were practising sowing clothes in thin paper (no cloth available), and practising needlework

⁵⁶ Learners can study in schools, or in Community Skills Training Centres (CSTCs), Basic Development Education Centres (BDECs) or Community Learning Centres (CLCs). Distant education for self study is also available.

on plastic flour bags. Lack of money for courses, suspicion from the locals and lack of need assessments and dialogue with participants are probably some reasons for this failure. Zonal Education officers in Nekemte (Region 4) stated that they had received 15 162 Birr from Sida for Non-formal adult education. With a staff of 23 Woreda Education Officers and Facilitators they claimed to have trained 9 418 adults 94/95. The quality of this training is unknown.

Plans in relation to budget seem to be ambitious but unrealistic. For example the Regional office of Awassa, Southern People's region had received 17 786 Birr from Sida. Plans are to employ and train 384 literacy trainers, open 96 centres and teach 24 000 adults. They must produce reading material in 9 languages, train 8 adult educational officers from zones and woredas, and give CSTCs 500 Birr each to help buy working tools. They plan to teach learners for 5 months during 6 terms, which will be 3 years up to the level of grade 4. Class size will be 45, two hours a day, and the cost per annum per student is 20 Birr, which is calculated by dividing the available sum with number of students. They asked MoE for 727 000 Birr for the production of educational material but did not receive any money. Monitoring and supervising of this enterprise will be carried out by Woreda, Zonal and Regional Education officers.

7. Textbook Production

The Ethiopian Educational Policy Implementation Strategy from October 1993, stated that the book to student ratio was 1/5. Also, it is stated that regarding the distribution of books, as well as the quality of them, "the preparation, printing and distribution will be expanded, and conditions will be facilitated"⁵⁷. The five year plan is to lower the book to student ratio to 1 to 3, and the twenty year plan is to reduce it to 1/1. In this sense, there is a strong rationale for the textbook production sub-programme.

The textbook production of Ethiopia is to a major extent performed by the Educational Materials Production and Distribution Agency (EMPDA). EMPDA is a parastatal, and it has 3 departments:

- Textbook department
- Technical department
- Educational material procurement & distribution department

The capacity of the EMPDA printing plant has substantially risen. In 1990, it was calculated to be approximately 1,5 million books per year⁵⁸, while 1994/95 they produced a total of 3,9 million books. EMPDA produces approximately 67 % of what the Ministry of Education orders them to produce (since the regionalisation, this demand emanates from the regions) and takes in tenders from private and other governmental printers on the remaining 33 % of total demand.

EMPDA is responsible for the printing of new books that correspond to the new curriculum, and they will produce the new books for two grades every year from 1995

⁵⁷ *Ethiopian Educational Policy Implementation Strategy*, October 1993, Ministry of Education, p. 30

⁵⁸ Executive summary, *The EMPDA Printing Plant, Capacity and Improved Efficiency*, April - June 1990, Esselte Print Consult AB, Sweden

onwards. In 1995, they produced all the new textbooks for grades 1 and 5 of the primary school from June until December 1995 and will continue with grades 2 and 6.

Sida has been supporting the EMPDA with paper, technical assistance, machinery, etc., since the beginning of this programme. This support, however, works as an inhibiting factor to a free market competition in Ethiopia, where, as mentioned above, there now are some private and government printing houses in operation. On the other hand, these are not yet fully-fledged publishing houses.

Since December 1995, the plant has produced 2.8 million books, and is planning for a total of 4.5 million copies until June 1996. The total production for 1995/96, including what is laid out on other printers, is planned to be 9.515 million books.

Factors that are inhibiting EMPDA from achieving their objectives are as follows:

- EMPDA has to produce books in approximately 15 languages, and sometimes the number of copies of one book is as low as 250. This makes it very hard to get cost-efficiency at the plant.
- Old machines, lack of spare parts and maintenance capacity.

According to the management of EMPDA, they no longer get any funding from the government. Before the regionalisation, they used to, but now the funding goes to the regions, who in their turn will order books from EMPDA and pay a service charge. EMPDA also provides the regions with training in different skills, such as how to produce camera-ready copies. If EMPDA has to prepare camera-ready copies for the regions, they charge for the service.

The management of the whole of EMPDA was changed in September 1994. The manager of the printing plant was expelled about one year ago, and the manager who replaced him has now been transferred to the Ministry of Education. Right now there is an acting manager of the printing plant. The team's overall assessment of the EMPDA is that they lack sufficient management capacity to be effective as one of the largest educational agencies. The importance of the central EMPDA plant, as the main source of experience and technical knowledge for the regions was heavily stressed by officials.

A recent report⁵⁹ recommends a variety of actions to be taken. According to the management of EMPDA, all recommendations have been implemented, except the total abandonment of ISO standard format of books. It is still not possible to arrive at the cost of producing one book is still not possible from the accounting system.

The relationship between the central EMPDA and the regions is:

- the regions order the books they want (to MoE, which then reports to EMPDA)
- EMPDA produces and distributes the number of books out to the regions
- EMPDA procures the printing services for the books which exceed their printing capacity
- EMPDA trains the regional representatives in different disciplines, mainly camera-ready copy, editorial skills and production skills.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

EMPDA is the major textbook producer in the country. It seems obvious that the support Sida has given has had an impact on the education sector. The size or quality of impact of Sida support is impossible for this mission to assess.

The reporting structure, where EMPDA does not get reports from the regions, but only from MoE, is not the most effective for the agency's market information. The agency should build up its own market information system in foreseeing the development of free markets in the country.

7.1 SUMMARY

The team would like to point out that the subsidising effect of the Sida paper support to the government printing plant is likely to distort the development of the free market for textbooks in Ethiopia. This factor must be considered in the planning of future support as the Ethiopian economic policy is for a market economy.

Considering the present situation with economic policy shifts in the country and the regionalisation process, we feel there is a golden opportunity to shift the sub-programme from textbook production to support to textbook provision⁶⁰. The provision of textbooks is a necessary component in an effort to support improved quality of primary education. In the future, this should be done by supporting the future providers of textbooks, i.e. the regions. Given that the EMPDA presently holds a certain amount of paper in stock, and given other donor support for paper procurement, there is a transitional period available for EMPDA to transform itself to market conditions and for the regions to build up capacity for textbook procurement on a market.

8. Instructional Equipment and Furniture Production

Sida has assisted in the development of alternative school furniture, partly because the conventional furniture is made from wood, a scarce resource in Ethiopia of today. Also, the transportation of ready-made furniture is demanding volume, so on-site production of furniture is preferable. Sida has also supported the production of so called science kits, boxes of materials, instruments and components to be used in the science education. This is in line with the Educational Strategy of Ethiopia states that "Regarding other education materials, the necessary organisational set up will be designed by which materials will be produced, distributed and properly utilised at each level."⁶¹

Both the furniture and science kits are produced by the EMPDA central plant, and furniture is also produced at 14 Production Units around the country. Initially, there were eight types of alternative furniture, today the number is three; adobe, concrete and

⁶⁰ By textbook provision is meant a set of ways of providing textbooks, but not necessarily the means of supporting production of textbooks. Another way for a foreign donor to support the provision of textbooks could, for example, be to support the regional governments to purchase their textbooks.

⁶¹ *Ethiopian Educational Policy Implementation Strategy*, October 1993, Ministry of Education, p. 30.

sheet metal furniture. However, the team found that the production of these alternative furniture only amounts to 2-3 % of the total production of the EMPDA furniture department. The remaining part is still conventional furniture, made from wood. Three years ago, conventional furniture reinforced with imported metal bars were chosen for mass production. Today, however, this type has been found to be too expensive, and the old type of all wood furniture is the most commonly produced.

The reasons for this reluctance to leave the conventional furniture emanate from problems with the alternative furniture:

- the sheet metal and the concrete furniture becomes very cold when the weather is cold, which is not healthy for the students
- the adobe furniture is not popular in the communities, it bears the stigma of poverty. Also, it needs frequent maintenance, which the communities in general are not prepared to provide.

The results achieved have been compiled from the Annual Reports, from which it may be seen that the targeted production of furniture and science kits has rarely been achieved. Concerning the science kits, a recent study⁶² on the utilisation of this equipment showed that only ca 5 % of the schools utilised the science kits. This is the responsibility of ICDR, who is responsible for popularising the science kits, which has not been done properly, according to the management of EMPDA.

According to the EMPDA some of the major factors inhibiting them from achieving their targets are as follows:

- the mismanagement of the former management
- the problems with the alternative furniture mentioned above have resulted in a greater demand for conventional furniture than for any alternative.
- constant delays of ordered materials.

The Sida planned and actual contribution to this sub-programme has been presented above (section D). The last disbursement made from Sida was made on September 20, 1994.

In a recent report⁶³, a question was asked with reference to approximately 2 million Birr which had been disbursed from Sida, but had not been accounted for or disbursed to the pilot schemes for alternative furniture. Subsequently, it has been explained that approximately 700,000 Birr were used for the construction of the display room, conducting a workshop, for fieldwork and for procurement of equipment & machinery. The remaining balance as of October 1995 is around 840.000 Birr which has already been committed for salaries.

The relationship between the EMPDA central production plant and the 14 Production Units in the regions is very loose. Basically the tasks for the central EMPDA furniture production plant are, apart from producing their part of the furniture, to

⁶² Quoted in the *Agreed Minutes* from the Joint Annual Education Sector Review, 1994

⁶³ Jörgen Pudeck and Björn Stillefors, December 1994

- serve the production units with maintenance
- arrange workshops on furniture production and procurement management
- distribute procured material
- allocate money

EMPDA does not, however, follow up on the use of the money allocated to the Production Units. The Production Units report to the REBs, who in turn report to the Ministry of Education. As in other education programmes, the regions do not report back to EMPDA, but to the Ministry of Education. This makes the management of the sub-programme an almost impossible task.

The Plans of Operations which outline demand and production figures are derived from the Ministry of Education. EMPDA is informed of target levels and which sort they shall produce in the coming year. If the amount surpasses that of the capacity of the EMPDA and the 14 Production Units, they take in tenders from private producers. The current production capacity, according to the EMPDA management, is:

- central furniture plant: furniture for 300-400 schools per year
- the 14 PUs: furniture for 150 -200 schools per year

The EMPDA claims that they are implementing the recommendations from the last report written on the furniture production⁶⁴. They mostly concern the production of alternative furniture production.

EMPDA also produce a substantial amount of furniture for NGOs such as World Vision and Action Aid. It would require a major study to investigate if this production takes resources from the Sida or IDA funds.

EMPDA effectiveness has improved since GoE funding has stopped. The result is that the workers work harder. They are aware of that if they do not produce, they will be out of work.

8.1 SUMMARY

The fact that the EMPDA plant is producing and charging other donors for furniture, while Sida money is used for salaries for six contract workers employed for alternative furniture making (840,000 Birr, manufacturing cost) together with a lack of cost consciousness does not auger well for continuing support to the EMPDA furniture production.

The way the support has been given during the old system should is not in line with the future economic policies in Ethiopia. Based on needs assessments, Sida could support provision of school furniture in terms that encourage market relations and commercial terms for the EMPDA.

⁶⁴ December 1994.

9. Primary School Construction and Maintenance

The Educational Strategy from which also treats the subject of overcrowded schools, as well as the insufficient status of the existing schools in the country, to the extent that some schools are even said to be hazardous to the health of the students.

It is also stated in the same document concerning school construction: "Those who are of age to get education shall have schools built for them by the government, the public, the individual, etc....."⁶⁵ and that in order to promote female participation in education, schools will be constructed near villages⁶⁶.

Also, with regard to educational quality, "to repair the existing schools and institutions so that they are convenient for teaching learning process"⁶⁷

The strategy clearly states that labour and monetary contributions of local communities for repairing and construction of schools is in accordance with the overall development plan.⁶⁸ In weak areas, however, the government has promised to finance the entire school construction.

The Ministry of Education stresses that school construction is one of the first priorities of the GoE in the Education sector, in line with the strive to increase the access to education for the people of Ethiopia.

Sida has been supporting school construction in Ethiopia for more than 25 years. During the past 3 years the sector reviews have criticised the lack of reporting on constructed schools. The team was aware of dissatisfaction with the type of schools that have been built in later years, the "chicka-schools", built from mud and wood. As with the adobe furniture, these schools are associated with the stigma of poverty, needing frequent maintenance, which has not been carried out, mainly due to the community dislike⁶⁹.

In contrast to chicka schools, the communities and authorities would prefer Sida to support solid construction schools.

The construction has been organised in such a way that Educational Institutes Construction and Maintenance Agency (EICMA) has been allocated money from the MoE, and has in its turn procured material and machinery internationally for the different regions. This material has been distributed out to the various regions, together with money for local procurement of material. In earlier days, EICMA was also the constructing body, but during the last years with regionalisation, they hold only an advisory and design role. EICMA has little control over whether the schools are actually constructed or not. As in all the sub-programmes, the regions no longer report to the central operative unit, in this case EICMA, but directly to MoE.

⁶⁵ *Ethiopian Educational Policy Implementation Strategy*, October 1993, Ministry of Education, p. 33

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 38

⁶⁷ *Ibid.* p. 39

⁶⁸ *Ibid.* p. 45

⁶⁹ Sources: interviews

The lack of reporting concerning construction of schools has led to Sida withholding all further disbursements. However, at the end of the fiscal year 92/93, Sida agreed to a "bridging" operation to facilitate the transportation of already procured material and the construction of 111 schools, a backlog from the 91/92 commitment. Sida requested monthly follow-up reports from EICMA on the progress of the bridging operation. Up to date, hardly any reporting has been submitted to Sida.

