

Sida Support to Environmental Public Awareness and Training Projects

Panos, Gemini & TVE

**Leo Kenny
Alice Petren**

**Department for Democracy
and Social Development**

Sida Support to Environmental Public Awareness and Training Projects

Panos, Gemini & TVE

**Leo Kenny
Alice Petren**

**Sida Evaluation 96/41
Department for Democracy
and Social Development**

Evaluation Reports may be ordered from:

Biståndsforum, Sida
S-105 25 Stockholm
Phone: (+46) 8 698 5722
Fax: (+46) 8 698 5638

Authors: Leo Kenny Alice Petren

The views and interpretations expressed in this report are those of the authors and should not be attributed to the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Sida

Sida Evaluation 96/41

Commissioned by Sida, Department for Democracy and Social Development,

Copyright: Sida and the authors

Registration No: Deso-1995-0371, Deso-1996-1069

Date of Final Report: November 1996

Printed in Stockholm, Sweden 1996

ISBN 91 586 7430 6

ISSN 1401-0402

SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY

Address: S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden. Office: Sveavägen 20, Stockholm

Telephone: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Telefax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64

Telegram: sida stockholm. Telex: 11450 sida sthlm. Postgiro: 1 56 34-9

Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
LIST OF TABLES	v
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	vi
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
 PART I	
INTRODUCTION	
1 Terms of Reference for the Review	6
2 Scope and Focus of the Review	6
3 Quantitative and Qualitative Methodology Employed in Conducting the Review	6
4 Survey Impartiality and Reliability	6
5 Limitations of the Review	7
 PART II	
CONTEXT OF SIDA SUPPORT	
1 Sida's Environmental Policy Goal and Sustainable Development Action Plan	9
2 Context of Sida Support for Environmental Public Awareness	9
 PART III	
DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT	
1 PANOS	
1.1 The Organisation	12
1.2 Sida Project Support History	12
1.3 Sida Inputs Relative to Other Donors	13
1.4 Constituency, Aims & Objectives	13
1.5 Panos Inputs	14
1.6 Relevant Outputs and Activities	15
1.7 Participation, Affiliations and Co-operation	15
2 GEMINI NEWS SERVICE	
2.1 The Organisation	15
2.2 Sida Project Support History	15
2.3 Sida Support Relative to Other Donors	16
2.4 Training Constituency, Aims and Objectives	16
2.5 Gemini Inputs	17
2.6 Relative Outputs and Activities	17
2.7 Collaboration and Co-operation	18
3 TVE	
3.1 The Organisation	18
3.2 Project History	19
3.3 Sida Inputs Relative to Other Donors	19
3.4 TVE Inputs	20
3.5 Constituency, Aims & Objectives	20
3.6 Relevant Outputs and Activities	21
3.7 Participation in Global Television Consortium	22
3.8 Other Participation, Affiliations and Co-operation	23

PART IV

PANOS FINDINGS: Achievements, Constraints, Organisational Capacity, Effectiveness & Sustainability

1	Aims and Objectives	
1.1	Focus	25
1.2	Clarity and Relevance to Constituency	25
1.3	Relevance to Swedish Development Goals, Sectorial Policies & Objectives	25
2	Achievement of Aims and Objectives	26
2.1	Information Outputs	26
2.1.1	Media Briefings	26
2.1.2	Panos Features	27
2.1.3	Panoscope/Transmedia On-line	27
2.1.4	Radio:	28
	(a) Down to Earth Radio	28
	(b) Mi Tierra	28
	(c) Francophone Africa	29
2.1.5	Panos Books	29
2.2	In-Country Capacity Building	30
2.2.1	Co-syndication	30
2.2.2	Media Fellowships	31
2.2.3	Institutional Support	31
2.2.4	Seminars & Conferences	31
2.3	Regional Partners, Participation & Collaboration	32
2.4	Planning, Monitoring & Follow-up	32
2.5	Constraints & Weaknesses	33
3	Impact	
3.1	National, Regional and International Public Environmental Awareness	34
3.2	Media Freedom, Pluralism & Independence	34
3.3	Networking, Institutional Development & Professional Competence	34
3.4	Gender Equality	35
3.5	Miscellaneous Benefits and Other Programmes	35
4	Cost Effectiveness in Utilisation of Sida Funds	
4.1	Current & Past Implementation	36
4.2	Cost Ramifications of Future Panos Plans	37
5	Reporting, Accounting & Transparency	37
6	The Future and Sustainability	
6.1	Current Trends and Developments in the Sector	37
6.2	The Future Shape of PANOS	38
6.3	Organisational Capacity	39
6.4	Sustainability of Panos Operations	40
6.5	Continued Co-operation with Sida & Sida Options	41

PART V

GEMINI FINDINGS : Achievements, Constraints, Organisational Capacity, Effectiveness & Sustainability

1	Aims and Objectives	
1.1	Focus and Relevance to Swedish Development Goals	44
1.2	Clarity and Relevance to Constituency	44

2	Achievement of Aims and Objectives: Training Seminars and Workshops	44
2.1	Content and Methodology	45
2.2	Logistics in Implementation	45
2.3	Target Groups and Participants	45
2.4	Planning, Monitoring and Follow-up	46
2.5	Quality of Training	46
2.6	Constraints	46
3	Impact	
3.1	National, Regional and International Public Environmental Awareness	47
3.2	Media Development: Freedom, Pluralism and Independence	47
3.3	Networking, Institutional Development and Professional Competence	47
3.4	Gender Equality	47
3.5	Miscellaneous Benefits	47
4	Cost Effectiveness in Utilisation of Sida Funding	
4.1	Project Implementation	48
4.2	Project Staff	48
4.3	Workshops' Duration	48
4.4	Collaboration and Co-operation	48
5	Reporting, Accountability and Transparency	
5.1	Auditing	48
5.2	Workshop Costs	49
5.3	Gemini Costs	49
6	The Future and Sustainability	
6.1	Current Trends and Developments in the Sector	49
6.2	The Future Shape of GEMINI	49
6.3	Organisational Capacity	50
6.4	Sustainability of Gemini Operations	50
6.5	Continued Co-operation with Sida and Sida Options	50

PART VI

TVE FINDINGS: Achievements, Constraints, Organisational Capacity, Effectiveness & Sustainability

1	Aims and Objectives	
1.1	Focus	52
1.2	Clarity and Relevance to Constituency	52
1.3	Relevance to Swedish Development Goals and Sectorial Objectives	53
2	Achievement of Aims and Objectives	54
2.1	Film and TV Production	55
2.2	Moving Pictures Distribution	55
2.2.1	Video Resource Centres - VRCs	56
2.2.2	VRC Workshops	56
2.2.3	Moving Pictures Bulletin	56
2.2.4	Database	57
2.2.5	Catalogue	57
2.3	Training	58
3	Impact	
3.1	National, Regional and International Public Environmental Awareness	59
3.2	Media Development: Freedom, Pluralism and Independence	59
3.3	Networking, Institutional Development , Professional Competence	59

3.4	Gender Equality	59
4	Cost Effectiveness	
4.1	Utilisation of Sida Funds	60
4.2	Cost-effectiveness	60
4.3	Project staff	60
4.4	Reporting, Accountability and Transparency	60
5	The Future and Sustainability	
5.1	Current Trends and Developments in the Sector	60
5.2	The Future Shape of TVE	61
5.3	Organisational Capacity	62
5.4	Continued Co-operation with Sida	62
5.5	Sida Options	63

PART VII

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1	PANOS	65
2	GEMINI	66
3	TVE	66
4	Sida SUPPORT TO THE SECTOR	67
4.1	Focus and Implementation	67
4.2	Channels of Assistance:	68
	4.2.1 Multilateral	68
	4.2.2 Bilateral - Swedish Organisations	68
	4.2.3 Other Bilateral	69
4.3	Concentration, Effectiveness and Flexibility	69
5	SUMMARY PROPOSALS FOR STRATEGIC DEVELOPMENT OF Sida SUPPORT TO ENVIRONMENTAL PUBLIC AWARENESS AND TRAINING	70

PART VIII

LESSONS LEARNED

73

ANNEXES: Annexes 4 - 12 are not included in this document but may be requested from Sida DESO/UND 74

1	Terms of Reference	75
2	List of Organisations and Individuals Contacted in the Course of the Review	79
3	A Select Bibliography: Documents, Publications and Other References Consulted in this Review	82
4	Questionnaires	
5	Audited Accounts FYs 1993/94/95: Panos, Gemini and TVE	
6	Income/Expenditure Statements 1993-1995: Panos, Gemini, TVE	
7	Sources of Funding: Panos Regional Partnerships Programme 93-95	
8	Sources of Funding: Panos Media Briefings 92-95	
9	Allocation of Resources 93-95: Panos London, Paris & Washington	
10	Panos Contracted Funds from Sida Stockholm 87-96	
11	Gemini Workshop Report (Windhoek)	
12	Gemini Statements of Income and Expenditure: Workshops, 1993 - 1996	

LIST OF TABLES**Page**

Table 1: Total Sida Support to Panos, Gemini and TVE 1985 - 1995	1
Table 2: Panos Support from Sida Natural Resources & Environment Division; and DESO 1987 - 1996	12
Table 3: Panos Support from Sida DESO/Health Division, 1987 - 1996	12
Table 4: Panos Support from Other Sida Divisions, 1987 - 1997	12
Table 5: Sida Input Relative to Other Bi-lateral Donors for Panos Regional Partnerships Programme, 1993 - 1996	13
Table 6: Sida Inputs Relative to Other Donors for Panos Media Briefing Documents ,1993-1995	13
Table 7: Summary of Panos RPP & MBD Activities and Outputs Supported by Sida 1993 - 1996	14
Table 8: Total Sida Support to Gemini, 1985 - 1996	15
Table 9: Sida Support to Gemini Relative to Other Donors, 1993 - 1996	16
Table 10: Gemini Outputs Supported by Sida, 1993 - 1996	17
Table 11: Total Sida Support for TVE 1990 - 1996	19
Table 12: Sida Inputs Relative to Other Donors, TVE, 1992 - 1996	19
Table 13: Utilisation of Sida Funds to Panos: Activities/Staff/Administration	36
Table 14: Funding Status of Panos Offices 1996 - 1998	39

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AIA	Afrique Information Afrique (newsagency)
BBC	British Broadcasting Corporation
BMZ	Development Co-operation Office German Foreign Ministry
CDC	Centre for Democratic Communications (South Africa)
CERN	Caribbean Environmental Reporters Network
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
CDI	Centre for Development Information (Zambia)
CJA	Commonwealth Journalists Association
CPPD (s)	Panos Centres for Public and Policy Debate
CRTV	Cameroon Radio and Television
DANIDA	Danish Development Co-operation Office (Min Foreign Affairs)
DESO	Department for Democracy and Social Development (Sida)
DCO	Development Co-operation Office (Sida)
DGIS	Netherlands Development Co-operation Office (Min Foreign Affairs)
IFJ	International Federation of Journalists
IRIS	Interlink Rural Information Service (Kenya)
IIED	International Institute for Environmental Development (London)
EU	European Commission
FINNIDA	Finnish International Development Agency
FRU	Film Resource Unit
F Y (s)	Fiscal Years
Gemini	Gemini News Service (London)
HÄLSO	Health Division (Sida)
IAJ	Institute for the Advancement of Journalism (South Africa)
IPS	Inter Press Service
IUCN	International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources
JET	Journalists' Environmental Association of Tanzania
LFA	Logical Framework Analysis
MBD	Panos Media Briefing Documents
MISA	Media Institute of Southern Africa
M&E	Monitoring & Evaluation
NBC	Namibian Broadcasting Corporation
NCMF	National Community Media Forum (South Africa)
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NHK	Nippon. Hosokawa Kyoku
NORAD	Norwegian Agency for Development Co-operation
N/N & N/S	North/North & North/South: South = underdeveloped countries; North = developed countries
NSJ	Nordic SADC Journalism Centre
Novib	Netherlands Organisation for International Co-operation
ODA	Overseas Development Administration (UK)
Panos Offices)	The Panos Institute (unless otherwise indicated, this includes London, Washington and Paris)
RPP	Panos Regional Partnerships Programme
RFI	Radio France International
SADC	Southern African Development Community
SACOD	Southern African Communications for Development (Harare)
Sida	Swedish International Development Co-operation Agency
SEK	Swedish Kronor (approx = US\$ 0.15/£0.10)
SNF	Swedish Society for Nature Conservation
TVE	Television Trust for the Environment
UND	Education Division in Sida
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environmental Development

UNEP	United Nations Environmental Programme
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNICEF	United Nations Emergency Children's Fund
UNESCO	United Nations Educational , Scientific and Cultural Organisation
URTEL	Union des radios et televisions libres du Mali
VRC	Video Resource Centre
WAIBA	West African Independent Broadcasters' Association
WHO	World Health Organisation
WIF	Worldview International Foundation
WWF	World Wide Fund for Nature

Swedish Translations

handlingsprogram för hållbar utveckling	Sida's Action Plan for Sustainable Development
det särskilda miljöanslaget	Special environmental projects financed from Sida's environmental tranche in Stockholm
miljöundervisning insatser finansierad inom land-ramen	Environmental education projects financed from country-frame allocations
kulturens roll i utvecklingsprocessen	The role of Culture in Development

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In the light of Sweden's fifth development goal on the environment and in accordance with the undertakings arising from Sweden's ratification of the Rio Declaration, Agenda 21, and other international environmental conventions, Sweden has since the 1980s attempted to integrate environmental issues within its framework of development co-operation.

Part of this process has involved the support for environmental public awareness and journalist training through support to a number of international organisations - the bulk of which has gone to:

Table 1: Total Sida Support to Panos, Gemini and TVE 1985 - 1995

The Panos Institute	1985-1995	SEK 32,594,100
Gemini News Service	1990-1995	SEK 4,680,000
Television Trust for the Environment	1989-1995	SEK 11,850,000
TOTAL	1985-1995	SEK 49,124,100

This study evaluates that support to the 3 organisations and assesses how such support has and can contribute to Sida's Sectorial policies, objectives and strategies with respect to environmental public awareness and training. In this sense, it is partly an evaluation of the 3 organisations; and partly a review of Sida support to the sector.

Sida support to Panos

Panos is an independent non-profit organisation with a decentralised structure of autonomous offices in London, Paris, Washington, and Africa. Panos researches, generates and provides information for and on neglected or poorly understood development issues. They work with the media, NGOs and governmental agencies to facilitate North-South and South-South dialogue and to stimulate public debate on development issues in the fields of (inter alia): environment, reproductive health and population, HIV/AIDS, poverty, gender, human rights, good governance, media and communications.

Panos outputs have been prodigious - both qualitatively and quantitatively. Sida supported outputs of the Regional Partnerships Programme and the Media Briefing Documents during the period 1993 - 1995 (which are the subject of this review), have included: 23 media briefing documents; 6 editions of Panoscope Magazine; 255 Panos Features on the Environment; 13 Panos Books; 10 Co-syndication agreements; 110 Fellowships; 60 grants for institutional development; 43 training workshops and seminars; 648 full pages and 5 supplements on the environment published in Southern Newspapers; 3 Journalists awards; and around 250 environmental radio programmes. These outputs do not comprehensively reflect all the programmes and activities in which Panos is involved; nor can they reflect the results of the capacity building in the South - which is an integral part of most Panos programmes. Sida in effect contributes to all of Panos' activities since they provide core support to Panos; and since there are strong inter-linkages between all Panos programmes. Of the other activities, the most relevant which are referred to in the body of this review are: the Panos AIDS/HIV Programme; and the Panos Reproductive Health and Women's Rights Programme - both of which, Sida directly supports, but which are outside the TOR for this review. Others are: the Panos Oral Testimony Programme; the Media Pluralism in West Africa Programme; and the Migration Programme.

This study would endorse the concern of some other major donors that implementation of Panos programmes, remains too Northern based. Panos Paris began addressing this concern five years ago. London and Washington have begun to do so. The new phase of Panos operations formalises the autonomy of the three Northern offices which allows them to strategize more effectively around establishing Southern offices. The strength of this approach is that it facilitates the identification of regionally-specific needs and allows each office to develop strategies to address them accordingly. Establishing new Southern Panos offices and consolidating others, will also directly build Southern institutional capacity. Sida should support this process monitor it closely according to a set of indicators which centre around the effectiveness of the mandate and permanence of regional Panos offices.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

What also remains a concern of this study is the question of whether Panos is trying to do too much in too many countries. Albeit, they have begun to focus on key partners in key countries, they may be too optimistic about the potential capacity of regional offices to help address this central concern. Future Sida support should encourage effectiveness through concentration.

Whilst narrative reporting has been (in the main) exemplary and financial reporting has been comprehensive, the regularity of this reporting appears to have been inconsistent: some donors were satisfied; some donors were quite dissatisfied with this aspect of Panos operations. In recent years, Panos has embarked strongly on systematic monitoring and evaluation methods. However, they acknowledge that much more needs to be done on developing modalities for qualitative assessment of the impact of their programmes. This issue also remains a concern of some donors.

The concerns about Panos operations mentioned above, are areas of Panos operations about which they are cognisant. They have begun to address them in a comprehensive manner. These criticisms should not detract from the valuable work Panos has done, is doing and has the potential to do.

Sida support to Panos has been an effective way of addressing their own development goal on the environment; and more specifically, their Sectorial objectives with respect to Environmental Public Awareness. However, it would be wrong to characterise the work of Panos as being predominantly "environmentally" centred. Their programmes first and foremost, promote and facilitate sustainable development. The environment is an integral development issue; so are the issues of media pluralism, human rights, good governance, women in development, health, poverty, migration, population etc. In this regard, the central strength of Panos is its holistic approach to people-centred development; and its belief that information, its ownership, accessibility and quality, play a major role in sustainable development. Sida may be well satisfied that Panos' aims and objectives are well in accordance with their own policies, strategies and priorities. DESO might consider however, that future support for the extensive range of Panos' operations is more appropriately the responsibility of DESO's Medier och Kultur rather than UND.

Sida Support to TVE

The Television Trust for Environment, TVE, is an independent non-profit organisation based in London. Its mission is to turn global development and environmental issues into television programmes, and to ensure their distribution in the South. It acts as a catalyst for new TV programmes and promotes film production in the South as well as co-operation South-South and South-North. TVE has established a world-wide network of local Video Resource Centres for film and video distribution. Other activities include: the acquisition of film rights; capacity-building co-operation with local broadcasters and NGOs; and the production of promotional print material.

During the period 1992 - 1996, 22,000 films on i.a. environment, development, women, human rights, poverty and wild life have been distributed by TVE's Moving Pictures Programme. TVE has also established 46 Video Resource Centres in 40 countries as well as a supportive database. A film catalogue with 362 films was issued in August 1996. The Moving Pictures distribution Service is promoted through a Bulletin, which has published 11 issues since 1992.

The impact of the films which TVE has distributed has not been empirically measured, but they have clearly provoked debate in many countries and have been both broadcast nationally and used in training sessions in many countries. Southern capacity building is central to the organisation's objectives. A major set of initiatives in this regard has been the establishment of the Video Resource Centres which have in many cases become self-reliant. The establishment of a solid distribution network for independent Southern film professionals is one of the most essential ingredients of pluralism in the film and TV industry. TVE has helped the South to compete with the dominance of the commercial and corporate film and TV-industry; and at the same time, thereby, promoting media pluralism and good governance.

The bulk of Sida's support has been used for distribution. It is a cost-effective approach and Sida funds have been used wisely. TVE's objectives are in line with Sida's development goals; and sectorial policies, strategies and priorities in the fields of media and environmental development. Planning and implementation of Sida supported activities has been good and financial reporting acceptable.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Since TVE is centrally concerned with developing media infra-structure in order to cover development issues (of which the environment is very central), it seems more appropriate that possible future Sida support should be the responsibility of DESO's Media och Kultur rather than UND.

Sida Support to Gemini

Gemini is a London-based non-profit organisation, providing (first and foremost), an international news-features service which places a special emphasis on development. Sida has supported Gemini's training activities in development journalism and environmental reporting which utilise the experience and contacts of the news service operations.

Gemini's training has been qualitatively effective and transparency and accountability, acceptable. Their strength is that they have the contacts to identify training needs of Southern journalists and utilise capable regional trainers to address them. Future Sida support should encourage Gemini to do this more and in the process, re-orientate their role from one of trainers, to one of training facilitators. This is more commensurate with Gemini's training capacity and expertise and will ensure that Sida support is developing Southern training capacity in the course of training journalists.

Gemini, rather than being viewed as an organisation with special emphasis on environmental public awareness, should be viewed as one which provides a media service. This service aims at broadening the horizon of journalists in the South through operations of the news service, use of local journalists, and training. It contributes to media development and promotes media freedom, pluralism and independence. Support for Gemini's operations are clearly more appropriately the responsibility of the Media and Culture Department, rather than UND.

Sida Support to the Sector

The findings of this study with respect to Sida's role, are that there is a need for greater co-ordination within and between Sectors, Divisions and Departments of Sida in order to effectively concentrate current and future support to environmental public awareness and training. This is not news to Sida. The **Summary Proposals for Strategic Development of Sida Support to Environmental Public Awareness and Training**, do not pre-empt Sida plans to any great extent. Sida's "mainstreaming" or conceptual approach which attempts to integrate an environmental dimension into all development policy areas, does not always produce demonstrable results in the short term. The underlying conclusion of this study is that Sida support for Panos, Gemini and TVE is well in line with the handlingsprogram för hållbar utveckling.

Continued support to the 3 organisations is not only in accordance with Sida's development strategies, but essential to the continuity and further development of Sida's efforts in the field of environmental public awareness and training. Above all else, there remains a compelling case for continued Sida support to the 3 organisations which may be summarised as follows:

- (a) The 3 organisations have been cost effective, transparent and exceptionally productive (both qualitatively and quantitatively) in their implementation of Sida and other donor support. They have in the past, and can continue to provide unique services (in their own fields of operations). This same concentration would be hard to achieve through multilateral co-operation; and even more difficult through bilateral co-operation (without a significant increase in the number of NGOs supported). The three organisations have also demonstrated their capacity and initiative in planning and implementation of development programmes. They thus remain an effective conduit for Sida attempts to implement their sectorial policies, strategies and priorities with respect to environmental public awareness and training; as well as media development and democracy building. In short, the activities of the three organisations demonstrate an holistic approach to development which is well in line with Sida's own development philosophy.
- (b) Sida support has not only been of value in quantitative terms, but also as indicative support which provides leverage for other fund-raising. In this regard, Sida should not underestimate the value of its leading role which has been established.
- (c) Sida's investment in the 3 organisations has been substantial: SEK 49,124,100 over the past 10 years. It is the central conclusion of this review that this funding has been well spent. It is incumbent upon Sida to

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

consolidate that expenditure through a continued and constructive co-operation with Panos, TVE and Gemini.

PART I

INTRODUCTION

PART I INTRODUCTION

1 Terms of Reference for the Review

The terms of reference for this review encompass two main elements:

- (i) **Evaluation:** a tri-partite assessment of Panos, TVE and Gemini programmes which Sida has supported over the past 10 years;
- (ii) **Review:** an assessment of how that support has and can contribute to Sida's co-operation within the field of Environmental Public Awareness and Training.

Full details of the terms of reference appear in **ANNEX I**.

2 Scope and Focus of the Review

The scope of the evaluation element examines past achievements and constraints in which the primary foci are the current Sida agreements with Panos, Gemini and TVE. The secondary, (but integral) foci are the 3 organisations' role in promoting environmental public awareness; and their organisational capacity to continue in that role. However it has not been possible to examine this role without a broader perspective of the development activities in which the 3 organisations are involved. This Review thus examines how the organisations have promoted environmental public awareness, but in the context of the organisations' achievements across the broad spectrum of their operations. In the light of these findings, this review draws conclusions and makes recommendations about the effectiveness and sustainability of the 3 organisations. Against this background, this document examines their work in the context of Sida support to the sector - in particular, Sida's development goal on the environment; Sida's handlingsprogram för hållbar utveckling; as well as Sida's sectorial policies, aims and objectives in the fields of media and education.

3 Quantitative and Qualitative Methodology Employed in Conducting the Review

Research for this review was carried out by two consultants between July and November, 1996.

In an effort to maximise primary sources of information, over 150 questionnaires in 5 main formats were despatched via mail fax and e-mail to: donor organisations; partner organisations; individuals and NGOs who have participated in activities implemented by the organisations in the targeted constituencies; as well as other organisations and individuals working in related fields of development. Information solicited in this manner was predominantly qualitative in nature.

Many of these primary sources were followed up through interviews either in person or by telephone and further e-mail communication. Central to this gathering of primary information was an organised schedule of meetings with all relevant staff of the organisations themselves, in London, over two different, one-week periods. These schedules included formal group meetings, brain-storming sessions as well as individual meetings with staff from regional offices. From these meetings, a prodigious amount of documentation was offered and requested, which formed the basis for a predominant proportion of quantitative information used in this review. Secondary sources were supplemented with information from Sida archives as well as through meetings with relevant Sida personnel from the various sectors, divisions and departments.

For Panos and TVE, a point of departure has been the evaluations carried out in 1992 and 1995* respectively. Consideration was also taken of the **preliminary** findings in a recent joint-evaluation of Panos' West Africa programme carried out by DGIS and DANIDA. *The TVE Evaluation in 1995 was commissioned by TVE itself.

As far as possible, a participatory approach has been used by the consultants in conducting this review. This has incorporated consultations with the organisations on the scope and presentation of the review, as well as comments on the first draft. Discussion of the subsequent second draft were conducted with relevant Sida personnel before the production of the final document.

4 Survey Impartiality and Reliability

In terms of impartiality, although a participatory approach was employed in this review, qualitative conclusions and recommendations may be seen as reflecting only the views of the consultants.

