

The Human Factor

**Cooperation in Public Administration
between Sweden and Mongolia**

**Lennart Peck
Marianne Hultberg**

**Department for
Infrastructure and
Economic Cooperation**

The Human Factor

**Cooperation in Public Administration between
Sweden and Mongolia**

**Lennart Peck
Marianne Hultberg**

**Sida Evaluation 96/50
Department for
Infrastructure and
Economic Cooperation**

Evaluation Reports may be ordered from:

Biståndsforum, Sida
S-105 25 Stockholm
Phone: (+46) 8 698 5722
Fax: (+46) 8 698 56 38

Author(s): Lennart Peck, Marianne Hultberg
Boman & Peck Konsult AB, Sida

The views and interpretations expressed in this report are the author's and do not necessarily reflect those of the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Sida.

Sida Evaluation 96/50
Commissioned by Sida, Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation

Copyright: Sida and the author(s)

Registration No.: INEC-1995-0332
Date of Final Report: November 1996
Printed in Stockholm, Sweden, 1996
ISBN 91 586 7450 0
ISSN 1401-0402

SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY
Address: S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden. Office: Sveavägen 20, Stockholm
Telephone: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Telefax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64
Telegram: sida stockholm. Telex: 11450 sida sthlm. Postgiro: 1 56 34-9

LIST OF CONTENT

Executive Summary.....	ii
Acronyms.....	iii
1 Introduction.....	1
1.1 Purpose of the study	1
1.2 Delimitations	2
1.3 Implementation.....	2
2 Brief Programme Description	4
2.1 Institutional Strengthening of IAMD (MNG0102 and MNG0103).....	4
2.2 Civil Service Training and Consultancy	5
3 Evaluation of Previous Co-operation.....	7
3.1 Relevance.....	7
3.2 Fulfilment of Objectives	8
3.2.1 Programme Output.....	9
3.2.2 Effects: Strengthening of IAMD.....	9
3.2.3 Effects: Civil Service Reform.....	11
3.3 Sustainability.....	12
3.4 Cost-effectiveness	13
3.5 Lessons Learned.....	15
4 Assessment of the New Proposal.....	17
4.1 Relevance.....	17
4.1.1 Overall Relevance	17
4.1.2 Relevance of Project Components.....	19
4.1.3 General Reflections	22
4.2 Viability.....	24
5 Conclusions and Recommendations.....	27
Annex 1: Terms of Reference.....	29
Annex 2: List of Sources.....	35
Annex 3: Data on Project Output.....	36

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report presents the findings and conclusions of an evaluation of the co-operation between Sweden and Mongolia in the area of Public administration: Institutional Strengthening of IAMD phase 1 and 2 (MNG0102 and MNG0102) and Civil Service Training and Consultancy (MNG0131). It also discusses a request for future Swedish assistance.

After the introduction (Chapter 1) a general description of the co-operation is provided (Chapter 2). In the first sub-project the client was the Institute for Administration and Management (IAMD) and in the second it has been the Cabinet Secretariat. All Swedish consultancy services have been provided by the Swedish Institute for Public Administration (SIPU) and financed by the Swedish government. Focus has been on human resources development. Details on objectives and output are attached in Annex 3.

In Chapter 3 the co-operation is evaluated. It is concluded that the programme objectives have been relevant to the objectives of the Mongolian reform process as well as to Sida objectives. On the whole, output has been produced according to plans and there are indications that development impact has been substantial. The sustainability of the Programme results may be expected to be high. The Programme has been relatively costly, but the overall impact in relation to costs has been greater than in many other Sida projects. There are several factors behind the overall positive results including the following:

- Timing and needs
- Local commitment
- Participatory consultancy
- Critical mass
- Choice of Topics
- Absorptive capacity
- Synergies

In Chapter 4 the new project proposal is assessed with respect to relevance and viability. It concludes that continued support to the reform process generally speaking is both relevant and viable. However, the proposal is unclear in a number of aspects and the relevance of some project components may be questioned. Concerns that are raised include:

- The priorities of the new government,
- The relevance and viability of the consultancy sub-component,
- The function of study tours,
- The need for further specifications as regards planned activities and expected output,
- The incorporation of a gender perspective,
- The choice of target group and awareness of decentralisation needs,
- The division of roles between SIPU and the Cabinet Secretariat
- The size of the project,
- The financing of local project costs.

As a result it is recommended that (a) that Sweden provides continued support to the Mongolian reform process and (b) that the Cabinet Secretariat and SIPU present a revised project proposal.

ACRONYMS

BITS	Swedish Agency for International Technical and Economic Co-operation
IAMD	Institute for Administration and Management Development
IMF	International Monetary Found
MDP	Mongolian Management Development Programme
SEK	Swedish crowns
Sida	Swedish International Development Co-operation Agency
SIPU	Swedish Institute for Public Administration
ToR	Terms of Reference
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
USD	US dollar

1 INTRODUCTION

In the early 1990s Mongolia embarked on an irreversible process of change. The new situation required new solutions, and the government of Mongolia responded by initiating an audacious reform embracing virtually all sectors of society. Measures based on market economic principles were introduced and a process of democratisation was initiated.

The new division of roles between the state and the market has called for a reform of the public administration. There are two aspects such a reform. One is the revision of formal structures, including the legal framework, routines and procedures. The other is human resources development. The latter has been the focus of the co-operation between Mongolia and Sweden. The initial contacts were taken when a Mongolian high level delegation visited Sweden in 1990. In 1991, the Institute for Administration and Management Development (IAMD) in Ulaanbaatar hosted a series of seminars on public administration and management, held by the Swedish Institute for Public Administration (SIPU). As a result of these contacts, a project for institutional strengthening of IAMD was initiated and implemented in two phases during 1993 and 1994. The project was financed by the Swedish government through the Swedish Agency for International Technical and Economic Co-operation (BITS), today incorporated in the Swedish International Development Co-operation Agency (Sida).

A key element of the Mongolian public sector reform has been the Management Development Programme (MDP), a national programme under the Cabinet Secretariat of the Prime Minister, supported by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and other donors. In 1994, the Cabinet Secretariat requested Swedish assistance to finance and implement the Civil Service Training and Consultancy component of the MDP. This component has been implemented up to November 1996 with funds from BITS/Sida.

A request for continued financial support for an "Phase II" has been presented to Sida.

1.1 Purpose of the study

This evaluation has been undertaken for several reasons. First of all, Sida has a general responsibility to monitor and report to the Swedish government on how its funds are used. Any major intervention should, according to Sida policy therefore be subject to some kind of evaluation.

Furthermore, the experiences from Mongolia may be of interest in a broader perspective. In some ways the Mongolian project resembles other ones financed by Sida. The evaluation could thus be seen as part of the general learning process of Sida.

An important reason for why this evaluation has been commissioned at this particular point of time is the request for financing for a second phase that has been presented to Sida. In order to decide on continued assistance Sida needs an assessment of the past co-operation as well as of the present situation in Mongolia.

Even if this report has been commissioned by Sida, it is also written for the benefit of the Mongolian government. Recently, there has been a change of the Mongolian government

administration. Although not an original objective, this report can hopefully give new decision makers a better platform for discussion on how to proceed in the future.

The full Terms of Reference (ToR) are attached in Annex 1.

1.2 Delimitations

According to the ToR, the evaluation should consider the Institutional Development of IAMD, phases 1 and 2 (MNG0102 and MNG0103) and Civil Service Training and Consultancy (MNG0131), not the initial Four Seminars for IAMD (MNG0101). There has, however, been a strong linkage between all of these projects, including the first four seminars. In this report, the different projects will thus be referred to as "the Programme".

The scope of the evaluation includes general description of the Programme as well as analysis of relevance, fulfilment of objectives, cost-effectiveness and sustainability. After discussions with Sida, it was decided that the analysis of cost-effectiveness would be limited to a general discussion on opportunity costs and cost implications of alternative approaches.

The evaluation also includes a review of the new project proposal. A proper appraisal of the this proposal would have required an in-depth problem analysis and needs assessment in Mongolia. This has not been possible during the time available. Comments made in this report should therefore be taken as a "second opinion" for Sida's decision making.

1.3 Implementation

The study has been carried out by Lennart Peck of Boman & Peck Konsult AB and Marianne Hultberg of Sida. It was guided by preparatory discussions with Sida and the approach presented in the tender to Sida 1996-07-05.

Work began during July 1996 with a review of existing documents, interviews in Sweden and planning of the field mission. Mongolia was visited during one week. Interviews were held with representatives of the Cabinet Secretariat, IAMD and other government authorities. Interviewees were those directly involved in planning and execution of the Programme and people that had participated in training and other events. The programme of meetings were set up in consultation with the Cabinet Secretariat. A list of persons met is attached as Annex 2.

This approach was chosen to permit a reasonable overall impression of the Programme within a limited period of time. However, the persons interviewed constituted less than 5% of the people that had participated in the Programme and the sample is not necessarily statistically representative. Among those interviewed, there has most likely been an over-representation of higher level staff and an under-representation of participants at the local level. Furthermore, it is always easier to identify persons that successfully are making use of training, than those that have left or perhaps were dissatisfied. How large the latter group might have been is unknown. There was also an over representation of participants of recent training events in relation to earlier ones.

**boman
& peck**

The choice of methodology poses limitations to the reliability of findings and conclusions. The report gives *examples* of what the co-operation has produced and discusses the *nature* of *probable* effects. However, the data are insufficient to make a thorough assessment of the Programme and its impact.

We are grateful for the comments received from the Cabinet Secretariat, IAMD, SIPU, UNDP and Sida on the draft report. Let us also express our thanks to all persons that have contributed to this report with information and practical support, in particular our hosts in Ulaanbaatar and the National Programme Director, Ms. Yenjmaa for her kind assistance during our mission.