The achievements of the sub-programme cannot be determined from the annual reports: the reports fall very short in outlining whether the targets have been met or not. The number of "missing" Sida schools currently stands at 440.

The MoE and EICMA gives the war the blame for the non-achievement of this sub-programme. It is true, that schools were looted and destroyed during the war, and we do recognise the difficulties this must have posed for the management of the sub-programme.⁷⁰

As seen in section D, this sub-programme has only received 7,4 MSEK during the review period. However, the funds seem to be mostly to procurement of vehicles, an external advisor for a period of time and some training of staff of EICMA.

9.1 SUMMARY

EICMA will cease to exist as from January 1996. The staff will be transferred to different departments within MoE. The manager will be part of a unit which will prepare bid documents for school construction.

The impact of this sub-programme on education sector appears to have been substantial in the past. However, since the review period in particular, it has been lacking sufficient management in such a way that, judging from the reports, the impact may be considered to be negligible.

In the future, MoE will allocate funds directly to the regions, who will procure internationally and locally the material needed for construction of schools. The international procurement will be executed in close co-operation with the Procurement department of MoE. The EICMA management of today does not consider the expertise in the regions to be adequate for the process of constructing schools. However, there are private contractors that could be engaged. The problem with these are, though, that they in general are situated in Addis Ababa, and are quite reluctant to construct schools in the remote areas, according to EICMA.

10. Summary Review of the Support Programme

The reviews of the sub-programmes illustrate the variations and differences between the nine areas of support. They point at progress and weaknesses in the programming, implementation, monitoring and reporting of the programmes. This section is an effort to point at common features of the sub-programmes and in doing so arrive at a

⁷⁰ Some reports on this matter have been produced by the Ministry.

summary review of the education support programme as a whole.

Every common feature presented here is arrived at by the sub-programme review and discussions within the team. Some features represent important aspects of the programme, while others may be of less interest for future project identification. The brief format of the presentation should not be taken to signify lesser importance, however. Most readers of this report recognise the issues involved, which permits the Team to keep the text short, while just presenting the main pointers for the future project identification.

The sector support agreement identifies primary schooling and achieving UPE in addition to supporting the adult education system, together with general support to both of these through improvement of their quality and relevance. However, the specific support to primary education is through hard inputs, for example support to school construction, rehabilitation and maintenance, provision of furniture and production of textbooks whilst it is unclear how adult education is to be 'supported'. Further support is to increasing planning, research and information capacity of the Ministry. It is with this background that the present nine programmes are supported within the education sector.

All activities of the programmes have taken place under the same specific agreement, starting July 1, 1992, although the origin of most programmes is much earlier. This agreement states overall as well as specific objectives of the support to the education system in Ethiopia, which are not very operational. For example, the overall objectives of the specific agreement are at the level of description and include the key words to *support, assist and improve*. There is also a discontinuity between what is identified to support in the overall objectives and the targets of the Swedish support in the specific objectives. This causes fragmentation between the identified sub-sector support as they are defined and makes only tenuous links between the support disciplines. This is one of the reasons for the isolation of each sub-programme from each other because the education sector support programme has to be guided by the objectives of each sub-programme, specified in the annual plans. These objectives are generally loosely worded and are described at the level of activities, rather than objectives, which are linked to operational and achievement levels. As a consequence, they are short-term in nature.

The overall objectives for the Sida assisted programme and sub-programmes in Ethiopia are basically not in contradiction with the development needs (school construction, teacher education, text book production, etc.) Nevertheless, many of the projects have faced difficulties over the review period due to policy changes (regionalisation), lack of relevance and a lack of well thought-out and clear project objectives. In the school construction, the conditions under which they should be built were clear but the willingness to build local chika schools has dramatically waned whilst local community charges have increased, which places doubts over relevance and effectiveness of the project. A closer look at the support for the production of textbooks reveals a contradiction between the supply and demand side of producing textbooks. The head teachers project was a carry over programme and the conditions under which training would take place were never reviewed and its inappropriateness was not raised until very recently.

As may be deduced from the preceding paragraphs the education support programme consists of several vertical sub-programmes. The nine sub-programmes have no meaningful horizontal links and are isolated from each other. Little convergence is achieved at any level and then only by association, for example, curriculum and teachers.

The difficulties in incorporating capacity building aspects within the programmes are reflected in the origins of particular projects. With poorly written or no long term objectives, little or no in-built monitoring and problem oriented evaluation, and a lack of completion criteria has meant that some projects have been drifting on a continuous and unquestioned conveyor belt type of existence. There has been a gradual withdrawal for Swedish technical assistance in many of the sub-programmes and this has occurred at the same time of regionalisation and a weakening of capacity at the Ministry as well as the regions. We suggest that in some instances a lack of technical input and support at critical times has led to a decline in the operation of some of the sub-programmes. However, we also detect in some instances that a lack of dialogue between the sub-programme leaders and Sida has also led to the slow escalation of problems. Awareness of these problems are sometimes only made public at the sector reviews.

The current programmes are diverse in what they are trying to achieve. Whilst it is sometimes possible to measure the quantitative outputs (for example, 1,200 head teachers trained in summer course) many questions are left unanswered as to the qualitative outcomes of such training and at what price. This points to an overall design which goes beyond just establishing key indicators to compare actual achievements at various levels against the objectives. In the main, the programmes lack clear, realistic and achievable objectives and often fail to distinguish between objectives and the means of achieving them (activities). With activities instead of objectives, the monitoring and reporting of each sub-programme has to take place at activities level. No monitoring of objectives is possible, not to mention evaluation of impact. With the help of hindsight it can easily be observed that the sub-programmes have not been planned with the Logical Framework Approach in mind. In this respect, many of the sub-programmes once begun, appear to be part of a continuing process without end.

Monitoring and reporting are — therefore — carried out at activities level. In general the report writing is of low quality and lagging behind. At the time of writing the Draft of this report, the programme report for 1994/95 had not been delivered⁷¹. The progress reports of the sub-programmes in most cases do not correspond to the plans and budget lines. An effort to tabulate all the actual activities per sub-programme and year in relation to plans turned out to be a waste of time, because of the inadequate and missing information in many of the reports.

Meanwhile, Sida has started a process, together with consultants and the MoE, to improve reporting from the sector. Planning and reporting formats have been worked out, supplemented by guidelines for their use. This is a good starting point for future monitoring and reporting, but has of yet not led to consistent improvements in programme reporting. Concerning reporting, if success is to be met in these endeavours, then more support must be given to those collecting relevant data and writing the reports. Because

⁷¹ They were delivered to Sida during the sector review in January, 1996.

of regionalisation, there are additional levels of administration which have responsibility for reporting (vertical hierarchy in the administration process) on the programmes and therefore add additional levels of reporting dependency. The situation points to having much clearer and well defined plans of operation with a clear information base, in-built performance monitoring indicators and appropriate completion periods.

The support to the sub-programmes is used to finance hard ware procurement and recurrent cost. These items account for 30% and 36%, respectively, of the total costs. Technical assistance makes up 34% of the sub-programme costs⁷². As has been illustrated above, these overall figures overlook the fact that some sub-programmes consist of only recurrent cost items. The sustainability of these sub-programmes must therefore be considered to be basically non-existent as the MoE recurrent cost budget is consumed by personnel remuneration at more than 80%. It may therefore be questioned whether the present support programme has much to do with long-term development.

At present, the incapacity to absorb the support funds⁷³ has led to a *de facto* halt of the co-operation. No funds have been disbursed since July 1995. The conclusion is that something radical has to be done about the planning capacity at the MoE.

This being said, it should be added that the merger of the Swedish international development co-operation agencies in July 1995, also has contributed to reduced planning capacity in Sida during the year. The new programme for education development in Ethiopia must get proper attention from Sida at policy level and also be designed along with new and emerging policies of Sida. The introduction of the Logical Framework Approach for project cycle management is a reflection of the new budgeting system of the Swedish government. In order to fully benefit from the LFA tools the performance based budgeting should be attached to them. This implies that also international development programming should be based on performance rather than budgetary frames. Among the new policies of Sida the sector programme support policy just decided upon is important for future project design. Among the emerging policies concentration of projects and increasing application of time limits deserve mentioning.

In order to improve overall programme impact on long-term development, most of the above-mentioned factors need to be considered. As this effort will be made in a situation of a practical stand-still in the co-operation, this offers an opportunity to make a carefully planned restart of the education sector support. Unless a performance based revival of the co-operation is done, based on carefully designed projects, no further support should be given.

F. DONORS AND THE EDUCATION SECTOR

In order to present a background for the identification of future opportunities for Swedish support to the education sector in Ethiopia this section deals with a summary of donor activities.

⁷² During the seminar in Addis Abeba the golden rule for the share of recurrent costs was asked for. If one believes that assistance is problem solving — as Mikael Ståhl claimed —, the share should be zero or close to zero.

⁷³ As demonstrated in section D above

1. Donor Programmes and Strategies

The main donors and international development banks supporting the education sector of Ethiopia are listed in Appendix F. NGOs have not been included. The appendix is described in section F2. Here, we describe some of the main donor's programmes and strategies.

USAID

The main focus is on primary education, and the aim is "to help the primary system boost quality and enhance equity in an environment of expanding access"⁷⁴.

Representatives of USAID revealed concern about the financing of the sector. The enrolment rate of Ethiopia is currently 20-25 %⁷⁵. If all children were reached, this would mean that the system had to swallow 4 - 5 times the number of children of today. The GoE has stated that cost-sharing should be strived for, but the actual possibility of parents contributing to their children's education is often remote.

The USAID support programme to the education sector of Ethiopia is BESO, Basic Education System Overhaul. It employs a systems approach of working both from top-down and from bottom-up and they assume that GoE will play an active part. Also, the funding is not activity-tied, but rather result-tied.

USAID only works in regions 1 and 7 - 11 (SEPR), and their rationale for this choice was to work in regions where there is adequate infrastructure and surrounding, rather than in a "weak" region, where the basics are not present. Also a strong commitment from the region towards a development agenda, as opposed to a political agenda, and easy accessibility to the region were important criteria.

FINNIDA

FINNIDA has basically two programmes supporting the educational sector of Ethiopia. The first one is called PAT, (Preparatory Assistance Team), and is now reaching the end of its preparatory phase after 17 months (Dec. 31 1995). It has consisted of management training, non-formal education, technical and vocational education, book and paper support and library support. Phase I had a budget of 1 MUSD.

They are now entering Phase II of the PAT programme, which will cover 1996-99, with a programme budget of 4 MUSD. It will contain the following components:

- Training of teachers and teacher trainers and administrators
- Curriculum development assistance
- Capacity building of Educational Institutions and Material support.

FINNIDA has so far only worked in region 3, which according to the representative of

⁷⁴ *Basic Education System Overhaul (BESO) Executive summary, USAID,*

⁷⁵ *Ibid.*

PAT (a private consultant) was appointed to them by the Ministry of External Economic Cooperation. During Phase II they will also start to work in region 6, which is considered a weak region, so as to apply lessons learnt from region 3.

Apart from the PAT project, FINNIDA has also supported students wanting to go to a Finnish university for special education.

WORLD BANK

The World Bank's main support to the Education sector from 1988 to September 1996 is called IDA 7. Total funding was 76 MUSD.

The next support programme, which consequently will be called IDA 8, will most likely have a budget of 100 MUSD. However, it is not yet decided what period it will run.

The IDA is a very widespread programme; it covers primary, secondary, and higher education, with an emphasis on the latter. It also covers civil works, such as rehabilitation of schools, colleges, radio stations etc. Also, library development is supported. The only component in common with Sida's support is the construction and maintenance of schools as well as furnishing of schools.

The World Bank has, since 1994 been supporting a pilot study for the Ethiopian Social Rehabilitation Fund (ESRF) in Southern Shoa, Addis Abeba and Tigray, totalling MUSD 13. In terms of the education component the pilots have focused on support for the rehabilitation of primary schools, programmes in adult skills development and literacy training. The intention is to extend ESRF nationally as the ESRDF programme which will essentially be part of the Bank's Country Assistance Strategy to support the government's poverty reduction programme. It is also expected that the ESRDF will attract support from other donor agencies.

The ESRDF rational and policy is in line with Sida's new education policy and development co-operation as well as the government's efforts to cater for the needs of rural communities and deprived and isolated vulnerable groups of the communities, especially poor women. In respect of school construction and rehabilitation, the building programme will be available to all regions and be organised around the basis of the regionalisation structures. The programme supports sub-projects initiated by the communities and is therefore demand driven. It is likely that the education component will be slightly less than 10% at MUSD 22 of the total project costs (MUSD 240) for the projected five year period.

The European Commission

The EU have four sub-programmes in the education sector;

- Support to Ethiopian students in the former USSR, helping students to complete their studies.
- Integrated training programme; local training activities, study grants abroad, especially in agriculture, education and management. One of the problems faced is that

a relative large number of scholarship beneficiaries did not return to Ethiopia from Europe.