PART I INTRODUCTION

The two consultants who have carried out this review, successfully tendered for the job on the basis of their knowledge of the sector and the organisations which work in it; their previous evaluation and media experience - both at a professional and developmental level; and their International Governmental and NGO work experience.

In terms of reliability of the data, limitations which affect conclusions drawn as well as the reliability of the data itself, are considered below in (5).

5 Limitations of the Review

There are 3 significant limitations to this review:

- 5.1 The terms of reference centre on the activities of the 3 organisations which are pertinent to environmental public awareness. Since the organisations are first and foremost media organisations, and secondarily (but integrally), organisations concerned with environmental issues, "pertinence" becomes a relative term. It was thus considered necessary to examine a broad spectrum of the organisations' operations. However, this context does not extend to some activities which are central to the *raison d'être* of (for example) Gemini, which is first and foremost, a news agency; nor, even, some activities for which Sida has provided substantial support during the period under review (for example in the case of Panos, AIDS/HIV Awareness and Reproductive Health programmes). Although such programmes are considered, they are not assessed in any depth here.

An assessment of organisational capacities on the other hand, is less selectively related to environmental public awareness since capacity to implement projects in this area must be seen in context with the overall operations of the organisations. As far as possible, aspects of all activities across the spectrum of their operations, which have bearing on Sida support to the sector, are examined.

- 5.2 An assessment of the impact of Panos and TVE programmes, due to the number of projects and large geographical constituency of the programmes being reviewed, has been difficult. Input from the constituency as well as independent individuals, organisations and other donors has been extensively solicited. However, even the organisations themselves, which have developed strategies for monitoring and evaluation of their programmes, are only beginning to assess their impact. Conclusions in this regard must thus be viewed as indicative only. They are based predominantly on self monitoring by the organisations themselves; and to a lesser extent random sampling amongst constituencies, donors and other organisations. Since field-work was not carried out in the huge constituency itself, this study cannot be considered as a full evaluation of the organisations' programmes.

- 5.3 In Part VII, on the basis of the findings of this review, Summary Proposals for Strategic Development of Sida Support to Environmental Public Awareness and Training have been formulated. In considering these proposals, it should be taken into account that:

- In many project areas funded via det särskilda miljöanslaget, Sida has yet to carry out evaluations;
- Sida is in the process of co-ordinating knowledge about pågående miljöundervisningsinsatser finansierad inom land-ramen;
- Sida's handlingsprogram för hållbar utveckling is an action plan; as such, it is part of a process, and not an empirical document against which the objectives of initiatives can be easily measured.

PART II

CONTEXT OF Sida SUPPORT

1 Sida's Environmental Policy Goal and Sustainable Development Action Plan

The development of Sida's *handlingsprogram för hållbar utveckling* (Jan 1996) (or **Action Plan**) needs to be seen in the light of the four policy goals for development assistance which were adopted by the Swedish Parliament in 1978, namely, to contribute to: economic growth; economic and social equality; economic and political self determination; and democratic development. Although it was made clear that the preservation of ecological balance and natural resources should not be subjugated by striving for economic growth, it was not until 1988 that a fifth environmentally specific policy goal was adopted by Parliament; namely, that Swedish development assistance shall contribute towards the sustainable use of natural resources and the protection of the environment. In the light of this commitment and in accordance with the undertakings arising from Sweden's ratification of the Rio Declaration, Agenda 21, and other international environmental conventions, Sweden has since the 1980s attempted to integrate developmental and environmental issues within its framework of development co-operation.

An official Commission on development co-operation and the environment was set up in 1994 and issued a final report in late 1995, **Sustainable Aid - Swedish Development Assistance after UNCED**. Based on the recommendations of that report, Sida's *handlingsprogram för hållbar utveckling* was developed as an action plan for the implementation of Sida's environmental policy goals.

This Action Plan focuses on development co-operation for sustainable development from the environmental perspective, but it assumes a broad definition of "development" which integrates environmental issues with economic, political, social and cultural ones. Also, central to the Action Plan is the notion that every country bears ultimate responsibility for its own environment and natural resources - as well as working actively for environmentally sustainable development. This necessarily implies that Sida prioritises development co-operation which strengthens and develops recipient countries' own capacity to analyse and manage their own environment. The central objectives of Panos, Gemini and TVE are in accordance with this priority. This review examines how effectively they have reached their objectives.

2 Context of Sida Support for Environmental Public Awareness

Sida's approach to implementing the 5th development goal on the environment has been based on a conceptual approach which seeks to integrate environmental issues into all policy areas. Since 1988, Sida has sought to implement this approach in conjunction with specifically targeted project support in (inter alia) the following broad areas: Sustainable Agriculture and Soil Conservation; Sustainable Forestry; Marine and Coastal Resources; Biodiversity; Ecological Pest Control; Water Resources; Urban Planning; Environmental Economics; and **Environmental Education and Information**. These processes have been overseen by the Environmental Policy Planning Unit within the Policy Division at Sida.

Identified as central to these efforts has been the need to generate awareness and bolster capacity in the South. The *handlingsprogram för hållbar utveckling* provides specificity for this process and the support for Environmental Public Awareness and Training (not least of which includes support for Panos, Gemini and TVE), should be seen in this context.

Whilst Sida's multilateral co-operation in the field of environment and development have little direct bearing on support for the 3 organisations, strategies for the utilisation of special environment allocations are necessarily informed by these multilateral activities. Ostensibly, these activities encompass close co-ordination with the Ministries of Foreign Affairs and the Environment; the National Environmental Protection Agency and other interest groups; as well as follow-up work to UNCED and to the various international conventions on the environment. More pertinently, support to the 3 organisations should be seen in the context of Sida collaboration with international organisations such as IUCN, IIED and World Bank programmes - all of which emphasise training, education and methods-development projects. It may also be seen in a similar context to the support for NGOs, paramountly SNF, which to some extent plays a similar role to Panos and TVE in raising environmental awareness and generating public opinion on environmental issues.

PART II CONTEXT OF Sida SUPPORT

Although some assistance for Panos prior to 1993 came from the Natural Resources and Environment Sector, the current support for the 3 organisations is the responsibility of the Department for Democracy and Social Development (DESO). Agreements with the 3 organisations have been drawn up by the Environmental Education desk, under the Education Division (UND) within DESO. Other divisions within DESO have either been involved on a consultative basis - since the initiatives are as equally concerned with their Department's activities - as is the case with the Media and Culture Department; or have unilaterally funded part of the organisations' programmes - as is the case with the Health Division and Panos' AIDS/HIV and Reproductive Health Programmes.

Finally, the current support for the three organisations needs to be seen in the context of projects financed "inom land-ramen" in 16 programme countries - which utilises funds allocated in a country frame according to a country strategy; as opposed to projects financed via "det särskilda miljöanslaget" (special projects budgets, which includes support to the 3 organisations under review).

This context of Sida support for the 3 organisations is treated further in **Part IV, (1.3) Relevance to Swedish Development Goals and Sectorial Policies, Aims and Objectives**; and in **Part VII, Conclusions and Recommendations**.

The integration of environmental issues into all aspects of development is a basic departure point of Sida's efforts in its development assistance and is in keeping with the conclusions of the two major international fora on the environment: the UN Conferences on Environmental Development (UNCED) in Stockholm, 1972, and Agenda 21 of the Rio Declaration, in Rio, 1992 (which concerns implementation at a local level).

Central to those conclusions, has been the international recognition that sustainable development is not a uni-dimensional concept; and that as a measure of development, economic growth alone is both insufficient and out of date. As a consequence, greater attention is being paid to the relationship between economic growth, poverty and environmental degradation. In the wider context, equally as important is the emphasis on inextricable linkages between the environment and the democratisation of communications and social justice as well as all of the sub issues: media pluralism, human rights, good governance, population, migration, gender equality, health etc.

Clearly, although there remains an international commitment to consider the environmental dimension of development, development agendas have been reshaped by conflict and relief concerns on a scale unprecedented in recent times. Apart from emergency relief, the NGO sector has had to cope with a decline in public financial support for long-term development objectives, as well as reductions in bilateral and multilateral funding.

PART III

DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

PART III DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

1 PANOS

1.1 The Organisation

Founded in 1986 as an independent non-profit organisation, Panos has a decentralised structure with autonomous offices in London, Paris, Washington and Africa. Panos offices are planned for South Asia and Latin America.

Panos researches, generates and provides information for and on neglected or poorly understood development issues. It works with the media, NGOs and governmental agencies to facilitate North-South and South-South dialogue and to stimulate public debate on development issues in the fields of (inter alia): environment, reproductive health and population, HIV/AIDS, poverty, gender, human rights and communications.

Through commissioning features, briefing papers, reports and radio programmes, and disseminating information throughout the North and the South, Panos aims to enable journalists from the South to reach a global audience.

Through the processes of information gathering, analysis and dissemination; and through their support of workshops and seminars; as well as through training and fellowships, Panos aims to: build new skills both in the media and among community groups and networks; and work with marginalized groups to help them gain access to a wider public and to decision-making bodies.

1.2 Project Support History

Co-operation between Sida and Panos began in 1987.

Total Sida funding 1987 - 1996 **SEK 32,594,100**

Funding sources and programmes, excluding assistance which may have been provided directly or indirectly from miljöundervisningsinsatser finansierade inom land-ramen, may be summarised as follows:

Table 2: Panos Support from Sida Natural Resources & Environment Division; and DESO 1987 - 1996

Regional Partnerships Programme	
Phases II-IV (1987-1996)	SEK 18,300,000
Nordic Conference (1987)	SEK 190,000
Agroforestry Guide (1987-1989)	SEK 430,000
Greenlink Phases I&II (1989-1991)	SEK 1,498,600
Apartheid & Environment (1989/90)	SEK 1,130,000
Media Briefings (1993-1996)	SEK 2,000,000
TOTAL	SEK 23,549,100

Table 3: Panos Support from Sida DESO/Health Division, 1987 - 1996

AIDS Programme (1989-1996)	SEK 6,500,000
Health 2000	SEK 500,000
Reproductive Health Prog. (1993-1996)	SEK 1,300,000
TOTAL	SEK 8,300,000

Table 4: Panos Support from Other Sida Divisions, 1987 - 1997

Rural Electrification (1989)	SEK 175,000
Migrant Communities (1991)	SEK 500,000
Panoscope (1989)	SEK 70,000
TOTAL	SEK 745,000

For full details of the above, please refer to ANNEX 10.

PART III DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

1.3 Sida Inputs Relative to Other Bi-lateral Donors

Sida input relative to other donor inputs for all programmes including the **Regional Partnerships Programme (1993-1996)**, and **Media Briefing Documents** during the same period, may be summarised as follows:

Table 5: Sida Input Relative to Other Bi-lateral Donors, Regional Partnerships Programme, 1993 - 1996

Sida	28%
DANIDA	19% * not including 96/97 grant of £323,000
DGIS	13%
EC	13%
NORAD	12%
ODA	7%
Others	8% * including: BMZ, SDC/DDA, FINNIDA

For full details please refer to ANNEX 7.

Table 6: Sida Inputs Relative to Other Donors for the Media Briefing Documents ,1993-1995

Sida	69%
ODA	31%

For full details please refer to ANNEX 8.

1.4 Constituency, Aims and Objectives

The constituency for Panos activities may be described not only as community groups, marginalized and minority groups in the South, but media, NGOs and governmental agencies as well as the wider public and decision makers both in the North and the South.

The aims and objectives of Panos programmes should be seen not as those of a supra-Panos organisation but as having special emphasis according to the needs in various regions in which they operate - but all subscribing to core values. These aims and objectives may be summarised as follows:

EAST AFRICA AND THE HORN

- To increase the quantity and quality of sustainable development information in the media, with a special focus on increasing the flow of information and ideas, to and from rural areas, through support for vernacular language media where appropriate.
- To strengthen national institutions contributing to development understanding and debate in the media; and to strengthen the skills of journalists working with these institutions;
- To give journalists from different countries in the region the opportunity to work together, to study, research and write/broadcast about key development issues from a regional perspective; these programmes aim to generate substantial and in-depth media coverage of the issues in the national media, so as to have an impact on public opinion and on decision makers.
- To promote the use of Panos outputs in the region, and to generate information about regional issues for Panos productions.

SOUTHERN AFRICA

- To stimulate and inform debate, so as to bring about change towards more sustainable development
- To work in partnership with other information actors, such as media, journalists, professional organisations, citizens groups and NGOs, both to produce and disseminate better information on sustainable development issues, and to strengthen their information capacities
- To increase the capacity of media and NGOs to analyse key environment and development issues for themselves, and to subject national and international policy to a more rigorous, informed and constructive analysis
- To enable them to communicate the results of this analysis to a wide public, especially via radio and the vernacular press; to support the development of a plural media, most especially, community based development orientated radio.

PART III DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

- To develop with NGOs and media, mechanisms for communication more effectively, the aspirations and perceptions of people outside the political elite, and to inject these ideas into national and regional decision-making processes.

SOUTH ASIA

- To select with partner organisations, one priority thematic issue per year, on which to focus, in order to maximise the potential impact on policy and public awareness
- To ensure maximum quality, relevance and usefulness of information produced
- To strengthen the commissioning and information generating capacities of partner organisations
- To increase the capacities of journalists in vernacular languages to cover sustainable development issues
- To raise understanding of sustainable development among journalists and to increase their links with NGOs

SAHEL PROGRAMME

- To support the emergence and development of a pluralistic media, able to provide a range of information and ideas, and offer a platform for expression for all sectors of civil society
- To encourage specialist journalism and information production on specific themes linked to sustainable development, in particular, environment and human rights

CENTRAL AMERICA AND CARIBBEAN

- To build capacity, partnerships with local and regional organisations and encourage constructive interaction between NGOs and the media.
- To sensitise journalists and increase information flows within the region, and North/South.

1.5 PANOS Inputs

Panos does not generate any significant degree of its running costs nor costs for its activities. Panos inputs which are central to Sida funding are thus predominantly "in kind" and may be summarised as personnel who plan, implement and monitor and follow-up programmes. In addition to these central inputs, Panos provides production support and limited capital grants in support of capacity and institutional building in the South. Tantamountly, their input is one of provision, generation and dissemination of information. These outputs are adequately described in Part IV.

1.6 Relevant Outputs and Activities

The following Panos outputs of the Regional Partnerships Programme and Media Briefing Documents were achieved with Sida support during the period 1993 - 1996.

Table 7: Summary of Panos RPP & MBD Activities and Outputs Supported by Sida 1993 - 1996

- | |
|--|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• 23 media briefings written and distributed to journalists and media outlets world-wide.• 6 editions of Panoscope magazine published and plans for a new on-line magazine developed.• 255 Panos Features written by journalists from the South.• 13 Panos Books and 5 reports published.• Co-syndication agreements with 10 media partners in the South operational in 12 languages.• 110 Fellowships awarded to journalists world-wide.• 60 grants given to Southern Partners for their own information production or capacity building• 43 skills training and awareness-raising workshops and seminars run.• 648 full pages and 5 supplements (totalling 44 pages) on environment published in African newspapers.• 3 West African journalists awards in West Africa.• Radio outputs: 206 programmes produced from Paris and Bamako; 36 Down to Earth Programmes produced by London; 7 pilot Mi Tierra programmes, 30 radio spots and 30 messages produced by Washington. |
|--|

For further details please refer to ANNEX 3

PART III DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

These outputs do not comprehensively reflect all the programmes and activities in which Panos is involved - even in the Regional Partnerships programme. Sida in effect contributes to all of Panos' activities since they provide core support to Panos; and the fact that there are strong inter-linkages between all Panos programmes. Of the other activities, the most relevant activities which are referred to in the body of this review are:

- Panos AIDS/HIV Programme (supported directly through Sida DESO/HÄLSO)
- Panos Reproductive Health and Women's Rights Programme (supported directly through Sida DESO/HÄLSO)
- Panos Oral Testimony Programme
- Media Pluralism in West Africa Programme
- Migration Programme

Presented in ANNEX 3 (3.1) is a directory for accessing: information outputs; a list of partner organisations; seminars conferences and workshops; fellowships; and support to in-country capacity building and information activities for the period 1993 - 1996. These appendices provide the best summary of outputs and activities. A more detailed account of these Outputs may be found in Part IV .

1.7 Participation, Affiliations and Collaboration

Please refer to PART IV (2.3)

2 GEMINI NEWS SERVICE

2.1 The Organisation

Gemini News Service is the trading name of News-Scan International Ltd., a company owned by NewsConcern International Foundation which was formed in 1983. Gemini is a London-based non-profit organisation which provides first and foremost, an international news-features service which places a special emphasis on development. It's service is subscription based, currently providing 12 illustrated features per week to about 100 newspapers, magazines and broadcasting stations predominantly in Africa, Asia and the Pacific. Subscriptions account for about 55% of expenditure; other operational costs are provided by donors and/or partner organisations with whom Gemini collaborates.

Features output is predominantly by journalists reporting from their own countries, on a freelance basis. Gemini's "niche" is that they obtain and run stories with a Southern perspective on development (and other) issues which are under reported or ignored by mainstream media. These activities are complemented by Gemini Graphics operations.

The core of Gemini operations, although not the exclusive domain, is print media. The basis of Gemini's training activities in development journalism and environmental reporting is firmly entrenched in the experience gained and contacts made through their 30 years of news service operations. Workshops utilise their in-house journalists, as well as journalist-trainers from the regions.

2.2 Sida Project Support History

Sida has supported the following Gemini activities between 1985 - 1996

Table 8: Total Sida Support to Gemini, 1985 - 1996

Rural Reporting Programmes 1985-1988	SEK 690,000
Environmental Reporting Series: W/S, Handbook 1989/90 - 1992/93	SEK 840,000
Development Journalism Workshops 1992/93 - 1994/95 4 workshops @ SEK 450,000	SEK 1,800,000
Environmental Reporting Workshops 1995/96 - 1996 3 workshops @ SEK 450,000	SEK 1,350,000
TOTAL 1985 - 1986	SEK 4,680,000

PART III DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

2.3 Sida Support Relative to Other Donors

Environmental and Development journalist training workshops held in African countries between 1993 and 1996, were funded exclusively by Sida. Other donors have contributed to workshops in Asia. However, funding for activities which are also training orientated, but which are related predominantly to the news features service are:

Table 9: Sida Support to Gemini Relative to Other Donors, 1993 - 1996

Donor	Support	1993-96 SEK*
IDRC	Internship, (Canadian)	430,000
Regina University	Internship, (Canadian)	105,000
DANIDA	Internship (African)	402,000
CIDA	News Agency	2,500,000
UNICEF	News Agency	365,000
ODA	Rural Reporting Prog.	450,000
UNDP	Environmental. Reporting W/S (Asia)	65,000
IPPF	"	65,000
UNFPA	"	65,000

* Approx. conversion rates: For further details, please refer also to ANNEX 11, Audited Accounts FYs 1993 - 1995: Gemini.

2.4 Training Constituency, Aims and Objectives

Gemini's training activities in Development Journalism and Environmental Reporting Workshops have traditionally targeted (predominantly African) correspondents at senior reporter and news editor level, who contribute to Gemini news service copy. Subscribers are also asked to make nominations for candidature. Participants have thus in no way been restricted to independent media nor print media but have included journalists from government owned as well as the corporate print and broadcast media - in Francophone, Portuguese speaking as well as English speaking countries.

This constituency includes journalists from the following countries: Benin, Cameroon, Cote d'Ivoire, The Gambia, Ghana, Liberia, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, Togo, Kenya, Malawi, Tanzania, Zambia, Zimbabwe, Uganda, Rwanda and Angola.

It would be incorrect to separate objectives of the Development Journalism from Environmental Reporting Workshops since the latter is an integral part of the former. There has however, been a different emphasis on environmental issues as can be seen below.

Objectives common to the two series of workshops have been (inter alia): to improve the skills of journalists to cover specialist issues in a newsy manner whilst also raising their awareness of the responsibility for professionalism and quality in their work. This includes the responsibility for ensuring that rural and environmental issues are seen as integral aspects of development; as well as seeing that political issues are covered in the context of their social and economic ramifications. These aspects of journalism are encapsulated in the responsibility to communicate without bias, in order to help audiences make independent decisions on development issues. Central to the workshops is the examination of the role of journalism and the media in the development processes.

Short term aims have included:

- to explore ways of effectively covering issues to maximise impact; to inculcate and reinforce participants skills in writing and fundamental investigative reporting;
- to explore ways of maximising perspectives of rural and traditionally neglected viewpoints.

Longer term aims have included:

- the development of journalistic credibility;

PART III DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

- linking the role of free, pluralistic and independent media to good governance; and by building on the above, to persuade media "gate-keepers" in both private and government-controlled media, to allocate resources to the development of media professionalism;
- to improve the exchange of information between the North and South.

In terms of environmental emphasis in the most recent series of workshops, central objectives have included:

- to improve the knowledge of Southern journalists about environmental development issues;
- to stimulate more media coverage of environmental issues and encourage an increase in the N/S and S/S flows of development information;
- to raise the quality and quantity of stories on environmental issues and place them in context with equally as important issues on sustainable development;
- to increase the capacity of Southern media to educate their audiences on the environment and related issues.

2.5 Gemini Inputs

Gemini's main inputs are their London-based staff and resources; as well as contacts and resource people from the regions. It is fair to say that the integral nature of Gemini's training and news service activities - including their extensive graphics activities - are all Gemini inputs to Sida supported activities. Most Sida funded workshops have been subsidised to some extent from Gemini income.

2.6 Relative Outputs and Activities

The TOR for this review stipulate that the primary focus of the evaluation element is the current agreement between Gemini and Sida. However the DESO decision on this agreement was only signed in February 1996 and covers 3 Environmental Reporting Workshops; the most recent was only completed in June 1996 and the final one is scheduled to be completed in November 1996. The consultants have thus found it necessary to consider a broader scope of relevant training activities, including the period 1993-1995 in order to gain a better qualitative picture. Although Sida support during this period was for "Development Journalism Workshops" the new title of support is more a shift in emphasis on the environment, than a new direction in training. Conclusions about those activities may be seen as indicative and representative of the activities in the current agreement 1995/96.

The relevant outputs for the period 1993 -1996 were the following workshops:

Table 10: Gemini Outputs Supported by Sida, 1993 - 1996

Development Journalism Workshops		
Oct	1993	Windhoek, Namibia
Apr	1994	Lusaka, Zambia
Nov	1994	Freetown, Sierra Leone
Apr/May	1995	Dar es Salaam, Tanzania
Environmental Reporting Workshops		
Feb	1996	Kampala, Uganda
June	1996	Accra, Ghana
Oct	1996	Windhoek, Namibia

In addition to the substantial output from Gemini's news service activities, two quality journalist training manuals on Rural and Environmental Reporting were produced.

Activities of each workshop which have addressed the objectives outlined in (2.4) above, have been (inter alia):

- discussions on the breadth and range of environmental issues;
- examining the role of governments, NGOs and the public in promoting sustainable development;

PART III DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

- exploring ways in which media "gate-keepers" can be persuaded to facilitate increased quality and quantities of environmental information for the public;
- assigned papers for presentation and discussion from individual participants and resource people - bringing to the workshops, country specific profiles;
- field trips involving report writing, forming the basis for work on writing skills and copy for editing;
- use of graphics and pictures.

2.7 Collaboration and Co-operation

Gemini has collaborated with Panos on the environmental education project (Panos features - which are now contracted to IPS). Gemini contributes to the work of, and/or collaborates with IFJ, UNDP, UNFPA, UNICEF, whereby these agencies seek Gemini's expertise in editorial training in specialist subjects. Gemini also collaborates with the CJA in the programming of workshops and in the bi-annual journalism conferences. Most journalists Associations in all target countries are consulted with respect to candidature for all workshops run by Gemini.

3 TVE

3.1 The Organisation

TVE is a non-profit organisation which was set up in London in 1984 by the UN Environment programme (UNEP), WWF and the independent film producer Central Television (UK). Today it is also represented in Japan, the USA and Sri Lanka as well as through a wide-spread network of distribution offices around the world.

UNEP and WWF foresaw in the early 80's that television and radio would become the dominant communications media of the near future. The fast growing number of TV-sets around the world and the exploding market for satellite and cable channels indicated that a far larger audience could be reached with audio-visual material than by the written word, and eventually be more cost-effective. The two organisations also recognised the difficulties and the delicate position of the UN agencies in reporting independently on critical aspects of environment.

TVE's mission is to turn global development and environmental issues into television programmes, and to ensure their distribution. Often TVE acts as a catalyst raising funds for the films without entering into productions itself. It acts as a bridge between non-broadcast agencies like i.a. Sida and the UN and the television industry. Its catalytic role embraces acquiring film rights for distribution in the South, bringing together producers from different continents and stimulating co-productions South-South and South-North. It aims at supporting Southern film professionals to portray their own perspectives and priorities on urgent development issues: environment, poverty, gender, human rights and health. In this way TVE facilitates the building of capacity of Southern Film makers. With the dramatic changes in the political landscape of the former USSR and Eastern Europe, TVE's geographical area of concern has come to include these countries.

In 1987, the Moving Pictures distribution service was launched to ensure that the films would also reach the South. Moving Pictures programme is a clearinghouse for information about environment and development films, which includes co-productions by TVE, but a majority are films by others. TVE's policy is to buy the rights from independent producers in the South. It has traditionally relied on the goodwill of major broadcasters like the BBC or NRK to secure programmes for non-profit distribution. Since 1992, TVE distribution has been decentralised to a world-wide net of local Video Resource Centres (VRCs) developed by TVE. They copy from master films and distribute them to i.a.: national and local broadcasters, NGOs, universities and women groups at reduced prices or free of charge. Marketing methods include: a data base, bulletins, catalogues, promotional flyers and faxed mail-shots.

PART III DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

3.2 Project Support History

Co-operation between TVE and SIDA started in 1990.