2 BRIEF PROGRAMME DESCRIPTION

To facilitate the reading of this report, basic data on Programme objectives, planned and actual output and costs are presented in Annex 3. Below, a general presentation of the different Programme components is made.

In 1990 a Mongolian delegation headed by the First Deputy Prime Minister visited Sweden with the financing of UNDP. The programme included a visit to SIPU, which at that time was owned by the Swedish government. In 1991 the Swedish government was invited to participate in the conference on "Restructuring Management and Economics in Mongolia", and later UNDP financed the visits of two study groups to SIPU. This marked the beginning of the co-operation between Sweden and Mongolia in the area of Public Administration.

Given the financial limitations and priorities of UNDP, the Mongolian government applied for assistance through BITS to continue the co-operation with SIPU. The request included financing of four seminars in the areas of personnel management, local government administration, tax administration and financial auditing (MNG0101). The seminars were reported to have been carried out successfully with a total participation of 300 persons.

2.1 Institutional Strengthening of IAMD (MNG0102 and MNG0103)

According to the contract between IAMD and SIPU, the "aims" of this component have been:

"To strengthen IAMD as a key institution in the Mongolian renewal process. Further on to enhance democracy in Mongolia through the exposure of Mongolian officials to different organisational and administrative systems".

The "objectives" of the co-operation have been:

"To support IAMD's efforts to become a modern, professional and cost-effective Management Development Institute,

"To develop a cadre of professional trainers, project managers and administrators within IAMD".

Programmed activities included:

- A training of trainers course,
- Development of training modules and a materials workshop,
- A study methods and investigations course,
- An organisational effectiveness course,
- A project management course,
- Administrative systems development.

In 1993 Sida granted financing for continued co-operation. The project proposal for "Phase 2" included the following components:

- Project management II,
- Project management III,
- Personnel management development and training,
- Personnel methods and techniques,
- Study tour in Sweden for personnel officers,
- Local government organisation and self government,
- Local government finance,
- Curriculum development for local government,
- Study tour to Sweden for local government administrators.

The project management components were a direct continuation of the training initiated during Phase 1, to "conclude the programme and reinforce the process to develop the staff at IAMD...". The personnel policy development components were based on an insight that the Mongolian civil service required development of rules, regulations and policies on personnel management and training. The local government components were initiated in view of the need to decentralise the Mongolian public administration.

MNG 0102 and MNG 0103 were implemented from 1992-1994. Output some approximately 25 effective weeks of training and seminars with a varying number of participants (10-23) participants, adding up to approximately 350 man weeks. In addition to this there was output in the form of direct consultancy and production of certain documents. The total Swedish cost was SEK 5.1 million.

2.2 Civil Service Training and Consultancy

This sub-project is part of the MDP. The overall objective of the MDP is to:

"Reform the Public Sector in the context of a market economy and in a democratic society".

According to the contract between the Cabinet Secretariat and SIPU

"The principal aim of the Civil Service Training and Consultancy sub-component is the expansion of the management capacity necessary to undertake the public administration and civil service reforms."

Listed activities included:

**boman
& peck**

- Direct consultancy on the civil service-reform in the context of the public administration reform,
- The training of civil service consultants and trainers,
- The design and execution of training packages for the implementation of the public administration and civil service reforms,
- The re-training of the central civil service in public management,
- The re-training of the local civil service in public management.

Key concepts emphasised in the proposal included "mutual learning" and "continuity" permitting "shared responsibility" for "concrete results".

Implementation of this project began in the spring of 1994 and it was terminated by November 1996. The project included approximately 20 effective weeks of training, workshops and study tours, with 10-25 participants, adding up to approximately 350 man weeks training. Approximately 14 % of the participants were women and 86% men. In addition to training, also this sub-project had elements of systems development and consultancy. The total budget has been SEK 5 million of which approximately SEK 4.6 million will be disbursed.

3 EVALUATION OF PREVIOUS CO-OPERATION

In this chapter, the project is evaluated with respect to the following criteria: relevance, fulfilment of objectives, cost-effectiveness and sustainability.

3.1 Relevance

The programme objectives have been relevant to the objectives of the Mongolian reform process as well as to Sida objectives.

Relevance refers to the degree to which programme objectives are in line with other superior objectives. Relevance must be seen in relative terms and be described in terms of "higher" and "lower". Relevance can further be analysed at different levels. Here, we will first look at relevance in relation to the objectives of the reform process and the MDP, and then in view of Sida objectives.

The reform process

After the withdraw of the Soviet Union from Mongolia, a complete reform at all levels of society was required. The immediate task was to reshape a new public administration. This required people with know-how of modern management in a democratic society. The next task has been to prepare civil servants for the new environment that they will work within. With this background virtually any programme targeted for and programme focused on management and civil service training would have been relevant in one way or another. Interesting to note is that the Mongolian institutions often stress that the Swedish consultants, to a higher degree than others, have tried to understand the Mongolian problems and view them from a local perspective. Furthermore, the fact that the co-operation has been co-ordinated by the very same people heading the reform process has largely assured coherence between the objectives of the reform and those of the Swedish support.

The Management Development Programme

The development objective of the MDP is "to advance enhanced public and private management capacities in the context of a market economy in a democratic society." The MDP is *the* leading programme for the reform of the public sector, headed by the Cabinet Secretariat and supported by UNDP. One characteristic of the programme is the synergistic approach; synergies between macro economic reform and business development, between the public administration reform and the programme support etc. While the UNDP has financed components primarily aimed at the legal and structural changes, the Swedish support has been focused on human resources development. Both is needed for successful reforms. The Swedish support is thus complementary to the UNDP support and relevant in view of the overall objectives of the MDP.

The so called contract-financed technical co-operation of Sida should be guided by several principles. These include that the support should be demand driven, that there should be a cost sharing between Sweden and the local counterpart, that the services financed should be internationally competitive, and that emphasis should be placed on the transfer of Swedish knowledge, not on hardware deliveries. How does the Programme relate to these objectives?

Local demand and cost sharing

Mongolia is in *need* of external support in the sense that such support may contribute to the solution of several problems. However, there is an important difference between needs and demand. In a market context, demand is often defined as needs backed by *purchasing power* and a *willingness to use* it. The client may very well need something and still express a demand for something else that he or she finds even more important. There is always an alternative use of funds. The value of this alternative use is sometimes referred to as the "opportunity cost". One of the main reasons for Sida to apply the cost-sharing principle is exactly to introduce an awareness of opportunity costs. In this programme the financing of local costs have constituted a problem since the very start, and the local share of financing has even diminished during the course of the project. However, there has been a strong national commitment at high political level and IAMD and the Cabinet Secretariat have been active in the planning and execution of services. This could also be taken as an expression of demand.

Transfer of know-how

Since the beginning, co-operation has been focused on the transfer of know-how in the form of training and advice. Hardware deliveries have been marginal and there has been no direct financial support. During interviews, the representatives express satisfaction with the focus on human resources development. However, it should be recalled that hardware and financial support is provided by other donors. Also, there is of course an awareness of Sida policies and of what is within reach when financing comes from Sida. Naturally, this is considered in the expression of "demand" towards Sida.

Competitiveness of the Swedish consultant

Sida should finance technical co-operation in areas where Sweden and the Swedish consultant are competitive. Representatives of the Cabinet Secretariat have had the opportunity to visit a number of countries. The Swedish experience is said to have been more relevant than many other countries. Similarities are found in the facts that both countries are non-federate, scarcely populated and have a relatively homogenous population. Both countries have also wished to pursue a market economic policies with consideration to the social development.

The consultant, SIPU, has participated in international tenders and has a substantial record of international assignments. The client expresses great satisfaction with services, comparing them with the services received from consultants of other countries.

3.2 Fulfilment of Objectives

The fulfilment of objectives must be viewed at two different levels. The first concerns the production of planned output. The second relates to the fulfilment of overall development objectives or "aims" of the Programme.

3.2.1 Programme Output

On the whole, output has been produced according to plans...

Looking at the planned and produced output in Annex 3, the variation is relatively small. There have been certain changes in terms of focus that can be seen as quite normal adjustments during the working process. Some components have not been completed within the time period as foreseen and some, such as curricula development for local government training, have been continued in later sub-projects. The personnel handbook, planned as a component of the first project (Strengthening of IAMD) was only terminated within the second project, partly as a result of the political process in Mongolia. The project should have been terminated by the end of 1995 but continued for one more year.

On the other hand, there has also been output which was not originally planned, such as the high level leadership training for government officials, and output not always reflected in the documentation. Apart from training, the Mongolian side has taken the advantage of the Swedish presence for consultancy and advice. One reason is that training has been closely linked to the regular work of participants as well as the work of the "consultancy teams" established within the MDP. The SIPU consultants have also participated in the MDP global workshops and in the general debate leading up the new Civil Service Law. This could be seen as a side output of the co-operation.

3.2.2 Effects: Strengthening of IAMD

...and there are indications that development impact has been substantial.

Any assessment the development impact of an intervention is coupled with a high degree of uncertainty. First of all, we have to compare the actual development with a hypothetical one without the intervention, although we can only speculate in what would have happened if SIPU had never come to Mongolia. Secondly, there are always a number of factors that intermingle making it difficult to assess to what degree a the present situation is due to the Swedish intervention or other factors. The Swedish support to IAMD and the civil service reform must be seen in the context of other interventions. Thirdly, development impact is long term. At this point one can only point at some immediate effects and speculate on their future implications. Finally, as already mentioned, the data generated for this study does not in any way permit a quantification of impact. However, it can give a better understanding of the nature of impact.