- Preparation of integrated training programme, with the priority areas: to improve the training and research capacity of selected colleges, faculties and institutes; manpower resources for the decentralisation process, and; training development and harmonisation for the private sector.
- Micro schemes, geared at increasing the agricultural production in rural areas.

2. Donor Funding

The donor funding is mapped out in Appendix D. Three classification criteria have been used; time, region and sub-sector within the educational sector. The tables are explained in the Appendix.

3. Donor Co-ordination

Even though there is a widely perceived need for improvement in aid co-ordination of the education programmes at the sector level little progress has been made. However, the current experience of the Education Discussion Group for Education (EDGE)⁷⁶ lead to some optimism, where to date, Sida has played a prominent role in co-ordinating these efforts to move towards a far greater coherent contribution to sector support through donor and government co-ordination. This is particularly important now that the new support agreement phase is imminent and it therefore should be possible to harmonise the planning processes between the government, Sida and other donors. In this way we see merit in the government being able to channel all donors' support to the sector through the identified sub-programmes.

Interestingly, many of the donor supported programmes reviewed in the above section, are paying much greater attention to policy framework and institutional support at both the centre and selective regions. But the decision to concentrate support at the regional level in itself creates tension between donors and with government departments. Even though these decision we were told are made through government consultations, a major effect has been to create a patchwork of duplication in rationale and activity in particular regions (see table: Sources of Financing to the Educational Sector). For example, a few programme policy documents explicitly target regions which have adequate infrastructures capable of supporting programmes. This strategy is also self selective, in that selection to 'strong regions' is partly determined by the identification of the existence of support infrastructures and not so much on a 'need factor'. If the donors look for substantial capacity at the regional levels as a partial pre-requisite for assistance, there is a danger that those regions that benefit most from support are not those in most need of international assistance.

There though surely must be questions raised as to the effect of seriously distorting the development patterns of the regions when some regions are targeted because of their

⁷⁶ The Edge meetings are regularly held informal meetings between bilateral and multilateral donor and government department representatives to discuss education issues. However, to date, The World Bank has been conspicuous because of its absence from the meetings.

ability to facilitate the programmes. Further questions must also be raised as to the effectiveness of duplicating programmes between regions when the infrastructures and needs are so diverse⁷⁷. In particular, it is important to acknowledge a recent warning when applied to regional efforts in that 'the availability of programme support does not encourage the unsustainable expansion of education systems, resulting in a serious deterioration of quality'⁷⁸. In this respect, there is a need for greater co-ordination to ensure a good match between the Ethiopian Education policy and programmes.

We see the move towards supporting the governments focus on *access and equity, quality and relevance* issues as a move towards a more successful co-ordination and complementary approach at the level of programme design. We would expect that effective sectoral co-ordinating at the Ministry of Education will relate the proposed Sida programme to other support programmes and to its own development spending. In this respect, we see support for national development of education where the benefits should be felt by all of Ethiopian people.

4. Moving towards future support

The general target is clear: to move towards greater programme sector support with well defined and achievable targets. The overall background to the present situation of fragmented and largely ineffective education programme is well understood. The major question is how to bring about the needed improvements. A number of avenues are recommended: increased programme development through improved research, capacity building and service delivery; improved donor co-ordination and reinforcement of Ministry and regional capacity and a major shift from project orientation to a programme approach focusing on agreed needs.

The programming of future support should further consider the following elements:

- A focus of objectives is needed: the projects should be guided and kept together by an overall programmes objective. The projects objectives should be outputs in the programme in the sense used in the Logical Framework Approach. The overall development objective should be tied to a long term commitment from Sida, which should be linked to a realistic time estimate. This could for example be a ten year commitment. During the long term programme implementation clear cut project objectives should be linked to time limits and performance monitoring.
- The preceding aspect requires that continuous monitoring systems are built into the projects. The monitoring should focus on the level of objectives, not activities. Internal monitoring could when necessary be combined with annual or semi-annual external monitoring teams who regularly follow a project from start to termination.
- The programme should not only be in harmony with Ethiopia's and Sida's education policies, but also in harmony with the Ethiopian strive for market reforms. The projects should be designed in such a way that market distortions are

⁷⁷ There are plans by the government with particular donors to replicate programmes to the 'weaker' regions.

⁷⁸ Penrose, P. (1993): *Planning and Financing Sustainable Education Systems in Sub-Saharan Africa*. Education Research Series, Serial No. 9. Overseas Development Administration. UK. p. 20.

- avoided.
- The programme should consciously combine impact on several levels, e.g. policy development, research, capacity building and service delivery.
 - Increased inputs of technical assistance by expertise supplied by long-term experts, short and long term consultants as well as institutions.

From the present low level of actual funding the future programme should be based on a graduated provision of funds, marked by triggering breakpoints in the form of conditions and time limits related to performance. The project inputs at the different stages should be timely in the process of development: currently capacity building is needed before service delivery can be effectively implemented.

Examples of such milestones for eligibility of increased funding are breakpoints to be identified along the following trends — developments over time — that must be established in order to achieve development impact:

- from plans to actual implementation
- from staff reshuffling to managerial and organisational stability
- from work overload to increased absorptive capacity
- from operational costs to long-term development inputs
- from donor caprice to co-ordination of donors

With respect to programme design, Sida should give more time for preparation and place more emphasis on the training components taking in institutional needs and capacities for support, seek closer and increased local participation early in the design. The best solution might be for the Ministry of Education to set out its priorities for institutional building within the identified interdependent programmes. For example, appropriate institutional support should be identified for curriculum development, teacher education and textbook development but with the important emphasis on co-operation between these institutions, the ministry and Sida to ensure a strong element of interdependence is established. In this way, these institutions can participate early in the development of all the programmes and, in particular, in those which are highly relevant to them.

It therefore is highly appropriate that the new identified programmes are much more focused and interdependent in their endeavours since this would drastically reduce the management aspect of the DCO and also that of the government and co-ordinator. Ways should also be pursued where other donors will participate in a holistic approach to institutional support and therefore encourage a move towards donor co-ordination.

G. PROGRAMME IDENTIFICATION

1. Introduction

A number of independent processes have contributed to the following section which outlines the overall framework and identified programme support. The first of these was through the many consultations and review mechanisms which led up to the review

of the Sida supported programmes. The second was the contribution emerging from the outcomes of a combined and lively workshop between all interested parties which has led to a review of this report and finally through continued discussions and negotiated consensus.

Sida's programme support during the last agreement period has been very much fragmented and very few linkages have been built into the sub-programmes. Historically, the support has been organised largely through a build-up of multiple and diverse projects. For example, the 1992/93-1993/94 specific agreement between the two governments for educational support span both the development of the primary and adult education systems, to assist in the quest for UPE in respect to primary education and improve the quality and relevance of this dual support.

In terms of primary education, the focus was on the continuation of support for school construction, rehabilitation and maintenance and the production of textbooks. The specific objective for adult education was through selective support of programmes. In addition, a further specific objective addressed increasing planning, research and information capacity of the Ministry of Education. Further programmes have either been continued from earlier agreements (for example, head teachers programme) or added to make up those programmes included in the review.

The sub-programmes reviewed have a number of major difficulties, spanning from original planning problems through to implementation, most of which are highlighted in a previous section⁷⁹. Any agreement for the continuation of the current programme support would need to address these multiplicity of problems in the sector (some of these, we believe are entrenched and therefore difficult to resolve). Further, any decision to continue with the existing programmes would also require re-orientation of the overall planning with the education sector as a whole.

In many instances, changes of directions in education policy have over taken the original programme design leading to a condition where programme rationales need to be adjusted to the current national policy. However, taking into account the many discussions and reviews undertaken, together with reflections on the wider practical constraints and developments in Ethiopia education, the general conclusions do not point to continuation of the programmes in their current design.

There is a strong case for introducing appropriate changes and reforms in order to enter into a new level of overall programme design. The danger of remaining with previous programme designs and practices is that any revised programme support will embody too many of the poor characteristics of the old programme to achieve its objective. As we have seen, the historical and nostalgic elements of the programme support are still a dominant factor, but these alone do not continue to justify programme support.

The section which follows, therefore, is an attempt at a new beginning (a fresh start) which aims to define the recommended change to the support process and programme focus within the education sector in order to set targets which can be more likely achieved. We also see this initiative as being highly appropriate given the present

⁷⁹ It should be remembered that this review is not an isolated report, but is part of a much wider macro and micro look at education in Ethiopia.

country education policies and reforms. The timing is also important, for this review and PIM has appeared during a period in which both the Ethiopian government and Sida have embarked on education policy reviews⁸⁰. These reviews set education strategies within the context of change during the 1990's which affect participation in education, its perceived relevance and likely outcomes.

In what follows, is an attempt to look at the future of programme support, rather than to try and restructure the past. The programme rationale takes into account the dynamics of change in Ethiopia which affect education and in particular responds to the needs to strengthen primary education through selective support of the government's declared interventions. However, we have been resolute in bearing in mind the lessons learnt from the past. In looking to the future we have relied very much on the government's education policies and strategies set in an overall framework of regionalisation and also (post review) the educational policies of Sida. It is here that the education new policies will be seen to complement each other in many respects.

2. Complementary Priorities and Policies of Sida

Both the education policy documents mentioned above have emerged with remarkably strong consensus in their focus on support to basic education linked to school and institutional levels. Furthermore, on a broad front, the emphasis on issues of Quality, Access, Equity and Relevance are also shared values. Although these policies have different origins (contextual for Ethiopia and globally for Sida) they both reinforce the connection between the national and sectoral dimensions of the policies.

The complimentary nature of Swedish development co-operation to that of the governments education policies and strategies are linked to improving the living conditions of poor groups and individuals. Support to education is an imperative in Sida's strategy for achieving this development objective. In line with the World Declaration on Education for All (Jomtien, 1990) and together with the overall objective of Swedish development co-operation (to improve the living conditions of poor groups and individuals in a sustainable way), Sida's development co-operation objectives for basic education are threefold:

- to support broad reform processes
- to raise the quality of education at the basic level, and
- to support the provision of basic education services for previously neglected groups and for people living in neglected geographical areas.

With a focus on basic education, Sida has two major objectives: *to contribute to the improvement of the quality of the basic education, (priority) and to improve the access to education*. Sida's new strategy is to focus more clearly on quality improvement through support to co-operation programmes where their design and analysis should include a classroom perspective and a focus on the learner and teacher as well as on the necessary

⁸⁰ See *Policy for Sida Co-operation in Basic Education and Education Reform* Education Division, Sida, January 1996. It is important to note that the main editors did not have access to this document when preparing the draft report and any consensus in strategy and support are unconnected.

supply side inputs. Stress is also placed on the equity aspect where particular attention should be paid to the special educational problems of girls.

3. Regionalisation and Ethiopian Government Education Policies

Regionalisation is the most recent, significant and momentous change in the education system of Ethiopia. The effects of the devolution are seen importantly in the broad spectrum of policy agendas⁸¹. Specifically, regionalisation has determined policy on language instruction, a move towards a transition of central ministry services to the regions where the education policies are implemented and progression towards consolidation of the federal system.

However, the regionalisation process is a complex mix of change, characterised by a prevailing but on-going flux situation relating to institutional, cultural, political and economic influences which the schools and other institutions have little control but, nevertheless, have to adapt. At the same time, the national education policies are characterised by a broad spectrum of changes effecting the provision of administrative reforms from the centre to the regions and importantly, linked to educational inputs which are wide sweeping and ambitious.

In respect to education services and regionalisation, Ethiopia is currently advancing towards a 'decentralised, efficient and professionally co-ordinated participatory system in respect to administration and management of the education system'⁸². The continuing declines in the school system though have been attributed, in part, to the regionalisation process which has effected the management skills at both centre and regions.

Whilst, the ministry has been depleted of much of its expertise, the regional and zonal management structures also remain in a state of flux as they are being established. All this is happening in a time which sees declining primary school enrolments and high drop-out and repetition rates especially for female students, continued use of double shift systems mostly in rural areas, great shortages of educational materials and large numbers of under trained and under qualified teachers and heads of schools⁸³.

In summary, the governments policies and interventions identify a range of priority areas, giving special attention to education at the primary level. For example, the policy changes effecting requirements for regional language bases, the emphasis on problem solving and practical skills in the primary and forthcoming teacher training curricula, and building the management and pedagogical capacities of various levels of the education system all heavily influence what goes on in the primary school classroom.

⁸¹ Much of what follows concerning policy and strategies relies heavily upon government publications cited in footnotes 2 and 4.

⁸² Transitional Government of Ethiopia (April 1994): *Education Policy and Strategy*. (p. 5).

⁸³ Gross and net enrolment ratios are 22.83 and 17.20 respectively, 26.5% of first grade students drop-out and close to 16% repeat grades. These figures represent some of the lowest in sub-Saharan Africa (ref. MOE *Basic Education Statistics*. Addis Ababa, July 1994). Whilst only 20% of school-age children (2.6 million) have access to primary education (Addis Zewer, July 1995 in *Press Digest*, July 1995). In 1993/94 female participation in primary schools was 38%.

However, lacking in much of the rhetoric is an acknowledgement that the effect of supporting primary education cannot be relied upon to be beneficial, without regard to the differences of poverty and disarray of primary schooling across the regions. Particular attention should therefore be paid to the needy social groups and geographical areas.