Total Sida funding 1990 - 1996 **SEK 11, 850,000**

Funding sources and programmes may be summarised as follows:

Table 11 Total Sida Support for TVE

DESO	
<i>Developing Stories,</i>	SEK 300,000
Swedish Embassy, Gabarone	
Botswana Awareness and Training for the National Conservation Strategy	SEK 650,000
DESO (Worldview International Foundation)	
Indigenous Programme Production in sub-Saharan Africa	SEK1,000,000
Natur/DESO	
The Moving Pictures service	
1990-92	SEK3,600,000
1992 -94	SEK4,500,000
1994 evaluation	SEK 300,000
1996 extension	SEK1,500,000
Sub Total	SEK9,900,000
Swedish Agenda 21 Trust Fund/UNEP	
Hardware supply and training to VRCs	SEK 680,000

3.3 Sida Inputs relative to other donors

This review will concentrate on the two latest agreements covering 1992-94 and 1996. Sida inputs in the Moving Pictures project may be summarised as follows:

Table 12: Sida Inputs Relative to Other Donors 1993 - 1996

	1993-94 %	1996 %
Sida	23,5	20.3
WWF International	19,5	-
Swiss Development Co-operation	13,5	1.4
Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs	9,5	7.6
Danida	6	9.1
Unep	4,5	8.6
European Commission	4	20.2
Finnish Environment	3	-
Unicef	3	-
BMZ	3	3.9
Rockefeller Foundation	3	-
ODA	1	-
WWF, Netherlands	1	-

PART III DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

Commonwealth Foundation	0,5	-
TVE Japan	-	4.5
Novib	-	20.7
Turner CNN	-	2

Figures for 1996 will be submitted by TVE

During 1994 WWF had to withdraw its support for TVE as well as for others. WWF's funding had been for three years only and conditional on TVE establishing the distribution office in Zeist, the Netherlands. It led to a move of the distribution from the WWF television office in Zeist to TVE's office in London.

3.4 TVE Inputs

Approximately 90% of TVE's total turnover is in the form of subsidies; 10% is generated through sales. Moving Pictures distribution service income from sales is higher; audited accounts for 1995 show a figure of 20%, and TVE's forecast for 1996 is somewhat higher.

TVE has a young industrious staff, which is very aware of financial constraints and increasing difficulties with fund-raising. It certainly recognises the need for cost recovery. As an 'investor' in new productions, TVE exploits its rights to exhibit the productions, and manages to squeeze out a certain percentage from the income of sales in commercial territories to cover over-heads. Income from co-production and sales of productions has risen from nil in the late 1980s to approximately 20% of the Moving Pictures service in 1994/95. It demonstrates that there is a market for the environmental and development products in low and middle income countries. TVE has also successfully negotiated with the tax authorities to gain tax exemptions because of its status as a NGO.

3.5 Constituency, Aims and Objectives

TVE's overall aim is to make programmes available on a diversity of topics, and in a variety of genres, that can create a greater understanding of the complex links between resource depletion, social inequity, poverty, health and environmental degradation.

Its top priority is to reach broadcasters with topical good quality films on development and environment so as to reach its principal constituency : the every day viewer - primarily in low and middle income countries. National, international, regional and local broadcasters all have established audiences and are thus effective disseminators of information on e.g. gender, health and environment. Television constitutes a powerful means of providing knowledge and tools for debate and action.

Policy planners, decision-makers and primary actors in the South and North on all levels - national, regional and local - are all targets groups. International conferences like The Earth Summit, the Beijing Fourth World Conference on Women, August 1995 and Habitat, 1996 have been fora for presentations of TVE in general and the Moving Pictures programme in particular. Non-broadcasters such as NGOs, educational organisations, universities and foundations are also among those who respond and order films and TV programmes. TVE classifies these groups as multipliers. Since the films come without copyright restrictions, there are no bars on the users to copy, lend or use them as they wish.

With Video Resource Centres established in Asia and the Pacific, Southern Africa, West Africa, Eastern Europe and Latin America, TVE can operate in all regions. The VRCs are meant to grow as self-reliant entities and therefor represent a way for TVE to develop local capacity. TVE's support to indigenous film producers is another step in developing an 'infra-structure' for national audio-visual production.

PART III DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

The objectives can be summarised as :

- to educate the public
- to foster cultural self-expression
- to stimulate participation
- to catalyse debate
- to raise awareness
- to support women, children and indigenous people

3.6 Relevant Outputs and Activities

The Moving Pictures programme has been the recipient of the bulk of Sida's support over the years. It has been core support to a programme with the following activities:

Distribution Service: _

Approximately 22,000 films have been distributed during 1992-96 of which 30% went to broadcasters.

Development of Video Resource Centres

46 Video Resource Centres have been established since 1992: 16 in Africa, 15 in Asia, 11 in Latin America and 4 in Eastern Europe. Several are self-reliant while others are in their infancy.

6 Regional VRC work shops have taken place in Nairobi, Johannesburg, Colombo, Pretoria, Senegal and Sao Paulo to develop the VRCs' capacities and establish regional networks. The workshops in Sao Paulo and Johannesburg were a direct result of Swedish funding.

The first issue of the VRC Newsletter came out in August 1996. It will be a means for world-wide communication and to provide information on new films.

Moving Pictures Bulletin

11 Moving Pictures Bulletins have been issued during the last four years. The bulletin contains information and background on the latest films. Recently, it has included thematic issues on i.a.: women, human rights and small islands.

Data base

The database includes 2,000 film titles, stock of videos, ordering and technical information on the films as well as 300 film and video free lancers, 3,018 NGO contacts, 510 broadcasters, 218 productions companies, 725 educational institutions as well as governmental agencies and UN offices.

Internet - on line information

A year ago TVE entered the World Wide Web on the Oxford based 'One world on line'. Those who make inquiries are referred to the web, which provides information on all TVE activities. Visitors amount to 1,200 - 1,500 per week. Currently there are few on-line data bases in the development sector.

The web-site also offers the documentary series *Earth Report*, which is produced in collaboration with WWF and is broadcast daily by BBC World Television on satellite direct to 50 million households and to bigger audiences via terrestrial transmissions.

Film Catalogue

The Sida grant has enabled the production of the distribution catalogue *Moving Pictures 6*. It is printed in 12,000 copies and contains 362 films. It's an easy to read listing of films available, which are categorised in eighteen different topics ranging from endangered species to child slavery. There are two indexes; themes and countries.

PART III DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

Footage library

The library supplies copyright-free material from TVE's own productions for educational or campaign activities. TVE's library of over 700 hours of international broadcast standard footage is an unique global resource. Three years ago an Italian company tried to buy it. TVE has utilised the resource in a stop-start fashion responding to TV station and NGO requests for thematic footage as well as making made-to-order compilation videos for international agencies on issues as diverse as practical steps to safeguard the ozone layer, the link between poverty and environmental destruction and a music video promoting awareness of urban issues.

Training courses

The Sida support in 1996 to the Moving Pictures programme has also been directed to **up-grade TVE's own staff**. It has been provided with Desk top publishing courses, a Data base Course and a Presentation course.

Sida support has also been directed towards **film production** to enhance the capacity of Southern Film makers. Money given to the indigenous programme production via WIF in sub-Saharan Africa resulted in a series of locally made videos. These were assessed by the film-makers themselves at a workshop in Johannesburg. That workshop called on TVE/WIF/Sida to help them produce more professional programmes. The result was *Africa Express*. It is a series of 24 individual reports on stories which intrigue Africans themselves. They are produced by three African reporters and local crews, in the form of on-the-job training.

A forerunner was the co-funding of the first series of *Developing Stories* broadcast in advance of the 1992 Earth Summit. It included 6 local co-productions in Brazil, Burkina Faso, India, Lebanon, the Philippines and the Caribbean. The films have been shown on Swedish Television (UR).

TVE has a policy of giving preference to informal on-the-job training and not become involved in **formal training projects**, but exceptions have been made for projects in Pakistan, Uganda, Solomon Islands, Estonia and Botswana. The latter has been a three year video-production, training and dissemination project for the National Conservation Strategy in Botswana completed in 1995.

3.7 Participation in Global Television Consortium

TVE's director was appointed co-chairman of GTC before it developed into YA*TV. African film-making projects resulted from this initiative, e.g. the TV series *Africa Express*. Funding was channelled via Worldview International Foundation. TVE has been a major supplier of bulk programming to YA*TV and continues to co-operate closely with WIF/YA*TV. Currently TVE is re-editing its *Earth Report* for transmission in Asia on behalf of WIF/YA*TV.

3.8 Other Participation, Affiliations and Co-operation

TVE is the quintessential partnership organisation; fulfilling its role as broker between donors and NGOs on one hand and broadcasters and producers on the other, is based on partnership. Since 1984 the production and the co-production of over 250 programmes of varying lengths (between 5 and 90minute specials, as well as series) has involved TVE in literally hundreds of partnership endeavours.

TVE is presently involved in producing a documentary series *Earth Report* together with WWF, Carlton Television and BBC. *Earth Report* is a 5 minute documentary news feature on the state of our planet. BBC World broadcasts the same piece once daily for a week, and reaches by satellites an estimated audience of 50 million households around the world (excluding the UK). It is broadcast in English, Japanese, Spanish and soon in Russian, and is also available on Internet. *Earth Report* is a response to a recommendation of 16 key donor agencies meeting in Bellagio, Italy for the need for a global news service on sustainable development.

PART III DESCRIPTION OF SUPPORT

Together with Channel 4 in the UK, TVE has invited directors to make a series of their vision of the 21st Century to be called *Millennium*. It will be a follow-up to the series *Developing Stories* consisting of 14 films, which was partly supported by Sida. Channel 4 has already provided US\$ 40,000 for research and development and is committed to providing another US\$ 1,000,000 to co-finance six, 60-minute documentaries. TVE is currently putting together a consortium of European broadcasters to co-finance the series. Grants also come from ODA and Danida.

TVE has also worked together with CNN International in Atlanta on producing and distributing the short film *People Count*. Three minute versions of TVE programmes are also going out on the CNN World Report through a tie-up with UN - TV in New York.

Other productions in the planning stage involve: the Finnish television, YLE - a three film project in Estonia, the Latvian Juris Podnieks Studio - the series *Growing up* and *Democracy Express*, TV in Ukraine on industrial pollution, NHK Japan on a series on biodiversity and music format road journey in Latin America.

TVE has recently finished a 30 minute documentary for the World Food summit, for which all the stories were shot by production companies appointed by the Video Resource Centres. Grants from Novib and the Netherlands government will enable TVE to continue this closer collaboration with VRCs as will a one-off grant for a production on dryland rehabilitation funded by Norad.

PART IV

PANOS FINDINGS

**Achievements, Constraints, Organisational Capacity,
Effectiveness & Sustainability**

1 Aims and Objectives

1.1 Focus

At its inception in 1986, global public awareness of environmental issues was very low. Panos aims and objectives thus reflected a priority concern with the environment. However, the focus of Panos programmes has evolved in response to regionally specific needs which has placed varying degrees of emphasis on the environment. In the Southern Africa and South Asian programmes for example, the emphasis on environmental awareness in the late 1980s was paramount. Programmes in the late 1990s however, whilst still emphasising environmental awareness, will need to concentrate on action for implementation of policy which has been formulated as a result of such awareness. In the late 1980s, West Africa on the other hand presented Panos with a dilemma: how to raise environmental awareness in a region without a developed and independent media. West African focus has consequently been on media pluralism in order to facilitate environmental awareness. This has also involved an increasing concern with other issues linked to the strengthening of civil society: human rights, conflict prevention etc. Central America and the Caribbean programmes have evolved to respond to the needs of a region which is characterised by a number of countries, often small and displaying cultural, political and linguistic and political variety. Programmes have thus concentrated on overcoming constraints, size and diversity through forging alliances.

Underpinning this pluralistic approach is the shared belief by all Panos programmes, that diversity or pluralism in civil society is inextricably linked to sustainable, people-centred development. Whilst this has meant placing an increasingly greater emphasis on social development, justice and democratic communications, it has in no way diminished the importance of the environment as an issue. It does however, place the environment in a more pragmatic context with other integral development issues such as health, population, gender, poverty, human rights and communication.

Perhaps equally as important as the Panos focus has been the development of modalities for addressing their aims and objectives. This has seen an increasing emphasis by all offices, on decentralising their operation to the South in order to more effectively address planning, implementation and follow-up of programmes.

1.2 Clarity and Relevance to Constituency

A strength of the Panos evolution as described above is that with increasing autonomy of the 3 Northern offices, and particularly because of the emphasis on decentralising Panos offices from the North to the South, they are increasingly able to respond to the priorities and characteristics of the regions in which they operate. Information strategies have been developed which are tailored to specific needs in regional and national programmes. The clarity of their aims and objectives are thus enhanced by the strong Southern perspectives they encompass. Perhaps most central to the relevance of these aims and objectives is the recognition by Panos of the importance of transferring resources and expertise to the South and creating strong and dynamic local institutions.

1.3 Relevance to Swedish Development Goals and Sectorial Policies and Objectives

Support for Panos programmes epitomises Sida's conceptual approach to the implementation of their environmental policy goal, which seeks to integrate environmental issues into all policy areas of their development assistance. Panos demonstrates inter-linkages between their programmes which (in theory) exists between Sida Sectors and Divisions - pertinently, within DESO and especially those of: Health; Media and Culture; Democracy, Human Rights and Conflict Management; and Education.

Unquestionably (albeit emphasis varies), Panos aims and objectives are relevant to Sida's development goals. Illustratively, this is endorsed in the examination of Panos achievements throughout this review - it is unnecessary to elaborate further here. What is of significance is that Panos has demonstrated an holistic approach to sustainable people-centred development, epitomising Sida's own development philosophy. This however, has not been entirely reflected in Sida's own approach to supporting Panos. In seeking to integrate environmental issues into all policy areas and decentralise responsibility for taking them into

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

account, it is apparent that even within DESO, there is a paucity of overall knowledge between divisions about support to a single organisation.

2 Achievement of Aims and Objectives

One of the main objectives of Sida's support in the field of Environmental Public Awareness is to strengthen local counterparts' own initiatives in the South - in order to raise public understanding and awareness of environmental issues. The core activities of the Panos Regional Partnerships Programme and Media Briefings have demonstrably contributed to the achievement of this goal; indeed, this strengthening of Southern partners' capacities and own initiatives may be seen as central to Panos' *raison d'être*.

Indications from donors, partner organisations and individuals who were surveyed independently by the consultants, would endorse the Panos conclusions from their own monitoring and evaluation activities that information outputs have provided and made accessible, good quality regional and international information in the South which stimulates informed debate in civil society; as well as promoting political environments which acknowledge public opinion. Programmes have contributed to the building of in-country capacity to analyse issues and communicate that analysis to the public through the print and broadcast media. This has facilitated North/South, N/N and S/S exchange of information which carries a Southern perspective.

What appears to remain largely under-evaluated however, is the extent to which Panos programmes have contributed to the capacity of the public, however limited, to communicate or have communicated, their opinions into the policy making process.

A better contextual view of the extent to which Panos programmes have addressed their aims and objectives can be gained by grouping activities into 3 broad areas:

2.1 Information outputs

2.2 In-country capacity building and information

2.3 Regional Partners, Participation and Collaboration

2.1 Information Outputs

Information outputs include: Media Briefings; Features Service; Magazine publishing (Panoscope); Radio; Books and teaching materials publishing. Where possible, Web site and e-mail have made information readily accessible. Panos has surveyed the effectiveness and availability of communications technology in their programme countries and responded accordingly. (Most countries in the South still require the printed and posted format.)

2.1.1 Media Briefings

The frequency and regularity of media briefings (6 per year - periodic, topically and linguistic specific) is impressive. Also impressive is the distribution - approx 1000 journalists in 105 countries, and 480 NGOs in the South; as well as 1000 international media outlets - incorporating use of materials in 32 different languages used in translation.

The potential impact of Media Briefings are enhanced by production which attempts to coincide thematically with the Panos Features packages. Another strength is the inter-linkage between the briefings, other related projects as well as other information outputs.

Whilst the surveyed constituency had little untoward to say about relevance or quality of the media briefings, some commented on the style of the documents which in their opinions contained too much development jargon and were too rhetorical in nature. The majority of these critics were journalists who possibly hoped for more packaged copy which they could use directly in their publications. It is apparent that this is not the primary intent of the documents which Panos sees as promoting stories and increasing journalists' capacity to cover an issue. Panos acknowledges that they initially tried to write briefings for a broad audience which led to an inconsistency of style and a lack of focus. They are now attempting to target briefings more

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

carefully for Southern journalists. A Panos London project review (1995-96) of London Media Briefings indicates that of 2600 recipients surveyed, 81% use them as a primary source of information. **Presented in ANNEX 3 (3.1) is a directory for accessing relevant information on all titles.**

2.1.2 Panos Features

Panos produced 255 Features between 1993 and 1996; issues covered were: 24% environment; 10% health; 13% agriculture; 12% AIDS/HIV; and 10% gender issues. The other 31% covered a variety of issues related to development.

An important aspect of the features production was that there were 125 different authors - 81% Southern journalists and 37% of them women. Equally important is the South - North communication. Panos Features work actively to place Southern journalists perspectives in European media (although no firm statistics are available on this).

Features reached 210 newspapers, 49 magazines and over 100 other media outlets including NGO publications, radio stations and news agencies. They are also distributed through IPS to a further 1000 media outlets and 4,000 NGOs. This link with IPS should be seen as a cost effective way of distribution and hence effecting a greater potential impact of Panos Features. Co-syndication agreements with regional partners means that Features can be translated in to 12 languages and reach a further 1000 local magazines and newspapers.

Panos has acknowledged that an evaluation of the impact of the Features service is difficult to make - even amongst recipients and users. Only 16% of their recipients survey replied to the 1995/96 survey. Whilst this survey proved very positive feedback in terms of relevance and topicality of the features, Panos needs to strategize around more comprehensive monitoring and assessment of impact in order to maximise future effectiveness. **Presented in ANNEX 3 (3.1) is a directory for accessing relevant information on all titles.**

2.1.3 Panoscope/Transmedia On-Line

Panoscope ceased as a publication in 1994. The major aim of the magazine was to present a Southern perspective to international media as well as to increase the capacity of Southern journalist to write on development issues. The magazine gave 56% of content to environmental issues; Southern countries accounted for three quarters of the distribution which was 8100 per issues in over 160 countries.

Independent feedback from Southern journalists indicate that Panoscope was too "glossy" in style, too singularly concerned with environmental issues to the neglect of other development issues, and too development jargon orientated. Panos acknowledged in 1994 that the magazine had lost it "cutting edge" since many more similar magazines had been established. In 1994, Panos made plans to launch the New Angles magazine; targeted at the Southern audience and concerned with democratic communications, technology and media in development. Funding for the new magazine was not secured and Panos had to look to a more cost effective solution.

Transmedia On-Line was proposed in the light of new available technologies with similar target and objectives as New Angles. It is an e-mail information and conference site concerning itself with media development. Panos is currently seeking partner affiliates to utilise and share in the costs of the project.

Without prejudice, it may be noted that Panoscope was exceptionally costly relative to other outputs for the period. Considering the negative feedback received, Panos made a good decision to scrap it.

2.1.4 Radio

The central aim of Panos' radio activities has been to increase the capacity of radio journalists in the South to analyse and report on environmental and development issues. However, Panos activities (especially in West Africa), support the development of independent radio stations (equipment grants; upgrading capacity of existing stations; working for legislation changes in broadcasting which impedes on the development of community radio; technical training support; and support to the emergence of networks at a national level, like URTEL; and at a regional level, like WAIBA.)

Generally, (although the West African programme may be the exception), Panos activities in the field of radio, are not geared towards providing management training, capital costs or establishment logistics. Over and above prohibitive broadcasting legislation, these areas may be viewed as the major impediments to radio pluralism in the South. Panos is not, and emphatically strives not to be, perceived as a donor organisation. Nor is it in a position to meet capital intensive costs. Nevertheless, feedback from the region indicates that many community radio groups feel that feasibility studies, management training, and establishment logistics are a priority in the South.

The core of Panos radio activities (which aim to build capacity) have been:

(a) Down to Earth Radio (Southern Africa, the Horn & South Asia).

Launched 8 years ago, this London tape script programme assists Southern stations to broadcast environmental radio programmes in Southern Africa, the Horn and South Asia. They are ready made tapes designed to be broadcast in their entirety, accompanied by support materials. In the 3 year period under review, 36 programmes were produced - predominantly on environmental issues; these were distributed to 55 radio stations North and South. A Panos survey in 1995 indicates that 85% of stations use the programmes on a regular basis. (The does not however indicate how many receivers responded to the monitoring; nor does it assess the impact of the various broadcasts.)

Although predominantly Southern journalists are commissioned to produce these programmes, the bulk of production emanates from the London office. Clearly, regional offices would increase the potential for a more hands-on approach by Southern broadcasters - maximising capacity building elements in this area of activities.

Panos also acknowledges that substantial work needs to be done on increasing contacts and distribution with new radio stations in the South; as well as establishing a wider commissioning network, commissioning better quality reporters and producing more focused content. Monitoring and evaluation techniques will also need to be re-assessed and developed. Budgetary constraints will limit how effectively these needs will be addressed. Panos has responded accordingly by scaling down the project and producing fewer more focused programmes on environment.

(b) Mi Tierra (Central America and Caribbean)

Some Caribbean partners use the English Down to Earth programmes; But Mi Tierra was developed for counterparts in Central America. NORAD has been the central funder for the Spanish programmes which since 1995, held 2 production courses for rural and urban radio stations and NGOs. From these workshops were produced the first 7 pilot programmes, 30 radio spots and 30 short messages. These pilots are now being utilised as a repository of example material for community radio stations and NGOs. It has also led to the establishment of a network of NGOs and community radio in Central America. It would appear that NORAD funding has been well spent and that the approach of Mi Tierra should inform the planning and re-focusing of Down to Earth; its major strength being the "hands-on" potential for Southern partners in the production of programmes.

(c) Francophone Africa

Central to the activities in West Africa implemented by the Paris office has been the response to the growing development of independent radio in the region. Panos has attempted to address production and distribution needs in this regard. Radio material which has commissioned members of a network of radio correspondents in 15 African countries has been produced in conjunction with developing relationships with 120 European community radio stations which facilitates the Southern perspective of development being aired in the North.

In its radio activities, Panos has collaborated with Radio France International to produce and broadcast programmes. This has included 132 weekly chronicles on development issues; monthly "quarry tapes" - distributed to 30 West African radio stations; as well as occasional ready to broadcast magazines.

In 1995, in order to work in closer collaboration with emerging radio stations in the region, Panos developed the Bank of Programmes in Bamako. This Bank produces, collects and distributes programmes to over 50 partner stations and a network of correspondents, free of charge. The Bank currently produces ready-to-broadcast radio magazines on: environment, human rights, conflict and media for democracy.

Whilst the collaboration with RFI was founded on very pragmatic reasons (established infrastructure and audience reach); and the Bank of Programmes is a particularly impressive achievement, the same question should be asked of these activities as is asked of Down to Earth: is reliance on such collaboration and the Panos centred production of programmes, maximising the potential capacity building and long-term benefits for Southern organisations? Utilising local correspondents addresses this issue and clearly, central to Panos objectives is the production and distribution of information - and in the process, building capacity. Panos points to the fact that current collaboration is encouraging growing autonomy by developing income-generating activities - commissioned programmes; co-productions etc. But when the collaboration ceases, will the Southern journalists, networks and radio stations be left with enhanced capacity sufficient to carry on the work of Panos? Independent feedback indicates that many of the networks and institutions are still rather weak; albeit, they are still in their infancies. Clearly, however, sustainability must remain a focal point of Panos programmes in future.

Presented in ANNEX 3 (3.1) is a directory for accessing relevant information on all radio programme titles.

2.1.5 Panos Books

The core of activities associated with book publishing includes: commissioning and editing; dissemination and promotion. The predominant aim is of course to inform and make an impact with the publication. Between 800 and 2000 copies of each book are disseminated free of charge to targeted NGOs.

Panos London books during the period 1993 - 1995 have been of 4 main formats:

- **Dossiers:** GRASSHOPPERS AND LOCUSTS (1993)
- **Multi-author books:** case studies resulting from fellowships or commissions of Southern journalists: RIVERS OF LIFE (1994); LET THE DAWN COME (1995); PRIVATE DECISIONS, PUBLIC DEBATE (1994)
- **Reports:** IN SEARCH OF HOPE FOR ZIMBABWE'S FARM WORKERS
- **Oral Testimony: series communicating direct experiences:** LISTENING FOR A CHANGE (1993); ARMS TO FIGHT, ARMS TO PROTECT (1995)

Panos Paris published the following Titles during the same period:

- Manual of the African Environmental Journalist
- The Environment of Niger
- The Vocabulary of the River (Senegal)

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

- Between Dunes and Savannahs (Tchad and its Environment)
- "Journalisme et conflits dans la Vallée du Fleuve Sénégal." (Which defies translation: concerned with environmental causes underlying the border conflicts between Senegal, Mauritania and Mali.)

Panos Washington facilitated the publishing of -"Valio la Pena" (Was it Worth It) with their partners in El Salvador (a compilation of oral testimonies dealing with women and conflict). During the same period they also published the following titles:

- Case Studies: Community and the Environment: Lessons from the Caribbean (1994)
- We Speak for Ourselves: Population and Development (1994)
- Population and Development (Development Education Teaching Modules) (1994)
- Conflict and Development (1994)

Independent sources unanimously endorse the quality of Panos books. Of the limited negative feedback received, some recipients felt that the books were not targeted specifically enough for audiences. (This is of course the nature of the medium.)