Below, the institutional strengthening of IAMD is discussed. The next section deals with the possible effects on the implementation of the civil service reform.

The strengthening of IAMD could be expressed in terms of (a) up-grading of the faculty members, (b) introduction of new courses and curricula and (c) capacity to carry out consultancy assignments. The final criterion (d) is the Institute's capacity to serve the public administration of Mongolia.

Capacity of the faculty members

Interviewed faculty members confirm that they have had "great use" of the courses. They have been introduced to new subjects as well as new pedagogical methods. However, the extent to which participants seem to have benefited varies. In one case, it is said to have determined the whole professional direction of a young faculty member. In other cases, participants expressed satisfaction with the training but stated that they had only been able to apply it to a very limited extent.

Out of a total number of 54 IAMD faculty members, 17 have received training by SIPU. The number of trained persons having left IAMD has been limited. Out of the 10 persons participating in the first "training of trainers" course in 1992, nine are still with the Institute. The SIPU training is likely to have contributed to the stability of IAMD. As the salaries are very low, the only thing the Institute can offer is further academic development and international contacts, something that the Swedish support has enabled.

Courses and curricula

The public administration training programme of IAMD was established at the same time as the SIPU consultancy began. It is therefore difficult to say to what degree the course programme now offered has been influenced by SIPU. However, there are several courses which clearly were introduced by SIPU:

- Project management,
- Investigation techniques,
- Personnel management,
- Leadership development,
- Strategic management.

Though introduced by SIPU, courses have been modified and extended to suit IAMD needs. They are now included in IAMD's regular programmes and each course can be given by 2-4 faculty members.

Apart from the courses, new teaching methods that were introduced by SIPU are now being used within IAMD. These include team teaching, group exercises and case studies.

Consultancy capacity

Besides training and research, one of the formal missions of IAMD has, since 1990, been consultancy. However, there had not been any consultancy activity until the SIPU training in project management, investigation techniques and other relevant subjects. The support was thus catalytic for the establishment of a "Consultancy Centre" within IAMD in 1994.

At present, the Consultancy Centre provides consultancy services both to the public and the private sector. The two major assignments have been donor funded: Local Government Development (Danida) and Social Development (Save the Children). The centre has also carried out a large number of smaller assignments for private enterprises. Individual consultancies from IAMD participated in the MDP project teams.

The consultancy centre generates 2,5 million TG out of IAMD's total budget of 144 million TG. However, as salaries in the consultancy centre are higher than the regular salaries at IAMD, it also permits consultants and temporarily engaged faculty members to earn an additional income.

Capacity to support Mongolian public administration

The IAMD that exists today was formed in 1994 by the merger of the "original" IAMD, the Academy of State and Social Studies and the Research Centre on State Policy. It is therefore not possible to make any direct comparison between the Institute's capacity before and after the support, nor to evaluate to what degree IAMD's capacity to support the public administration has increased *as a result of the co-operation with SIPU*. What can be observed is that IAMD is the by far most important institution in this area, that it has more courses and a better trained faculty than before 1994. The number of students has been as follows:

1994	1781
1995	2073
1996	2500 (preliminary figure)

IAMD has a leading role in the so called Consortium of the Management Development Institutions, which comprises seven institutions.

It is interesting to see how the role of IAMD has changed from the first project to the second. Initially, the strengthening of IAMD was the main *objective* of the co-operation. Later on, IAMD has become a *resource* in the overall civil service reform.

An important side effect of the support has, according to the previous rector, been improved relations with local and central government.

3.2.3 Effects: Civil Service Reform

The impact on the *civil service reform* can also be assessed from different angles. The first one could be referred to as human resources development; what have the participants learned and how have they used their knowledge and skills? The second we could in very broad terms refer to as systems development: what new, systems, laws and regulations have been introduced as a consequence of the co-operation.

Human Resources Development

Examples of what participants state that they have learned include the following:

- The importance of separating the political level from the administrative,
- Understanding the concept of change management,
- Making performance evaluations,
- Elaboration of a "business strategies" and to set objectives,
- Establishing salary and reward schemes,
- New training methods,
- Designing information systems,
- Realising that a different public administration is actually possible.

Several participants state examples of how they have used the knowledge. Measures that have been taken as a direct result of training include drafting of business plans, preparation of job descriptions, revision of salary systems and training of other staff members.

Systems development

When it comes to formal and structural change, the Swedish co-operation has been one of many factors. A new Civil Service Law was adopted in 1996, as well as a number of other laws, regulations and procedures affecting the public administration. The main impact of the Programme comes from the fact that a large number of the persons responsible for drafting these laws had received training by SIPU, some of them in Sweden. A considerable amount of preparatory work has been carried out in the so called "consultancy teams", set up within the MDP, each one responsible for a particular issue. The Cabinet Secretariat states that about 50% of those having received training by SIPU have participated in such consultancy teams.

What would have been the situation without the SIPU services? A new Civil Service law would have been passed in any case, but the co-operation has probably speeded up the process and raised the quality of the new law. The person heading the working group on the civil service law states that experience was drawn from many countries, including Sweden. There was never any direct copying of the Swedish model but the co-operation gave important impulses, ideas and a better understanding of central concepts. For example, the very notion of "government service" has largely been learned from Sweden. Other areas where the influence from Sweden is said to have been strong was labour relations and decentralisation. The reorganisation of the Cabinet Secretariat is said to have been strongly influenced by the Swedish experiences. The Personnel Handbook, elaborated as part of the Programme has in a way become the manual for implementation of the new civil service law.

The human resources development enabled a more active participation by the Mongolian government in the reform process. Without an understanding of key concepts of modern public administration management the Cabinet Secretariat would have had to rely on foreign expertise to an even higher degree.

3.3 Sustainability

...and the sustainability of the Programme results may be expected to be high.

What are the prospects that the impact of the co-operation will be long-lasting? The question must be seen with the background of the nature of the support: basic human resources development, which almost irrespective of future events will have some a lasting impact. What about the sustainability of IAMD and the progresses made in the Public Sector Reform?

For IAMD it is largely a financial problem. Funds are required both for giving the courses and to maintain the teachers trained. Today 40% of the budget is self generated and 60% financed by state subsidies. Government finance is extremely strained. The courses introduced by SIPU will probably not disappear completely, but teachers having received

training may lose their competence if they are not given the chance to give the courses regularly.

The future of the Mongolian public sector and the recent civil service law is difficult to foresee. The previous opposition supported the new law but some time after the elections, there were voices raised for revisions. However, as training largely has been at a general and conceptual level, introducing general models and concepts, a possible revision of the law would not make the training and consultancy wasted. The fact that there is a law to improve is a sign of progress in itself.

The major problem appears to come from institutions which are unable to implement the reforms, either due to financial restrictions or due to limited human resources. For example, the government is already realising that it is not in a position to live up to the new law in the area of employers' rights and benefits. Will government afford to use the training and consultancy facilities of IAMD? Will the new personnel handbook be used?

A less likely but considerably more serious threat would be that Mongolia is unable to maintain its democratic institutions. In this case, the co-operation would have no sustainability at all. However, the Programme may very well have been one contributing factor towards political and institutional stability.

3.4 Cost-effectiveness

The Programme has been relatively costly, but the overall impact in relation to costs has been greater than in many other Sida projects.

With cost-effectiveness we refer to the relation between costs and project output. A proper cost-effectiveness analysis requires that costs can be clearly related to specific outputs. Furthermore, relevant data for comparison must be available for the figures should be meaningful. After consultations with Sida it was decided to exclude a quantitative analysis and instead rather the project in a general cost-effectiveness perspective.

The costs¹ of the Swedish support are presented below:

Capacity building of IAMD (phase 1)	1 881 000
Capacity building of IAMD (phase 2)	3 234 944
Civil Service Training and Consultancy (budget)	5 041 600
Total:	10 157 744

The figures imply that the average *approximate* cost has been SEK 225 000 per effective training week or SEK 14 000 per training week/person. This is of course a rough estimation which does not consider the fact that costs have varied between different events. However, it gives a rough indication of costs in relation to output. What then have been the factors determining cost-effectiveness?

The fee levels of SIPU are in line with those of most other similar Swedish firms. Nor is

¹Sida allocations, excluding MNG0101.

there much to say about the reimbursable costs, which would have been at a similar level for any consultant. More interesting is it to look at how work has been carried out.

Generally speaking, SIPU appears to dedicate quite a lot of time and energy on listening, confidence building and project planning. In financial terms, this tends to make each output unity more expensive. However, this approach may pay off in the longer perspective if it leads to higher relevance and a higher quality of the output.

The "team teaching" method of SIPU has been appreciated by the course participants. According to SIPU it permits a higher intensity during training and it is ultimately a question of quality. It also implies higher costs, as it involves more people. We are in no position to evaluate how this has affected cost-effectiveness, but it is an aspect to keep in mind when assessing both the costs and the impact of training.

There has been both training in Mongolia and study tours to Sweden. The cost of SIPU's training in Mongolia was SEK 1000-2000 per day and participant. The corresponding figure for training/study tours to Sweden is SEK 2000-4000. Training in Mongolia and in Sweden are two different forms of human resources development, serving different purposes. However, in order for the visit to Sweden to be worthwhile, the impact from it should, from a cost-effectiveness perspective, be considerably greater than training in Mongolia.

In the general discourse on development co-operation, there is often a discussion about the advantages and disadvantages of short term consultancy and long term advisers. Even though it has not been considered within this programme, and is not recommended nor possible as part of Sida's contract financed technical co-operation, it is of interest to note that costs of the Programme could have financed two permanent experts stationed in Ulaanbaatar². Maybe, this would have permitted more training activities and consultancy but not with the same flexibility. There would also have been the risk of lost national ownership.