4. Focus of Primary Education Reform

There are strong government policy links to the current changes at the school and institutional level and these are to be promoted through the education policy which addresses three critical issues: *Access and Equity, Quality and Relevance*. In relation to improving the quality and relevance of education, these are addressed through curricula reform and increasing the availability of education resource material, research activities and teacher training programmes. In this respect, the government intends to build a combination of first cycle and second cycle primary schools and up-grade the old 1-6 schools to the 1-8 complete primary schools. New construction will be placed near to the communities in efforts to improve access in the more deprived and isolated communities.

These reforms are central to the sweeping educational reforms and is a major focus in the five year plan for primary education⁸⁴ Such factors will be achieved through the provision of much improved educational inputs to the primary school sector - assigning qualified, trained and motivated teachers, by improving access to and relevance of educational materials through the use of the revised and restructured curricula, textbook and teacher materials, by improving pedagogical capacities at woreda levels, and through improving the management and administration of human, material and financial resources.

Improving access, equity and increasing enrolment to primary education also features prominently in the policy and strategy statements. The main objectives are to improve access to basic education through increasing educational opportunities for all and ensuring equity in the distribution of educational facilities and opportunities by using cost-effective methods of school construction. In this respect, the government's policies towards constructing more schools in rural areas and bringing schools closer to the community are very important for improving *access and equity*, especially in disadvantaged rural areas where gross primary enrolment ratios among the regions ranges from 7% to over 80%. Similar differences exist among the zones and woredas within the same regions.

Serviceable school buildings⁸⁵ would appear to be very important for encouraging new entries into the school system but less so in keeping children in the school, particularly girls. Most of the factors behind high drop-out rates are beyond the control of the schools and teachers and do not seem to be significantly improved by having good quality school rooms, especially if there is little in the way of resources in them. What

⁸⁴ Ministry of Education (1994): *Short-Term Ethiopian Education Plan (1994/95-1998/99)*. Major Interventions with Focus on primary Education.

⁸⁵ School maintenance is seen as a major problem with little or no maintenance taking place. This is especially so because at present the responsibility falls on the school committees. See evaluation of EICMA by MEC & SIDA, page 27, 1992.

can be said is, that even though there are strong social benefits accruing from primary schooling, the demand for schooling in many of the regions and communities remains low.

Progress towards increasing access is being heavily impeded by the low demand in the system as well as insufficient opportunities to get to school, especially in the rural areas. Even though it is envisaged that at the end of the First Year Plan (1998/1999) participation at the primary level will reach 33.72%, current gross and net enrolment figures are very low (18.2% nationally for grades 1-6) and grade repetition and drop-out rates are very high and barely half the children who enter school complete⁸⁶. Although there are very great differences between and within rural and urban figures these results remain highly disappointing and place serious doubts about increasing broad enrolment when demand is declining.

In terms of improving *demand* for schooling, it is more likely that measures to improve the quality of schooling (processes of schooling) in existing schools, through selective educational inputs, will be more effective in increasing participation and retention rates and will better help to stimulate overall increased demand. There is much evidence which points to improved benefits of schooling when they are well resourced (this includes trained teachers) and when they are supported by a broader environment which is conducive to the needs of its students⁸⁷.

The lack of qualified and trained teachers at each level remains one of the serious problems of the educational system and has added dimensions within the current education reforms. The restructuring of primary schooling into two cycles⁸⁸ has meant new and different demands for the training of two distinct grades of teachers in line with the new primary school curricula. In the first instance, the policy means that there are suddenly extra demands for training general subject teachers at the lower end and subject specialists at the upper level of primary schools. Secondly, creating two levels is a critical move and has major implications for both pre-service and in-service training programmes. Thirdly, it places extra demands on increasing the capacities of existing teacher training institutes. Finally, it will require substantially more resources to this sector than was previously the case.

Further, the restructuring of the primary curricula and the emphasis placed on problem-solving and practical relevance will also require upgrading and importantly, reorienting the teaching skills of all teachers in both primary school cycles. Looking to the future, the demand for trained teachers will be critical if the aim to increase school enrolment figures to 80% participation in the next twenty years is to be met. The present disproportionate distribution of teachers colleges creates barriers to the regionalisation programme and training of the teachers. In this respect, the government intends to build

⁸⁶ MOE (1994): *Education Statistics: Annual Abstract 1986*. Addis Ababa, MOE. February 1995. p.7.

⁸⁷ See for example; Hill & King (1991), Lockheed & Verspoor (1990, esp. Ch. 3), Colclough & Lewin (1993).

⁸⁸ Primary schooling has been extended from grades 1-6 (ages 7-12) to two cycles: basic primary or first cycle, grades 1-4 and general primary or second cycle, grades 5-8 (ages 7-14). There are approx. 13,000 teachers in need of further professional training and a further 6,000 teachers drawn from the secondary system who need up-grading to be able to teach at grade 5-8 levels. Therefore, there are nearly 19,000 under-qualified and un-trained teachers currently working in the primary system.

three new colleges in Afar, Oromia and SEPA regions and up-grade four TTI's to accommodate training of the new 5-8 primary school teachers.

One of the most pressing needs consistently expressed is for more textbooks at the school level. In this respect, reducing the student to textbook ratio is a central element of the government's educational policy. Although there is little accurate information on the student to textbook ratios, estimates suggest national figures of one book for every five students. However, there are some subjects for which there are no available textbooks and there exists very great differences in textbook availability at the regional and school level.

The government recognises that increasing the availability and quality of primary school textbooks for teachers and students has a strong influence on how and what students learn. A major side effect of this policy would also seem to suggest that adequate supplies of learning materials are a strong influence on reducing drop-out rates from schools. Selective and flexible ways of supporting the provision of more and better teaching materials, and quality textbooks in particular are therefore critically important to meeting the government's strategies for improving the quality of primary education.

In summary, there is a strong sense that now is the time to act and support government initiatives whilst there remains a growing momentum and structural changes to the system⁸⁹. The educational inputs which promote the government's quest for improvements in *Access and Equity, Quality and Relevance* have been outlined through support to *school construction, maintenance and rehabilitation*, improving in-service and pre-service teacher training, wider distribution of instructional materials as key ingredients in learning and the development of quality curricula for primary education.

If success is to be met in these endeavours, it will need an efficient and disciplined approach to programme management and policy implementation on the part of the government and Sida. The immediate concern for Sida must be how to maintain, improve and re-inforce the more positive outcomes of the change mechanisms put in place by the government whilst fulfilling Sida's social, democratic and humanitarian policies.

5. Recommended Overall Strategies for Sida Support

Much has changed in Ethiopia since the beginning of the current agreement period between Sida and the Ethiopian government⁹⁰. In the light of these profound changes which have taken place in government policies, restructuring and strategies now largely in place, and in consideration of the future Sida development policy, we have outlined a framework for a new orientation towards programme support for the education sector that will complement national efforts in primary education.

In support to education, a major expectation is that reform and progress through regionalisation of services will help improve the quality and relevance of primary education in a coherent, sustainable and equitable way. The proposed support encompasses

⁸⁹ See for example, Noonan, R. (1995): *Desk Study of the Education Sector*, Sida, p.45 and USAID,(1994): *Basic Education System Overhaul* p.1.

⁹⁰ The agreement period is from July 1992 to June 1996.

the government's declared policies, priority actions and reforms. We see the immediate need therefore to support the government in trying *to improve demand for schooling and restore confidence in the educational system as a whole*. In view of this urgency, we envisage support of selected educational inputs *by focusing on quality and relevance of primary schooling*. Strategies to support the government reform would be in the form of

- (a) improving the quality and relevance through selective, efficient and effective educational inputs and
- (b) improving the capacity of major providers at the centre and regions.

The overall support strategy will therefore seek to accomplish the following:

- (a) improve the overall conditions for effective and efficient use of external resources;
- (b) be broad based to incorporate several interrelated priority components;
- (c) relate to achieving agreed target, performance and benchmark levels within realistic time frames;
- (d) operate within and strengthen the administration and control of the centre and regional government management structures;
- (e) move towards the improved provision for donor co-ordination as a vehicle for the government;
- (f) be consistent with the needs expressed at central, regional and other levels in alleviating the problems of the sector;
- (g) strengthen accountability and efficiency of programme performance through access to monitoring and auditing.

Consultations and consensus building at centre, region and local levels will therefore be a priority and fundamental to this strategy. The above strategies will be implemented through the framework of support outlined below, but this must remain tentative until further discussion and research is carried out before implementing the recommended programme support.

6. Sector Programme Support

The sector programme support is a natural outcome of the present sub-programme review and analysis of other support material, where we have built upon the experiences gained and the lessons learnt from the review⁹¹. We have confidence that the proposals will lay the foundation for a much improved coherent, long term policy and a greater focus for programme support which are consistent with the needs expressed by Sida 'to focus on a smaller number of sub-programmes' and importantly, through consideration of the government priorities and the needs of the education sector.

Responding to this challenge, firstly we have proposed a move towards graduated and interdependent sector programme support package which aims at improving the overall way in which Sida support will become more effective and efficient in the education sector. In this respect, it is the intention to support sustainable developments and re-

⁹¹ See list of documents referred to in the review and persons met.

forms within a limited number of sub-programmes based upon the Ethiopian Policy and Strategies for education.

Close attention should also be paid to programme design in terms of rationales, achievable objectives, levels of capital investments and recurrent costs of both the government and Sida funding. The overall sector programme will aim at providing umbrella type support for decentralisation, strengthening the progress from centre to regionalisation through to sector and implementor levels.

7. Graduated Support and Preparatory Phase

We have proposed a graduated and phased approach to programme support for both policy and institutional reforms which will boost quality and relevance of the primary education sector at regional and school levels.

Experience from the review of the current Sida programmes reveals that most have been overtaken by reconstruction and reform of regional policies, since their inception. In this connection, the new programmes recommended for Sida support can be made more relevant and effective by being designed and implemented within the new structures of the Ethiopian and Swedish assistance agreement.

The framework for sector programme support would be structured along a sequence of benchmarks or milestones. As pointed out below, these would need to be agreed at a very early stage. There are a number of important decisions to be taken by the government relating to the support to the identified sub-programmes in the new agreement. Although this review has identified those programmes, it has not sought to make specific recommendations, for example, on levels of funding, or the overall framework for sector programming. These all need to be established at an early stage.

The first phase would concentrate on preparing the groundwork for what needs to be done, identifying particular programme requirements and preparing the programme outline and strategies. As the programme begins to take shape and focuses upon agreed issues, a number of integrated technical studies would take place to establish the ground work and if necessary appropriate technical assistance would be included. These might include:

— Teacher Education Study

The objective of the study is, in the absence of comprehensive studies on teacher education and training, to bring together up-to-date information on pre-service and in-service teacher education, in order to provide the base of analysis for integrated strategy for in-service methods. It would be hoped that such a study would lead to measures to improve teacher quality, within the budget constraints.

— Educational Inputs Study

The objective of the study would be to establish the effectiveness and relevance of education inputs which can be effective in the different learning contexts. In this

respect it might be possible to identify appropriate and effective methods of textbook provision (taking in the private sector), and learning and teaching resource material, taking into account the recent curriculum study.

— Private Sector Study

Taking into account the nature of the past diversified Sida supported sub programmes (non-formal and adult education, environment, AIDS/STD etc.) and the apparent private sector education capacity, this study is designed to provide comprehensive information on the role of the private sector and the provision of education. There are close links with the above study, but the study will specifically analyse the roles and capacities within the private sector to support education and identify relevant ways of improving educational inputs. The study will be used to identify the sub-programmes and areas to be supported in the sector programme support.

8. Technical Assistance

In respect to the major outcomes of the programme reviews, we propose that technical support will be vital where capacity building is a major objective of the sub-programme. However, we acknowledge that there have been cases of low effectiveness and dependency of long term technical assistance in previous sub-programmes and therefore the form of technical assistance for any recommended sub-programme should be carefully defined.

The adoption of sector programme support, whilst simplifying the management of the programme, but often requiring more institutional competence than the existing project approach, where it requires strengthening capacities to define sectoral strategies, priorities and programmes in addition to improved project planning, monitoring and reporting. The government's responsibility and involvement in the preparation are therefore seen as essential and this will be reinforced by efforts to strengthen institutional capacity in Ethiopia.

Wherever possible technical support would, in the main, take the form of multi institutional-institutional linkages. These would involve relevant Ethiopian institutions and personnel and overseas institutions whose academic profiles are in general, complementary. The aim of institutional linkages would be to help capacity building through a mutual benefit exchange of experiences.

However, we would also see the place for short-term and long term consultancies in specialised areas where these are more appropriate, for example in programme start-up where a long-term advisor can help the ministry plan and co-ordinate the various Sida inputs. In general though, in most cases we would see institutional and short term consultancies as being most effective and important. In addition, we also see support to strengthening of administration and control of the programme activities (institutional capacity building) as being essential at both central and regional levels. The government's responsibility and involvement in the preparation are seen as essential and this will be reinforced by efforts to strengthen institutional capacity in Ethiopia.

9. Programme Benchmarks and Performance Indicators

Strategies for attainment of performance levels and benchmarks should be built-in for each of the sub-programme objectives, though at this stage of development these should be viewed as very tentative in that they illustrate the sort of performance indicators which might relate to each programme. Much more work is required in finalising the indicators, benchmarks and monitoring instruments and this should be established through immediate sector studies. The series of benchmarks and targets would have to be achieved in a timely way.