Book production activities appear to maximise Southern input at the same time as building capacity. Most importantly, they provide permanent, topical in-depth information from a Southern perspective, often pre-empting international fora on development issues. Although Panos does not appear to have an established strategy to monitor the impact of their books, it is significant that random surveys and international reviews are most praiseworthy for an area of cost which is relatively small in relation to Panos' overall programme budgets.

2.2 In-country Capacity-building

Panos describes its in-country capacity building activities in terms of: co-syndication agreements; media fellowships; support to partner information outputs (in which they ascribe a certain institutional support); seminars and workshops; networking support; and audio visual and photography. The achievements of these activities are summarised below. Significantly, they do not incorporate the planned (London's CPPDs); Paris' established (Bamako, Dakar, Accra or N'jamena) regional office activities; or Washington's plans (Guatemala/El Salvador, Haiti, Barbados/Jamaica, Brazil). The establishment of these regional offices and institutions may be viewed as substantive programmes to build Southern institutional capacity. This is discussed further in (4.2) below.

This is not to say that the elements of the Regional Partnerships Programme mentioned above are not building Southern capacity. The primary objective of Panos is to stimulate and inform debate so as to bring about change; and to work in partnership with Southern actors to produce and disseminate information on development - at the same time, strengthening their information capacities. These things, (especially developing capacity) are hard to measure. Monitoring and effective follow-up are crucial factors in Panos' attempts to build capacity in the South and it would appear that this still needs addressing in many of the activities.

2.2.1 Co-syndication

In the period 1993-1995, Panos signed 23 co-syndication agreements with Southern news organisations and media NGOs. With some financial support from Panos, these Southern partners translate Panos Features and produce their own features in indigenous languages. This has meant that over 500 features have been syndicated in the 3 year period; Panos estimates that over 800 organisations receive them.

The strength of co-syndication is that it is an extremely effective way to generate and disseminate development information. As well as helping to build capacity in the South, it facilitates the establishment and strengthening national and international networks.

Panos acknowledges that perhaps the main constraint is monitoring the quality and accuracy of Features in translation. Perhaps in-country monitoring is the best way to achieve this - which again is an endorsement for the CPPD's and other regional offices, antennae and satellites.

2.2.2 Media Fellowships

Fellowships have been an effective link between all Panos programmes of information activities. During the period under review, 110 Fellowship grants were made to Southern journalists to research various development issues.

The central strength of the Fellowships is that it provides opportunity and resources for Southern journalists' research - directly building capacity in the process. In terms of output, it produces a series of articles or radio programmes on development which reach local, national and international audiences - promoting action on issues and informing debate.

Presented in ANNEX 3 (3.1) is a directory for accessing relevant information on all Media Fellowships.

2.2.3 Institutional Support

Institutional support by Panos is predominantly support for information outputs by regional partners. Although this does include minor capital grants, training and technical support, the emphasis is on joint information initiatives: editorial and financial support for production of radio programmes, newspaper supplements and NGO newsletters in the South.

During the period under review Panos provided 39 partners with grants for radio and print productions. Capital grants were also provided to 13 key partners including JET and CERN - both of which have grown out of Panos initiatives, and both of whom are now major actors in the production and distribution of environmental information in their regions. As mentioned in (2.2) above, Panos has supported the emergence of a number of institutions linked with viability and strengthening of the press - such as the Bamako Press Centre, a purchasing centre for publishers in Dakar, the Bank of Programmes in Bamako, and a number of broadcasters' networks - WAIBA, WAJA and SEPP.

Panos acknowledges that they are sometimes perceived as a donor and consequently, the type of institutional support they provide, attempts to avoid any type of dependency. This nevertheless raises the question of the scope and geographical spread of Panos activities. The 1992 evaluation suggested that a number of partners felt that Panos did not follow-up on their activities closely enough. Creating, strengthening and developing partner organisations is one thing. Following up on that development is another. A simple case of logistics means that too many partners must necessarily reduce the quality of support and follow-up. Whilst monitoring and evaluation strategies are a priority at Panos, the regional offices will need to play a significant role if continued institutional support on the current scale is to build sustainable and permanent institutional capacity in the South - considering Panos' current geographical scope of activities.

Presented in ANNEX 3 (3.1) is a directory for accessing relevant information on all activities carried out in Support to Partner Information Outputs/Institutional Support

2.2.4 Seminars and Conferences

During the period under review, Panos provided technical and financial support for 43 workshops and seminars in the South. Varied thematically, the workshops and seminars have incorporated debate, policy discussion, practical skills training etc. The focus of this area of activities is on issue-based discussion (which is not to say that they do not promote capacity building or address practical needs).

All Panos seminars and workshops are held in the South in association with regional partners or groups of partners - with the underlying objective of placing maximum onus on the partners for planning, implementation and follow-up. Personal experience of the consultants as well as testimony from partners and other organisations indicate that Panos has been extremely successful in achieving their aims and objectives in this field of activities.

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

A major strength of these activities is indicated by the important initiatives which have resulted from them. Three specific examples are indicative: CERN, NCMF and JET. Evidence also suggests that Panos has provided extensive follow-up in this area of activities both thematically and practically.

Presented in ANNEX 3 (3.1) is a directory for accessing relevant information on all 43 Seminars and Workshops supported over 1993-1995. It is an impressive list of achievements.

2.3 Regional Partners, Participation & Collaboration

The pivot of Panos collaboration is its Regional Partnerships Programme. This collaboration should be differentiated from strategic links, alliances and collaboration with like minded organisations which are best illustrated in the relationships between Panos and (inter alia): Gemini, Inter Press Service, Radio France International, UNICEF, UNEP, IIED and WHO.

Collaboration should also be seen in terms of Panos relationships with individual Northern and Southern journalists, researchers and experts - through commissions, fellowships and the like; similarly, through co-syndication agreements with Southern partner organisations.

It should be seen as a major strength of Panos operations that they increasingly utilise greater networking, cost sharing and collaboration with like-minded organisations; as well as seeking input from major international, national and regional organisations.

However discussion about participation and collaboration in the body of this review cannot comprehensively assess the full extent or effectiveness of such collaboration. Nor can it make judgements on the extent to which such partnerships have built permanent Southern capacity. Lists of newspapers and radio stations which have received support from Panos provides little indication about the impact this has made. In most cases, Panos has not fully assessed this themselves. Evidence suggests that collaboration with regional partners as well as strategic alliances, ranges from exceptionally strong partnerships and alliances, to nominal contact. However, indicative output and feedback from regional partners when seen in conjunction with Panos' own monitoring and reporting on the extensive programme of activities, would indicate that such collaboration is a strength of Panos programmes. **Presented in ANNEX 3 (3.1) is a directory for accessing relevant information on all Panos Regional Partners as well as Organisations with which Panos collaborates or has developed strategic relationships.**

2.4 Planning, Monitoring and Follow-up

Inconsistent follow-up was singled out for criticism in the 1992 evaluation of Panos. Fundamentally, this means that there had been insufficient monitoring and evaluation (M&E). In acknowledging that strategies and policies were not firmly established in this area, Panos set about addressing this in the most recent Phase IV. Their plans appear to be very comprehensive. Nevertheless, a number of major donors share the concern that there has been little qualitative assessment of the impact of their programmes and until this is redressed, it must remain a concern of Sida.

In mitigation, indicatively, three aspects are worthy of note:

- even during a period of transition in late 1993 and 1994, the organisation set about addressing the criticism of the 1992 evaluation. They appear to have moved from an ad hoc approach to a more strategic set of modalities which are described below;
- narrative reporting which has drawn upon indicative quantitative monitoring and internal reviews, has been of a consistently high calibre throughout the 10 year period of Panos operations - even though its regularity has been criticised by some donors; *Please refer also to (5) Reporting,, Accountability and Transparency, below.

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

- even during the 93/94 period, programmes appear to have been geographically needs responsive - phased out, modified or new activities planned and implemented. This has been a result of quite effective monitoring.

The current Panos London monitoring and evaluation strategy started with **internal reviews** which identified that monitoring was indeed too ad hoc and needed to be strategized around. This has led to **policy formulation** stipulating that: all project development will utilise the LFA approach; all projects will include a monitoring and evaluation component and list indicators for projects; and all projects will include a budget line for M&E (around 5% of budget) which cannot be omitted. To supplement this policy, a **Project Review Group** was established to meet at regular intervals and qualitatively discuss and approve all projects and budgets. The strategy appears to be well thought through although Panos acknowledges that further work is needed. M&E is a priority at Panos presently. They have been commissioned to carry out M&E activities for (inter alia): UNICEF and Sida and in response are developing a special unit in London to research and develop indicators to measure impact.

Panos Paris currently employs a "consultations strategy" before designing its programmes and activities. Presently, a permanent consultative committee, comprising 7 West Africans, is guiding the West African programme components. Panos Paris also cites the bi-annual meetings with all antenna staff as a useful M&E mechanism.

Panos Washington suggests that they have embarked upon qualitative assessment which has been used as a paradigm for the other two offices, including: pre- and post evaluation of the impact of their training courses; standard evaluation forms which are disseminated along with publications; and regular needs assessments in networking activities.

Nevertheless, Panos monitoring during the period of review has been limited predominantly to recipient surveys and internal reviews. The obvious weakness of this approach is the usual small proportion of users who respond to such monitoring procedures; compounded by results being basically quantitatively orientated. This provides only an indicative assessment of impact. Planning is thus based on indicative results. Donors may however be assured that the problem is being addressed in a comprehensive manner by Panos. They must also be assured that these impressive modalities for M&E are in future consistently applied in each Northern and Southern office of Panos.

2.5 Constraints and Weaknesses

Panos dependence on donor funding places it in an invidious situation: to secure funding it must remain effective and to remain effective it must respond to developments within the sector with new strategies and approaches. The whole NGO sector has had to cope with a decline in public financial support for long-term development objectives, as well as reductions in bilateral and multilateral funding. But in contrast to "relief" and "humanitarian" NGOs, Panos finds it particularly difficult to appeal for private donations. Furthermore, Panos is especially burdened by a conscious effort to not compete for funding with its regional partners.

Perhaps the core criticisms of Panos activities which have been elicited from independent feedback from Southern media organisations and other donors relates to the epicentre of operations being too Northern based. The bulk of production, distribution and general decision and policy making, remains in the London, Paris and Washington offices. This criticism should be seen in the light of Panos' acknowledgement of this fact and its current and future plans to decentralise operations to the South through regional offices. In mitigation, it should be pointed out that whilst the bulk of operational procedures have emanated from the North, at every opportunity, Panos activities have attempted to maximise Southern input as well as to build capacity and strengthen institutions in the process.

These perceived weaknesses must also be balanced against the funding constraints which Panos faces in maximising Southern input amongst a considerable geographic constituency and across a varied and comprehensive set of programmes. To do this effectively, Panos needs multi-year agreements on core funding in order to develop long-term strategies. The central question in the 1992 evaluation bears

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

repetition here: is Panos still trying to do too much in too many countries; would it not increase its cost effectiveness by concentrating efforts accordingly?

Finally, although Panos has taken pains to play down the unresolved status of the degree of autonomy of between the 3 Northern offices, it is obviously an issue. The consultants would suggest that it is a constraint since attempts to resolve it through the creation of Panos International have not been manifestly successful. This is treated in more detail in (6.3) below.

3 Impact

3.1 National, Regional and International Public Environmental Awareness.

The impact of Panos programmes in this area has been discussed above in achievement of aims and objectives. Clearly, little empirical data exists in this regard although the available feedback from Panos programmes would suggest that Sida has supported a diverse range of initiatives in an extremely diverse geographical constituency which have addressed their sectorial objectives in Environmental Public Awareness. Obviously, due to the difficulty of developing reliable and comprehensive indicators, this is more difficult to measure than the impact which such support has made on the development described below.

3.2 Media Freedom, Pluralism & Independence

Clearly, Panos programmes have made a substantial impact in this area: indeed, as a pre-requisite of making any impact in Environmental Public Awareness, it has been an integral part of their work. Apart from the empirically measurable impact of the West African Media Pluralism Programme (see next paragraph)*, workshops and seminars on media pluralism have unquestionably made a substantial impact in each region of Panos operations. Panos' own claims in this regard are substantiated by the personal knowledge of the consultants as well as by partner and other organisations in these regions. Considering the prolific nature of Panos information outputs, it would be difficult for them not to have made an impact in their targeted constituency. Not least of the potential for impact been as a direct result of providing pluralistic information. Equally as important in this regard has been the fostering of capacity to keep generating such information through the networking of interests. Such impact has been measurable in terms of changes perceived as a result of activities: promoting legislative reforms; supporting training and institutional building; enhancing economic viability of independent media; and producing and making accessible, information.

* Some of the most outstanding results in this area have been as a result of the **Media Pluralism Programme in West Africa** which has been designed and implemented by Panos Paris. Although Sida does not contribute directly to this programme, because Sida provides core support to Panos, they do contribute indirectly. Through this programme, Panos has been the major catalyst or contributed in a very significant way to i.a. the following initiatives:

- establishing a new legal framework to ensure freedom of the media in Mali, Niger and Chad
- establishing an important precedent for similar legislation in Senegal and Guinea-Bissau
- establishing a Press Centre in Bamako
- contributing to the emergence of an institutional framework for media in Mali: associations of private radio broadcasters (URTEL); and independent publishers (ASSEP);
- contributing to the establishment of the Organisation of West African Broadcasters (WAIBA)
- establishing the Bamako Sound Bank (of Radio Programmes)
- establishing a Press Purchasing Centre in Senegal (which is to be duplicated in Cote d'Ivoire)
- producing a wealth of publications on radio and media pluralism which have been used as base documents in the region
- publishing a bi-lingual quarterly liaison bulletin for broadcasters (Radio-Action)

3.3 Networking, Institutional Development & Professional Competence

A major strength of Panos activities is that they are designed to build institutions through developing professional competence and building and consolidating on networks of like minded and partner organisations. The impact which Panos has made through these programmes is firstly empirically

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

measurable through the effectiveness of organisations and institutional structures which have evolved as a direct consequence of Panos initiatives, inter alia: CERN, CDI, JET, IRIS, Bamako Press Centre and Sound Bank, Dakar Press Purchasing Centre; and not least, the various radio networks. In addition to catalysing the establishment of collaborative networks such as CERN, Panos remains involved in their further development and expansion.

Less empirically measurable, but indicatively obvious is the impact which Panos programmes have made on strengthening institutions and developing professional competence through: commissions, fellowships as well as seminars, workshops and exchange of experiences and competencies in general.

3.4 Gender Equality

Many Panos programmes incorporate the promotion of debate on the ways in which development affects the lives of men and women respectively - not least of which, components which promote the gender dimension of environmental awareness. Demonstrably also, many Panos programmes have been gender sensitive in awarding fellowships, commissions, participation in conferences, seminars and workshops (in some cases, implementing affirmative action). They have also produced and disseminated specific information on equal access to, and participation in development by men and women. Thematic Programmes such as Reproductive Health, Women in Media and AIDS/HIV Awareness, have in-built gender dimensions.

Sida encourages organisations to incorporate gender perspectives in programmes. Whilst clearly, Panos programmes have not neglected the gender dimension in their programmes, their approach in the Regional Partnerships Programme appears to have been ad hoc with a limited degree of consistency. Nor do they appear to have developed specific indicators to assess their impact in this regard.

Such criticism should be seen in the context of the opinion of one of a team of consultants vested with the task of overviewing the impact of Sida support to gender awareness across the spectrum of development programmes. A general conclusion is that Sida provides scant guidance in suggesting such indicators; this in no way facilitates the efforts of organisations supported to build in gender equality to their programmes with any degree of consistency. It appears fruitless to ask development partners to "put on the gender spectacles" without suggesting what to look at.

3.5 Miscellaneous Benefits and Other Programmes

Thematic programmes mentioned in Part III (1.6) deserve some attention because they are in many cases, integrally linked to the Regional Partnerships Programme. There has been no attempt to assess these programmes here. However, clearly, as Panos decentralises to the South, the capacity of these thematic programmes will be enhanced; so will these programmes strengthen regional staff capacity by bringing to them, a body of relevant and topical information as well as contacts and experience.

The thematic programmes on **AIDS/HIV** (Panos London and Washington); **Reproductive Health**; **Oral Testimony** (Panos London); are global. They work in countries within and outside the regional focus. The 3 offices have developed activities linked with **Conflicts and Conflict Prevention**. Panos Paris and London have developed a strong **Media Pluralism Programme** in Southern and West Africa and to a lesser extent, in East Africa. Panos Washington and London have developed activities in the field of **Population** and Panos Paris has developed a **Migration and Development Programme** with global components. These programmes could also be viewed as networks. Of note also is the **Development Education** function which has been filled by Panos Washington.

In the longer term it is envisaged that the thematic programmes offering global analysis of specific issues will be transferred to one or more of the Southern offices.

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

4 Cost Effectiveness in Utilisation of Sida Funds

The following analysis concentrates on the period of the most recent agreement with Panos i.e. Phase IV Support to Regional Partnerships Programme and Media Briefing Documents, for the period 1993-1996. Reference should be made to **Part III Sida and Other Donor Inputs**, above as well as **ANNEXES 7-10**

4.1 Current & Past Implementation 1993-1996

Table 13: Utilisation of Sida Funds to Panos: Activities/Staff/Administration

Project Activities: % funds spent directly on activities in South	Budgeted	Actual
London	49	52
Paris	49	63
Washington	49	35
Project Staff: % funds spent on staff		
London	32	31
Paris	37	26
Washington	32	40
Project Administration: % funds spent on admin		
London	19	17
Paris	19	11
Washington	19	25

Source: See ANNEX 9

Panos points out that of total expenditure across all programmes throughout Phase IV, 82% of funding was spent on activities in the South or "in direct support of them". This represents a very impressive percentage considering the substantial overheads associated with the planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of Panos activities. However, it should be pointed out that staff costs are included in their calculation of funds spent in "direct support of activities". The actual percentage of transfer of funding North-South is thus closer to 51%. This represents direct costs for: correspondents, fellowships, grants, co-syndication, workshops, seminars, features, publications etc., but does not include the costs for planning, monitoring and evaluation.

In real terms, actual expenditure directly on activities from the London and Paris offices was higher than budgeted (52% vs 49% and 63% vs 49%); and lower than budgeted for staff costs and administration (48% vs 51% and 37% vs 51% respectively). The Washington office is the exception and this needs to be addressed by Panos. Washington spent significantly less than budgeted on activities (14% less) and significantly more than budgeted on staff (8%) and administration (6% more).

Whilst the ratios for Paris and London do not represent any significant increase in the amount of funding directly spent on activities, they do indicate a downward trend in administration and salaries costs. Staff costs in Panos London for example during the period 1993 - 1996 have in fact been reduced from 39% to 26% of income. This may be seen as significant since income has been comparable in each of the years for the period. Once again, the Washington office is the exception.

The annual budgets for the period 1993-1995 show an increase in expenditure over the previous year of: 18% in 1993; 11% in 1994; and 8% in 1995. Total growth of 43% over the three year period appears commensurate with the increase of in-country activities, introduction of regional delegates and greater emphasis on monitoring and evaluation activities.

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

4.2 Cost Ramifications of Panos Future Plans

In the context of current and past utilisation of funding, it is important to look at the cost ramifications of future Panos plans to decentralise their offices to the South. (This is not an empirical prognosis of future funding needs nor budgetary implications of planned programmes.)

Logically, the costs of establishing regional offices will be initially high. Establishment costs will include housing, salaries, (in some cases, foreign allowances) and other associated costs. Recruitment and training of local staff will also be a budgetary burden. Decentralisation of Panos offices should thus in no way be considered in the shorter term, as cost saving. In terms of cost effectiveness however, the regional offices, in the longer term, stand to rationalise the costs of monitoring, follow-up and implementation due to the physical presence of Panos staff in the South.

However, future cost effectiveness must never compromise the central development objectives of Panos. Decentralisation of Panos offices should be considered as a necessary and an integral step which directly enhances the potential impact and effectiveness of programmes; and which builds permanent capacity in the South. This in the short and medium term will require a considerable degree of co-ordination if the linkages between the various offices and programmes are to be effective.

5 Reporting, Accountability & Transparency

Panos financial and narrative reporting which was presented to the consultants by Sida and Panos, was of a very high calibre. However, whilst there has been no specific criticisms about Panos' transparency and accountability, some donors have indicated that Northern offices were sometimes tardy in financial reporting: Panos Paris was singled out by 2 major donors in this regard, and Panos, London, by one donor. These criticisms appear to be programme-specific and office-specific. Considering the diverse geographical operations of Panos, it would be less than appropriate to take this as a general criticism of Panos. The arrangement whereby the London office has had de facto responsibility for the other two offices, has led to some problems. Other donors have complained that in some cases, London reporting did not correctly reflect Paris and Washington activities. Panos Washington and Paris similarly expressed this concern to the consultants. Panos London acknowledges that in some instances they found it difficult to obtain information. This should not be seen as a criticism of Panos London but as an endorsement for the new Panos approach which formalises a more autonomous relationship between the three offices. This mandates the three offices to develop, implement, monitor and evaluate autonomous programmes which are regionally specific; as well as placing the onus on them to co-ordinate their feedback more systematically. * Please refer also to (2.4) Planning, Monitoring and Follow-up, above.

Audited accounts incorporating reconciliated income and expenditure for the three Northern offices are presented in ANNEX 5. A Breakdown of Income and Expenditure 1993 - 1995 for the Regional Partnerships Programme, for three Northern offices, is presented in ANNEX 6.

6 The Future and Sustainability

6.1 Current Trends and Developments in the Sector

Clearly, the information field is the vehicle of Environmental Public Awareness; and it is changing rapidly. This means that the quantity of information available is very great; but the lack of interpretative capacity in the South means that developing countries face both information overload and information shortfall. Panos suggests that the regionalization process upon which they are embarking, serves to strengthen their own capacity to identify emerging issues, place them in context with current trends and developments and to generate appropriate responses. Of identified international and regional trends, including those of: globalisation, fragmentation, rationalisation and concentration, Environmental Public Awareness will continue to be addressed as a central but integral contextual issue. Effective response to relevant problems requires first and foremost that responsible reporting is fostered on development issues which are under-reported or about which mis-information abounds. This is the Panos *raison d'être* and it is sufficient to say that they appear to be cognisant of, and responding to, current trends and developments in the sector - not least of which surround developments in information technology.

6.2 The Future Shape of Panos

The future shape of Panos will be largely determined by the success of its attempts to decentralise operations to the South - a process which is underway in all regions in which it operates. Instead of 3 Northern offices with Southern partners, there will be a federation of Northern and Southern offices, whose relations with each other will be progressively defined, according to the specificity's of each region and each programme. As the Southern operations deepen in capacity, so the administrative role of the Northern offices is set to shrink. In future, Panos aims to act as a service organisation for Southern partners and Southern Panos', while also retaining an international function; and the research and dissemination role on key, inter-regional development issues. In the immediate term, Panos London, Paris and Washington will retain a significant executive and co-ordinating role, predominantly in financial accountability, monitoring and evaluation with regard to regional operations.

Other donors contacted by the consultants are pleased with this approach. Indeed, some donors have pre-empted the regionalization approach by switching their support for Panos, from global support, to support for specific regional offices. Like Sida, they will be able to use the following indicators to assess Panos progress in this regard:

- (a) the extent of autonomy of the office from the Northern offices;
- (b) Southern offices' mandate and ability to recruit local staff; raise their own funds; plan, implement and monitor their own programmes; and explore modalities for generating their own income;
- (c) the increasing proportion of funds for activities, directly transferred from the Northern offices to the Southern offices; as well as a transfer and commensurate decrease in policy and decision making power from North to South.

However, it is important to point out that Panos exists in the North precisely because it can exploit resources not accessible to Southern partners. There appears to be a strong emphasis by other donors on the scaling down of operational costs of the Northern offices, commensurate to their support for Southern offices. The caution here is that this emphasis should not jeopardise the operational effectiveness of the Northern offices, upon which the functional capacity of Southern offices will depend for some time. In this regard, the strength of Sida support should not only be seen in terms of the amounts contributed, but in terms of willingness to enter multi-year agreements and to support core funding needs - which has allowed Panos to develop such strategies.

In terms of Panos London programmes, future shape is adequately described in their project to create autonomous **Centres for Public Policy and Debate (CPPDs)**. This initiative harnesses the work of key Southern partners and will see the establishment of offices in: East Africa and the Horn; Southern Africa; and South Asia. Full details of this programme are contained in the Panos document **A proposal to establish regional Centres for Public Policy and Debate in East Africa, Southern Africa and South Asia** which was presented to Sida in March, 1996. Panos Washington also submitted a proposal at the same time, for the attention of Sida's Latin American desk: **Panos in the Field; A Multi-Year Strategy to Strengthen Information Capacities in the Americas**.

The Panos Paris "antenne" programme in West Africa began establishing local consultative and decision-making mechanisms in the South, as early as 1992. Future plans are for the consolidation of these offices in Dakar, Bamako, Accra and N'jamena as well as the establishment of local institutions likely to contribute to press pluralism in the region. Examples such as the Press Centre in Bamako; the Press Purchasing Centre in Dakar; and the planned Research Centre on African Media in Dakar, are indicative of the future role of Panos in the region - building of autonomous institutional capacity which will work in collaboration with Panos programmes to extend such development activities to new areas of the constituency.

The future agenda for Panos Washington similarly involves restructuring to support regionally based activities emerging in Latin America and the Caribbean. Initially, Panos has embarked on the location of representatives within key established partner organisations in the region. These Panos field offices will

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

concentrate on the national and regional implementation of project activities as well as related global Panos activities. Panos points to the fact that these field offices will optimise their logistic and financial efficiency whilst maximising the Panos capacity-building role.