The co-operation has not involved Sida-finance only. What is here referred to is not so much the local project budget, which will be returned to later, but the indirect costs involved in the Mongolian government's participation in the programme, notably the cost of time. These costs are not necessarily of a financial nature but must be expressed in terms of opportunity costs.

There is of course a considerable difference between the cost of Mongolian staff and those of Swedish consultants, both as a result of different salary levels and of the different expenses involved, e.g. air fares and hotel. Therefore, the more work that could be done locally, the higher the cost-effectiveness of the Programme. Would it for example be possible to introduce even more of joint Swedish-Mongolian team teaching in the future? It could, apart from raising cost-effectiveness, be an important element in the capacity building process.

What has been discussed so far is the cost of programme output. The ultimate criteria is of course cost of *impact*. Considering the many factors influencing impact, any assessments of this kind will be highly speculative. There are still several reasons to

²Assuming a yearly cost of approximately SEK 1 million for a long term consultant.

believe that the "leverage" of funds spent in this programme has been relatively high in relation to many other Sida funded projects. Relevance and fulfilment of objectives was noted to be high and the prospects for sustainability looked rather positive. There has been little or no overlapping with other donor initiatives, while important synergies obtained within the different components of the MDP have been noted.

3.5 Lessons Learned

There are several factors behind the overall positive results.

What can be learned from the co-operation? As the overall assessment of the Programme is positive one may ask: What have been the major "success factors" in this co-operation? Some possible factors are listed below.

Timing and needs

According to the available documentation there was virtually no knowledge of modern and democratic public management when the co-operation commenced. SIPU came in at an early stage in the reform process, when the Mongolian government had to make a number of crucial decisions. The newly acquired knowledge and skills did thus yield immediate impact. The co-operation with Sweden was initiated before that of many other donors. This seems to have given the Swedish co-operation a special position. The fact that the co-operation came at a time when it was most needed, and was implemented during a period in which there has been tremendous change, largely explains the level of impact.

Local commitment

There has been strong local commitment and the buzz word "ownership" could probably be used to describe this programme. Formally, the MDP is set up with steering groups at the highest levels of government. However, local commitment also seems to be a question of attitudes. Available documentation, including that from the MDP Global workshops, shows that there is a high awareness of the problems of the country and an eagerness to do something about them. The Mongolian side has taken active part in planning and implementation of Programme activities.

Participatory consultancy

The Swedish consultant has, according to the Mongolian side, responded with a participatory way of working, stressing the dialogue with the Mongolian side and utilised their own knowledge and experience, both during the planning process and in the implementation. Such an approach is often attempted but is not always successful. What has made it function in this case seems to have been the local commitment to the programme. There has been a process of learning on both sides and both parties confirm that contacts at the personal level has been good. Over the years a high level of mutual confidence has developed.

Also the pedagogical approach used in training has been characterised by a high degree of participation, rather than lecturing in a traditional sense. This has been very appreciated and is said to explain the impact of training.

Choice of Topics

Training has been focused on topics of a rather general nature: leadership, investigation techniques and project management, to mention a few. Such training can be applied in a number of different ways and different circumstances. It does not require any major investments and is relevant for staff in most positions. Even if a trained person will change to a completely different area of work, chances are that he will still have benefited from this type of training. Training has in this sense had a "low risk" focus.

Furthermore, training has largely been linked to the work of the participants and their daily problems. This has had a motivating effect, has facilitated the application of knowledge and has indirectly reduced the cost of participants' absence from their regular working places.

Absorptive capacity

Participants in the Programme have absorbed the training in an unusual way. This has several explanations. As mentioned above, the on-going reform process has permitted the participants to use what they learned immediately. Also, the general level of education in Mongolia is relatively high. Several of the participants have had an academic profile and/or considerable practical experience of public administration which has facilitated learning considerably.³

Synergies

The Swedish Programme has not operated in isolation. The MDP itself is based on a synergistic thinking and the Swedish support has both reinforced, and been reinforced by, the other programme components. Examples of this are the "consultancy teams" set up as part of the MDP and partly financed by UNDP, where participants have applied their knowledge. One could also talk about synergies between the two sub-projects: institutional development of IAMD and the Civil Service Training and Consultancy component. The support to IAMD has permitted the institution to become one of the key players in the civil service reform, and the civil service project has entailed an additional strengthening of IAMD. The two sub-projects have thus been mutually reinforcing.

Critical mass

Considering the limited relations between Sweden and Mongolia as well as the size of the Mongolian public administration, the support has been quite substantial. The relatively long duration of the co-operation has permitted the Swedish consultant to understand the problems of Mongolia. It has also produced a good relationship between the two sides. In some programmes, the persons trained are unable to apply their knowledge and skills, as colleagues and superiors do not share their perspectives and visions. In this project, number of persons have been trained, at different levels in the organisation, seem to have been sufficient to permit a massive change in attitudes, visions and policies.

³However, for the development co-operation with Mongolia *as a whole*, there is a considerable problem of absorption capacity. According to figures from the Tokyo donor meeting, only 60% of amounts committed for the period 1991-1995 were disbursed.

4 ASSESSMENT OF THE NEW PROPOSAL

In October 1995, the Cabinet Secretariat and SIPU signed an agreement, subject to the approval of Sida, for a prolongation of the MDP Civil Service Training and Consultancy Component. Its objective is to assist the implementation of the Mongolian Public Administration and Civil Service Reform through support for the Cabinet Secretariat in the areas of:

- Human Resources Development,
- Organisational Development,
- Consultancy.⁴

No formal decision has been made by Sida so far. The decision will be determined by several factors. In the following two issues are discussed: Is the project proposal *relevant* to the objectives of Sida and Mongolian government? Is it *viable*, i.e. can the objectives of the proposal be expected to be fulfilled?

4.1 Relevance

Support to the Public Sector Reform is still of high relevance relevant, but...

As indicated previously, relevance can be assessed from different angles. The new proposal is first assessed with respect to the objectives of the reform process, the MDP and the objectives of Sida's technical co-operation. We then look at relevance of the different *components* of the proposal, in relation to overall objectives of the proposal. After only one week in Mongolia it would be presumptuous to make categorical judgements on a project proposal as complex as the one in question. Also, it is the Cabinet Secretariat, being the client in this co-operation, that ultimately must define the content of services under the new contract. The points made below should therefore primarily be taken as general reflections and a "second opinion" on the proposal.

4.1.1 Overall Relevance

The reform process

The Mongolian situation has changed radically since the start of co-operation. The legislative framework has been revised and there has been an increased exposure to international experiences. The level of competence is considerably higher than only a few years ago. The reforms will now pass from a design phase to an implementation phase. This calls for elaboration of new systems within the reformed public administration as well as massive staff training. The Cabinet Secretariat estimates that a total of 10 500 persons, 2 500 at the central level and 8 000 at local levels, need training during the coming 2-3 year period.

The Management Development Programme

A new Global Workshop of the MDP will be held shortly after the presentation of this report. The future direction of the Programme will then be drawn up. It is an important

⁴For detailed information on the proposal, see the original document.

event as it is the first workshop since the change of government. This opportunity may be used to review the project proposal, with its various components, against possible new goals and priorities. However, under any circumstances the MDP will require a component of human resources development.

Local demand

Demand has been expressed in the form of a request for financing and through an active involvement of in the previous phases co-operation.

Since the project proposal was drafted and signed there has been a change in the government administration. The new administration has also expressed their clear interest in continuing the co-operation, but must of course be permitted to establish its own priorities. The question which need to be asked by the new Mongolian government is not whether it wants the proposed project or not. Rather, if Sweden is prepared to allocate a little more than a million dollar, should it be used for the project as it now stands or for support with a different focus?

Competitiveness of the Swedish consultant

During the five years of co-operation, SIPU has had the opportunity to gain experience from Mongolia. The mutual trust that has developed between the parties is another important asset. It also means that SIPU is in an even better position than before to provide relevant services to the Mongolian government.

Other donor interventions

Mongolia has a relatively small population and a small public administration. As a result, donor co-ordination is easier than in many other countries. So far, virtually all co-operation in the area of public management has been co-ordinated within the framework of the MDP. An example is the recent proposal for decentralisation which, if co-ordinated as foreseen, will complement the Civil Service Training and Consultancy Programme. The management projects presented at the donor meeting in Tokyo in February 1996 are either focused on the private sector or on specific line ministries. The only project directly concerned with the public administration reform is the UNDP-component itself, which does not represent any overlapping.

IAMD is the only post graduate school in the fields of Public Administration and Business Administration. It has several bilateral co-operation agreements, which is something quite natural for any academic institution and does not constitute a problem of overlapping.

However, things could change very rapidly, especially as Mongolia has become somewhat of a success story. The European Union will soon initiate activities and other donors may chose do the same. If so, there may be a problem of donor co-ordination and saturated aid absorption capacity.

4.1.2 Relevance of Project Components

...relevance varies between different project components and the proposal calls for certain clarifications.

What could then be said about the relevance of the different project *components* in relation to the project's ultimate objective: implementation of the Mongolian public administration and civil service reform.

Human Resources Development (3.1)

As mentioned, the reform process will now go from design to implementation. This calls for training of another character, with a different target group and of a completely different magnitude than before. Massive training can only be implemented nationally and the Swedish co-operation can at most be an additional resource. Rather than training, which was urgently needed at an early stage in the reform process, strengthening of the local training *capacity* will not be crucial.