We would expect the benchmarks and indicators to be negotiated at a later date when the overall support programme is presented and also be in line with Sida's current requirements for monitoring, performance indicators and annual reviews. There would be reports of progress at each milestone whilst we expect there also to be incentives for achievements of targets through quick disbursements of funds to the programme and every third year the need for in-depth analysis of their impact in relation to the sector objectives.

10. Recommendations for Sector Programme Support

A critical factor in improving the quality and relevance of primary education will be the provision of programme assistance aimed at providing the necessary technical support at all levels for effective and efficient implementation. We also see a real and progressive move away from supporting operational costs towards long term development and attaching importance to supplementary investment in local research activities, and with appropriate institutional support through technical assistance for capacity building.

The overall aim of the proposed support programme will be to Improve the Quality and Relevance of Primary Education in Ethiopia⁹². The Sida support programme should be national in line with Ethiopian policy. Three key areas or sub-programmes are identified:

1. Support for the improvement of the quality and provision of qualified and trained primary school teachers through in-service training methods.
2. Increased effectiveness and relevance of learning and teaching inputs through support for curriculum planning, research and educational material development.
3. The closely linked provision, availability and logistics of supplying textbooks, and teaching and learning resources.

These three interdependent sub-programmes will quite naturally be supported at all levels of the primary school system: central to regional to zone to woreda levels and to the schools.

⁹² Interestingly, this is also one of three overall objectives stated in the *Specific Agreement Between The Government of Sweden and the Transitional Government of Ethiopia on Education Support 1992/93-1993/94*.

We also strongly recommend that programmes should be national programmes and that by their selection, quite naturally relate to national targets and needs. It would be an essential condition that Sida funding be seen and used in combination with government funding. In this respect, the programmes would to a large degree be aimed to fit into the government's regional and economic policies. In terms of funding levels, we envisage much greater funding over the long term support in what are recognised as priority components for support (see figure below) which will reflect Sida's "fresh start" to continued commitment to the government's efforts in improving the quality and relevance of education for all its people.

The new education and training policy has promoted two cycles of primary education which places new demands on the training of all levels of primary school teachers. To meet this challenge and improve the quality, relevance and accessibility of in-service teacher training methods the support will necessarily include both up-grading and professional components supported by mixed method approaches.

By the end of the support period it is hoped that there will be a strengthened and systematic in-service training programme with effective teacher's resource centres in operation which is integrated with the functions of in-service teacher training. Distance education will be a major component in conjunction with 'close to school' support mechanisms and will also facilitate greater access and equity for participation in training activities for female teachers already in service at primary schools.

With the new policy of regionalisation and decentralisation, Teacher Training Institutions (TTI's) will have more autonomy and responsibility for the training function of teachers and will necessarily be a major focus within the sector programme support. Therefore, we would see support for the TTI tutors as essential. Also we see comprehensive support for the new woreda pedagogical centres as being a natural site for teacher resource centres and school clustering strategies.

Two other sub-programme areas are to be supported but through a more disciplined approach to project identification. *Firstly, we have made special provision for programmes which address the equity and access priorities of government policy.* This might include identification of special needs for school construction and rehabilitation. One observed local effect has been the increasing local costs for school construction which the previous support programme was attempting to alleviate. We have been influenced here by the potential contribution to school building and rehabilitation programme of the ESRDF (see earlier section on World Bank) in which Sida is a likely funding partner and therefore its role in school building is maintained through co-ordinated donor input.

Only where a strategic objective needs to be attained (such as real need in a weaker region as a means of retaining teachers, greatly improving access for school children, especially females or improving quality support) should Sida support capital assistance to school construction. This support would be of limited scale, and would be seen as a component of wider co-ordinated assistance within the programme aim (donor-government co-ordination) and involving complementary support of other donors and government programmes. Therefore, we propose a much more focused approach to this sub-programme whereby support will be through well defined needs.

The final identified sub-programme addresses important support for the *private sector* in line with the governments plans for economic development. We envisage that this sector should include, in part support for non-formal education programmes which conform to the governments policy of increasing access to basic education, including local community needs through the flexible use of schools and institutions.

Referring back to the first paragraph of this section, we would like to suggest that the new programme be designed in such a way that there is a conscious balance between research, policy, capacity building and service delivery. The balance should be worked out in relation to the overall objective of the programme and the sequencing of outputs. The following chart illustrates the dimensions of this analysis.

| Components | Sub-programmes | | | | |
|-------------------|----------------|----------|-----------|-------------|----------------|
| | Curriculum | Teachers | Textbooks | Needy areas | Private sector |
| Research | ***** | | | | |
| Policy | ***** | | | | |
| Capacity building | **** | ***** | | | *** |
| Service delivery | | | ***** | ***** | *** |

In our view, the new programme could very well be centred around a core of capacity building at the Ministry (at all levels), where leadership and management would be vested. This should benefit from research supporting policy studies and policy development and over time lead to increasing emphasis on effective service delivery components.

The new programme should be designed with the help of a tool like Logical Framework Approach or similar. This implies that the new programme should be guided by one overall objective. This overall objective should be the guiding principle for the design of the sub-programmes in such a way that the objectives of the sub-programmes become outputs in the programme design (in the Logical Framework sense).

This way of designing the sector programme will ensure that there is convergence on the objectives level between the sub-programmes and will hence necessitate an operational convergence in terms of management of the programme and linkages between sub-programme implementation. Another important result for Sida's management of the co-operation is that management should be done at the objectives level and nowhere else. This will reduce the administrative burden of Sida and therefore make possible a more pro-active role of Sida in the co-operation management.

H. LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Sida support to the education sector in Ethiopia has a long and varied history. The current agreement on Swedish support has spanned the last four year and is a large multi-project with ambitious programme goals. In commenting on the programme support and sub-programmes, it is necessary to be aware of the historical back-ground and acknowledge the major policy changes that have taken place. Despite concerted efforts by government and considerable donor support, modern education in Ethiopia is one of

the most underdeveloped education systems in the world.

Over the last few years, the effects of implementing structural adjustments programme and a major reorientation of the sector to a transition towards regionalisation and decentralisation have affected virtually every aspect of education, from language of learning to administration and management of services. At the same time, major education policy directives have been introduced pointing the way to a new future for education. Sida has also undergone change cumulating in a new organisation and policies which are very much oriented towards sector programme support.

It may be concluded from the previous pages that a new start is needed for the Sida support to the education sector in Ethiopia. This is why we think that a new agreement starting July 1996 is not only an opportunity for renewal, but also a necessity in order to avoid moving past problems into the new co-operation.

We have identified the areas to which Sida support should be given according to our analysis. Our first recommendation is to adopt a new programme based on those support areas. In doing the identification, we have also outlined in what ways the support could be up-dated in terms of management, monitoring and reporting. This ought to be reflected in the new agreement.

Comparing the disbursements figures from 1992/93, 1993/94 and 1994/95 two main observations may be made. One is that the regionalisation is clearly seen in the changes from 92/93 to 94/95 by increasing distribution of funds from the centre to the regions. This is one main issue for the future support. The second observation is that 1995/96 may be seen as a year of opportunity for changes due to the low level of activities. Therefore, this year should be seized as an opportunity to work out a new programme where both parties have agreed on a graduated provision of funds, whereby funds increase over time and the distribution to regions increase over time as well. The rate of change would be dependent on progress.

Using the assumptions below and following our recommendations as to priority areas for support, our main ideas about the development of the future co-operation in the timing and changes could be broadly illustrated by the following chart.

| 1996/97 | | 1997/98 | | 1998/99 | | New Programme Support |
|---------|--------|---------|--------|---------|--------|--|
| Centre | Region | Centre | Region | Centre | Region | |
| *** | *** | **** | ***** | **** | ***** | Curriculum Development/Research Teachers training Textbook provision |
| ** | ***** | ** | ***** | ** | ***** | |
| | ***** | | ***** | | ***** | |
| | ** | | *** | | **** | Other support by need Private sector participation |

The programming of the new co-operation falls outside the scope of the present study, but we believe that the following assumptions must be included in the analysis. Some of them could be given the status of break-points in the graduated support, others could be important external factors in the programme design.

Major Assumptions

- * Political stability at all levels and regions.
- * Regional budgeting is secure.
- * Trained manpower is well established at centre and regions.
- * Stability of regionalisation through co-operation.
- * Donor co-ordination implemented.
- * Participatory support from all levels of administration and communities.
- * Capital investment for construction/rehabilitation of schools and TTI's is met through other donors and government.
- * Co-operation and co-ordination between centre and regions.
- * Sustained political and macro-economic stability through growing economic and development.
- * Continued political and economic support from Sida.

Sub-Programme Assumptions

- * Establishment of relevant curricula for teacher training and head teachers.
- * Support for keeping trained staff in their respective roles from centre and regions.
- * Strong inter-dependence and support across education and other sectors.
- * Strong local ownership of sub-programme.
- * Effectiveness of technical assistance.
- * Effective reporting, planning and co-ordinating capacity at centre and regions.
- * Programme addresses real needs of target groups.
- * Active participation of communities, teachers etc. in programme design and implementation.
- * Gender and equity issues are addressed.
- * Disciplined monitoring and reporting activities at all levels.

I. APPENDICES

A. Terms of Reference

TERMS OF REFERENCE

Combined Review of the Sida support to the education sector in Ethiopia, Agreement Period 1992-07-01 - to date, and Project Identification Mission for the period beginning 1996-07-01

1. Background

Ethiopia is currently undergoing structural adjustments and administrative changes which are affecting all sectors. These changes are not only adjustments in the existing system but also its regionalisation and decentralisation. At the same time, the Government of Ethiopia has formulated an Education and Training Policy, and Education Sector Strategy, a draft Master Plan for Education (20 years perspective) and a Short-Term Education Plan (1994/95 - 1998/99).

Sida is also undergoing a period of change. Several Swedish government agencies for development aid have been amalgamated into a new organisation, the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Sida. This opens up the possibility for varied types of support within sector programmes. New policies are being formulated, for example for poverty alleviation, and a review of all programmes is being carried out with the aim of increasing the focus on key problems and reducing the total number of programmes. A new guidelines for education support is in the final stages of preparation.

Sida has been supporting the education sector in Ethiopia for many years. It has been the leading bilateral donor supporting the Ethiopian Government's effort to provide quality education through both the formal and non-formal approaches. The World Bank has also been an important financier of the development of formal education. Since the Jomtien Conference on Education for All, a number of bilateral donors have increased their support to basic education. In Ethiopia, this can be seen in the increasing number of bilateral donors active in the education sector. The most important of these is USAID.

Despite the Ethiopia Government's interest in providing education and donors willingness to support education, there are critical problems of both access and quality in Ethiopian education. The gross enrolment rate is very low, around 22 percent. There are wide disparities between regions, urban/rural areas, population groups and there are gender disparities. There are many untrained teachers in the system and the supply of basic teaching materials is problematic. The infrastructure for education needs rehabilitating and expanding. The education system is also seen as failing to

respond to basic learning needs in relation to practical skills required for everyday life.

Despite these problems, the next few years can be seen as a period of opportunity for Ethiopian education. For example, with low enrolments, this is an ideal time to provide in-service training for teachers. The decentralisation of responsibility for education opens the way for locally appropriate solutions to problems of educational quality, and the new language policy for education, given sufficient support, can be the basis for improved quality of education.

The present specific agreement between the Governments of Ethiopia and Sweden on support to the Education Sector has, due to slow implementation and utilisation of allocated funds, been extended till June 30, 1996.

The sub-programmes included in the current agreement are:

- Education Planning and Information (EMIS)
- Curriculum Development and Research
- Teacher In-Service Training
- Environmental Education
- AIDS/STD health Education
- Non-formal/Adult Education
- Textbook Production
- Instructional Equipment and Furniture Production
- Primary School Construction and Maintenance

During the next agreement period, the Sida support to education in Ethiopia needs to be adjusted in order to take advantage of the opportunities which arise during a period of transition. The new education support programme needs to take cognizance of Ethiopia's new education policy and strategies and macro economic and political reforms. It has therefore been agreed by the Ministry of Education and Sida to review the Sida support to date, with a concentration on the current agreement period, and to carry out a project identification mission for the next agreement period.

2. Objectives of the combined review and project identification mission (PIM)

As a first step in the preparations for the new agreement period, a desk study has been carried out on the education sector, based on studies and reports on Ethiopia which have been written since 1991*. It is therefore not the intention that the Review/PIM team shall make a new description of the sector but that the new study will concentrate on a review of the present cooperation and the identification of possible areas for a new Sida support to Ethiopian education.

* Hifab/Interscience "Desk Study of the Education Sector in Ethiopia" May 1995. A consultancy report to Ministry of Education, Ethiopia, and Sida.

The main objectives for the Review/PIM are therefore twofold:

- a. to review the programmes supported by Sida in the current education agreement period, analysing their appropriateness to present circumstances in Ethiopia, and the progress and problems experienced in their implementation, and
- b. to identify those areas of education which are most appropriate for Swedish-Ethiopian cooperation in the new agreement period, taking into due consideration the respective policies for education of the Government of Ethiopia and Sida.