6.3 Organisational Capacity

The calibre of Panos outputs described earlier, and the endorsements of regional partners, donors and other sources, is evidence of the strong organisational capacity of Panos. Nevertheless, this capacity has at times been compromised by organisational problems which in future, would bear scrutiny from Sida in the monitoring process.

Panos has acknowledged serious organisational problems during the period 1993/94 and that the future presents equally serious challenges, especially with regards to devolving power and autonomy North/North and North/South. Modalities for the North/North devolution of autonomy, although embarked as early as 1994, appears as yet unresolved. Those plans included the development of a supra-Panos International which would bind the 3 current (for all intents and purposes, autonomous) offices under one Panos. The new modalities outlined in Part IV (6.5) may yet help to resolve this relationship. It is the opinion of the consultant that greater autonomy of the offices would serve to bolster the organisational capacity of Panos generally. However, unless it is formalised, it is potentially divisive and will remain a logistic constraint - but more with regards to fund-raising, than programme implementation.

The resignation of the founding President in 1992 logically presented Panos with a need to consolidate and re-focus their role. Evidence that they were not on-track in this new phase was the resignation of the new London Director in 1994 and shortly afterwards, the London Director of Finance. It is apparent that the requisite re-focusing and consolidation was not taking place and that restructuring was demanded. Although Panos London attempted to address these problems in late 1993 and early 1994, their efforts were hampered by the absence of a permanent Director for over 8 months in 1994. The acting Director and 2 senior management representatives began the restructuring process which has subsequently been revised and is (currently) being implemented by the new Director who was appointed in April 1995.

The 1992 Evaluation of Panos did not actually suggest that Panos' capacity was suspect. Rather, it pointed out that Panos was failing in some cases, to consolidate its activities; dealing with too many subjects and activities in too many countries at the same time. The view of the evaluation was that Panos thus compromised the impact and effectiveness of its activities. It further cited the endorsement of most partners for the establishment of Panos regional offices. Panos acknowledged this problem and since 1992 has attempted to address it in terms of consolidating relationships with key partners and establishing a greater presence in the South; but not, it appears, by directly reducing the number of countries and activities. When the latter issue was broached with Panos offices, they pointed out that their programmes are regionally specific and respond in an integral way to identified needs. Whilst it may be true that the number of activities associated with programmes have not decreased, nor have the issues associated with sustainable development which have been identified as requiring action.

Whilst it should be seen as a strength of the Panos approach that their programme activities have evolved and responded to identified needs, because this review makes only indicative judgements of impact and effectiveness, it cannot unequivocally support the Panos affirmation that their organisational capacity is (and will be) commensurate with their scope of operations. Clearly, the success of their attempts to make Panos more Southern based will be a key element of their future organisational capacity.

It is the view of most donors consulted, regional partners and the consultants, that the new vision for Panos is innovative, well founded and both pragmatic and practicable. However, this appears to be a very general conclusion by Panos funding partners. A donor consortium which involves a sharing of information as well as strategic co-operation in support of Panos activities would be of great benefit to Panos and donors alike.

6.4 Sustainability of Panos Operations

Panos was created in 1986 with no financial resources of its own. The % of self generated income is peripheral to Panos operations and, it appears, will remain so in the foreseeable future. The sustainability

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

of Panos activities should not thus be measured in terms of the functioning of Panos itself, but in terms of the sustainability of the regional partner organisations. Building capacity within regional partner organisations has been a central objective of Panos and their activities have clearly contributed extensively to institutional development as discussed above in (2) **Impact**.

On the question of sustainability of newly established Southern offices, Panos' CPPD project intends the offices to be self sufficient within a 5 year period. However, modalities for this process appear somewhat vague. Programmes in financial and management training and skills transfer (where appropriate) will be implemented. However, it appears that fund raising in the South will concentrate more on autonomous approaches for bi-lateral donor assistance than strategizing around income generation and raising capital from the private sector. Panos London suggests that modalities for achieving self-sustainability need to be fully discussed by the CPPDs Boards - which have not yet been appointed.

It is suggested here, that much needs to be done in this respect and that this issue should remain a priority of all Panos offices plans for decentralisation. The potential for income generation through the marketing of facilities and expertise in training, production and consultancies, provides realistic opportunities for regional offices to develop their own and their constituents' capacity and infrastructure. These modalities need to be explored in a systematic way. It is further suggested that these regional centres, once established, should explore the possibilities of facilitating the establishment of development funds by consortiums of regional partners, similar to the MISA Media Development Fund which has been established in the SADC region. In the immediate future, Panos programmes North and South, remain dependent on donor funds and so fund raising will continue to be a central task of all Panos' offices. The continued securing of such funding pre-supposes that Panos remains effective within the sector. In the immediate future, two factors remain crucial to Panos's operational effectiveness: the need for multi-year agreements by donors; and arrangements on core funding support. Without both, the stability, sustainability and hence room for creative thinking, planning, monitoring and evaluation in order to build permanent Southern capacity is compromised.

Table 14: Funding Status of Panos Offices 1996 - 1998

London *	
Target 1996	£1.4 million
Secured for 1996	£1.159 million
Funds sought for 1996	£ 240,000
Secured for 1997	£ 414,000
Secured for 1998	£ 30,000
Paris	
Target 1996	£1.678 million
Secured for 1996	£1.541 million
Funds sought for 1996	£ 138,000
Secured for 1997	£ 223,000
Secured for 1998	-
Washington	
Target 1996	£ 227,000
Secured 1996	£ 196,408
Funds sought for 1996	£ 80,592
Secured for 1997	£ 399,333
Secured for 1998	£ 384,000

* Panos London's annual target has been set at £1.4 million for the last 3 years (excluding funds received by London on behalf of other offices). These targets were met in 1994 and 1995 and are achievable in 1996/97. Multi-year agreements from key bilateral funders are being renegotiated over the next 8 months (DGIS, Sida, NORAD, FINNIDA) and further project fund-raising for 97/98 will commence towards the end of 1996.

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

6.5 Continued Co-operation with Sida and Sida Options

The significance of Sida's long standing support for Panos should be seen in the following context:

- (a) as the largest donor to the Regional Partnerships Programme, Sida can take commensurate credit for the successes of Panos' information outputs, capacity building and networking activities;
- (b) as the biggest core funder, providing multi-year support, Sida has not only provided Panos with capacity to effectively plan, implement and monitor programmes in a strategic way, but has provided Panos with the capacity to respond quickly to changing, regionally specific circumstances;
- (c) not least of the value of Sida support has been its endorsement of Panos development programmes which has facilitated leveraged counterpart funding from other donors.

The increasing autonomy between the 3 Panos offices and their plans for regionalization of their operations, will lead them to submit a single proposal to Sida which will integrate 3 sets of programme initiatives under a revised administrative formula. Each office will assume responsibility for its own project management, financial and narrative reporting. Whilst this approach would appear outwardly, at odds with Sida's current emphasis on "concentration", the ramifications are mainly positive:

- (a) it provides flexibility required for each office to develop programmes which address their region's problems with specificity whilst still subscribing to the core Panos philosophy;
- (b) it will facilitate effective monitoring, evaluation and reporting procedures which were erstwhile loosely bound under the Regional Partnerships Programme; this will formalise what in effect has been occurring anyway, during the most recent period of Sida support.

The emphases of these programme initiatives will be on building permanent Southern capacity; i.e. Panos offices in the South. These offices will work with the Northern offices to generate, produce, access and disseminate information in support of Environmental Public Awareness, and in the context of the most pertinent issues related to sustainable, people-centred development. With respect to the 3 Northern Panos offices, Sida support would mean:

London

Support for the establishment of CPPDs in Southern Africa, East Africa and the Horn, and South Asia in the context of a wider programme of information outputs and regional capacity building..

Paris

Support for enhancing local and inter-regional capacity of its "antennes" and transferring related experience to neighbouring regions.

Washington

Support for consolidation of field offices within existing regional partner organisations, in order to implement an environment and information programme integrating information providers in Latin America and Caribbean countries.

In the opinion of the consultants, there are consequently two options for Sida to consider:

Option 1

Continue to support the core funding needs in a multi-year agreement for the new phase of Panos activities as outlined above. This consolidates the Regional Partnerships Programme to emphasise the building of autonomous Southern institutional capacity in order to develop media and generate greater awareness of the issues which promote sustainable development - of which environmental public awareness is an integral part.

Within this option, Sida should give close consideration to which Department within DESO, the responsibility for possible continued support should be placed. It is the view of the consultants that such responsibility would be more appropriately with Media and Culture than UND.

PART IV PANOS FINDINGS

Paramountly, support for Panos should not be interrupted for any bureaucratic reasons. For Sida to suspend support to Panos would mean a significant erosion of their attempts to address their own development goal on the environment. Similarly, removing this commitment without replacing a very effective conduit like Panos, constitutes an erosion of Sida's effectiveness in addressing their own sectorial objectives on environmental public awareness as well as media development, human rights and democracy ; and the various developmental issues which contribute to the building of civil society in the South.

OPTION 2

Support the establishment of selected regional offices, similar to the DANIDA support for the Lusaka Office, but in each region of Panos operations. This assistance should also be for a three year period in the form of core funding.

Whilst this option may make the Sida support more commensurate to other donors; and provides a paradigm of other donor supported activities to follow, the crucial weakness is that it is an ad hoc approach which weakens Panos' long-term planning capacity. Sida has played a leading role in the past and should continue to do so. This option would erode that position; and more importantly, the position of Panos.

These options are elaborated upon more contextually in **Part VII, Conclusions and Recommendations**.

PART V

GEMINI FINDINGS

Achievements, Constraints, Organisational Capacity, Effectiveness & Sustainability

1 Aims and Objectives

1.1 Focus and Relevance to Swedish Development Goals, Sectorial Policies and Objectives

The aims and objectives of Gemini's operations are well in keeping with Swedish development goals. The focus of the aims and objectives of their Environmental Reporting Workshops are similarly in accordance with Sida's handlingsprogram för hållbar utveckling. They attempt to raise environmental public awareness and at the same time contribute to the capacity of Southern journalists to report responsibly on the environment; placing the environment integrally in the context of equally important issues which contribute to sustainable development.

However, Gemini could (and does) contribute as effectively to reporting on health, poverty, good governance, or any other development issues for that matter. Gemini, rather than being viewed as an organisation with special emphasis on environmental public awareness, should be viewed as one which provides a media service. This service aims at broadening the horizon of journalists in the South through operations of the news service, use of local journalists, and training. It contributes to media development and promotes media freedom, pluralism and independence. Support for Gemini's operations may thus be more appropriately the responsibility of the Media and Culture Department, rather than UND, since it is the strategies of that Department which Gemini's operations address most squarely, (inter alia):

- stimulating the growth and vitality of media sectors that are characterised by pluralism; integrity and responsibility;
- training which focuses on: journalistic and production skills; and specialised knowledge;
- enhancing media efficiency through assistance to production and distribution.

1.2 Clarity and Relevance to Constituency

Gemini's training aims and objectives are clear, specific and unambiguous. Their relevance to the constituency has been maximised by virtue of the fact that they have been developed through close contact with journalists and media organisations in the South. This relationship has been established as a result of harnessing and developing the capacity of Southern media, in the course of providing a service.

2 Achievement of Aims and Objectives: Training Seminars/Workshops

Gemini news service activities are unquestionably effective. Empirically, their success in this, their main area of operations, may be measured through the increasing number of paying subscriptions. Independent feedback from their constituency also endorses the quality of Gemini output: in particular, the quality, relevance, reliability and ready to publish copy was commented upon by most media organisations from whom input was solicited. Further testimony to their current international journalistic credibility is the Press Award in the One World 96 Awards.

Although the news service is not the subject of this review, Gemini's effectiveness in this area is important since these operations form the basis for their training programmes which utilises their expertise gained in the expedition of their news agency operations.

What follows is a summary of feedback received on the qualitative aspects of Gemini's Development Journalism and Environmental Reporting journalist training activities carried out during the period 1993-1996. The workshops' aims and objectives have been treated in (2.6) above.

Feedback from participants has been predominantly favourable. However, future Gemini planning must take cognisance of criticisms, albeit levelled by a minority, for whom workshops have fallen short of expectations and claims. Obviously, the calibre of training has either varied from country to country, or the workshops have been addressing the needs of the constituents to a different degree. Gemini should see such input as being constructively critical. This review would NOT suggest that any of the criticisms constitute any significant compromise of Gemini's effectiveness as a news agency or training capabilities.

Since many of the criticisms appear to be circumstantial in nature, the consultants arranged through MISA for an experienced journalist to conduct an assessment of the Windhoek workshop, 14-26 October, 1996. Their report appears in ANNEX 11. In addition, a complete set of individual evaluations from all

PART V GEMINI FINDINGS

participants was reviewed by the consultants for the Accra workshop in 1996. These reports suggest that criticisms are rather individualistic and that in general, the training has been of a high calibre.

2.1 Content and Methodology

In terms of content and emphasis, some participants have levelled the criticism that Gemini workshops had too little concentration on fundamental journalistic skills. Central to these criticisms was a view that some workshops were too talk and theory orientated with too many paper presentations. This resulted in an erosion of product centred activities. This appears to have varied from workshop to workshop - for example, more so in Lusaka than in Accra.

Some participants suggested that there were discrepancies between advertised content of workshops and actual course implementation. These criticisms ranged from: no general overview of the environment being presented as advertised; to the suggestion that too much of the content was politically orientated rather than practically based.

The criticism that Gemini trainers sometimes dominated proceedings without encouraging (and as suggested by one participant) allowing participants' input, is more serious. The DCO in Kampala received rather strong criticisms from a participant in this regard. This criticism was endorsed by a Swedish journalist who attended the Kampala workshop. These criticisms should be weighed against empirical evidence from workshop programmes which indicate a substantial amount of designated input from participants. Furthermore, the consultants personally contacted a number of the participants who suggested that the views of the author of the letter to the DCO, did not reflect their views; and that in their opinions, the workshop was very valuable.

A lack of the use of audio-visual aids and technological input in courses has been mentioned by some participants and is a serious criticism when seen in the light of suggestions from much of the constituency that they felt a need for closer consideration of new information technology and how it affects their ability to report on sustainable development.

2.2 Logistics in Implementation

Organisation in general appears to have been well handled, although some criticisms were received about transport allowances, perdiems, accommodation, meals etc. As explained in Part VIII, it is the opinion of the consultants that these criticisms are becoming all too frequent in courses and workshops: rather than being seen as a criticism of Gemini, they are indicative of an "aid mentality" amongst many participants and this should be addressed.

The workshop in Uganda in March 1996 seems to have experienced some problems with regards the use of resource people. Such problems may be mitigated by closer collaboration with regional organisations in future. This would be a cost effective way of arranging logistics; and at the same time, bolstering regional training capacity.

2.3 Target Groups and Participants

Gemini suggests that their targeted constituency is extensive and the Development Journalism Workshops produced a healthy mix of full-time employees from media organisations, stringers and freelancers. Gemini targets senior journalists and editors for their workshops. It is clear that the journalistic skills of these reporters require updating (and in many cases - fundamental teaching). Many reporters in the South suggest that training aimed at senior journalists and editors is disproportionate to the need. Clearly, junior reporters need training, but this is more a question of logistics than a criticism of Gemini. Nevertheless, Gemini's assertion that basic journalistic skills are for the formal schools of journalism does not acknowledge the fact that many of their workshop participants are "senior" only in terms of title.

Perhaps one good reason for targeting senior journalists, is the issue pointed out by MISA and NSJ, namely: that perhaps Gemini targeting freelancers is not an effective way of maximising environmental public awareness. They suggest that environmental reporting is not a priority area in Southern Africa and consequently, editors are reluctant to release their key reporters for such workshops. Nor is stringer and

PART V GEMINI FINDINGS

freelance copy given much priority with editors. A suggestion in this regard is that Gemini in future targets more stringers who file regularly for agencies like AIA, IPS and Gemini themselves, in order for environmental copy to gain most exposure.

A final observation with respect to target groups is that whilst the recent Environmental Reporting Workshops appear to have adequately addressed rural reporting in the context of environmental public awareness, their targeted constituency has been predominantly urban based.

2.4 Planning, Monitoring & Follow-up

A criticism levelled at Gemini by some participants was that workshops were planned in London with little or no input from targeted participants, either prior to, or during workshops. With respect to prior consultation, it is fair to suggest that such criticism may stem from the fact that it is not logistically feasible to consult every individual participant in workshop planning. Furthermore, Gemini has a very strong consultative base for its identification of training needs and course content, by virtue of its close association with Southern journalists in all constituent countries, through its news service.

In terms of monitoring, Gemini suggests that their maintenance of links with participants places them in a position to evaluate the results of their training. This monitoring is complemented by an assessment of copy, clippings, as well as listings by subscribers of features used in their service. Gemini also points to the self evaluation and internal evaluation exercises which are conducted at the end of each workshop, a basis for their own future planning.

Although follow-up is assured with workshop participants who are Gemini correspondents, this does not take into account the extent to which skills of editors and senior journalists are being passed on to less experienced journalists. It is suggested that monitoring and follow-up procedures need to be more systematic and modalities developed for more qualitative assessment of training impact. Much of the current monitoring appears to be geared towards the monitoring of copy fed into Gemini's news service - which would take place with or without the presence of training workshops.

2.5 Quality of Training

Co-ordination of training has been largely the responsibility of the Managing Director of Gemini. This has brought to the workshops, the benefit of his many years experience in media management. Training has been extensively supplemented by regional resource people; and this appears to have been very successful. The bulk of training has been conducted by the Managing Director. Whilst the feedback has been predominantly favourable in this regard, it should be noted that his main area of expertise is in media management and not in basic journalism per se. In the context of a few criticisms that the workshops did not concentrate enough on fundamental journalistic skills, this needs to be addressed by Gemini.

More importantly, it is suggested that more of the actual training responsibility should be going to regional resource people/trainers; and that this should be a part of strategic planning by Gemini with respect to their training activities. Whilst this may not increase the quality of training in the immediate term, permanent southern training capacity must be built.

2.6 Constraints

The central constraint faced by Gemini in their execution of training activities is their organisational capacity to conduct such training. Whilst their capacity to implement current activities is not questioned, it is suggested that Gemini needs to pay more attention to monitoring and evaluation. It is further suggested that this would require surplus capacity from their news service operations. This is discussed further in (6.3) below.

Gemini would of course like to be able to address the range and experience of participating journalists in all workshops. The constraint here is that they must pitch their training at some level. This necessarily means that in the most recent Environmental Reporting Workshops, less experienced journalists were excluded.

3 Impact

3.1 National, Regional and International Public Environmental Awareness

Anecdotal evidence would suggest that Gemini training is making an impact in this area. Quantitative feedback would also support the same conclusion. However, clearly, this is an area which needs to be strategically addressed by Gemini if their training activities are to form an integral and permanent part of their operations; and if their training is to have maximum impact. It is an area which has been neglected by all of the organisation being assessed in this review. Albeit, impact is a very difficult thing to assess, future planning must incorporate the development of suitable indicators to monitor progress.

3.2 Media Development: Freedom, Pluralism and Independence

The philosophy underlying the Gemini *raison d'être* is that factual, unbiased and constructive coverage of issues is the best argument for press freedom and the best defence for the independent press. Workshop content has impressed upon participants that an effective and responsible media are essential components of pluralism and good governance and in turn, pre-requisites for sustainable development.

Whilst these are stated intentions of Gemini training, the emphasis appears to have been inconsistent in their implementation. Many participants across the range of workshops have endorsed Gemini's effectiveness in this regard. Fewer (but significantly) suggest that pluralism was treated superficially. In this regard, it is also significant that discussions on pluralism and independence of the media has not consistently been stated in the content outlines of some Gemini workshop documents.

3.3 Networking, Institutional Development and Professional Competence

Gemini suggests that their commitment is to capacity building through journalist training rather than institution building. They may be too modest in this regard since much of their work in providing a news service, training journalists and collaborating with regional organisations in the South, has contributed significantly to building of organisations and institutions as well as consolidating and establishing networks. They may also be unnecessarily modest about the scope of their training role. More than building direct journalistic capacity, their utilisation of journalist-trainers from the regions, directly builds up a network of resource people and training capacity. It is suggested that Gemini does not place enough emphasis on this aspect of their training.

Gemini training has promoted and facilitated the consolidation and establishment of local and regional journalists' networks and associations. Individuals have pointed to a major benefit of the workshops as being the contact and interaction with reporters from other countries. This has stimulated journalists to take an introspective look at professional practices.

3.4 Gender Equality

Gemini is quite cognisant of the gender imbalance in media operations and its consequences for effective media coverage. They have consequently demonstrated an affirmative action policy with regards to candidature. All things being equal, this appears to have provided an equitable balance of male and female journalists who have had access to Gemini training. This conclusion would appear equally applicable to Gemini's news service activities.

3.5 Miscellaneous Benefits

In accordance with (3.1 - 3.5) above; and the longer term objectives of Gemini courses outlined in Part III (2.4), Gemini has involved each host country's Information Ministries in the activities of the workshops. This should be seen as an effective way of addressing the objectives related to convincing media "gate-keepers" on the importance of free, independent and pluralistic media; and environmental public awareness.

Similar benefits were achieved through including government media people on courses; as well as utilising a wide range of resource people involved in various government ministries, statutory authorities etc.

4 Cost Effectiveness in Utilisation of Sida Funding

It is not easy to completely separate costs for all of Gemini's operations since much of administration and staffing costs are not differentiated in audits for each area of operation. Cost effectiveness below is related to how Sida funds were utilised.

4.1 Project Implementation

Sida can be well satisfied that Gemini has been very cost conscious in its implementation of workshops. The only area of possible better cost effectiveness relates to more collaboration with regional organisations (see 4.4 below)

4.2 Project Staff

Minimal staff working out of very modest offices shared with Panos, Gemini's salary and administration costs form a very reasonable percentage of their overall operational costs. Sida support does not fund these costs - except indirectly through a 12.5% overheads charge for workshops. A significant contribution to their editorial staffing needs is made through internships from the Regina School of Journalism, DANIDA and D. It is important to note that the salary component of their training activities are an integral part of their operational costs which predominantly facilitate their news wire service.

With respect to the actual workshops, one trainer/co-ordinator from London co-ordinates the input of three or four local resource people who are paid a nominal fee. This is very cost effective but slightly (in the opinion of this consultant) exploitative of Southern trainers. It is suggested that as well as placing more emphasis on the utilisation and development of regional trainers, such trainers should be remunerated accordingly.

4.3 Workshops' Duration

Gemini suggestions that 2 weeks has been arrived at as an optimum duration for workshops, is questionable. MISA, NSJ and IAJ experience would indicate that 10 days is a maximum period for productive work. A shorter duration would reduce costs substantially. This should also be seen in the light of some criticism which suggest that time management has been inefficient on some workshops; some participants suggested that un-utilized evenings and weekends was an inefficient use of their own and resource people's time.

4.4 Collaboration and Co-operation

It is suggested that Gemini should in future explore more possibilities of holding courses in conjunction with existing training institutes and organisations like: NSJ, Malawi Institute of Journalism, IAJ etc. This would inevitably reduce overheads and logistic costs.

5 Reporting, Accountability and Transparency

Sida funding for the period 1993-1996 has been accounted for with specificity and is predominantly in accordance with budget estimates in project requests. The following financial arrangements may however bear some scrutiny from Sida's Finance division:

5.1 Auditing

Gemini News Service is the trading name of News-Scan International Ltd., a company owned by NewsConcern International Foundation. Accounts for the year ended 31st March 1996 and 31st March 1995 have not been audited. Accounts for the year ended 31st March 1994 have been audited but under sections 246 and 247 of the Companies Act 1985, (UK), Newscan is entitled to deliver abbreviated financial statements. Whilst this does not suggest any anomalies in Gemini's accounting, it may not be in accordance with Sida's standard Agreements.

PART V GEMINI FINDINGS

5.2 Workshop Costs

The costs of workshops in the period under review appear reasonable. The increase in costs after 1994 would also appear reasonable and in accordance with inflation. Perdiems, travel and other reimbursables appear more than adequate and in accordance with Sida's own conditions.

One anomaly which needs clarification explained is the perdiem at the Accra workshop in June 1996 which was according to some participants USD 5/day. In a Statement of Expenses, Gemini suggests that perdiems were as follows: non Ghanians - USD20/day; and locals - USD10/day. Gemini suggests that the USD 5/day was the advertised perdiem which was actually increased to USD 11.45/day due to unforeseen extra transport costs. This matter appears unresolved.

5.3 Gemini's Costs

The following observations are without prejudice and do not in any way imply that Gemini has not been transparent in their financial reporting:

The budgeted 12.5% overheads for Gemini's costs appears a reasonable implementation fee. However, in some cases, charges have been made by Gemini, in addition to this fee for (inter alia): phones, faxes, courier services etc. It is suggested that these costs are part of admin costs represented by the 12.5% overheads fee.

Similarly, a "fee to expatriate trainer" would appear inequitable in the light of the above 12.5% overheads charge. It would appear even more inequitable in the light of a budgeted similar amount which is split between three to four resource persons from the region - non of whom are on a Gemini salary.

The above observations should be weighed against a net debt incurred by Gemini in most workshops after the Sida contribution.

6 The Future and Sustainability

6.1 Current Trends and Developments in the Sector

Clearly, Gemini fulfils a need - but this does not ensure its survival. The survival of Gemini as a third world news agency has been largely due to its ability to adapt to changing circumstances, not only with respect to the needs of its constituency, but its own financial and organisational capacity. Gemini's future operations remain cognisant of the fact that environment awareness remains an integral part of all attempts to strive for sustainable development. Their *raison d'être* will change little in the knowledge that journalists and the media (and particularly Southern media) will have an increasing role to play in covering the linkages between the environment, economics and politics, which affect and are affected by a range of issues - education, health, gender, population and reproductive health, migration, poverty etc. Trends and developments apart, Gemini's operations are based on the notion that it remains incumbent upon the first world to help provide and reinforce the skills of third world journalists to cover these issues with clarity, accuracy and responsibility; instilling Southern perspectives in language and style that can be understood by audiences in the North and the South.