Against this background, the relevance of the first sub component, (3.1.1) assisting the Cabinet Secretariat to elaborate a "Strategy and Policy for Human Resources Development of Government Administrative Employees", appears to be high. Given the limited national training capacity it is important that there is a strategic thinking on how to use this capacity and develop it further. Training needs must be defined and prioritised. As the Cabinet Secretariat has little or no previous experience of such work, the Swedish support could be of key importance.

Activities also include "training programme and work shops for the newly established State Secretariats" (3.1.2) and "advanced training in personnel management in view of the new Law on Government Service" (3.1.3). This could be seen as a direct continuation of previous training activities. However, the project proposal says virtually nothing about the target group, training needs and the content of training. Presumably, a more in-depth training needs analysis will be done as part of the project. A clearer definition of the contents of these components may, however, be expected already in the project proposal. Another thing to consider are the recent changes within the government structures, including the reduction of the number of ministries, not foreseen when the proposal was drafted. Many key positions are since recently occupied by persons who have had small opportunities to acquire knowledge and experience of modern public management techniques. Finally, referring to the need to establish a permanent training capacity, inclusion of a "training of trainers" component should be considered.

Organisational Development (3.2)

The aim of this component is "to strengthen key organisations for developing and implementing the Public Administration and Civil Service Reforms in practice", by developing "learning organisational strategies" in the Public Sector. This includes supporting organisational development within the Ministry of Finance, the Cabinet Secretariat and IAMD as well as training of consultants in practical organisational development and learning organisations.

The whole reform process could be described as a giant process of organisational

development. Organisational development is thus by definition in line with the overall objective of the co-operation. What should be noted is the different roles the consultant has in the training programme and in the actual implementation of the reforms. Presumably, the Swedish consultants will primarily furnish the tools and methods, working as facilitators. It is important that the government agencies themselves assume responsibility for the actual process of change.⁵

Consultancy (3.3)

There are many notions of "consultancy". By common understanding, it indicates a process whereby someone *external* to an organisation is *consulted* for advice. The consultant may apply certain methods and techniques to carry out this work. However, the use of such skills and methods are not in any way restricted to "consultancy" in a strict sense.

The aim of this project component is "to strengthen the consultancy capacity for implementing the Public Administration and the Civil Service Reform processes". Sub-components are "training of facilitators in applying the developed handbook in OD", "training of new consultants" and "assistance for the creation of further independent consultancy centres and the creation of joint consultancy teams".

To develop so called consultancy *skills*, including training of facilitators in applying the handbook in OD, is important and perfectly in line with the overall objective of the project. To reduce the dependency on international consultants is important in a sustainability perspective. However, the proposal is not clear when it comes to who the intended "consultants" are, nor how and when they are to use their skills. It indicates that consultancy centres should be set up externally to the cabinet secretariat which would be logical in view of the institutions' non-operative role. However, if there are plans to create independent consultancy centres, it should be clear before hand how they will be financed and organised. This, which is ultimately a question for the government of Mongolia, should be made clear in the project proposal.

Sweden should not promote the creation of structures that would be fully dependent on foreign assistance, as there are likely to be unsustainable in the long run. Nor should Sida promote a system whereby government staff would require additional funds for performing work that is clearly part of their regular functions.

Study tours (3.4)

Study tours may be an way of transferring knowledge and widening the perspectives of participants. It is also a way of drawing on the particular resources and experiences of *Sweden*.

As noted earlier in this report, it is also relatively costly. Objectives of the visits must therefore be clear and the participants carefully selected. The project proposal foresees 42 visits of a duration of two weeks each. It does not specify the purpose of the visits nor the selection of participants, referring to the importance of "flexibility". This is normal,

⁵Commenting on the draft version of the report, SIPU stressed that this "always has been a guiding star in the co-operation".

just as it would be normal that Sida is presented with such information before financing is granted.

Given the limited resources and the magnitude of work to be done in Mongolia a restrictive use of study tours is recommended. The purpose of each visit should be clearly defined, with reference made to the work descriptions of the participants. Priority should be given to persons that have not had the previous possibility to study the public administration in a foreign country.⁶

Co-ordination (3.5)

Proper co-ordination is imperative for successful implementation of the project and should be included as a component in the project. Exactly how co-ordination is organised must be determined by the two parties. A strong local co-ordination can be justified both a financial and control point of view, considering that the Cabinet Secretariat is the client of services.

Evaluation (3.6)

The fact that evaluation is included as a separate component in the proposal, indicates an awareness of the importance to follow-up and assess activities. In a key sentence it is stated that "planning and implementation of the different projects should be made in such a way that an evaluation and follow up of the agreement is easily made".

It is then somewhat surprising to see how vaguely objectives are defined in the contract. There are very few quantitative or time-bound objectives, in fact even less than in the previous project proposals. The opposite could be expected. The project environment is more stable than before, there is the experience of previous activities and several persons at the Cabinet Secretariat have received training in establishing aims and objectives during the previous co-operation. In the proposal it is stated that operational objectives will be defined later on for each of the project components. However, the way the project is presented will not only make an ex post evaluation difficult but may even give Sida the impression that the content of the proposal in fact is not very clear.

As this is a project of co-operation, one may assume that it will be a participatory evaluation carried out jointly by SIPU and the Cabinet Secretariat? This would enhance the learning on both sides. It would also be of interest to know if the parties intend to make an own evaluation of the first phase of this project? Such an evaluation would be something completely different, and probably even more valuable, than the one which is now carried out by "outsiders".⁷

⁶In a comment to the draft report, UNDP's senior advisor on public management points out that "previously the study tours dealt with broad-based topics that served for familiarization with a market economy and a democratic society and the role of national and local government in them. The executive personnel involved in and around the project have now advanced far beyond that stage of requirements. It is now thought that study tours should be made for specialists on much more specific topics related to problem solution and taking advantage of developmental opportunities."

⁷SIPU mentions in a comment to the draft report that the Mongolian side has taken initiatives for an evaluation but that there has been a lack of competence and of resources to carry it out.

4.1.3 General Reflections

Gender

There has been no explicit gender perspective in the Swedish support so far nor has this been requested by the Mongolian counterparts. Considering the above there are reasons to believe that the project had been even more effective if there had been more conscious gender thinking.

The gender issue is both a question of *equality*, giving men and women the same opportunities and a question of looking at both men and women as *resources* in a development processes. Not utilising the full capacity of both men and women is a sub-optimising of the countries resources. Needless to say, the relevance of applying a gender perspective varies between different types of co-operation. For some interventions it may not be very relevant at all. However, in a comprehensive reformation of the public administration it definitely is. First of all, the public administration will be the employer of a great number of men and women. Secondly and perhaps even more important, the public administration will make and enforce decisions which will influence the lives of both men and women and that may have a strong impact on the relations between them. Obviously, the gender question must be placed in a *local* socio-cultural context. In the public sector reform of Mongolia, there seems to have been a complete absence of gender thinking. The Swedish co-operation could therefore be a good opportunity to highlight the gender issue, to include it on the agenda and elaborate a conscious strategy to be incorporated in the reform process. A few measures that easily could be taken within the framework of the project include:

- to arrange a seminar on gender awareness,
- to make it a routine to analyse the effects on the relation between men and women when new reforms are presented,
- to set up a separate "consultancy team" to elaborate a gender strategy,
- to assure proper representation of both men and women in all training events.

Sweden recently has made gender equality an official objective of its development co-operation. This should obviously not affect Mongolian priorities. However, *if* such a component is included, it would imply higher relevance from a Swedish perspective.

Decentralisation

From originally having worked with IAMD and other government agencies, including the Cabinet Secretariat, co-operation appears to become more and more focused on the Cabinet Secretariat itself. Reaching the higher government levels often has the benefit of reaching a higher impact when new skills and knowledge are being applied. Furthermore, it is the Cabinet Secretariat that has the responsibility to guide the decentralisation process to which the government is strongly committed. However, it is important that the service function of the Cabinet Secretariat is not lost. Strengthening of the secretariat must never become an objective in itself. Experience shows that reforms will seldom function with a "top-down" approach. It is important to work at different levels simultaneously. Ultimately, this is a problem of target group selection. As the proposal states very little in this respect, a clarification would be useful.

Parallel with this project proposal, another project for decentralisation has been presented to Sweden. The decentralisation project has not been considered in this study. However, the study strengthens the opinion that support to the central level must be complemented at local level to obtain a balanced reform process. Care should be taken so that there is not too much a gap, nor any overlapping between the decentralisation and the Civil Service Training and Consultancy projects.

Division of roles

In the contract the provision of Swedish consultancy services is regulated, but the project is in fact one of joint *co-operation*. Very little is said in the project proposal on the division of roles between SIPU and the Mongolian side. It could be an advantage elaborating on this, for several reasons. One is the inevitable discussion on local financing. When this comes up, the Cabinet Secretariat will stand stronger if it can show what its role and responsibilities will be in the actual implementation of project activities. Another is that the Swedish support will not continue forever, at least not under these forms. A clearer definition of the division of roles will facilitate the phase-out process of the co-operation. Finally, defining the roles and responsibilities on *both* sides before hand always reduces the risk of misunderstandings during the implementation phase.

Size of project

The project proposal amounts to a total of 180 Swedish consultancy weeks over a period of little more than one and a half year. This corresponds to more than two full-time posts over the time of project implementation and it is 50% more consultancy input compared to the first phase of the project, implemented between 1994 and 1997. The total cost is well over one million US dollar, not including local costs and possible co-financing by the UNDP.

Considering the magnitude of problems in Mongolia, the proposed intervention is relatively limited. Considering previous support, the support of other donors, Swedish contacts with Mongolia as a whole, the duration of the project and the average size of Sida's Technical co-operation projects, it is large.