3. Tasks

The consultancy team will be expected to carry out the following tasks:

- to review, in relation to the specific sub-programme objectives, the progress and problems of the sub-programmes of the Ethiopia-Swedish (Sida) cooperation in education, during the current agreement period,
- to review the recommendations of earlier studies and evaluations of Sida-supported programmes**, and assess the extent to which these recommendations have been implemented,
- to assess the appropriateness of current programmes to the new Ethiopian education and training policy and the new administrative structures for Ethiopian Education,
- to provide recommendations for sub-sectors to be considered for inclusion in the Ethio-Swedish (Sida) cooperation in the field of education, taking into account the need for Sida to focus on a smaller number of sub-programmes than at present, and taking into consideration the question of concentration to central level / regional level programmes. Alternative proposals may be made.

** evaluations made in the last five years include:

- external evaluation of school buildings construction and maintenance programme
- External evaluation of instructional materials (not textbooks)
- Internal evaluation of school furniture
- Internal and External evaluations of the environmental education pilot project
- External evaluation of teacher in-service training (old report, ca 1987) and head teacher training
- various reports on the Educational Materials Production and Distribution Agency (EMPDA)
- EMIS - various reports

4. Method of Work

The consultancy team will work in close cooperation with the Ministry of Education, Ethiopia, and Sida.

Previous reviews and evaluations of Sida supported programmes should be analysed, including the Desk Study of Education in Ethiopia (Hifab, 1995)

The consultancy team shall maintain contact with a concurrent review of curriculum development which to be carried out starting October 1995 and is due to be finalised by December ,1995.

Sida staff who have been/are involved in the support to Ethiopian education should be interviewed in both Stockholm and Addis Ababa.

Ministry of Education staff should be interviewed in Addis Ababa as should the education staff in a number of regions, including Region 3, both at regional, zonal and local (woreda) levels.

Field visits should be made to education offices at different levels of the system as well as to schools and adult education centres, both urban and rural.

The total financial situation of education should be included in the analysis, including the contributions of other donors and development banks, as far as it is seen as being relevant to the review and to the proposals for the new programme.

5. The Evaluation Team

The evaluation team will consist of two internationally recruited consultants and two national/local consultants. The consultants shall have experience of similar education programme reviews and/or project identification missions. One of the consultants should be a development economist (be the team-leader) and the other a general educationalist. At least one of the two international consultants should have knowledge about Ethiopia and Sida.

The Ministry of Education PPD will provide a coordinator for the study who will work in close cooperation with the team and take responsibility for all practical arrangements including field trips.

6. Time Plan

The evaluation will start in the beginning of November 1995 and will include 4 weeks of field work in Ethiopia for the two international consultants and two weeks for preparation and final report writing. A total number of six weeks.

The Ethiopian consultants will work for 4 weeks in Ethiopia, three weeks together with the international consultants and one week collecting material prior to the fieldwork.

The report shall be finalised not later than 15th January 1996.

7. Reporting

The evaluation team will prepare a draft report for presentation, in a seminar, to the MoE and Sida (Addis Ababa) upon completion of the field work. The final report should take into account the comments of MoE and Sida.

The final report will be submitted to Sida-Stockholm in 10 copies for further distribution to Ethiopia.

8. Finance

The review/PIM will be financed out of the budget for the current specific agreement for education between the Governments of Ethiopia and Sweden.

B. Documents reviewed

- Abraham, K (1993?): Ethiopia. *The Challenge of 20th. Century Education and Modernisation — The Role of Swedish Aid. Education Division Documents No. 57.* Sida.
- Aregay, A. et. al. (June 1992): *The Environmental Education Project of Ethiopia — Six Years of Experiences as a Pilot Project.* Environmental Education Project Co-ordinating Office. Ministry of Education. Addis Ababa.
- Axen, C. (June 1994): *Report on National Environmental Education Workshop.*
- Axen, C. (various periods): Slutrapport (Sept. 1995); Report 1 (Sept. 1994); Report 3 (July 1995)
- Embassy of Sweden (November 1994): *Inför landstrategiarbetet. Några tankar om Sveriges långsiktiga bistånd till Etiopien.*
- Embassy of Sweden Development Cooperation Office (February 1994): *Draft Report on the Review of Accounting and Financial Management Systems and Audit of Accounts of Sida-funded projects/programmes (WAAS).*
- Embassy of Sweden, DCO (January 1995): *Diskussionsunderlag inför framtida stöd till undervisnings-, hälso- och förvaltningssektorn i Etiopien.*
- Embassy of Sweden, Development Co-operation Office (December 1994): *Minutes of meeting, Ethio-Swedish cooperation.*
- Final Report of a Joint Evaluation Team.
- FINNIDA (1994): PAT Project documentation.
- Grönvall M. (May 1995): *Environmental Profile of Ethiopia.* Sida report.
- Hansson, G (1995): Ethiopia 1995. *Macroeconomic Studies.* 1995.64 Sida. Stockholm.
- Hansson, G. (1994): Ethiopia 1994. *Economic Achievements and Reform Problems.* Institute for Economic Research, Lund University. Sweden.
- ICDR/MoE (June 1995): *Impacts of Aids/STD Education in Ethiopian Senior Secondary Schools.* Addis Ababa.
- ICDR/MoE (September 1995): *Needs Assessment on Aids Education for Ethiopian Primary Schools.* Addis Ababa.
- Junge, B. (1994): *Improving the Quality of Teacher Education.* USAID.
- Ministry of Education (April 1993): *Strengthening National Education Statistical Information System. Assessment, Action Plan, Project Proposals* (Aberra Makonnen, National NESIS Unesco Coordinator)
- Ministry of Education (December 1994): *Minutes. Workshop on Sida supported programs,* Addis Abeba.
- Ministry of Education (December 1995): *Draft organisation chart.*
- Ministry of Education (October 1995): *Terms of Reference. Combined Review of the Sida support to the education sector in Ethiopia, Agreement period 1992-07-01 — to date, and Project Identification Mission for the period beginning 1996-07-01.*
- Ministry of Education, Educational Management Information System (1995): *Draft contents (dummy) of annual regional statistical booklets.*
- MoE (December 1994): *Short-term Ethiopian Education Plan (1994/95-1998/99) — major Interventions with Focus on Primary Education.*
- MoE (Jan. 1993): *Proceeding on the Discussion Session on the Environmental Education Pilot Project Evaluation Report. First Draft.* Addis Ababa.
- MoE (Nov. 1995): *Highlights on the Proposed Strategy on School Directors, In-Service Training in Ethiopia.* Teaching & Educational Management Staff Development Department. Addis Ababa.
- MoE (Oct. 1995): *AIDS Information Exchange.* Quarterly Issue. Vol. 1. No. 1 Oct. 1995. Addis Ababa.
- MoE (October 1993): *Ethiopian Educational Policy Implementation Strategy.*
- MoE (September, 1993): *Report on Sida assisted Education Programmes (1992-1993).*
- MoE (September, 1994): *Report on Sida Assisted Education Programme (1993-1994).*
- MoE. Division of Distance Education, EMA. (1995) *Plan of Operation: Upgrading First & Second Cycle Primary School Teachers.*
- MoE/EE unit (April 1995): *Plan for Development of the Environmental Education Office and Information Centre.* Addis Ababa.
- MoE/Sida (Sept. 1995): *Report on National Environmental Education Workshop,* Nazareth.

- MoE/Sida (September 1992): Evaluation of the Environmental Education Project in Ethiopia.
- MoE/Sida — *Annual Plans of Action and Activity Plans* (1992/1993/1994/1995).
- MoE/Sida. *Annual Activity Report of Aids Education* (July 1994-June 1995).
- MoE: *Education Statistics* 1992/1993, 1993/1994 (1995).
- Negash, T. (August 1993): *A Report of a Workshop: The Draft Ethiopian Educational Policy*.
- Noonan, R. (January 1993): *Decentralised National Educational Information System: Filling Information Needs for Decentralised Decision Making* (InterScience)
- Noonan, R. (October 1994): *Decentralised National Educational Information System: Testing and Evaluating the Pilot EMIS Computer Program* (InterScience)
- Noonan, R. (1995): *Desk Study of the Educational Sector in Ethiopia*. Sida/MoE. Stockholm.
- Osterling, O. & Shibeshi, A. (1994): *Report on the Evaluation of the Ethiopian Primary School Headmaster Training Programme*, 5-29 April. Ministry of Education, Addis Ababa.
- Population & Dev. Planning Unit (1994): *National Population Policy*.
- Shibeshi, A. (Sept. 1995): *Participatory Training Needs Assessment of Head Teachers in Amhara National Regional State*. FTP/PAT. Addis Ababa.
- Sida (Feb. 1992): *Ethiopia 1992 - Change and Continuity. Recommendations for Future Co-operation*. Sida High Level Technical Mission. Final Report. Stockholm.
- Sida (July 1995): *Sector Programme Support. Background document to Sida Strategy*. Stockholm.
- Sida (Oct. 1993): *Promemoria. Informal Donors to Education Meeting*. Addis Ababa (15/10/95).
- Sida Development Co-operation Office (June 1994): *Financial Guidelines for Programmes/Projects Funded by Sida in Ethiopia*.
- Sida, Education Division, Department for Democracy and Social Development (January 1966): *Policy for Sida Co-operation in Basic Education and Education Reform*.
- Sida Development Co-operation Office (1994): *Sida Guidelines for Planning and Reporting 1994-12-22*.
- Sida/MoE Sector Reviews 1993-1995.
- Svenska ambassaden, Addis Abeba (mars 1995): *Etiopien, En landöversikt*.
- Tekeste Negash (January 1994): *National Programme on Capacity Building for Sustained Human Resources Development and Utilisation. Summary and Preliminary Comments*, Uppsala
- TGE (1994): *An Economic Development Strategy for Ethiopia*. February 1994.
- TGE/IMF/World Bank (1992): *Policy Framework Paper for Ethiopia*, 1992/93-1994/95.
- The British Council (1993): *Conference on the liberalisation of the book trade*, 17-21 May 1993 (EMPDA)
- The World Bank Review: *Ethiopia* (1995). Washington DC.
- Transitional Government of Ethiopia (April, 1994): *Education Policy and Strategy*. Addis Ababa.
- Transitional Government of Ethiopia (February 1994): *An Economic Development Strategy for Ethiopia*.
- Transitional Government of Ethiopia (February 1995), Education Management Information Systems, Ministry of Education: *Education Statistics*.
- Transitional Government of Ethiopia (July 1994), Education Management Information Systems, Ministry of Education: *Basic Education Statistics*.
- UNESCO (1993): *Report of the Meeting of the International Working Group on Education*. 14-16 April 1993. IIEP. Nice.
- UNICEF (1996): *The State of the World's Children*. Oxford University Press.
- USAID (1992): *Education Sector Review - Part I. Preliminary Report*. Washington DC.
- USAID (1993): *Ethiopia: Education Sector Review - Part II*. Washington DC.
- USAID (1993): *The Demand for Primary Schooling in Rural Ethiopia. A Research Study*. Addis Ababa. USAID.
- USAID (1994): *Basic Education System Overhaul (BESO)*. Washington DC.
- Wort. M (1994): *Summary Report. Report on World Bank Appraisal Mission (ESRDF) with Particular reference to the Education Sector*. Uppsala University, Department of Education. Uppsala.
- Wort. M. (1993): *Report on Workshop for Course Writers*. Sida/MoE. Ambo.

Wort. M. (1994): *Report on Pre-Appraisal Mission (ESRDF) with Particular Reference to the Education Sector*. Uppsala University, Department of Education. Uppsala.

C. People met and itinerary

Itinerary

27 NOVEMBER — 15 DECEMBER 1995

| | | |
|---------------------|-------|--|
| Monday, 27/11 | AM | Arrival & Check in — Ghion |
| | 14:00 | Team Consultations |
| Tuesday 28/11 | 09:30 | MoE (EDGE) |
| | 14:00 | DCO/Sida Coordinator |
| | 16:00 | USAID |
| Wednesday 29/11 | 10:30 | Meeting with the Vice Minister of Education, Dr. Teklehaimanot T/Ghiorgis, Head of Planning & Projects Dept. & Sida Coordinator |
| | 15:00 | Meeting with Planning & Programming Panel, (Haile Selassie Kebede & Alemayehu Minas (AM) |
| | 17:00 | Working Group DCO |
| Thursday 30/11 | 07:00 | Departure to Nazareth |
| | 10:00 | Meeting at Zonal Education Office |
| | 14:00 | Meeting at Zeway Woreda Education Office |
| | 16:00 | Departure to Awassa, Southern Ethiopia Peoples' Region (SEPR) |
| Friday 1/12 | 09:00 | Meeting in SEPR Regional Education Bureau, Awassa |
| | 10:00 | Visit/discussions at Awassa TTI |
| | 14:00 | Cont. meeting in SERP REB |
| Saturday 2/12 | 08:00 | Team work in Awassa |
| | 11:30 | Return to Addis |
| Sunday 3/12 | Open | |
| Monday 4/12 | 08:30 | MW/GC — EMA; IC/AB/AM — EMPDA(ILCA) |
| | 10:30 | Airport pickup Jan Valdelin |
| | 16:00 | Meeting at DCO; IC/AB/AM — EMPDA |
| | PM | Team Meeting/Ghion |
| Tuesday 5/12 | 08:30 | MW/AM/AB Teaching & Educational Staff Devt. Dept. |
| | 09:30 | AB/IC/MW — EEP; GC/AM — NFE |
| | 11:30 | MW — AID/STD |
| | 11:30 | IV/GC/AB — Region 4 REB |
| | 14:00 | JV — EMIS; IC/MW/AB — Ato Desta's Office, MoE |
| Wednesday 6/12 | 09:00 | AM/MW/IV — ICDR; IC — FINNIDA |
| | 14:00 | JV/IC/ — EICMA |
| | 16:00 | IC — European Union; MW — World Bank |
| Thursday 7/12 | | Visit to Bako school for the blind (GC) |
| Friday 8/12 | 06:00 | Departure for Debre Berhan (JV, MW, AB, AM) |
| | | Meetings with Zonal Education Department, Debre Berhan; Site visit of schools; Meeting at Debre Berhan TTI |
| | | Visit to East Wollega Education Office (GC); Daaloo Primary School (GC); Visit to Nekemte TTI (GC); Visit to Gomata CSTC, Nekemte (GC) |
| Week end 9/12-10/12 | Open | |
| Monday 11/12 | 8:30 | MW/JV Meeting with Daag Skoog/DCO |
| | | IC — UNICEF; Visit to Aira secondary school (GC) |
| Tuesday 12/12 | 09:00 | Meeting with Michael Palme |
| | 10:00 | Meeting at Planning & Projects Department — Ato Teferi Hagos |
| | 15:00 | Meeting at the DCO |
| | 19:00 | Meeting with IDA Supervisory Mission |
| Wednesday 13/12 | Open | |
| Thursday 14/12 | 14:00 | Debriefing meeting at DCO |
| | 16:00 | Debriefing to the Vice Minister of Education |
| Friday 15/12 | 10:00 | Departure |