6.2 The Future Shape of GEMINI

Gemini has the capacity to maintain its special niche in the international news flow and thus the news service will remain the core of its activities. The emphasis will be on development of twice-weekly news-feature service. This will involve more vigorous marketing; raising the visibility of their products in donor countries; and content development. The latter will see a maintenance of commitment to environment and development but with an additional emphasis on health and science, good governance, business and economics.

In line with the development of their news service, will be development of their training activities. The emphasis will be on environmental reporting but also on developing the logistics of the training component. In this regard, they should consolidate on the network of resource people in the regions, thus enhancing their own training capacity and helping at the same time to build regional media as well as training capacity.

To facilitate the achieve these aims, Gemini will approach Sida for support of a planned 6 Environmental Reporting workshops during the period 1997-1998.

To complement this programme, Gemini will also attempt to develop two further training components, namely:

- (a) a correspondence course training editor to work with Southern journalists; to provide systematic educational feedback on copy forwarded for their news service;
- (b) consolidation of their Internships with Gemini in London - currently supported by CIDA, DANIDA and the Regina University School of Journalism.

* Significantly, only the DANIDA support provides for a Southern journalist internship.

6.3 Organisational Capacity

Gemini is a tight-knit unit - a managing director, news editor and a few editorial staff on secondment or fellowships. Together they harness and develop the skills of hundreds of Southern journalists to provide a service. Since the departure of the founding member from Gemini's operations, it has managed to consolidated on its news service activities and has proved itself to have been very effective in the training sphere. However, the core news service operations consume the lion's share of their organisational capacity. They unquestionably have the expertise to train journalists but their capacity to conduct such training and monitor its impact, is limited under the current arrangements whereby Gemini staff implement the bulk of training. Clearly, the news service activities impedes on the news editor's available time to leave his desk and conduct workshops; and the managing director's expertise is more in line with media management than journalist skills training.

Gemini could and should address this capacity limitation by placing greater emphasis on the training responsibility of regional journalists in their workshops. In other words, it is a question of re-orienting Gemini's training role from one of training to facilitating training.

6.4 Sustainability of Gemini Operations

Gemini news service has established an operational niche which has proved sustainable: it has survived over the past 3 decades. International acclamation is testimony to how effectively it has exploited this niche. Gemini's training activities are necessarily dependent on the sustainability of the news service. The news service sustainability depends on its subscriptions for income-generation; training is and will remain dependent upon donor funding.

6.5 Continued Co-operation with Sida and Sida Options

- If Sida considered supporting Gemini's training activities through the Internships Programme, it is strongly suggested that such support be directed, like DANIDA's, at facilitating Southern journalists' work experience.
- Sida may also consider supporting Gemini's intentions to raise the visibility of their products in donor countries by (for example), making its news service available to Swedish NGOs; as well as facilitating a greater exposure to Swedish mainstream media. This would necessarily fall within the parameters of Gemini's current marketing arrangements.
- The immediate consideration for Sida is support of a further 6 Environmental Reporting Workshops for the period 1997 - 1998. **Please refer to Part VII (2)**
- The option of re-orientating Sida support in pursuit of the same objectives, either: multi-laterally; through Swedish or other NGOs, would not (in the opinion of the consultants) provide support for the same development niche in which Gemini has proved itself effective. This view is supported by most major training organisations in sub-Saharan Africa who believe that Gemini is doing a good job. This option is discussed further in Part VII (4).

PART VI

TVE FINDINGS

Achievements, Constraints , Organisational Capacity, Effectiveness & Sustainability

1 Aims and Objectives

1.1 Focus:

The urge for tackling environmental issues was the predominant ingredient in setting up TVE in 1984. But as mentioned earlier there was also a need to establish a media-entity, which could allow itself to bring up controversial issues and to present these in a more multifaceted way than an UN agency. So TVE started off as an environmental and fiercely independent actor in the audio-visual field to raise public awareness. However, although its programmes are used for campaigning purposes by some of its multiplier users, it is important to stress that TVE is **not** a campaigning organisation like e.g. Greenpeace.

TVE has since been inspired by the outcome of UNCED in Rio and in particular 'Agenda 21'. Its activities are characterised by an integral approach to sustainable development. TVE tries to anticipate emerging issues, which commercial producers would be reluctant to take up (at least initially), like the famine in Ethiopia, the eco-catastrophe in the Black Sea, the ozone layer depletion and organised killing of street children. Films on these subjects all resulted in concrete action. A common theme in the films is a focus on the human stories involved in fighting for sustainable development

TVE has also focused its resources on capacity building. While realising that only local forces can bring about change, TVE decided to focus its coverage of the low and middle income countries, using wherever possible, locally based film-makers as well as non-broadcast allies. The development of Video Resource Centres for distribution also builds the capacity of local broadcasters and local film professionals and has contributed to the strengthening of local and regional infrastructure for communication.

The main focus is to service the needs of the developing countries, but demands from the Western world have increased. TVE will shortly publish a Euro-catalogue, which contains details on 25 programmes to meet these demands. TVE must rationalise the diversity of demands, which come from donor agencies, other funders, co-producers in the television industry, broadcasters and NGOs in the South.

1.2 Clarity and Relevance to Constituency

Like PANOS, TVE decentralises its operations - entrusting local NGOs with distribution and entering into co-productions with local broadcasters and film professionals. This has made it possible to respond to local needs. TVE's mission is clear to its counterparts: firstly, to help build up the capacity of organisations in low and middle income countries to promote, so they can market and distribute environment and development programming as part of their own awareness raising work; and secondly, to facilitate the production of their own films on their own environment and development needs - in their own vernacular.

TVE's ambition to keep up the high quality work in the film production has, however, provoked local Video Resource Centres to underline that the audiences' main priority is information and not glossy films. There is apparently a risk that the films still remain too Northern in content and orientation. This criticism is taken seriously, but the consultants believe that maintaining quality is the key to securing funding. No Western TV production companies would otherwise enter projects. Donor funds enable TVE to lever the far greater sums mobilised from broadcast sources. Maintenance of quality is also essential in ensuring that broadcast and multiplier users in the developing countries do not perceive that they are being supplied with inferior productions. Furthermore, requirements from NGOs do not always overlap with those from national broadcast companies, who have to look at ratings - for example, the series *Africa Express* was well received by the African broadcasters and far less by local NGOs.

The Moving Pictures Bulletin has developed a specific constituency among international broadcasters, film-makers, festival organisers and educationalists. It can be questioned if the Bulletin isn't also too much a product of the North appealing to those who are already

enlightened, but its appearance at environment and education conferences has led to a marked pick-up in film orders.

1.3 Relevance to Swedish Development Goals and Sectorial Objectives

As pointed out in Sida's policy 'Handlingsprogram för hållbar utveckling', there is not a single universally accepted global definition of sustainable development. Instead, local conditions play a crucial role for the analysis on 'What is sustainable?' while development should be interpreted in its broadest sense linking ecological/environmental, economical, social, cultural and political aspects. Each country must take its own responsibility, and therefore it is important to strengthen Southern capacity to analyse issues and to act on their own environmental problems.

TVE works in accordance with this policy. By targeting decision-makers, policy planners, other primary actors and the public with informative quality films and TV programmes, it certainly aims at strengthening local capacities. A limitation has been TVE's own capacity to customise productions, i.e. language versions and locally adapted programmes. This problem is addressed by the delegation of mandate to VRCs. They take on the responsibility of packaging films for local audiences. The success of this strategy was evident at the recent meeting of VRCs from Asia and the Pacific, where individual VRCs reported back on their own packaging of programmes for local use. The Nepalese VRC reported it has made Nepalese language versions of over 25 TVE films, while the VRC in China is now making Mandarin language dubs of its third package of TVE programmes.

Capacity building is a key concept in Sida's support to developing countries. TVE has certainly put that into practice. The distribution of films is decentralised to local Video Resource Centres, which have in several cases become completely self-reliant. TVE is also developing the capacities of Southern film makers and film crews by arranging for co-productions with either its own film producers or from e.g. Carlton Television. TVE often finds it important to include a producer from the North to maintain a quality which ensures that the film will address not only a local problem but also be put into a global framework. The films are also meant to be distributed South-South.

The VRCs are mostly existing NGOs, which apply to become distributors. Sida considers that NGOs and the civil part of the society play a crucial role in sustainable development. TVE's efforts are directed at utilising the audio visual medium to help build civil society and this involves many NGOs.

Sida strives to support the promotion and development of cultural heritage, but stresses the importance of stimulating development which leads to innovations. New cultural processes often have difficulties in finding domestic support and should therefore be given specific attention. The Sida document 'Kulturens roll i utvecklingsprocessen' recognises that global massculture and the media world in which we all live is overwhelming us with language and images manipulated and predominantly designed by multinational media companies. This constitutes a great risk of gaining a superficial picture of the world. TVE offers an alternative to this one-sided description. Its approach is to present a prismatic picture of development and environment issues.

2

Achievement of Aims and Objectives

To date TVE has met over 35,000 programme orders and co-produced over 250 films. It has produced a lot of publications, established local Video distribution centres and enforced independence and pluralism in the reporting on development issues by allowing local professionals come forward. No doubt it has been successful in developing its own and other organisations as well as adapting its focus to new media conditions, new donor requirements and not least, a local approach. The activities correspond well to TVE's objectives of fostering self-expression and stimulating participation and debate. Harder to measure are the results of the activities designed to educate the public and raise awareness. This is not exclusive to TVE, and

PART VI TVE FINDINGS

its main outlets are the TV stations of the low and middle income countries which are not equipped to carry out audience ratings.

The promotion and co-production of specific distribution packages for World Aids day, World Environment day and the Beijing Women's Conference have been carefully planned and therefor rewarded. They have led to a high take-up of Moving Pictures titles. Apparently these fora are keys to organising activities to raise awareness.

TVE works closely with broadcasters in helping them to design their TV programmes on local issues. This entails recommending films for broadcast and acquiring rights for films specially requested by broadcasters.

2.1 Film and TV production

TVE seldom goes into film production by itself. Instead it works as a bridge between funders and television companies, and enters as a co-producer to ensure the rights to films for distribution in the South. It has been involved in an impressive number of film productions.

TVE has over the years undertaken several co-productions with Sweden. Its first international co-production was with TV2 Sweden. The four-part series on the United Nations, *Under the Blue Flag*, was produced together with i.a. Swedish Educational Broadcasting (UR). Electrolux has provided support for the 1995 documentary *Polio - the Last World*. Other examples include *Latvia's Rich Wetlands*, *Green Medicine* and *Juvenis* produced with Bo Landin and Staffan Hildebrand. The BBC has sold a number of the TVE co-production programmes since 1984.

Three series of *Developing Stories* including 14 films were produced in 1992 -96 together with The One World Group of Broadcasters, a consortium of public TV stations in Europe, in which Swedish Educational Broadcasting is a member. It ensured that the series were broadcast in Europe, Japan and Canada. Sida provided support for the first series of *Developing Stories*. The series have been distributed to TV stations with an estimated audience reach of 2,5 billion people according to information supplied to TVE by its partners. *Developing Stories* will be followed by a similar series *Millennium*.

Africa Express, which was partly financed by Sida, was a result of an on-the-job training project with local film producers. The films are professional and high-quality and have been very well received in Africa (particularly South Africa). However, dealing with topics like the taxi market in Johannesburg and hyperinflation in Zaire, they do not give a direct linkage for the audience to environment and development. TVE's opinion is, however, that it directly fulfils its aim to support cultural self-expression.

TVE has also been the initiator and co-producer of a series of women's films: *Beijing shorts*. A staff member co-operated with local female film producers around the world, which resulted in six 10 minute documentaries on the status and condition of women. A TVE survey found that broadcasts had been made of one or all of the films in a 'Woman's place' in over 90 countries. Following this success, the trust decided on a concerted follow-up, the series *Not the Numbers Game*. For 1997, TVE plans to continue to focus on women's equality with a series of key-profiles in the international women's movement; *In praise of older women*.

TVE is involved in producing *Earth Report* together with WWF, Carlton Television and BBC. *Earth Report* is a 5 minute update on the state of our planet. BBC World broadcasts the same piece once daily for a week. It reaches all over the world by satellites. *Earth Report* is also available on Internet.

TVE is also soliciting funds for a *Democracy Express*, a Latvia /Russia pilot magazines series on human rights. A project supported by the Ford foundation has also seen TVE co-produce a series of films on indigenous people's issues to support the UN decade of indigenous people.

2.2 Moving Pictures Distribution

The Moving Pictures distribution service started 1987 with the intention of supplying broadcasters in developing countries with quality films and TV programmes. TVE had realised that producing films was not enough; the films had to reach an audience as well. The Southern film makers do not have the expertise or access to distribute or sell their own films, and the commercial film industry is often seeking out independent producers. The video-distribution is not a glamorous task, but is the major impediment to a viable Southern Film industry - assisting film producers in the South to reach a global audience and gain access to decision-making bodies.

The initial policy of distributing programmes free of charge needed to be modified. Sometimes accused as 'dumping', this model undermined the positions of local independent film producers. The programmes were often under-valued. The philosophy was that something you have to pay for is more valuable. Furthermore, distributing videos from the North did not contribute to capacity building. TVE therefore changed its policy and decided to decentralise the distribution and to set up Video Resource Centres and a differentiated pricing - dependent upon customers' financial situations.

The Moving Pictures Distribution Service has been the main focus for Sida's support to TVE.

Total amount of films ordered

1992 - 93	8,400 orders met
March 93 - Sept. 94	5,484 programme orders met of which 400 commercially
Oct. 94 - Aug 96	8,064 video tapes distributed of which 1.063 to broadcasters

Presented in ANNEX 3, is a directory for further statistical data in 'What Happened' reports I - IV

2.2.1. Video Resource Centres - VRCs

During the past four years, TVE has joined forces with 46 existing NGOs in 40 countries to channel TV programmes and films to viewers, who TVE would not otherwise reach. The VRCs are divided into regions: Asia, Southern Africa, West Africa, Latin America and Eastern Europe. They hold mastercopies, duplicate them themselves and approach broadcasters, governmental agencies, NGO's and educational institutions.

The NGOs have to prove a non-profit status and media experience to be selected as VRCs. A criticism raised in the last evaluation was that they are nominated too much on an elite-ground. TVE, however, finds it important to be very selective in this process for legal reasons regarding film rights and commercial exploitation and so as to guarantee sustainable VRCs.

TVE stresses that the VRCs should not be considered TVE clones, but rather independent entities aiming at self-reliance and with defined areas of responsibilities. In Peru, South Africa and Colombia for example, the VRCs are virtually self-supporting, while others still have a long way to go. Their needs range from technical assistance and equipment to how to version programmes and use videos for campaigning to liaise with broadcasters.

The advantages of decentralised distribution are obvious in many ways. It is more cost-efficient to have copies made close to the viewers, and avoid transportation costs. As customs authorities have been blocking video-dispatches in some instances, the local duplication has been a practical way to circumvent such distribution problems. The VRCs can also charge in local, non-convertible currency. They can fund-raise in their own territory, and produce their own promotional material.

Another advantage is that the VRCs can tailor the packaging of films. So far it seems they have had limited resources to develop local versions which is a serious shortcoming of the whole process.

Maybe, the most pleasing aspect of the VRCs has been the way some of them have mobilised local funding from donor sources with no TVE intervention: for example; British Council, GTZ (Sri Lanka), Asia Foundation and Mitsubishi (Colombia). TVE Japan contributed US\$ 50,000 in 1996 from the Japanese Foundation, to further develop the Asian VRCs.

For a listing of VRCs and local promotional material, please refer to ANNEX 3.

2.2.2 VRC Workshops

Between 1994 and 1996 TVE organised six workshops in Nairobi, Johannesburg, Colombo, Pretoria, Sao Paulo and Senegal - involving NGOs, producers, broadcasters and funders. The workshops defined the future needs of the VRCs, which included:

- Instructions on professional language-versioning.
- The lack of versioned copies remain a problem, which is commented on in most reports. Often the VRCs will get master tapes to dub themselves, but they have had an apparent limited capacity to handle this so far. Local ways to overcome this problem is however encouraging. An Indian film director decided to provide a script in Hindi, which was read while the video was screened and the sound was turned down. This was also a way to reach grass roots level, but is of course not satisfying generally speaking.
- Training on 'topping and tailing' to make foreign programmes relevant to local circumstances. Like language versioning does this still remain a problem, but it is starting to be addressed in a systematic way.
- Management courses on how to operate a VRC. The VRCs get a lot of support from the manager and the regional desk officers in London. But many still need to be more self-supporting and effective in selling and cost-recovery.
- Provision of hardware. The Swedish Trust Fund/UNEP has with its contribution provided video cassettes, master tapes, video recorders and duplication equipment, as well as some funding to help with language versioning. Sony has also come up with video machines and cassettes, but the need for hardware still remains. Except for video recorders, it would be an advantage to get all VRCs computerised, so ordering, exchange of information and networking between the VRCs could be more swift.
- Catalysing VRC networking through e-mail, Moving Pictures publications and/or regional VRC newsletters. A VRC Newsletter has now appeared with its first issue in August, 1996. Many of the VRCs have e-mail, but as mentioned above, many still lack this utility.
- Supporting more local programme production. TVE has certainly responded to this; *Developing Stories*, *Africa Express*, *Earth Reports*, *the Beijing Shorts* and *Not the Numbers Game* are good examples.

For VRC Workshop reports see ANNEX 3.

2.2.3 Moving Pictures Bulletin

The Moving Pictures Bulletin is a professional, high quality magazine. From the beginning it was issued quarterly, but due to financial restrictions it now has an irregular appearance. Because of financial constraints, it has also deviated from its earlier format of listing new programmes on a variety of themes, to focusing on special themes;

PART VI TVE FINDINGS

women, small islands, population and new media. It is translated into French and sometimes Italian and Spanish. During the period reviewed there have been eleven bulletins:

1992: 2 issues; Earth summit, Population

1993: 2 issues: India's Media and the Environment, Broadcasting for children

1994: 5 issues: Indigenous people, New media, Small islands, 10th Anniversary of TVE, 2nd UNICEF issue on Broadcasting for Children

1995: 1 issue: Women

1996: 1 issue: Human Rights

Each issue comes in 10,000 copies except 1995's women issue, which was printed in 12,500 copies. The cost per issue is approximately £ 30,000 (SEK 300,000). Subscriptions, sales or advertising have been limited partly because of its irregularity. In December, 1994, at the TVE Trustees' meeting in Bellagio, it was decided that future editions would have to be fully self-financed.

Criticism has been aired that the Bulletin is too much a product of the North. Its glossy appearance and the selection of authors have caused these objections. TVE has considered moving its production to the South, but once again because of its irregularity, there has been no urge.

The consultants find it relevant to question if Moving Pictures Bulletin has a future. With local promotional material, VRC Newsletters, the Moving Pictures Catalogue, the data base and the web-site on Internet, it seems that the informative side is adequately covered. The Bulletin represents interesting and intellectually stimulating reading which many certainly welcome, and it does play an important role in promoting the films. However the consultants believe that it may not be cost effective. Furthermore, it seems somewhat paradoxical to stress the superiority of audio-visual media over printed media and then still come up with this nice magazine.

TVE could perhaps consider transferring its valuable 'yellow pages' role to inserts in the two publications, VRC Newsletter and TVE Update. Another option would be to come to terms with the 'stop-go' nature of the publication of the Bulletin and get it on a regular footing in order to organise commercial subscriptions, which would help to pay for its productions costs.

Moving Pictures Bulletins are to be found in ANNEX 3.

2.2.4 Database

The database includes contacts, 300 film and video free lancers, stock of videos, ordering, 2,000 film titles, technical information about the films like language and video format, and copyright details. TVE can receive orders by order forms, fax or e-mail, but will forward these to VRCs.

The database allows for quantitative evaluations. A popular film has been *Half the Sky*, a co-production between TVE and another film company. A Chinese female film producer is telling the story about four generations of women in one family. TVE knows it's a success, but the database confirms to whom it was sent and thus who the prospective audience was. For example, in the case of this film:

Broadcasters: Argentina (2), Austria, Belgium, Brazil, Chile, China, Colombia, Denmark, Fiji, Finland, India, Italy, Kenya, Mexico, Nepal, New Zealand, Nigeria, Norway, Peru, Portugal, Seychelles, Slovene, South Africa, Spain, Sri Lanka, Tanzania, Uganda, UK, USA and Vietnam.

PART VI TVE FINDINGS

Non-broadcasters like i.a. Bahamas Planning Association, Women's media centre in Cambodia, SUCO in Canada, SPOR film Promotion in Denmark, Festival International du film d'environnement in France. The list is long and impressive.

The data base could perhaps also be a tool for further analysis of e.g.: the number of broadcasts, repeats, when broadcast, press coverage, VRC assessments, positive actions following the film screening etc. Most of these indicators would be more quantitative than qualitative.

2.2.5 Catalogue

The *Moving Pictures Catalogue 6* is a beautiful product. The lay-out is very appealing and inspires a detailed look at each page. In this competitive and commercial world of television, the importance of appearance should not be underestimated. Photos, texts and information are relevant and well presented.

A real hit among TVE films is *Participatory Research with Women Farmers*. As the title indicates, the film is about gender research to improve agricultural production in semi-arid regions of India, and how the research yielded little until scientists involved local farmers (women). This film is listed under 'How to' with a short description on how the film came about. An icon indicates to whom the film is available to show. Technical information like length, video type and language is presented. Other categories are i.a. environment, marine, water, agriculture, population, women, Agenda 21, health, indigenous people and human rights.

One third of the films presented in the new catalogue *Moving Pictures 6* emanate from the South or are results of South-North co-operation.

The Moving Pictures Catalogue 6 can be accessed through ANNEX 3.

2.3 Training

TVE encourages on-the-job training. Involving local film producers and crews in TVE (co-) productions have resulted in shared experience and imparted knowledge on specific techniques and skills - both in filming and on local approaches to development. The production of *Africa Express*, which Sida supported is an example.

A formal training project, which was an exception to TVE's policy, was the public awareness and training projects in Botswana. Sida was a minority funder with Norad, while USAID funded the major part. It was a multi-media training project for the Curriculum Division in the Ministry of Education to produce programmes for school use in order to promote Botswana's National Conservation Strategy. TVE oversaw the training of a Botswana film crew, which produced six videos and a 30 minute international broadcast standard production. The videos were drama, docu-drama and documentaries and were screened as part of the curriculum in all Botswana schools, which are all equipped with video recorders. The idea was that this would be a model for neighbouring countries.

Other formal training activities undertaken by TVE include: a film training project on forest resources funded by ODA; a Dutch film project on pressures on the environment from urban development and training in the Baltic Republics, which have been supported by the Finnish television YLE, The Finnish Ministry of the Environment, The World Bank, The Swedish EPA and ODA.

3

Impact

3.1 National, Regional and International Public Environmental Awareness

TVE's films on the struggle of the Ogoni people against the Nigerian regime and Shell have been transmitted throughout the world (including on Swedish Television). A film broadcast in

Zanzibar on the threat from dangerous pesticides led to public demand to send a consignment back to Europe. Broadcast and special showings of a series of films highlighting the World Bank's disregard for environment, has been instrumental in a re-formulation of the bank's policy, according to TVE's sources (Bank insiders and other individuals). That the head of the Senegal TV Broadcasting company was sacked after the screening of the film *Inside the Poison Trade*, which implicated government officials in corruption, shows that the films do have impact and sometimes are political dynamite. There is not only anecdotal evidence like this to demonstrate the impact. Replies on a questionnaire sent to the VRCs from the Sida consultants show that e.g. national debate has followed the screening of the films (e.g. in China). Quantitative feedback in the form of orders also indicate a certain impact. TVE has not had the resources to undertake a thorough impact assessment. Letters to TVE and responses to VRCs have been encouraging enough. However, like PANOS and Gemini, an impact assessment of TVE's activities should be a part of future planning.

3.2 Media Development: Freedom, Pluralism and Independence

TVE was founded by UNEP and WWF with the role of being a free, independent film producer, which would not back off controversial issues and dilute its messages. Its own *raison d'être* is reproduced in its activities. Facilitating local film professionals to present their views on environment and development is a way of promoting pluralism.

The establishment of VRCs is also meant to support a pluralistic and free media. They target broadcasters in order to get them to screen films, which could be alternatives to the regular commercial productions. Also, the fact of having established a VRC in a country like China, which manages to get films shown on various TV channels (there are 1,000) and where there are 240,000,000 TV sets, is a step forward.

3.3 Networking, Institutional Development and Professional Competence

Networking is the cornerstone of TVE operations. As a broker, catalyst, co-producer and establisher of VRCs, the broad net of contacts must be considered as one of TVE's own main resources.

The VRCs are institutions developed by TVE. They existed as NGOs before but not with their consequential broad mission. The VRCs have developed their own networks with broadcasters, NGOs and educationalists. Professional competence has also been enhanced by the on-the-job training with local film professionals.

3.4 Gender Equality

In 1995, TVE produced a 12 hour package of films, in English, French and Spanish language versions. This included the series *Beijing Shots*, three long documentaries and 28 one-minute spots, all made with female film producers from a long list of countries. The films were produced ahead of the Beijing Conference. Strategic marketing with a thematic Moving Pictures Bulletin led to a strong pick up in orders. There has not been a follow up in order to see if the women felt that they had developed their capacities, but it's most likely to believe so.