The size of a project is ultimately a question of priorities and opportunity costs. Both the Swedish and the Mongolian government have limited budgets. What is the possible alternative use of one million USD, or part of this money, for the Mongolian government?

Timing

The timing has been a crucial factor in this co-operation. As mentioned above, it permitted the Mongolian counterparts to make effective use of their knowledge in the preparation of the new civil service law. Today, the rapid economic and social development calls for urgent implementation of the public sector reform. The new government administration is committed to speeding up the pace of this process. New measures are being taken continuously. For various reasons, a whole year has passed since the project proposal was signed. Given the present situation in Mongolia, Sida and the two contract parties are urged to take immediate action after the presentation of this report.

4.2 Viability

*The proposal is viable but will require a considerable effort from all of those involved.
Local financing constitutes a problem*

Assuming that the project proposal is relevant, is it also viable?

One way to answer the questions would be to look at the "success factors" of the previous co-operation. Are they still there? It appears so. There are problems that Sweden could assist in solving and there is an explicit demand for assistance. Local ownership of the project is still strong. Having worked several years in Mongolia, the consultant is of course even more qualified now than before, and the relation between the parties even stronger.

However, there are also potential constraints.

Absorptive capacity

The local absorption capacity was not a major problem in the previous co-operation and recent years' development is likely to have increased the capacity to absorb foreign assistance. However, the new proposal also implies a considerable acceleration in terms of project activities.

Just *assuming* that one Swedish consultant will work with an average of five Mongolians, in lectures, workshops, meeting etc., we are talking about some 1 700 Mongolian man weeks just for the *participation* in project activities. Participants will be persons in key positions, with important daily functions to perform. Furthermore, the Swedish co-operation is not the only one they will be engaged in. In other words, the project involves a heavy investment also from the Mongolian side. The financial consequences may be relatively limited considering the low salary levels but the opportunity costs of temporarily lost scarce human resources is something that the Cabinet Secretariat should consider.

There is also the aspect of planning, co-ordination and monitoring. Previous experience indicate a rather high capacity to manage the co-operation with Sweden. It is important that also the future co-operation is dimensioned to the management capacity of the Cabinet Secretariat.

Institutional stability

A key factor for success in a co-operation of this kind is institutional stability.⁸ Considering the circumstances, Mongolia has shown a remarkable political and institutional stability in recent years. The transition to democracy took place peacefully, the recent change of government has followed democratic principles and the new government has clearly expressed a wish to continue and even speed up the reform process. However, after the recent elections there have been changes of people also at civil service level and the *risk* of future political and institutional instability, affecting the viability of the project, should not be ruled out.

Financing of local project costs

In the early 1990's government finances deteriorated rapidly. GDP dropped 6% annually between 1990-93 and the budget deficit increased sharply. Recently, macro economic indicators have turned upwards, and GDP is estimated to have increased by 6,3% in 1995. The 1995 budget deficit was 3%, considerably lower than that of Sweden during recent years. Tax income amounts to 28% of GDP, which is high in comparison with many other countries.⁹ However, in terms of GDP per capita, only estimated to be in the range of USD 350. The government is under strong pressure from IMF to reduce public expenses. At the same time, social problems are increasing in an alarming way. This has implications both for the viability of cost-sharing and for the actual implementation of reforms.

Sida has several instruments of co-operation. The so called technical co-operation is usually applied for middle income countries where the country in question has expressed a explicit demand for Swedish services. To assure that this demand is genuine, the local party is expected to finance at least local project costs. For more traditional development aid, the policy is more flexible, although a genuine interest, demonstrated by some kind of local contribution, is often emphasised.

Financing of local costs was a problem already in the previous Programme phases. The government of Mongolia states that it is not in a position to finance direct costs in connection with the Swedish co-operation. As a result, the UNDP has offered to finance these expenditures and budget provisions for this has already been made.

It is questionably whether it actually matters from *where* the Cabinet Secretariat gets finance for the other local project costs, and if this should be Sweden's concern. What does matter is the local commitment and the priorities of the Cabinet Secretariat.

Are there other ways, apart from cost sharing, by which the Cabinet Secretariat can show that this co-operation is of high priority? One would be to continue maintaining a high level of involvement and to take active part in planning, execution, monitoring and

⁸In an evaluation of the impact of Swedish support to Uruguay, a country where any political change has great impact also on the public administration, it was concluded the most common factor for project failure was institutional instability. See Peck, de Vylder, *Utvärdering av tio års samarbete med Uruguay*, Interconsult, 1994".

⁹Source: Papers on Economic and Social Development of Mongolia, Tokyo Donors Meeting, 1996, Government of Mongolia.

evaluation. Another way is to ensure that training and other support is effectively used. A third way would be that the Mongolian Government shows that it indeed contributes with considerable resources to the implementation of the project, e.g. in terms of *human* resources and office facilities. A rough estimate of local time input was presented above. If the Cabinet Secretariat could estimate what this implies in terms of costs, it would stand stronger in the dialogue with Sida. Finally, the Mongolian government can show cost consciousness, striving to find low cost solutions whenever possible and contributing with internal resources for certain services, such as translation.

Financing of reforms

The Mongolian government's budget crisis implies low salaries for civil servants as well as limited resources to implement the reforms. The flight from the public sector has so far been limited, largely because the lack of alternatives within the private sector. Furthermore, there have been elements of "topped-up" salaries. This is no long term solution. On the contrary, it may be highly destructive if a situation is created in which civil servants do not perform their regular duties without additional financing.

It is quite clear that the financial restrictions may influence the impact of the Swedish support. Potential scenarios include staff members not being able to dedicate themselves to their work due to low salary levels, "brain drain" from the public sector, distorted pay structures as a result of foreign aid and the emergence of corruption. Will there be funds to implement the training plan? Will there be funds to run the new "learning organisations"? Will there be financing for consultancy?

An advantage of this project, as opposed to many others, is that it does not imply any heavy investments. It may actually contribute to financial savings as a result of better resource allocation. However, a continued deterioration of government finances may influence the viability of the project.

5 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Conclusions and recommendations have been presented along the way in this report. The most important conclusions from the evaluations are summarised below:

- The project has been relevant in view of Sida objectives and the Mongolian reform process.
- Fulfilment of objectives has generally been high. Planned output has been produced without major deviations or delays. There are also indications that the development impact, institutional strengthening of IAMD and public administration reform, has been substantial.
- The exact level of cost-effectiveness has not been determined by this study. Generally, it appears to have been a relatively costly project, but with a reasonable balance between cost and impact.
- One may be carefully optimistic as regards the likeliness of sustainability of the support. The political and economic development remains crucial.

These generally positive results can be traced to several factors, including the following:

- The timing of the support,
- The high level of local commitment,
- The participatory approach,
- The choice of topics for training,
- The local absorption capacity,
- The synergies with other co-operation programmes,
- The "critical mass" obtained.

A general review is made of the request for continued financing. It is concluded that Sweden can play a positive role for the Mongolian reform process. In previous phases, the Mongolian government has proved capable of making effective use of the Swedish support.

Recommendation: Sida should take a positive stand as regards continued support to the Mongolian reform process.

However, the project proposal is unclear in a number of aspects. The relevance of some components may be seriously questioned.

The concerns raised in this report include:

- The priorities of the new government,
- The relevance and viability of the consultancy sub-component,
- The function of study tours,
- The need for further specifications as regards planned activities and expected output,
- The incorporation of a gender perspective,
- The choice of target group and awareness of decentralisation needs,
- The division of roles between SIPU and the Cabinet Secretariat
- The size of the project,
- The financing of local project costs.

Recommendation: The Cabinet Secretariat, SIPU and Sida initiate a direct dialogue to clear these issues before any further action is taken.

More than a year has passed since the project proposal and contract was drafted. Since then, there has been many changes in the project environment. The proposal must therefore be revised in any case.

Recommendation: It is recommended that Cabinet Secretariat and SIPU as soon as possible present a revised project proposal to Sida, reflecting the new realities and the conclusions of this report.

As mentioned previously, timing has been an important factor for success in this project, and it will continue to be so. The reform process now enters into a new phase, with a new government.

Recommendation: Irrespective of the decision, it is recommended that Sida takes immediate action as soon as a revised proposal has been presented.

ANNEX 1: TERMS OF REFERENCE

Diarienummer

INEC-1996-1021

TERMS OF REFERENCE : CONSULTANCY ASSIGNMENT**REVIEW OF INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT OF INSTITUTE FOR ADMINISTRATION AND MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT (MNG0101, 0102, 0103) AND MONGOLIAN MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME - CIVIL SERVICE TRAINING AND CONSULTANCY (MNG0131)****1. BACKGROUND**

Sida has supported public sector management in Mongolia since 1991 by four inter-linked projects. The total amount contributed to all of the four captioned projects amounts to approximately 11 million SEK. The four projects are described below.

Four Seminars for Institute for -Administration and Management Development (MNG0101)

In 1990 the Mongolian Institute for Administration and Management Development (IAMD) requested assistance from former aid agency BITS (now merged to form the new Sida) in the form of four seminars (Personnel Management, Local Government, Financial Auditing and Tax Administration for IAMD. The IAMD is a non-profit organization with the main function of training the personnel within the public sector in the area of public administration.

The project was approved by BITS in May 1991 - it was the first Swedish technical assistance project approved to Mongolia - and the seminars were held during the fall of 1991.

Institutional Development of IAMD, phase I (MNG0102)

In 1992 BITS received a project proposal from IAMD on a follow-up to the training support, however this time with emphasize on institutional development of IAMD through training of trainers and project managers.