List of People met

Ato Abdissa Tafa — Principal, Nazareth TTI
Ato Abebe Edfersha — Head of East Wollega Zonal Education Office
Ato Abu Tussuma — Zeway Woreda Education Office Head
Ato Ahmed Ali — Action Aid Ethiopia
Ato Alebachew Mekonnen — Primary School Teacher Training Programme Senior Expert, MoE
Ato Anbesu Biazen — Senior curriculum and research expert
Ato Awash Gebru — Educational Programmes & Supervision Department Head, MoE
Ato Badasa Tooboo — Administrator, East Wollega Zonal Education Office
Ato Befakadu G/Tsadik — Head, Teacher Education Panel, Ministry of Education
Ato Bekele Degu — Debre Berhan TTI Environmental Education Programme Coordinator
Ato Berhanu Birke — Teaching & Educational Staff Development Department A/Head, MoE
Ato Berhanu Wodajo — Oromia Regional Education Bureau, Deputy Head
Ato Beyene Abraha — General Manager, EMPDA
Ato Bogale Geremu — Nazareth TTI, Environmental Education Coordinator
Ato Damfeu — Chief Editor
Ato Daniel — SEPR REB Curriculum Development Head
Ato Dereje Terefe — Director of ICDR
Ato Desta Wodajo — Sida Coordinator, Ministry of Education
Ato Esmari Abafasi — Principal of Nekempte TTI
Ato Fiqadu Waqjiraa — Supervisor, East Wollega Zonal Education Office
Ato Gebreselassie Anania — EMIS/MoE, Acting Head, Ministry of Education
Ato Geremew — SEPR REB Planning & Projects Head
Ato Getachew Kelemu — Distance Education Panel Head, Ministry of Education
Ato Getachew — SEPR REB Administration & Finance Head
Ato Girma Goru — Adama (Nazareth) Zonal Education Dept. Head of Educational Programmes
Ato Girmai Chekol — Planning Unit, EMPDA
Ato Haile Selassie Kebede — Head, Planning and Programming Panel, Ministry of Education
Ato Iwnetu Abate — Debre Berhan TTI Principal
Ato Jayilu Uomer — Reg. 4 REB Educational Programmes Head
Ato Kassaye Abera — Debre Berhan ZED Supervisor
Ato Kedir Ibrahim — Co-ordinator of Academic Subject Curriculum Development, ICDR
Ato Keleab Goitom — Educational Media Materials Production Co-ordinator, Ministry of Education
Ato Mammo — SEPR Regional Education Bureau A/Head
Ato Mebratu Berhan — Head, vocational and special education curriculum development co-ordination, ICDR
Ato Mengistu Edo — Oromia Regional Educational Bureau, Planning & Project Services, Head
Ato Mengistu Lelealum — Vice Principal, Nazareth TTI
Ato Merid Kirubel — SEPR REB Building Engineer
Ato Negussie Estifanos — Debre Berhan Zonal Education Department Head
Ato Paolos Reke — Awassa TTI Principal
Ato Resom Gebre Hiwot — Printing House, EMPDA, Manager
Ato Seleshi Berhanu — Head, Adama (Nazareth) Zonal Education Department
Ato Shanka Biramo — SEPR REB Nonformal Education Head
Ato Sitotaw Yimam — Physical Education & Co-Curricular Programmes, Head, Ministry of Education
Ato Solomon Mesfin — A/Head, Printing Unit, EMPDA
Ato Tadelle Zewde — Instructional Equipment and Furniture Production Department, EMPDA
Ato Tamiru Shanko — Science Kits Production Expert, EMPDA
Ato Tassew Gizaw — SEPR REB Construction
Ato Teferi Hagos — Head, Planning and Projects Department, Ministry of Education
Ato Tilahun Zewde — Furniture Production Unit, EMPDA
Ato Tsegaye Tesfaye — Nonformal Education Panel Head, MoE
Ato Wonjellie Gudina — Principal, Daaloo primary school
Ato Yacob Bime — SEPR, Awassa Furniture Production Unit Head
Ato Yohannes Godanaw — AIDS/STD Health Education Programme Coordinator, Ministry of

Education

Ato Yoseph Betmariam — EE Programme Coordinator, Ministry of Education
Ato Zerihun Alemayehu — Debre Berhan, Sida programme follow-up
Ato Zerihun — Debre Berhan ZED, following Sida Programmes
Ato Zerom G Christos — Manager, EICMA
Dr. Christine McNab — Deputy Head, Department for Democracy & Social Development/Education Division, Sida
Dr. Michael Palme — Consultant to Sida
Dr. Mikael Ståhl — Embassy of Sweden, Development Co-operation Office Counsellor, Addis Ababa
Dr. Richard Noonan — Interscience Research Corporation
Dr. Teklehaimanot Haile Selassie — Vice Minister of Education
Head of CSTC, Nekempe
Headmaster of Taira secondary school
Headmaster of the Bako school for the blind
Mr. Anders Lönnqvist — Project Manager, FTP International (Consultancy company for FINNIDA in Ethiopia)
Mr. Anders Öhrström — First Secretary, Senior Programme Officer, DCO, Addis Ababa
Mr. Björn Stillefors — Stillefors & Pudeck Architecture and Industrial Design
Mr. Cameron S. Bonner — Office of Human & Institutional Development, USAID, Ethiopia
Mr. Daag Skoog — Senior Programme Officer, DCO, Addis Ababa
Mr. Heino Marius — Economic Adviser, EU Delegation of the Commission in Ethiopia
Mr. Henner Hildebrand — Non-formal Education Advisor, MoE
Mr. Jörgen Pudeck — Stillefors & Pudeck Architecture and Industrial Design
Mr. Ragnar Funemyr — Graphium Consult AB
Mr. Thomas Melin, Senior Programme Officer, Urban Development Division, Sida
Ms. Carol Martin — Education Project Officer, UNICEF, Addis Ababa
Ms. Emma Sundberg — Senior Programme Officer, Department for Democracy & Social Development/Education Division, Sida
Ms. Izabella Eriksson — Desk Officer, Ethiopia/Horn of Africa, Sida
Ms. Marie Grönvall — Consultant for Environment
Ms. Young Kimaro — World Bank, Washington, Team leader, IDA Supervisory mission in Ethiopia
W/o Etsegenet Wondimagegnehu — Editing Unit Head, EMPDA

D. Donors in the Education Sector

This Appendix presents summary tables of donor finance to the education sector. The two first tables map the donor funding to the various sub-sectors of the educational sector. The first one deals with the time period July 1992 - June 1996, and the second one with the donors' plans for the period July 1996 - December 1997. The two second tables map the donor funding to the various regions. As in the above case, the first deals with July 1992 - June 1996, and the second one the donors' plans for the period July 1996 - December 1997.

A major assumption is that no NGOs and programmes under 1 MUS\$ are included.

The sub-sectors are created in the following manner:

- primarily, Sida's nine sub-programmes are listed
- other donors' programmes, which do not fit into these nine areas, result in the creation of a new sub-sector, general enough to host other donors' funding as well.

Sources of information have been interviews and documents with FINNIDA, USAID, EU, Sida, and UNICEF, and statistics at the Ministry of Education for the remaining donors. In cases where programmes are running over several years, they have been assumed to disburse equal amounts every year, and equally throughout the year.

It is important to realise, that in the regional division, "Centrally" may mean that the funds are allocated to the centre. However, a part of these funds are often re-allocated out to the various regions from the central level. "Nation-wide" may mean that the whole nation has an equal part to benefit from the funds. However, as in the case with grants for university studies abroad, we assume that in reality, among the population who qualify to apply, the representatives from the stronger regions are in majority.

In the Sida figures divided by regions, it is only since the year 94/95 that Sida has disbursed money to the regions. Before that year, all funds were disbursed to central level, and this is why the central level seems to have an unproportionally large share. However, the central level did during 92/93 and 93/94 allocate money to the regions. The reason the Sida total figures for the period 92-96 do not match exactly, is that they come from two different sources. The sectorial figures come from actual disbursed funds, year by year, while the regional figures come from interview sources. In the case of the World Bank, their WIBS-programme (Woreda Integrated Basic Services), have been assumed to have a 10 % educational content (interview sources).

The sectorial division table for 1992-96 table does not include the support from the central and regional governments, since we do not know the sub-sector division of their support. However, from July 1993 to June 1996, the central government will have contributed 27.90 MUS\$, and the regional governments with 60.70 MUS\$⁹³. As can be seen in the sector tables, the two most favoured areas of support during 1992-96, measured in amount of funds, are School construction and maintenance, and

⁹³Source: Ministry of Education.

University level, with 26.83 and 20.37 % of the total support, respectively. However, the EU and FINNIDA support to the university level (approximately 1/3 of the total) does to a large extent mean that grants for studies abroad are funded, and not to the university. The next area of major support is for textbook production, with 15.09 % of the support.

The most favoured areas in terms of number of donors supporting them, are curriculum development and research, and regional, zone & woreda management training, with five donors each supporting them. However, the amounts of funds represent only 1.07 and 4.55 % of the total, respectively. The largest donor is the World Bank. They surpass the Central and Regional governments' allocation to the educational sector, by lending 94.70 MUSD during the period.

In the table for sectorial division 1996-97, the Sida contribution has been excluded, since their support from July 1996 onwards is still to be decided. We have no information on the amount of support the central and regional governments will contribute to the educational sector during this period.

For the years to come, the most support goes to the University sector. However, the result here is not as valid as for the period 92-96, since the figures from the most important funder, the World Bank, were not available.

Support for School based support, followed by English language training and regional, zone & woreda management training are the next most nearly funded. Among the nine programmes that Sida have been supporting, only curriculum development and research can count on any significant support from the other donors (still keeping in mind that the World Bank may be having plans within these areas).

Not included in the table for the regional division in 1992-96 are the central and regional governments' contribution to the educational sector. From July 1993 to June 1996, the central government will have contributed 27.9 MUSD, and the regional governments 60.71 MUSD⁹⁴. The distribution of these funds between the regions is not available. The single, most favoured region between 1992 and 1996 is SEPR, mainly because of USAID's presence, with 3.86 % of the total funds. On second and third place comes Tigray and Amhara, with 2.41 and 1.62 % of the total support. However, it is important to keep in mind that part of the central and the nation-wide support is divided between the regions as well. The least favoured regions are Dare Dawa, Harar and Afar, with 0.04, 0.09 and 0.12 % of the total support.

As in the sectorial division table, for the period July 1996 to December 1997, in the regional division table for 1996-97 the Sida column is excluded, since the Sida support from July 1996 and onwards is to be decided. We have no information on the amount of support the central and regional governments will contribute to the educational sector during this period either. Again, the absence of figures from the World Bank affects the validity of the figures in the table. However, the donors included tend to support the SEPR region, Tigray and Amhara. Dare Dawa is not expected to receive any specific support, and Afar, Harar and Somali will only receive 0.45 % of the total support.

⁹⁴ Ibid.