In January 1996, as a follow-up to the Beijing and Cairo Conferences, TVE and the North-South Centre of the Council of Europe had a meeting of the One World Women's group in Lisbon to discuss how to co-operate to maintain a more permanent 'women's track' on television screens around the world. Participants came from 30 countries, including i.a. Europe, India, Uganda and the US. The women decided to make a new series of one-minute spots for the Habitat Conference in Istanbul. Fourteen pieces were produced and screened in 22 countries. TVE is currently planning a fourth meeting of women producers in Italy in 1997 and is collaborating with Unesco on a special programme to mark International Women's Day in March 1997.

4 Cost Effectiveness

4.1 Utilisation of Sida Funds

Sida funding has been directed to the Moving Pictures project in general; it is difficult to separate the outcomes of Sida's contribution. However, it is clear that for 1996 the Sida money was utilised for : (1) the production and publication of the Moving Pictures Catalogue 6; (2) the Sao Paulo VRC workshop; (3) the up-grading of TVE's own staff; (4) the provision of secretariat help to organise the Lisbon meeting of women broadcasters in January, 1996; and (5) to appoint a marketing manager to increase the income from commercial sales of TVE programmes in order to be able to further subsidise distribution.

4.2 Cost-effectiveness

TVE has taken several steps to become more cost-effective. Its investment in a digital clip-board has reduced production costs. The continued decentralisation of distribution to VRCs is lowering costs extensively. The investment in upgrading the skills of Moving Pictures staff is already showing dividends in terms of faster reporting back procedures from the new, updated database. By reducing the need for outside consultants to design and print e.g. the VRC Newsletter and the TVE update, the printed covers for Video cassettes or flyers has also reduced costs and lead to more effective routines.' TVE has also attempted to maximise the income it generates from programme sales in commercial territories. Provisional figures for 1996 show that their strategies are working - income to August 1996 amounted to more than 38% of total Moving Pictures budget for the year. This has enabled TVE to commission a consultant to undertake the work needed to put the Moving Pictures Catalogue on line in January 1997 out of income from sales rather than from donor funding.

During the consultant's visit to TVE, some staff members aired their personal ideas on how TVE could raise additional money itself. Although, these may not actually be lucrative ideas, it shows a mental preparedness for maximising cost-effectiveness.

4.3 Administration costs

	Moving Pictures Budget	TVE Overall Budget
Staff % of overall costs.	38.48	14.85
Admin.% of overall costs	14.05	9.68
Projects% of overall costs	47.47	75.47

4.4 Reporting, Accountability and Transparency

Reporting and accountability do not seem to be a problem any longer. The departure of the former Finance and Development Director in 1994 left a big gap. His successor was an accountant with less interest in the 'products' and who only stayed on for a short period. It left TVE in a turmoil with financial reporting falling behind and strategic planning becoming less efficient. However, with a full time book-keeper and a part time officer charged with checking the progress of the project implementation, the figures are in order again. Nevertheless, staffing could still not be termed sustainable or satisfactory. This is fully appreciated by the director and trustees, but with no core funding to cover the post of a financial director, TVE's Finance Committee recommended to the board that the current staffing be retained.

5 The Future and Sustainability

5.1 Current Trends and Developments in the Sector

How fast the world is being catapulted into this new era of inter-active multi-media is difficult to tell. It is also difficult to predict whether certain parts of the world population will be able to broach the widening gap of access to quality information. High ranked professionals at

PART VI TVE FINDINGS

international broadcasting companies like BBC and Sky, with whom the Sida consultant met, would simply say: 'It's moving fast'. Their approach seems to be to try to work on two fronts parallel: 'traditional' TV broadcasting including satellites, cable TV etc.; and Internet and the multi-media world.

It is certain, however, that the proliferation of television has overtaken all the predictions of the 1980's. For example, India's national broadcaster operates 16 stations and 2 satellite services. The Indian with a dish can receive over 40 separate satellite services and there as many as 60,000 cable TV operators. Television is still, like in 1984, a most powerful medium, and the number of satellites increases steadily, which enlarges the potential audience for TV programmes. Thanks to satellites it is becoming harder for censors, dictators and authoritarian regimes to control information. Information boundaries have ceased to exist. When it comes to raising awareness on sustainable development, television continues to be a central medium.

TVE's own perspective of the future televised world is one with more 'niche' TV channels due to 'niche' advertising markets. Today, sports and music (for example) have their own channels clean from interference from other types of programmes. Others will follow - cooking, gardening and (why not dog care?) The development follows two paths: a mass media for entertainment, sports and news and then a minority medium for documentaries. TVE is convinced that there will be a market for 'niche' film production. Its donors have also agreed that news dispatches are among the most efficient ways of raising awareness and get a message across.

Most of the films TVE produces and distributes are documentaries. Few are dramas, animation or soap operas. The Sida consultants will not argue whether one format or another is more effective for raising awareness, since no impact assessments among audiences have been done, but it is apparent that producers of documentaries have to struggle more for their films than before. The commercial and competitive world of television does not consider documentaries to be lucrative programmes reaching the largest audiences, and young audiences have little patience with 'televised radio'. A cynical film producer would say: Spice the documentary with some animals and children, and people are going to love to watch it. In this explosion of information, the format is important.

TVE may not be a unique organisation, but it has been very successful in setting up its world-wide distribution and acting as a bridge between South and North. Theoretically, TVE has a straight competitor, WETV, which is funded by IDRC in Canada. Although it's been there for several years, it does not seem to leave any prints. So in practice, it cannot be compared to TVE. BBC Enterprises and National Geographic produce and distribute films on nature, but are not editorially as independent as TVE. There is no comparison to TVE in Sweden.

5.2 The future shape of TVE

TVE has considered changing the meaning to its E from Environment to Education. Nevertheless it will continue its role as producer, broker and distributor of film and bridge the gap between North-South. It has succeeded very well in taking an outstanding position as distributor of films. As mentioned above, there seems to be no serious competitor, and it is important to remember that it has taken TVE many years to build this capacity both in London and in the VRCs around the world.

Technically, TVE will have to match its activities with the fast developments in the media sector. It has recently entered the web-world, which will probably offer new possibilities in the near future. The *Millennium* films produced together with Channel 4 will be transmitted in 1999 by TV, video or computer with CD-ROM capability. The *Earth Report* broadcast by BBC World is already on Internet.

Channel 4 has underlined that 'the series *Millennium* must above all be accessible and relevant to audiences in the West as well as in other parts of the world'. This mirrors a tendency among

PART VI TVE FINDINGS

financiers in the North, that they need to justify their investment even more than ever before. The same goes for the donors, which have to justify their support to the tax payers. As mentioned earlier, TVE's main constituency is in the South, so it is a balancing act.

TVE would like for the coming years to expand its activities in the Baltic region and in former USSR. This area has huge environmental problems and to educate the public and to influence decision-makers is most essential. It will be important to stress the linkages and the need for an integrated approach for a sustainable development and improved environment. TVE defines its mission up to the year 2000 as:

- to co-produce programmes
- to subsidise cassette distribution
- to develop VRCs
- to train film-makers
- to train in audio-visual use
- to research on the basis of feedback
- to develop the data base

5.3 Organisational Capacity

TVE has always struggled with a significant turn-over in staff. There are several reasons why it is difficult to consolidate its forces. The TV industry and the International agencies pay higher salaries. The culture in the British film industry is that you move on once the project is terminated. There has been a lack of core income to provide staff security. The upshot is that it cannot be said that there is an organisational stability at TVE.

A review commissioned by the 1993 TVE's Board of Trustees found an over dependence on key personnel. The commitment and expertise of the director and deputy director was the pillar that the organisation had to lean on. The leading circle is now enlarged with the manager of the VRC, who is fluent in Japanese, French and German and has played a big role in raising co-finance from Japan and Germany, but the lack of a finance and development director is still a management weakness. The VRC Asia Director based at TVE Sri Lanka has secured the services of an outstanding officer, but TVE's worry is that he will go to an international agency.

TVE is funded from over 50 different sources. It means that a lot of work is done on proposals and negotiations on agreements. At the start of each financial year, there is a £200,000 deficit in office running expenses. TVE therefore has to generate enough income to cover the running costs. Although, 18 are on the staff, many of them work part-time and perform operational tasks like distribution, book keeping, film rights, negotiations, so few are on a strategic level, able to fund-raise.

5.4 Continued Co-operation with Sida

A basic but nevertheless crucial question for Sida to answer is: "Does anyone want to see the films and TV programmes produced and distributed by TVE and its Moving Pictures Programme?" VRC workshops underwrite that there is a market for the TVE films. Ordering figures also indicate: yes. Although, TVE is imposing a policy of charging for the video copies, orders come in a steady stream and there is no sign of decline. A complete and just analysis of the 'market' is difficult, since some video copies are handed out free of charge.

Sida will have to consider its support from a global cultural political perspective. Beating totalitarian regimes, ruthless companies, social and racial prejudice by supporting free media and independent journalists is not the only aspect of freedom of expression. The commercial TV supply with mostly superficial soap operas or talk shows may be another threat to sustainable development. As the Head of Documentaries and International Co-productions, Roger James at Carlton Television puts it: "Consumerism is the message and it equals happiness. TVE conveys an alternative message".

5.5 Sida Options

The following could either be seen as ingredients of the Sida contribution to TVE or single activities to support :

- To support TVE with core-funding. UNEP has for many years been the principal source of catalytic project finance (US\$ 300,000), but it has now ceased because of UNEP's financial crisis.
- To support language versioning and local adaptations of videos. This should be done by the VRCs, but they will support for training.
- To continue the capacity building of the VRCs with out earmarking the money.
- General funding to the Moving Pictures programme to continue i.a. the capacity building of the VRCs, the development of the database and the Internet .
- To earmark a certain part for activities in the Baltic region
- To provide a part as seed money in film production/news features. TVE is e.g. soliciting funds for a Latvia/Russia series *Democracy Express* on human rights.
- To support mobile screening facilities to cover rural audiences, which cannot otherwise be reached.

PART VII

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1 PANOS

Sida support to the Panos Regional Partnerships Programme and Media Briefing Documents has been an effective way of addressing its own development goal on the environment; and more specifically, its sectorial objectives with respect to Environmental Public Awareness and Media development. But support for Panos has also meant support for a whole range of development activities in which Panos is involved and which contribute to sustainable development and the building of civil society. In this respect, Panos has exhibited an holistic approach to promoting sustainable development which is in direct keeping with Sida's own development philosophy.

Panos has not been without its problems, however they have achieved remarkable success in terms of quantitative and qualitative output. This conclusion is endorsed unanimously by partner organisations, other donors, individuals and independent organisations who were contacted.

Panos financial and narrative reporting which was examined by the consultants was found to be (in the main) exemplary. However, in the view of some donors, the regularity of this reporting has been inconsistent. Panos has demonstrably striven for cost effectiveness in all aspects of their operations, although there is always room for improvement in this area.

Whilst planning and implementation of Panos programmes appears to have been impressive, Panos is aware that they have not embarked strongly enough on qualitative impact assessment. This is central to the criticism of the 1992 evaluation and it remains pertinent. This review would re-endorse the conclusions of the 1992 evaluation: Panos is trying to do too much in too many countries. They should concentrate their efforts more and consolidate on a wealth of successful activities - and assess their impact more thoroughly. Albeit, they have begun to focus on key partners in key countries, they may be too optimistic about the potential capacity of regional offices to help address this central concern. It is not up to Sida to suggest where Panos should concentrate; however, continued Sida support should emphasise effectiveness through concentration.

The attempts to decentralise power and autonomy from the North to regions in the South with local staff, is a consolidation of the Regional Partnerships Programme. It is important to realise that this process will in no way decrease funding requirements in the short term. Sustainability, an effective mandate and permanence of these regional centres should be key objectives and they should also be encouraged to explore income generation possibilities in order to sustain their regional activities.

In the course of this review, no NGOs have been identified as having significantly better capacity to act as an effective co-operation partner for Sida support to so many Southern NGOs in the sector. Certainly, it would be difficult to match the same calibre and extent of information outputs as Panos. In accordance with the current Sida emphasis on concentration, it is the view of the consultants that support to the sector should embrace consolidation and rationalisation rather than increasing support to other initiatives.

Sida should continue to support Panos programmes. The options for this support are outlined in **PART IV (6.5)**

Support required from Sida for the next three years will be similar to the support for the most recent agreement i.e. SEK 12 million. In addition, Panos will approach Sida (DESO/UND) with a request for bridging finance of approximately SEK 1.7 million for the period August-December 1996. Further to this, approximately SEK 772,000 will be sought from Sida (DESO/HÄLSO) for the Panos AIDS and Panos Reproductive Health programmes. It is strongly recommended that this request should be considered jointly by DESO - /UND/HÄLSO and Medier och Kultur.

2 GEMINI

In accordance with their own development objectives, Sida may be well advised to support varied training initiatives which show potential or have a good track record and fulfil identified needs. Gemini training activities have demonstrated all of the above and should be considered favourably by Sida. Gemini's training has been effective. Their strength is that they have the contacts to identify needs and utilise capable regional trainers to address them. However, future support should encourage Gemini to re-orientate their training role from one of trainers, to one of training facilitators. This is more commensurate with Gemini's training capacity and expertise and will ensure that Sida support is developing Southern training capacity in the course of training journalists. The indicators which should be used to monitor and evaluate progress in this regard are obvious.

Whilst Sida support for Gemini's Environmental Reporting Workshops is not misplaced with the Environmental Education Desk at UND, their training activities in general are more aptly related to the policies, strategies and priorities of the Media and Culture Department in DESO. This in no way precludes a continued Gemini training emphasis on environmental reporting. However, it is suggested that Development Journalism more suitably describes Gemini's training competence than Environmental Reporting (which in any case, is an integral part of the former.)

In any case, future support for Gemini should be based on the recommendations of DESO's Media and Culture Department whose programme officers are best equipped to place the value of the Gemini role in the context of journalistic training needs in Sub-Saharan Africa.

The approximate funding required for 6 Environmental Reporting Workshops for the period 1997 - 1998 will be approximately SEK 450,000/workshop, i.e. SEK 2.7million.

3 TVE

TVE and its Moving Pictures Programme has been effective in building capacity in the South through the decentralisation of film distribution and the establishment of 46 Video Resource Centres in 40 countries. Co-production with Southern film professionals has also strengthened local infra-structure for communication.. The Sida support to TVE has been focused on these two activities and thus, has been used in a beneficial way. To stimulate debate and participation and to encourage self-expression have been objectives, which were fulfilled. TVE's efficiency and success as a result of wise strategic planning has been endorsed by partner organisations, local NGO's and other donors, who the Sida consultants have contacted.

TVE should continue to develop the VRCs so as many as possible can become self-reliant. Some produce their own local promotional material and manage to language version the films, but this is a key task for the future. The videos are of high quality and relevant, but screening is limited because of lack of language versioned copies. The VRCs will need assistance in this area and in management of the organisation.

The VRCs' distribution of films constitute a potential source for knowledge and information when linked to other Sida projects, but questionnaires sent to the DCO's by the consultants showed that few were familiar with TVE and its efforts to raise public awareness in environmental and development issues. To benefit more from the Sida support to TVE, Sida could encourage the VRCs to liaise locally with Sida's DCOs.

Letters, questionnaires sent out to the VRCs by the consultants and general response from partner organisation indicate that the films do have an impact and lead to national debate, but

PART VII CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

no empirical or systematic assessment of impact has been undertaken. TVE has set up a system with VRC surveys, but the response has so far been weak. TVE should therefore be asked to develop indicators for assessing the impact of its programmes.

If Sida decides to continue its core support to the Moving Pictures Programme, it should discuss with TVE, the future for the Bulletin in its present format. Is it important in order to gain attention among decision making bodies or is too much of the North and only for 'half literate'. It's a paradox to stress the superiority of audio-visual material and then go for printed material.

4 Sida SUPPORT TO THE SECTOR

4.1 Focus and Implementation

The broad range of development issues which are being addressed by the three organisations, necessitates that Sida view support for the 3 organisations with more specificity than as general support to environmental public awareness. Media is the *raison d'être* of Gemini and TVE and central to all Panos programmes. Furthermore, it is relatively underdeveloped third world media. But it is central to the environmental message as well as all of the other development issues with which the 3 organisations are concerned. This necessarily means that in many instances, democratisation of communications and development of a free, independent and pluralistic media is a pre-requisite within the sector and as important as the environmental message itself or any of the other messages.

The purists would have it that "the medium is the message". This is borne out by (for example) the necessity in West African Panos programmes to concentrate on promoting media pluralism in order to facilitate environmental public awareness. The status quo in other regions Panos has programmes, whilst differing in the relative degree of media development, means that a concentration on environmental issues, to the neglect of media development itself, would similarly render such programmes impotent. TVE is an organisation contributing to film and TV production and distribution of video and film related to sustainable development - albeit, the environment is a central theme. Gemini presents a somewhat different case. It is first and foremost, a third world news-wire service which can utilise its contacts and experiences to train journalists in environmental reporting - or any other reporting for that matter. If titles of programmes are anything to go by, it would appear that Gemini may be concentrating more singularly on environment as an issue than the other two organisations (since Sida supports, very specifically, environmental reporting workshops). Clearly however, "environmental reporting" has since the 1970s, been an integral part of "development journalism". That this support between 1993-1995 was called "development journalism", is cosmetic and reflects little shift in emphasis. The workshops continue to address environment as one of the integral issues in reporting on sustainable development.

The three organisations have undergone a similar metamorphosis in their approaches to environmental public awareness. Clearly, none of the 3 organisations could be described as being "environmental" organisations although their programmes have a strong emphasis on the environment as an integral part of sustainable development.

Previous Sida support to environmental public awareness has emphasised the importance of environmental issues, whilst recognising that environment as an issue cannot, and should not be singled out from equally as important issues which are an integral part of promoting sustainable development. Future support should continue to do this. As importantly, it should recognise that environmental public awareness is inextricably linked to media development and the promotion of democratic communications and social justice. It is this that the three organisations have demonstrably done well and can continue to do so with Sida support.

Possible future Sida support for the three organisations is just as relevant to the sectorial policies, strategies and objectives of Sida/DESO's Media and Culture department, as they are to the Environmental Education/UND desk. It is the view of the consultants that future responsibility for possible support would be most appropriately placed with Media and Culture.

Having said this, Sida needs to be clear about its approach to implementing its development goal on the environment and its Action Plan on sustainable development. Whilst the conceptual approach emphasises the integration of environmental issues into all policy areas, certain contradictions remain. Devolving responsibility for ensuring that all development assistance is in keeping with Sida's environmental policy goal has the potential to promote an environmental dimension in all projects. Such an approach also has the potential to permit the environmental dimension to be treated superficially or even omitted. Environmental Education has a relatively well defined focus and set of indicators encapsulated in a good working policy document. Sida's handlingprogram för hållbar utveckling is a comprehensive document which appears to have put Sida on track. Nevertheless, the integration of environmental policy into all policy areas, still requires more effective departmental co-operation and co-ordination if current support to environmental public awareness is anything to go by. The impermanence of the desk officer for Environmental Education can surely not be conducive to an effective implementation of the action plan - albeit, the Environmental Education desk in UND/DESO is one of many implementation points for Sida's strategy in this regard.

Furthermore, continuity and feedback are essential ingredients of effective co-operation. The three organisations evaluated all feel that they do their job well, but lack feedback and contact with Sida. Since the environmental education desk officers have been so transient, continuity is lacking. Changes of positions within Sida will always take place; Sida obviously needs to establish a more systematic way of ensuring continuity.

4.2 Channels of Assistance

In the course of surveying the targeted constituency of the three organisations, as well as multilateral agencies which support them, numerous requests for Sida funding of initiatives related to environmental public awareness were received. These requests have not been given analytical attention in this review and nor has it been the express intention of the consultants to suggest to Sida what other initiatives it should be supporting in the sector. An underlying conclusion of this review is that Sida, rather than supporting more initiatives, should be more effectively concentrating its support to the sector. Some of the reasons for this may be summarised as follows:

4.2.1 Multilateral

Channelling funding multilaterally obviously cannot provide focus for strategically important NGO activities in the field of environmental development (of which support to the 3 organisations is a part.) UN and other multilateral agencies often have to cope with complicated political agendas which in many cases erodes the potential effectiveness of programmes in the areas being addressed by the 3 organisations. In any case, it is the considered opinion of the consultants that what the 3 organisations do, they do well, and it is strategically important work. No multilateral agencies which implement the same programmes as Panos, TVE and Gemini, come to mind. The 3 organisations themselves value the special relationship which they have with Sida - one of partners in development. Multilateral support would mean Sida participation more as a funder than co-operative partner.

In summary, it is the opinion of the consultants that multilateral alternatives has little relevance to the current support for Panos, TVE and Gemini.

4.2.2 Bilateral - Swedish Organisations

Summarily, it would be wrong to think that the specificity of programmes could, or should be replicated by Swedish NGOs. This is not to imply that organisations like SNF are not doing a good job. But such support should **not** be considered as an alternative to support for international NGOs like the three organisations; rather as an integrated approach to support for sustainable, environmentally-aware development. What may be implied is that Sida could facilitate much greater co-ordination between Swedish NGOs, and international NGOs like the 3 organisations being reviewed here.

4.2.3 Other Bilateral

There are other effective NGOs working in similar areas to Panos, Gemini and TVE which Sida is not currently supporting. Applications for support from these organisations will no doubt be considered by Sida on their merit. But it is the suggestion of the consultants that the following two imperatives remain:

- (a) whilst the 3 organisations may not be unique in their activities, they have found a development niche over the past 10 years and are doing a good job in addressing the associated development issues;
- (b) Sida has expended a prodigious amount of money and effort on the 3 organisations and it is incumbent upon Sida to consolidate that funding and resource expenditure.

4.3 Concentration Effectiveness and Flexibility

In Part VIII below, this review draws attention to the apparent lack of co-ordinated knowledge about environmental projects which are financed from "inom land-ramen" tranches. Significantly, all programme countries were asked to provide brief accounts of their country-specific activities in order for the consultants to draw conclusions about overall Sida support for the environmental sector. (The response was fair only - and only from a limited number of countries). Significantly, few of the DCOs had much knowledge about activities of the 3 organisations - despite the fact that they were operating in the same country and region; and more importantly - despite the fact that Sida's "inom land-ramen" tranches were in some cases, supporting very similar initiatives to the ones being implemented by Panos, Gemini and TVE. (One pertinent example is the substantial support - USD 84,000 - by Sida Mozambique in 1995 of the IUCN project for Journalists Training Courses in Environmental and Development Reporting. Whilst it is not suggested here that such support is ineffective, in none of the project documents is mention made of how such projects complements or fulfils a need which is not already being addressed by (for example) Gemini or Panos, in the very same country. It must be considered in such cases, that a (not insubstantial) part of such support goes to administrative costs of the organisation itself.)

With respect to projects financed from det särskilda miljöanslaget, only indicative comments can be made. These comments centre around the question of whether or not an effective concentration of Sida assistance could be made by rationalising individual projects in the light of this review. It would appear that some support (e.g.) EWNHS, WIF, Action-Environmental Health Magazine; as well as support to national and international regional seminars in East Africa; may be duplicating the support to Panos and TVE who are pursuing similar objectives in the same constituency.

These questions about the possibilities for a more concentrated approach by Sida in this sector, must nevertheless be weighed against the advantages of a pluralistic approach in all aspects of development. This facilitates regionally and nationally specific needs being addressed by specific initiatives. The obvious advantages of delegated funds to programme countries is that Sida can respond in a timely and appropriate manner to specific areas of need. It is not suggested here that this approach should change; nor that Panos and TVE could possibly address the specific needs of every programme country. But there is room for rationalisation; this must be based on co-ordinated knowledge and corresponding action. Obviously, without co-ordination effort, Sida's attempts to concentrate its development assistance in this field, whilst engendering flexibility in their approach, is severely undermined. The danger is that such concentration will be ad hoc which could severely undermine the doubtless effectiveness of some of the initiatives which exhibit an holistic approach to development - because Sida support is incongruously piecemeal.

- 5 Summary Proposals for Strategic Development of Sida Support to Environmental Public Awareness & Training**
- 5.1 Continued core support for Panos Programmes with a concerted emphasis on the decentralisation of Panos operations in order to build permanent Southern capacity.**
 - 5.2 Continued core support for TVE Moving Pictures Programme (distribution) and consideration of support for limited production.**
 - 5.3 Re-allocation of responsibility within DESO from UND/Environmental Education to Media and Culture, of possible continued support for Gemini. Re-consideration of the current delineation of responsibility for support to Panos and TVE, between UND and Media and Culture.**
 - 5.4 In all possible future support to the 3 organisations, greater insistence should be made by Sida that future programmes develop indicators for monitoring and evaluation in accordance with LFA methods. Although Panos now uses the LFA approach to project planning, all three organisations must develop modalities for more comprehensive assessment of the impact of their work.**
 - 5.5 Possible rationalisation of support to environmental public awareness projects funded via det särskilda miljöanslaget; with particular attention to reducing possible duplication of support to projects which produce, generate and disseminate environmental information, and with a view to concentrating support in the most effective and comprehensive projects.**
 - 5.6 More closely co-ordinated knowledge within DESO and other sectors, of pågående miljöundervisningsinsatser finansierade inom land-ramen.**
 - 5.7 Regular (continued) Nordic donors meetings on support to environmental development which should identify (inter alia) environmental public awareness and environmental education as differentiated agenda items from support for projects from the Natural Resources and Environment sector (or the equivalent departments within other Nordic donor organisations). (Other non-Nordic donors who support the 3 organisations have expressed an interest in participating in a possible meeting - i.a. BMZ, DGIS, Novib,)**
 - 5.8 Enhancement of the role and permanence of the environmental education desk at UND/DESO. Specific emphasis should be placed on closer co-ordination of support to projects and organisations by divisions within DESO (in particular the Health, Education and Media and Culture Divisions) when part of that support incorporates environmental public awareness. It goes without saying that co-ordination between DESO and (particularly) the Environmental Policy Planning Unit, and the Natural Resources and Environment Sector; but indeed all Regional Departments and Sectors, is the key to an effective implementation of Sida's Policy on Environmental Development and hence, its 5th development goal on the environment.**

PART VIII

LESSONS LEARNED

LESSONS LEARNED

- 1 As is often the case, the process of review and evaluation has been an important one for the 3 organisations. By their own admission, this process has stimulated greater self-scrutiny, introspection and self criticism and led to a re-thinking (and in some instances, re-focusing) of development objectives and modalities for achieving those objectives. (Sida funds were not completely wasted on these consultants).
- 2 In a number of evaluations carried out by the consultants, the inconsistency of financial and narrative reporting by organisations receiving support has been singled out by donors. This review has not been an exception. In most of these cases, there has been a conspicuous absence of expectations by donors in this regard - other than a stipulation in agreements that financial and narrative reporting should be carried out. Although Sida's standard agreements give **some** detail of what is expected, it is suggested that donors need to provide more guidance in this respect and specify exactly what they want. All agreements could have a standard format for narrative and financial reporting (similar to the format which NORAD has adopted). The insistence on LFA approaches to project planning should also go some way to mitigating this pervasive problem.
- 3 In the process of evaluating the three organisations and in contacts with individuals, other organisations and donors, the consultants constantly found themselves in a position of having to explain Sida's Policies, Aims and Objectives in the area of Environmental Public Awareness. This was especially pertinent with other donors with whose own policies, the consultants attempted to compare Sida's. It is significant that non of the organisations supported by Sida were fully cognisant of Sida's central objectives in the area of environmental development.

The relationship between Sida and its development partners needs to be improved in this regard. A first step is for Sida to make available more and relevant information about its own development goals - not least of which should include a translation into English, French, Portuguese and Spanish of Sida's *handlingsprogram för hållbar utveckling*.

- 4 Complaints from participants about perdiems, hotels, transport and the like is a perennial problem with organisers of courses, workshops and seminars. It seems particularly prevalent amongst journalists in Africa - so much so that recently, MISA and NSJ published an article deploring the aid-mentality of journalists in Southern Africa, who complain about, and abuse at every opportunity, "re-reimbursable expenses and perdiems". The consultants appreciated the quality input for this study from many journalists world-wide; they were also disappointed by the priority which too many journalists gave to complaining that their hotels were poor or perdiems, inadequate - over and above providing qualitative input about training activities or information outputs. Complaints from the vociferous few in this regard should not be dismissed. They should be addressed by implementing NGOs and should be backed up by donors. Sida agreements could for example, include a clause that sub-contracts which utilise Sida funds should not exceed the same standard conditions and rates of reimbursable expenses, as Sida uses. This takes the burden off the implementing NGOs. It must surely also be inherent in Sida development co-operation, not to foster an "aid-mentality".

ANNEXES

THE FOLLOWING ANNEXES ARE INCLUDED IN THIS DOCUMENT

- 1 Terms of Reference**
- 2 List of Organisations and Individuals Contacted in the Course of the Review**
- 3 A Select Bibliography: Documents, Publications and Other References Consulted in this Review**

THE FOLLOWING ANNEXES ARE NOT INCLUDED IN THIS DOCUMENT: they are available on request from Sida DESO/UND.

- 4 Questionnaires**
- 5 Audited Accounts FYs 1993/94/95: Panos, Gemini and TVE**
- 6 Income/Expenditure Statements 1993 -1995: Panos, Gemini and TVE**
- 7 Sources of Funding: Panos Regional Partnerships Programme 93-95**
- 8 Sources of Funding: Panos Media Briefings 92-95**
- 9 Allocation of Resources 93-95: Panos London, Paris & Washington**
- 10 Panos Contracted Funds from Sida Stockholm 87-96**
- 11 Gemini Workshop Report (Windhoek, October, 1996)**
- 12 Gemini Statements of Income and Expenditure: Workshops, 1993-1996**

DESO-UND

Diarienummer

DESO-1996-0492

Terms of Reference for a Review of Sida's Support to Environmental Public Awareness and Training Projects.

1. Background

In the light of Agenda 21, the main objectives of Sida's support in the field of Environmental Public Awareness and Training are to strengthen the local counterpart's own initiatives, and to integrate environmental aspects into Sida's ongoing bilateral support.

Sida has, since the late 1980s, supported a number of international organisations working in the field of environmental public awareness projects and training programmes for journalists. The main bulk of Sida's environmental media support has been given to 3 major international organisations: Gemini News Service, the Panos Institute, and the Television Trust for the Environment (TVE).

Gemini News Service has received SEK 3,870,000¹, since 1985, to conduct seminars/workshops and train African journalists in environmental reporting.

The **Panos Institute** has received SEK 20,850,000² since 1989. Sida support to Panos has mainly been used to increase the quality and quantity of sustainable development information in media at large, and to strengthen national institutions that contribute to the

¹ SEK 690 000 (1985-1988) ; SEK 840 000 (1990/9 -1992/93); SEK 990,000 (1993/94-1994/ 95); and SEK 1,350,000 (1995/96).

² SEK 7,000,000 (1989/90-1992/93); SEK 2,550,000 (1992/93); and SEK 11,300,000 (1993/94-1995/96). In addition, Panos also receives funds for AIDS-projects from Sida's Health Division .

debate on development issues in local media. Funds have also been used to strengthen networking between journalists in developing countries.

The **Television Trust for the Environment (TVE)** has received SEK 9,900,000³ since 1990 for its Moving Picture Distribution Services. The main objective of Moving Pictures is to produce and distribute audio-visual programmes that will increase international awareness of environmental and development issues, especially in low and middle income countries.

Sida has decided to examine and reassess its co-operation within the field of environmental public awareness and training. In addition, Sida has to ensure that its support keeps up to date with the rapid changes within the media and information fields.

2. Scope and Focus of the Review

The purpose of this review is to facilitate and strengthen Sida's future co-operation within the field of environmental related public awareness and training. The main objective of this review is to assess future direction and objectives for Sida's support within this field in light of Sida's new guidelines and policies. The review should examine each of the three mentioned organisations and their role within the international arena. Each organisation should be considered as an entity and an overall assessment should be made of how such project support has (and can) contribute to Sida's sectorial objectives, policies and strategies.

The specific tasks of the review are divided into three sections:

- 2.1. Evaluation of Past Achievements and Constraints
- 2.2. Assessment of Organisational Capacity
- 2.3. Operational Conclusions and Recommendations

2.1. Evaluation of Past Achievements and Constraints

The primary foci of the evaluation are the current or most recent Sida agreements with each of the three organisations: Gemini News Service, Panos, and TVE.

³ SEK 3,600,000 (1989/90-1991/92) SEK 4 800 000 (1992/93-1994/95); and SEK 1,500,00 (1995/96).

The review shall analyse and assess:

- if the objectives of each project were clear and realistic;
- to what extent the objectives have been met;
- the main achievements and constraints of each project;
- the efficiency, including cost aspects, of the organisations; and
- the impact and sustainability of projects.

2.2. Assessment of Organisational Capacity

The second task of the review is to assess the above mentioned, three organisations' role on the international arena in the light of current trends and developments within the sector (including links with each other, links to other significant media organisations, and links, if any, to Swedish media).

The consultant shall assess the capacity of the organisations. The consultant shall also assess strengths and weaknesses of the organisations future agendas, taking into account aspects such as cost-efficiency, sustainability and impact.

2.3. Operational conclusions and recommendations.

The review shall give recommendations for future development of Sida's support within the field, including proposals for strategic development of Sida's support to environmental public awareness and training projects.

3. Methodology

The review will start with an in-depth desk-study of all relevant background documentation, complemented by interviews with key-actors within Sida and the three organisations. The consultant is encouraged to seek additional information from other sources. Such sources should include as far as possible, representative target groups for the projects. This approach would complement an assessment of planning and products which in itself, cannot adequately evaluate the impact of the projects. Due to the extensive geographical target group for each projects, it is obviously not feasible to directly survey this group. However, it is possible to maximize their input. Information can be solicited through

foundations, as well as from secondary sources. An extensive use of questionnaires in order to provide feedback from as wide a spectrum of "other sources" as possible is recommended.

4. The Consultant

The review will be carried out by two consultants who together, have extensive experience from work within the media sector in developing context and a comprehensive knowledge of current trends in the sector, as well as environmental knowledge.

5. Reporting

The final written report in English shall contain a maximum of 75 pages, including an executive summary. Background information shall be provided in appendices.

A draft of the report shall be submitted to Sida no later than the 1st of November, 1996. Sida has a right to comment on the draft. Within 2 weeks after receiving Sida's comments on the draft report, a final version shall be submitted, together with a diskette. Subject to decision by Sida, the report will be published and distributed to interested parties.

The consultant shall be prepared to present his/hers findings at a meeting with Sida and others invited by Sida.

ANNEX 2

Organisations and Individuals Contacted in the Course of the Review

ORGANISATION or individual	NAME	CONTACT Tel/E-mail
NB Only individuals and organisation who responded to the consultants enquiries and provided input are included in the list below.		
AIA (Harare)	Jane Roper	aizim@harare
BBC World	Bob Wheaton	80 Wood Lane, W12 0TT London
BMZ (German Foreign Ministry) 8241332	Franz Kremp	(44 171)
Carlton Television	Reuter Roger James	(49 228) 5353626 35-38 Portman Square, W1H 9FH London
CDC (South Africa)	Shariffe Cullis	cullis@cdc.org.na
Concordia University (Canada)	Lindsay Crysler	crysler@vax2.concordia.ca
CIDA	Jason Reiskind	Stock. Embassy
CDI (Zambia)	John Mukela	jmukela@zamnet.zm
CRTV (Cameroon)	Venessa Sona	(237) 206065
DANIDA	Kristina Djurhuus	(45 33) 920000
DGIS (Netherlands Foreign Ministry)	Kirsten Norregard-Rasmussen	"
DGIS/DANIDA Consultants	Jacqueline Broerse	(31 70) 348648
	Edith Weersink	"
	Birgitte Jallof	bjallov@ruc.dk
IPS - Stockholm	Ton Nijzink	ton.nijzink@nld.toolnet.org
IRIS (Kenya)	David Dahmén	
IIED International Institute for Environmental Development	Evaline Ware	iris@elci.sasa.unon.org
E U European Commission	Koy Thompson	
Financial Gazette (Zimbabwe)	Mark Leysen	(32 2) 2993060
FRU (South Africa)	Elias Rusike	(Harare) 738722
GEMINI (London)	Mike	fru@wn.apc.org
Horizon Magazine (Zimbabwe)	Bethel Njoku	gemini@gn.apc.org
IUCN (Maputo)	Bill Saidi	
JET (Tanzania)	Maria da Luz Duarte	(2581) 492815
MISA (Namibia)	Rose Safari	(Dar) 68563
Multi-Media Centre (Cameroon)	Methaetsile Leepile	leep@ingrid.misa.org.na
Namibian Broadcasting Corp	Florence Tan	(237) 311462
	Dan Tjongarero	(264 61) 247327
	Vitura Kavari	
	TJ Kandanga	(264 651) 303761
	Corry Tjaveondja	(264 631) 23233
NORAD	Terje Vigtel	(47 22) 314400
	Marit Karlsen	"
NSJ (Mozambique)	Geoff Nyarota	svarre@nsj.uem.mz
NOVIB	Allert van den Ham	(31 70) 3421621
	Adrian Saldanha	
	adrian.saldanha@novib.nl	
ODA	Ron Fosker	infOrwf.vs3@oda.gtnet.gov.uk
PANOS (London)	Nigel Cross	panoslondon@gn.apc.org
	James Deane	

	Tracey Cabache	
	Olivia Bennett	
	Heather Budge-Reid	
	Adrian Evans	
	Aida Opoku-Mensah	
	James Steel	
	Kitty Warnock	
PANOS (Paris)	Charles Condamines	(33 1) 40410550
PANOS (Washington)	Francoise Havelange	
SACOD (Harare)	Jan Voordouw	panos@cais.cais.com
	George Ferrao	sacod@icon.uz.zw
Sida (Headquarters)	Angelica Broman	DESO/UND
	Kjell Nyström	
	Inge Gerdemo	POL
	Mats Segnestam	"
	Ingemar Gustafsson	NATUR
	Anita Theorell	DESO/Medier
	Lena Johansson	"
	Peter Erichs	
Sky Television, London	Tom Neville	
SNF - Svenska Naturskyddsföreningen	Gudrun Hubendick	
Swedish Embassies/DCOs:	Kampala,	
	Maputo	
	Pretoria	
	Windhoek,	
	Managua	
	Gaborone	
	Hanoi	
	Guatemala	
	Vientiane	
Swedish Television	Eugene Plym-Forshell	784 84 75
The People (Uganda)	Emmanuel Mukanga	PO Box 20183, Kampala
The Monitor (Uganda)	Tom Gawayo	(256 41) 251353
	Henry Bayego	
	Ted Nanozi	
TVE	Ivan Hatting	
	Robert Lamb	tve-uk@tve.org.uk
	Jenny Richards	
	Mark Harvey	
	Cath Hall	
	Jan Kees	
	Nick Rance	
	Pat Richardson	
TVE-VRCs:	-RADEV, G Traoré, Ethiopia	(251 1) 515 833
	-ACE Communications	(254 2) 890467/8
	-Film Resource Unit,	
	Mike Dearham, South Africa	Fru@wn.apc.org
	-ISTIC, Wu Weixin, China	(86 10) 851 4001
	-Audio/Visual Unit,	
	Mohyan Mainall, Nepal	(977 1) 231 991
	-South Pacific Centre, Univ.	
	of Papua New Guinea	100353@compuserve.com
	- TVE Sri Lanka,	
	Nalaka Gunawardene	tve@sri.lanka.net
	-Citurna Ltda, Adelaida Trujillo,	
	Colombia	(57 1) 334 1677

UICN/ORMA (Costa Rica)
UNESCO

UNICEF

WWF

-Amigos de la Biósfera,
Tiahoge Ruge, Mexico
- Garabato, Stefan Kaspar.
Peru
Lorena Aguilar
Alain Modoux
Choy Arnaldo
Warren Feek
ChrisArmstrong
Hans Olsen
Luc P Deslarzes
Robert SanGeorge

(52 5) 662 27 83

postmast@films.com.pe
(506) 2290222
d.mullett@unesco.org

wfeek@unicef.org
(21 2) 3267470

luc.deslarzes@ian.wwf.ch
robert sangeorge@lan.wwf.ch

ANNEX 3

A Select Bibliography: Documents, Publications and Other References Consulted in this Review

3.1 PANOS DOCUMENTS

All of the following selected documents are available from Panos London or from Sida archives.

COMPREHENSIVE ANNOTATED LISTS OF ALL PANOS PROGRAMMES':

- REGIONAL PARTNER ORGANISATIONS
- ACTIVITIES INCLUDING SKILLS-TRAINING AND AWARENESS RAISING WORKSHOPS, SEMINARS, etc.,
- BOOKS, MEDIA BRIEFINGS, ENVIRONMENTAL SUPPLEMENTS, MAGAZINES, FEATURES AND OTHER PUBLICATIONS
- RADIO PROGRAMMES AS WELL AS PROGRAMMES AVAILABLE FROM BAMAKO BANK OF PROGRAMMES etc.,
- CO-SYNDICATION AGREEMENTS
- FELLOWSHIPS
- GRANTS
- JOURNALISTS AWARDS

ARE INCLUDED IN THE DOCUMENTS LISTED IMMEDIATELY BELOW.

- Down to Earth Radio Programmes: June 93-June 96
- Features Service (Panos): Project Report & Evaluation, 1996
- Media Briefings Project: May 95-May 96; Report to Sida
- Media Briefings: Evaluation; Summary Report to Sida, July 96
- Panoscope to Transmedia On-Line: A Report
- Partners (Principle Panos London, Paris and Washington) (Detailed List)
- Regional Centres for Public and Policy Debate in East Africa, Southern Africa and South Asia (A Proposal to Establish)
- Regional Partnerships Programme: Report to Donors, Nov 1993
- Regional Partnerships Programme: Report to Sida; Activities Jan-Dec 1995; Workplans for 1996
- Regional Partnerships Programme; Phase IV, 1993-1996; Report, October 93-Dec 94
- Seminar & Workshop Reports (over 50)

In addition to Reports, Evaluations etc., actual outputs for the period 1993-1996 are also available (i.a.):

- Panos Media Briefings (23)
- Panoscope Magazines (6)
- Panos Features (255)
- Panos Books (14)
- Radio Programme Tapes for Down to Earth; Mi Tierra as well as a selection of tapes produced by Paris and Bamako
- Press' envi (Press extracts on the Environment) (000s)
- Radio Actions Magazine (3)
- Supplements & Press Dossiers (published in African newspapers) (000s)
- Development Education Teaching Modules (5)

Full documentation on all Panos Thematic Programmes is available, including:

- Oral Testimony
- AIDS/HIV
- Migration Programme
- Media Pluralism in West Africa
- Reproductive Health & Women's Rights

Fully Audited Accounts as well as Yearly Income and Expenditure Statements for each office are available from Panos only

3.2 TVE DOCUMENTS

The following films, publications or reports are available at Sida in Stockholm or TVE London

Films:

- Africa Express, Under Blue Flag, Arak Arakan, Inside the Posion Trade, Juvenis, FreshWater, Endangered species, Half the Sky, Beijing Shorts, Developing Stories among others.

Publications:

- Moving Pictures Bulletin in English, French, German and Spanish
- Outreach
- Moving Pictures Catalogue 6
- TVE Update
- VRC Newsletter
- VRCs' Local Promotional Material
- Information of Developing Stories
- TVE Japan booklet

Reports:

- VRC workshops in Colombo, Pretoria, Senegal, Johannesburg and Sao Paulo
- The Agenda 21 Helsinki Group - meeting in Helsinki, 1992
- Development in the Digital Village - high representative meeting in Bellagio, 1994
- A proposal by TVE with WWF, YLE, Unep and Estonian TV for an e&d public awareness and education project in Estonia and the Baltic countries.
- The Earth Report Asian Road Show
- Final Report September 1995 - June 1996, support to the establishment of VRCs
- Proposal to Novib for funding VRCs
- Living with Disaster - a Marketing Strategy for the programmes
- Broadcast figures for TVE's women's programme package
- Data Base Figures of 6 September, 1996
- Progress report 1994
- Proposal for training package to support Botswana's National Conservation strategy

3.3 GEMINI DOCUMENTS

All of the following documents are available from Gemini (London) or Sida Archives

Workshop Evaluations by Participants:

- Accra, July, 1996
- Kampala, March 1996
- Windhoek, Oct, 1996

Workshop Reports to Sida: (incl. Gemini Statements of Income and Expenditure: Workshops, 1993-1996)

- Windhoek, Oct, 1993
- Lusaka, April, 1994
- Sierra Leone, Nov, 1994
- Dar es Salaam, April, 1995
- Kampala, March, 1996
- Accra, July, 1996
- Windhoek, Oct, 1996

Views from the Village (Gemini Training Manual)

News on a Knife-Edge: Gemini Journalism and Global Agenda, Bourne.R., John Libby & Co,
London, 1995

Gemini Audited Accounts, Income and Expenditure Statements 1990-1995 available from Gemini only

3.4 Sida AND OTHER DONOR DOCUMENTS

- All relevant Sida agreements, promemoria, decisions as well as correspondence, relating to Panos, TVE and Gemini, 1987 - 1996.
- Co-operative Environment Programme, AIT 93-96, Malmqvist & Wallberg
- Sida and the Environment, Sida Planning Secretariat, 1993
- DESO Strategy for Freedom of Expression
- Sida Support to Environmental Projects
- DANIDA Policy on Freedom of Expression
- Evaluation of The Panos Regional Partnerships Programme 90-92, DGIS Netherlands
- Sida's handlingsprogram för HÅLLBAR utveckling
- Sida's Evaluation Policy/ and Manual
- The Role of Culture in Development (Sida)
- NORAD contracts, agreements and correspondence with Panos
- DGIS/DANIDA Evaluation of Panos Paris Programmes in West Africa (selected draft findings)
- Sustainable Aid - Swedish Development Assistance After UNCED

Sida Evaluations - 1995/96

- 95/1 Educação Ambiental em Moçambique. Kajsa Pehrsson
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 95/2 Agitators, Incubators, Advisers - What Roles for the EPU's? Joel Samoff
Department for Research Cooperation
- 95/3 Swedish African Museum Programme (SAMP). Leo Kenny, Beata Kasale
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 95/4 Evaluation of the Establishing of the Bank of Namibia 1990-1995. Jon A. Solheim, Peter Winai
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/1 The Beira-Gothenburg Twinning Programme. Arne Heileman, Lennart Peck
The report is also available in Portuguese
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/2 Debt Management. (Kenya) Kari Nars
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/3 Telecommunications - A Swedish Contribution to Development. Lars Rylander, Ulf Rundin et al
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/4 Biotechnology Project: Applied Biocatalysis. Karl Schügerl
Department for Research Cooperation
- 96/5 Democratic Development and Human Rights in Ethiopia. Christian Åhlund
Department for East and West Africa
- 96/6 Estruturação do Sistema Nacional de Gestão de Recursos Humanos. Júlio Nabais, Eva-Marie Skogsberg, Louise Helling
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/7 Avaliação do Apoio Sueco ao Sector da Educação na Guiné Bissau 1992-1996. Marcella Ballara, Sinesio Bacchetto, Ahmed Dawelbeit, Julieta M Barbosa, Börje Wallberg
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/8 Konvertering av rysk militärindustri. Maria Lindqvist, Göran Reitberger, Börje Svensson
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/9 Building Research Capacity in Ethiopia. E W Thulstrup, M Fekadu, A Negewo
Department for Research Cooperation
- 96/10 Rural village water supply programme - Botswana. Jan Valdelin, David Browne, Elsie Alexander, Kristina Boman, Marie Grönvall, Imelda Molokomme, Gunnar Settergren
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/11 UNICEF's programme for water and sanitation in central America - Facing new challenges and opportunities. Jan Valdelin, Charlotta Adelstål, Ron Sawyer, Rosa Nunes, Xiomara del Torres, Daniel Gubler
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/12 Cooperative Environment Programme - Asian Institute of Technology/Sida, 1993-1996. Thomas Malmqvist, Börje Wallberg
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/13 Forest Sector Development Programme - Lithuania-Sweden. Mårten Bendz
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/14 Twinning Programmes With Local Authorities in Poland, Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania. Håkan Falk, Börje Wallberg
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/15 Swedish Support to the Forestry Sector in Latvia. Kurt Boström
Department for Central and Eastern Europe

- 96/16 Swedish Support to Botswana Railways. Brian Green, Peter Law
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/17 Cooperation between the Swedish County Administration Boards and the Baltic Countries.
Lennart C G Almqvist
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/18 Swedish - Malaysian Research Cooperation on Tropical Rain Forest Management. T C Whitmore
Department for Research Cooperation, SAREC
- 96/19 Sida/SAREC Supported Collaborative Programme for Biomedical Research Training in Central America. Alberto Nieto
Department for Research Cooperation, SAREC
- 96/20 The Swedish Fisheries Programme in Guinea Bissau, 1977-1995. Tom Alberts, Christer Alexanderson
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/21 The Electricity Sector in Mozambique, Support to the Sector By Norway and Sweden. Bo Andreasson, Steinar Grongstad, Vidkunn Hveding, Ralph Kårhammar
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/22 Svenskt stöd till Vänortssamarbete med Polen, Estland, Lettland och Litaunien. Håkan Falk, Börje Wallberg
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/23 Water Supply System in Dodota - Ethiopia. Bror Olsson, Judith Narro, Negatu Asfaw, Eneye Tefera, Amsalu Negussie
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/24 Cadastral and Mapping Support to the Land Reform Programme in Estonia. Ian Brook
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/25 National Soil and Water Conservation Programme - Kenya. Mary Tiffen, Raymond Purcell, Francis Gichuki, Charles Gachene, John Gatheru
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/26 Soil and Water Conservation Research Project at Kari, Muguga - Kenya. Kamugisha, JR, Semu, E
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/27 Sida Support to the Education Sector in Ethiopia 1992-1995. Jan Valdelin, Michael Wort, Ingrid Christensson, Gudrun Cederblad
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/28 Strategic Business Alliances in Costa Rica. Mats Helander
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/29 Support to the Land Reform in Lithuania. Ian Brook, Christer Ragnar
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/30 Support to the Land Reform in Latvia. Ian Brook, Christer Ragnar
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/31 Support to the Road Sector in Estonia. Anders Markstedt
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/32 Support to the Road Sector in Latvia. Anders Markstedt
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/33 Support to the Road Sector in Lithuania. Anders Markstedt
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/34 Support to the Maritime Sector in Latvia. Nils Bruzelius
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/35 Sida/SAREC's Marine Science Programs. Jan Rudengren, Per Brinck, Brian Davy
Department for Research Cooperation, SAREC

- 96/36 Support to the Development of Civil Aviation Administration in the Baltic States. Johan Svenningsson
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/37 The Opening of the two Road Sectors in Angola. C H Eriksson, G Möller
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/38 Statistikproduktion i Nordvästra Ryssland. Lennart Grenstedt
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/39 Sri Lankan - Swedish Research Cooperation. Nimal Sanderatne, Jan S. Nilsson
Department for Research Cooperation, SAREC
- 96/40 Curriculum Development in Ethiopia, A Consultancy Study for the Ministry of Education in Ethiopia
and for Sida. Mikael Palme, Wiggo Kilborn, Christopher Stroud, Oleg Popov
Department for Democracy and Social Development



SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY

S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden

Tel: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Fax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64

Telegram: sida stockholm. Postgiro: 1 56 34-9

E-mail: info@sida.se. Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>