Table 1**Source of financing to the educational sector of Ethiopia****Regional division July 1992-June 1996****Unit: MUSD**

Exchange rates used: 7 SEK/USD, 6.25 Birr/USD, 0.82 ECU/USD

| Regions | Source of financing | | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------|---------------------|---------------|-------|---------|------------|------------|-------|-----------|-------------|-------------|--------|--------|
| | Sida | UNICEF (1) | USAID | FINNIDA | GTZ (2) | ODA (2) | EU | WB (2) | UNDP (2) | OPEC (2) | TOTAL | |
| 1 Tigray | 0.17 | 0.17 | 2.71 | | 0.34 | | | | | | 3.39 | 2.41 |
| 2 Afar | 0.09 | 0.08 | | | | | | | | | 0.16 | 0.12 |
| 3 Amhara | 0.44 | 0.17 | | 1.06 | | | 0.61 | | | | 2.28 | 1.62 |
| 4 Oromo | 0.51 | 0.26 | | | 0.34 | | | | | | 1.12 | 0.79 |
| 5 Somali | 0.09 | 0.08 | | | | | | | | 0.29 | 0.45 | 0.32 |
| 6 Benshangul | 0.07 | 0.16 | | 0.13 | | | | | | 0.29 | 0.64 | 0.46 |
| 7 - 11 SEPR | 0.33 | 0.16 | 4.33 | | | | 0.61 | | | | 5.43 | 3.86 |
| 12 Gambella | 0.06 | 0.16 | | | | | | | | 0.29 | 0.51 | 0.36 |
| 13 Harar | 0.04 | 0.08 | | | | | | | | | 0.12 | 0.09 |
| 14 Addis Ababa | 0.11 | 0.26 | | | | | | | | | 0.37 | 0.26 |
| Dare Dawa | 0.05 | | | | | | | | | | 0.05 | 0.04 |
| Centrally | 12.41 | 0.85 | 1.89 | | | | | | | | 15.15 | 10.78 |
| Nation-wide | | 1.21 | | 2.31 | | | 10.98 | 94.70 | 1.75 | | 110.95 | 78.90 |
| Total | 14.37 | 3.65 | 8.93 | 3.50 | 0.68 | 0.00 | 12.20 | 94.70 | 1.75 | 0.86 | 140.63 | 100.00 |

1: Source: UNICEF Annual reports 1993-1995. Figures from 1992 not included.

2: Source: Statistics of the Ministry of Education

Where not stated, source of information is interview with donor representatives.

Table 2**Source of financing to the educational sector of Ethiopia****Sectorial division****Year: July 1992 - June 1996**

Unit: MUS\$

Exchange rates used: 7SEK/USD, 6.25 Birr/USD, 0.82 ECU/USD

| Sector | Source of financing | | | | | | | | | | | % |
|----------------------------------|---------------------|------------------|-------------|-------------|---------------|---------------|--------------|--------------|----------------|----------------|---------------|---------------|
| | Sida note 1 | UNICEF note 2 | USAID | FINNIDA | GTZ note 3 | ODA note 3 | EU | WB note 3 | UNDP note 3 | OPEC note 3 | TOTAL | |
| EMIS | 1.70 | | | | | | | | | | 1.70 | 1.21 |
| Curr. dev. and research | 0.53 | 0.31 | | 0.18 | 0.14 | | | | 0.35 | | 1.50 | 1.07 |
| Teacher in-service training | 0.86 | | | 0.03 | 0.14 | | | | | | 1.02 | 0.72 |
| Environmental education | 1.21 | | | | | | | | | | 1.21 | 0.86 |
| AIDS/STD health education | 0.42 | | | | | | | | | | 0.42 | 0.30 |
| Non-formal/adult education | 1.37 | 0.82 | | 0.10 | | | | | 0.35 | | 2.65 | 1.88 |
| Textbook production | 6.28 | | | | | | | 14.93 | | | 21.20 | 15.09 |
| Instruct. equip. & furniture | 0.83 | | | | | | 1.22 | 0.93 | | | 2.98 | 2.12 |
| Prim. School Construct & Main. | 1.06 | | | | 0.14 | | | 35.65 | | 0.86 | 37.70 | 26.83 |
| Secondary Heads training | | | | | | | | | | | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| TTI Training | | | 1.65 | 0.10 | 0.14 | | | | | | 1.89 | 1.34 |
| Pre-Primary/Special Training | | | | | | | | | | | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| MoE Staff Upgrading | | 0.41 | 0.69 | | | | | 14.00 | 0.35 | | 15.45 | 10.99 |
| University level | | | | 2.00 | | | 7.93 | 18.70 | | | 28.63 | 20.37 |
| Reg. Zone & War Mngmnt Trng | | 0.30 | 2.20 | 0.70 | 0.14 | | 3.05 | | | | 6.39 | 4.55 |
| Book/Library support | | | | 0.30 | | | | | | | 0.30 | 0.21 |
| TVET | | | | 0.10 | | | | | 0.35 | | 0.45 | 0.32 |
| Wareda Integrated Basic Services | | 1.54 | | | | | | | | | 1.54 | 1.10 |
| Educational Media | | 0.27 | | | | | | 10.50 | | | 10.77 | 7.66 |
| School Based Support | | | 4.39 | | | | | | | | 4.39 | 3.12 |
| English training | | | | | | | | | | | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Women's education | | | | | | | | | 0.35 | | 0.35 | 0.25 |
| Total | 14.25 | 3.65 | 8.93 | 3.50 | 0.68 | 0.00 | 12.20 | 94.70 | 1.75 | 0.86 | 140.51 | 100.00 |

1: Source: Statistics of Sida. For all years, actually disbursed funds are used Where not stated, the source is interviews with representatives of the donor.

2: Source: UNICEF Annual reports 1993-95. Does not include figures from 1992.

3: Source: Statistics of the Ministry of Education

Table 3**Source of financing to the educational sector of Ethiopia****Sectorial division****Year: July 1996 - Dec 1997**

Unit: MUS\$

Exchange rates used: 7 SEK/USD, 6.25 Birr/USD, 0.82 ECU/USD

| Source of financing | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------------------------|--------|-------|---------|---------------|---------------|------|--------------|----------------|-------|--------|
| Sector | UNICEF | USAID | FINNIDA | GTZ note 1 | ODA note 1 | EU | WB note 1 | UNDP note 1 | TOTAL | % |
| EMIS | | | | | | | | | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Curr. dev. and research | 0.53 | | 0.53 | 0.14 | | | | 0.21 | 1.40 | 7.13 |
| Teacher in-service training | | | 0.08 | 0.14 | | | | | 0.21 | 1.07 |
| Environmental education | | | | | | | | | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| AIDS/STD health education | | | | | | | | | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Non-formal/adult education | | | | | | | | 0.21 | 0.21 | 1.07 |
| Textbook production | | | | | | | | | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Instruct. equip. & furniture | | | | | | | | | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Prim. School Construct & Main. | | | | 0.14 | | | | | 0.14 | 0.69 |
| Secondary Heads training | | | | | | | | | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| TTI Training | | 0.99 | 0.30 | 0.14 | | | | | 1.43 | 7.25 |
| Pre-Primary/Special Training | | | | | | | | | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| MoE Staff Upgrading | 1.18 | 0.41 | | | | | | 0.21 | 1.80 | 9.17 |
| University level | | | 2.00 | | | 2.32 | | | 4.32 | 21.98 |
| Reg. Zone & War Mngmnt Trng | | 1.32 | 0.60 | 0.14 | | | | | 2.06 | 10.47 |
| Book/Library support | | | | | | | | | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| TVET | | | | | | | | 0.21 | 0.21 | 1.07 |
| Wareda Integrated Basic Services | 1.73 | | | | | | | | 1.73 | 8.83 |
| Educational Media | 0.80 | | | | | | | | 0.80 | 4.05 |
| School Based Support | | 2.63 | | | | | | | 2.63 | 13.41 |
| English training | | | | | 2.50 | | | | 2.50 | 12.73 |
| Women's education | | | | | | | | 0.21 | 0.21 | 1.07 |
| Total | 4.24 | 5.36 | 3.50 | 0.68 | 2.50 | 2.32 | na | 1.05 | 19.64 | 100.00 |

1: Source: Statistics of the Ministry of Education

Where not stated, the source is interviews with representatives of the donor.

Table 4**Source of financing to the educational sector of Ethiopia****Regional division July 1996-december 1997****Unit: MUS\$**

Exchange rates used: 7 SEK/USD, 6.25 Birr/USD, 0.82 ECU/USD

| Regions | Source of financing | | | | | | | TOTAL | % |
|----------------|---------------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|---------------|
| | UNICEF | USAID | FINNIDA | GTZ (1) | ODA (1) | EU | UNDP (1) | | |
| 1 Tigray | 0.18 | 1.63 | | 0.34 | | | | 2.14 | 10.92 |
| 2 Afar | 0.09 | | | | | | | 0.09 | 0.45 |
| 3 Amhara | 0.18 | | 0.94 | | | | | 1.12 | 5.68 |
| 4 Oromo | 0.30 | | | 0.34 | | | | 0.63 | 3.22 |
| 5 Somali | 0.09 | | | | | | | 0.09 | 0.45 |
| 6 Benshangul | 0.18 | | 0.38 | | | | | 0.55 | 2.82 |
| 7 - 11 SEPR | 0.17 | 2.60 | | | | | | 2.77 | 14.10 |
| 12 Gambella | 0.17 | | | | | | | 0.17 | 0.87 |
| 13 Harar | 0.09 | | | | | | | 0.09 | 0.45 |
| 14 Addis Ababa | 0.30 | | | | | 0.61 | | 0.91 | 4.61 |
| Dare Dawa | | | | | | | | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| Centrally | 2.11 | 1.14 | | | | 1.71 | | 4.95 | 25.19 |
| Nationwide | 0.40 | | 2.19 | | 2.50 | | 1.05 | 6.14 | 31.24 |
| Total | 4.24 | 5.36 | 3.50 | 0.68 | 2.50 | 2.32 | 1.05 | 19.64 | 100.00 |

1: Source: Statistics of the Ministry of Education

Where not stated, source of information is interviews with donor representatives.

Sida Evaluations - 1995/96

- 95/1 Educação Ambiental em Moçambique. Kajsa Pehrsson
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 95/2 Agitators, Incubators, Advisers - What Roles for the EPU? Joel Samoff
Department for Research Cooperation
- 95/3 Swedish African Museum Programme (SAMP). Leo Kenny, Beata Kasale
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 95/4 Evaluation of the Establishing of the Bank of Namibia 1990-1995. Jon A. Solheim, Peter Winai
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/1 The Beira-Gothenburg Twinning Programme. Arne Heileman, Lennart Peck
The report is also available in Portuguese
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/2 Debt Management. (Kenya) Kari Nars
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/3 Telecommunications - A Swedish Contribution to Development. Lars Rylander, Ulf Rundin et al
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/4 Biotechnology Project: Applied Biocatalysis. Karl Schügerl
Department for Research Cooperation
- 96/5 Democratic Development and Human Rights in Ethiopia. Christian Åhlund
Department for East and West Africa
- 96/6 Estruturação do Sistema Nacional de Gestão de Recursos Humanos. Júlio Nabais, Eva-Marie Skogsberg, Louise Helling
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/7 Avaliação do Apoio Sueco ao Sector da Educação na Guiné Bissau 1992-1996. Marcella Ballara, Sinesio Bacchetto, Ahmed Dawelbeit, Julieta M Barbosa, Börje Wallberg
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/8 Konvertering av rysk militärindustri. Maria Lindqvist, Göran Reitberger, Börje Svensson
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/9 Building Research Capacity in Ethiopia. E W Thulstrup, M Fekadu, A Negewo
Department for Research Cooperation
- 96/10 Rural village water supply programme - Botswana. Jan Valdelin, David Browne, Elsie Alexander, Kristina Boman, Marie Grönvall, Imelda Molokomme, Gunnar Settergren
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/11 UNICEF's programme for water and sanitation in central America - Facing new challenges and opportunities. Jan Valdelin, Charlotta Adelstål, Ron Sawyer, Rosa Nunes, Xiomara del Torres, Daniel Gubler
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/12 Cooperative Environment Programme - Asian Institute of Technology/Sida, 1993-1996. Thomas Malmqvist, Börje Wallberg
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/13 Forest Sector Development Programme - Lithuania-Sweden. Mårten Bendz
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/14 Twinning Programmes With Local Authorities in Poland, Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania. Håkan Falk, Börje Wallberg
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/15 Swedish Support to the Forestry Sector in Latvia. Kurt Boström
Department for Central and Eastern Europe

- 96/16 Swedish Support to Botswana Railways. Brian Green, Peter Law
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/17 Cooperation between the Swedish County Administration Boards and the Baltic Countries.
Lennart C G Almqvist
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/18 Swedish - Malaysian Research Cooperation on Tropical Rain Forest Management. T C Whitmore
Department for Research Cooperation, SAREC
- 96/19 Sida/SAREC Supported Collaborative Programme for Biomedical Research Training in Central America. Alberto Nieto
Department for Research Cooperation, SAREC
- 96/20 The Swedish Fisheries Programme in Guinea Bissau, 1977-1995. Tom Alberts, Christer Alexanderson
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/21 The Electricity Sector in Mozambique, Support to the Sector By Norway and Sweden. Bo Andreasson, Steinar Grongstad, Vidkunn Hveding, Ralph Kårhammar
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/22 Svenskt stöd till Vänortssamarbete med Polen, Estland, Lettland och Litauen. Håkan Falk, Börje Wallberg
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/23 Water Supply System in Dodota - Ethiopia. Bror Olsson, Judith Narrowe, Negatu Asfaw, Eneye Tefera, Amsalu Negussie
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/24 Cadastral and Mapping Support to the Land Reform Programme in Estonia. Ian Brook
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/25 National Soil and Water Conservation Programme - Kenya. Mary Tiffen, Raymond Purcell, Francis Gichuki, Charles Gachene, John Gatheru
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/26 Soil and Water Conservation Research Project at Kari, Muguga - Kenya. Kamugisha, JR, Semu, E
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment



SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY
S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden
Tel: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Fax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64
Hemsida: <http://www.sida.se>