Institutional Development of IAMD, phase II (MNG0103)

In 1993 IAMD requested BITS to further support the institutional development of IAMD. The third phase of the project contained the following training components:

- Project Management II,III
- Personnel Management Development Training
- Personnel Methods and Techniques
- Local Government Organization and Local Self Government
- Local Government Finance

In addition a number of study tours to Sweden were included. The overall objective of the above mentioned projects was to strengthen IAMD as a key institution in the Mongolian reform process towards a market economy. The project objective was to develop IAMD towards a cost-effective and professional institution for public administration development.

Civil Service Training and Consultancy (MNG 0131)

In 1994 BITS approved a project on "Civil Service Training and Consultancy", which is one component of the major UNDP-sponsored "Mongolian Management Development Programme".

The overall objective of this project is the expansion of the management capacity necessary for the public administration and civil service reforms. The project consists of training for managers from the central and local government organizations. The following training programmes are included in the project:

- The training of civil service consultants and trainers,
- Basic management programme for the local government administration staff in Aimags and Sums (Mongolia is divided into administrative and territorial units at local level. The highest administrative unit at local level is called aimag. There are 18 different aimag. Each aimag is divided into sums , totally 325)
- Basic management training for the central government administration staff
- Management program for the central government
- Management program for the local government administration

The Mongolian counterpart in this project is the Cabinet Secretariat and the Swedish part is SIPU International AB (as in all of the above mentioned projects). The project activities have not yet been terminated. The consultant shall, however, include this project in the review.

2. SCOPE OF WORK

Sida will contract two consultants who shall carry out a review according to the scope of work below.

The consultants shall review the past cooperation, the possibilities for continued cooperation and the proposal for prolongation of "Mongolian Management Développement Programme" according to the scope of work below. The ambition of the review shall be seen against the background that the total time allocation to the review is approximately seven man weeks.

Based on the project documentation provided by Sida, and other relevant material obtained in Mongolia, a field visit to Mongolia (during approximately 7 days) including discussions with relevant Mongolian and Swedish parties and representatives of the concerned institutions, the following shall be carried out:

2.1 Back-ground description

- 2.1.1 Describe the institutional structure, including roles and responsibilities, in the field of public administration in Mongolia. This includes an overall description of both the central level as well as the local level.
- 2.1.2 Describe what other donors are doing in the field of public administration.

2.2 Review of the Past-Cooperation

- 2.2.1 Make a thorough review of the Swedish technical assistance projects "Institutional Development of IMAD" and "Mongolian Management Development Programme - Civil Service Training and Consultancy" in which SIPU in Stockholm was the Consultant, and Institute of Administration and Management Development and the Cabinet Secretariat were the Clients. The review shall consider the following dimensions:
- 2.2.2 Describe the Institute of Administration and Management Development with special emphasize on :
 - the institute's efficiency in providing the public sector with adequate training and consultancy for the continued work on the reform process
 - the institute's efficiency and adequacy in providing the different Mongolian ministries with manuals and documents for decisions.
 - IAMD's impact on the Mongolian reform process

- 2.2.3 Achievement of objectives and products as defined in the contract and in BITS approval, taking into consideration possible changes of circumstances.
- 2.2.4 Reasons for high/low achievement of goals regarding, i.a. organizational, administrative, financial, institutional, and other factors.
- 2.2.5 Relevance. The relevance of the projects approach, goals and services provided under the technical cooperation project. (Length and content of the programme in relation to its objectives; contents of the programme: systems development, training etc.)
- 2.2.6 Efficiency of the project implementation. The fulfilment of the roles and responsibilities of the parties involved, i.e. the Mongolia parts and SIPU International AB.
- 2.2.7 Costs and benefits. An estimation of the cost-effectiveness of the project activities carried out.
- 2.2.8 Side-effects. Positive and/or negative effects which were not foreseen during the planning of the projects.
- 2.2.9 Conditions for sustainable effects of the projects. Aspects which influence the long term impact of the projects.
- 2.3 Review of the Possibilities for Continued Cooperation**
- 2.3.1 Review the project proposal for prolongation of the "Mongolian Management Development Programme" and identify priority issues and needs with regard to:
- the proposed long and short term objectives
 - organizational strengths and weaknesses of the concerned Mongolian institutions
 - foreseen tangible results (expected outputs) and long term development effects
 - the impact on the economic reform process
 - the need for coordination with relevant Mongolian institutions in the field and eventually other donors
 - the relevance and potential impact of the transfer of knowledge from Swedish inputs
 - the possibilities for cost-sharing (the covering of local cost) in a possible future project.
- 2.3.2 Based on the above findings, give Sida recommendations on the potential of supporting a future project and, if relevant, suggest improvements of the proposal with

regard to project objectives, organization, activities and other design aspects with the aim to reach the best possible development effect.

3. REPORTING

The report, in English shall include the following:

- Executive summary
- Project contents
- The evaluation methodology
- Findings
- Conclusions and recommendations
- Lessons learned

The report shall be presented to Sida within three weeks after the completion of the field visit to Mongolia. The final report shall be submitted to Sida within one week after Sida has commented upon the draft report.

The report shall be written in WP 6.1. for MS-DOS or a compatible program and formatted in A4.

In addition to the report, the consultant shall write a short summary in English to be published in Sida Evaluations Newsletter, and fill in a questionnaire for the UTV database.

4. TIME PLAN

A total input of approximately 7 man-weeks is envisaged. The mission to Mongolia is scheduled to be carried out in September 1996, during approximately 7 days. The draft report shall be presented to Sida no later than three weeks after the mission.

5. CONTRACT AND BUDGET

See attached documents.

ANNEX 2: LIST OF SOURCES

Adya, Ts.	Deputy Rector, IAMD
Byambayar, J	Lecturer, IAMD
Danielsson, Anne	Sida
Dashzeveg, Ts.	State Secretary, Ministry of Defense
Davaadulam, Ts.	Senior Expert, Cabinet Secretariat
Glovinsky, S.	UNDP Consultant
Gombosurem, Ts.	Rector, IAMD
Hedén, Åsa	Sida
Hjidsuren, S.	Head of Petition Division, Cabinet Secretariat
Lhagva, T.	Chief of the Cabinet Secretariat
Lingov, L.	Chairman of the Government Administrative Service Council
Mujaan, D.	Department Head, Office of the President of Mongolia
Oquist, P.	UNDP Senior Advisor Management Development
Rinchinbazar, R.	Head of the Public Administration Management Department
Samballhundev, Ts.	Head of Department, Cabinet Secretariat
Shuurav, Ya.	Business Management Project Director, IAMD
Stjärneklint, A.	UNDP Deputy Resident Representative
Tserendkulam, Ts.	Head of Division, Governor's Office
Tserendorj, B.	Legal Advisor to the President
Udval, B	IAMD, Lecturer
Yanjemaa, Ts.	Manager-coordinator MDP
Yunden, A	Head of Division, Governor's Office, Tuv aimag
Zandansharav, D	Director, Consultancy Center, IAMD

ANNEX 3: DATA ON PROJECT OUTPUT

INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT OF IAMD (MNG0102)

Overall objectives:

- To support IAMD's efforts to become a modern, professional and cost-effective management development institute.
- To develop a cadre of professional trainers, project managers and administrators within IAMD.

Budget: Expenditures:

Fees:	1 310 000 SEK	1 310 000 SEK
Reimbursables:	685 000 SEK	571 000 SEK
Total:	1 995 000 SEK	1 881 000 SEK

Expected output:

Immediate objectives:

Produced output:

Execution:

Expected output:	Immediate objectives:	Produced output:	Execution:
• Training of Trainers A two-week course for 16 training officers from IAMD and other government agencies.	To enable participants to use modern learning principles in practical work, write aims and objectives, prepare, plan and assess training and to use different training methods.	Workshop held with 20 trainers from IAMD and other training institutions. Training methodology, including team teaching, group discussion, review and reflection methods, case studies and other participatory methods were presented.	1992
• Training modules and materials A two-week workshop for 16 trainers from IAMD and other government agencies.	To enable participants to investigate and assess training needs, transfer these into training modules and to develop training materials and use them properly.	Seminar conducted with 23 faculty members from IAMD and other institutions. Consultants described the curricula development process and analysed the current curriculum of IAMDs business administration programme.	1992
• Study methods and investigations A two-week course for maximum 16 prospective project officers from IAMD and other govt. bodies.	To enable participants to perform simple investigations, use different methods for data collection, analyse the data and make a comprehensive report on the results.	22 participants attended a three week course dealing with data collection, study methods and investigation techniques. Subjects were later incorporated in IAMD curricula.	1993
• Organisational effectiveness A two-week course in Sweden for a maximum of 16 IAMD staff and other civil servants.	To enable participants to design an organisational development project, handle organisational processes and understand change processes and resistance to change in organisations.	A two week course with study visits to various Swedish institutions implemented with 10 participants.	1993
• Project management A four-week programme for 10 senior trainers and administrators conducted in Sweden and Mongolia.	To develop a cadre of project managers within IAMD and enable participants to describe the project cycle, organise a project and act as project managers.	11 participants attended a course in Sweden; four IAMD faculty members and representatives from government and business.	1993
• Administrative systems development A four-week programme for government officials from IAMD and selected ministries.	Documentation of present management systems in a way that it can be used for training, basic training modules available and an administrative development programme started.	A two-week organisational effectiveness course conducted in Sweden for 10 persons from the IAMD, Ministry of PA and some private companies.	1993

INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT OF IAMD (MNG0103)

Overall objectives:

Same as for MNG0103

	Budget:	Expenditures:
Fees:	2 402 400 SEK	2 286 960 SEK
Reimbursables:	973 800 SEK	947 984 SEK
Total:	3 376 200 SEK	3 234 944 SEK

Expected output:

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Project management II Development of a project management course and facilitation and co-ordination with trainers from IAMD. • Project management III Training in data collection, study methods, investigation techniques and project evaluation. Follow-up of the project started in previous components. • Personnel mgmt development and training Development of a draft Personnel Management Manual for information and training purposes, to be introduced in workshops/seminars for personnel officers. • Personnel methods and techniques Development of methods and techniques for personnel management, including performance indicators and techniques for redundancy planning and operation. • Study tour in Sweden for personnel officers A two weeks study tour for 10 govt. officials, mainly from the Prime Ministers office to study personnel management. • Local govt organisation and self govt. Preparation of proposal for a pilot project on local govt. development to be submitted to the government for further consideration 	<p>See objectives for project management III</p> <p>IAMD should be fully equipped to continue training in project man. IAMD consultants should have the capacity to work as project managers in middle size development projects.</p> <p>Development of rules, regulations and policies on personnel in the Civil Service, a training programme for personnel officers and methods and techniques for personnel management.</p> <p>Improved methods and techniques for personnel management. New democratic systems for industrial relations.</p> <p>To expose government officials to modern personnel management in practice.</p> <p>Improved organisation of the division of responsibility, administration and staff between central and local government in Mongolia.</p>
--	--

Immediate objectives:

Produced output:

Execution:

Course implemented in Mongolia with previous participants, concentrating on three projects: privatisation in NIC, reorganisation of the compensation scheme at the Darkhan factory and local government reform in Tuv aimag.	1993
The course was designed for faculty members of IAMD and other training and research institutions. Two faculty members participated in teaching together with two Swedish consultants.	1993
A two-week consultancy and training project implemented resulting in a draft personnel management manual. This has been firmly linked to the new Mongolian civil service law.	August 1993- May 1994
2,5 weeks seminars and workshops for 23 participants, primarily personnel managers and personnel officers of different ministries.	May 1995
A two weeks study tour for 10 persons, with visits to relevant Swedish institutions implemented.	January 1994
Analysis and recommendations on local government organisation and local self government in Mongolia, focused on Ulanbaatar City and Tuv aimag.	Nov. 1993- March 1994

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Local government finance Draft recommendations to government on local govt. finance. 	To find possible ways and means for local revenue as well as proper utilisation of public funds.	A workshop and seminar on local government finance held in Ulambaataar, resulting in a "proposal for initiating a chage program".	August 1994
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Curriculum development for local govt. Preparation of a basic training programme, in co-operation with IAMD and Prime Ministers office. 	Possibilities to train local government staff and elected members of local hurals.	The component implemented as part of MNG0131	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Study tour to Sweden for local govt. adm. A ten-day study tour for about 15 participants from central and local govt and IAMD to study local self government, local administration and regional policy. 	To expose participants to Swedish experiences in relevant fields.	A ten-day study tour with visits to various Swedish institutions.	May 1994

Civil Service Training and Consultancy (MNG0131)

Overall objectives:

- Expansion of the management capacity necessary to undertake the public administration and civil service reforms.
- To provide the Cabinet Secretariat with qualified experts and consultants who can contribute towards the programme in terms of advice, training of staff, policy and methods.
- To develop training programmes and training staff of the Cabinet Secretariat in areas new to the same.

Budget: Expenditures:

Fees:	3 230 600 SEK	Not available
Reimbursables:	1 811 000 SEK	Not available
Total:	5 041 600 SEK	Not available*

* Information November 1996 indicates that the budget for fees will be fully used while approximately 400 000 SEK will remain from the budget for reimbursables.

Expected output:

• Training of Consultants Development and implementation of a consultancy training programme for persons working within the Civil Service Sector. (2x15 persons)	A core of persons responsible for managing reforms, strengthening of training and research, and conditions for mongolians to work as consultants in joint task-forces with NDP finance.
• Management training for central govt Needs analysis of the target group, development of a basic management programme for central government managers and pilot implementation of training.	Strengthened management capacity necessary to undertake reforms; providing the participants with both new knowledge and skills and a broader outlook and new perspectives.
• Management training for local govt. A needs analysis for aimags and sums administration; curricula development and pilot implementation of training.	Strengthened management capacity necessary to undertake reforms; both providing the participants with new knowledge and skills and a broader outlook and new perspectives.
• Training programme for central govt. admin. A needs analysis for govt. administrative staff, curricula development and pilot implementation of training.	Enhanced capacity in the central administration to cope with the new roles and tasks in the transition process.
• Training for local administrative staff. A needs analysis for local govt. administrative staff, curricula development and pilot implementation of training.	Enhanced capacity in the local administration to cope with the new roles and tasks in the transition process and to strengthen the employees' ability to cope with change.

Produced output:

Training executed, during four weeks in Mongolia and two weeks in Sweden	Sept-December 1994
Training needs analysis completed and a 2,5-week training programme conducted with 21 participants.	October 1994
Training needs analysis completed and a 2,5-week training programme conducted with 26 participants.	April-Dec. 1994
Training needs analysis executed and a workshop on change management in the Cabinet Secretariat held with 25 participants.	May-October 1995
Training needs analysis executed and a 2,5-week training programme with 22 participants from aimags and sums conducted.	May-Sept. 1995

Execution:

<p>Training of trainers programme</p> <p>A training programme to give participants the needed knowledge to implement the above training programmes and civil service procedures.</p>	<p>Enhanced capacity within different governmental training organisations for implementing and developing the above four proposed training programmes and civil service procedures.</p>	<p>A one-week training course in Mongolia for 16 participants and a two weeks study visit and training in Sweden for 10 participants from IAMD implemented.</p>	<p>June-August 1995</p>
<p>Training of trainers programme (continued)</p> <p>Same as above.</p>	<p>To develop the ability in managing change on an individual and personal level as well as on a group and organisational level.</p>	<p>A one-week training programme with 12 heads of department within the newly established ministries and 2 teachers of IAMD and the rector of IAMD.</p>	<p>November 1996</p>
<p>Training of trainers programme (continued)</p> <p>Same as above.</p>	<p>To facilitate the implementation of the Mongolian Public Administration and Civil Service Reform</p>	<p>A one-week training programme for 15 teachers of IAMD.</p>	<p>November 1996</p>
<p>Civil service system development</p> <p>Pilot testing, adjustment and implementation of appropriate procedures and rules; training the people who are involved in these activities.</p>	<p>Strengthening of the civil service system and effective enforcement of the new civil service law.</p>	<p>Elaboration of a personnel management handbook.</p>	<p>March-May 1996</p>
<p>Not originally planned.</p>		<p>A one-week leadership development seminar for 22 top executives, including 7 members of the cabinet, in the Mongolian government executed.</p>	<p>June 1995</p>

Sida Evaluations - 1995/96

- 95/1 Educação Ambiental em Moçambique. Kajsa Pehrsson
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 95/2 Agitators, Incubators, Advisers - What Roles for the EPU's? Joel Samoff
Department for Research Cooperation
- 95/3 Swedish African Museum Programme (SAMP). Leo Kenny, Beata Kasale
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 95/4 Evaluation of the Establishing of the Bank of Namibia 1990-1995. Jon A. Solheim, Peter Winai
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/1 The Beira-Gothenburg Twinning Programme. Arne Heileman, Lennart Peck
The report is also available in Portuguese
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/2 Debt Management. (Kenya) Kari Nars
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/3 Telecommunications - A Swedish Contribution to Development. Lars Rylander, Ulf Rundin et al
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/4 Biotechnology Project: Applied Biocatalysis. Karl Schügerl
Department for Research Cooperation
- 96/5 Democratic Development and Human Rights in Ethiopia. Christian Åhlund
Department for East and West Africa
- 96/6 Estruturação do Sistema Nacional de Gestão de Recursos Humanos. Júlio Nabais, Eva-Marie Skogsberg, Louise Helling
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/7 Avaliação do Apoio Sueco ao Sector da Educação na Guiné Bissau 1992-1996. Marcella Ballara, Sinesio Bacchetto, Ahmed Dawelbeit, Julieta M Barbosa, Börje Wallberg
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/8 Konvertering av rysk militärindustri. Maria Lindqvist, Göran Reitberger, Börje Svensson
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/9 Building Research Capacity in Ethiopia. E W Thulstrup, M Fekadu, A Negewo
Department for Research Cooperation
- 96/10 Rural village water supply programme - Botswana. Jan Valdelin, David Browne, Elsie Alexander, Kristina Boman, Marie Grönvall, Imelda Molokomme, Gunnar Settergren
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/11 UNICEF's programme for water and sanitation in central America - Facing new challenges and opportunities. Jan Valdelin, Charlotta Adelstål, Ron Sawyer, Rosa Nunes, Xiomara del Torres, Daniel Gubler
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/12 Cooperative Environment Programme - Asian Institute of Technology/Sida, 1993-1996. Thomas Malmqvist, Börje Wallberg
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/13 Forest Sector Development Programme - Lithuania-Sweden. Mårten Bendz
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/14 Twinning Programmes With Local Authorities in Poland, Estonia, Latvia and Lithuania. Håkan Falk, Börje Wallberg
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/15 Swedish Support to the Forestry Sector in Latvia. Kurt Boström
Department for Central and Eastern Europe

- 96/16 Swedish Support to Botswana Railways. Brian Green, Peter Law
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/17 Cooperation between the Swedish County Administration Boards and the Baltic Countries. Lennart C G Almqvist
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/18 Swedish - Malaysian Research Cooperation on Tropical Rain Forest Management. T C Whitmore
Department for Research Cooperation, SAREC
- 96/19 Sida/SAREC Supported Collaborative Programme for Biomedical Research Training in Central America. Alberto Nieto
Department for Research Cooperation, SAREC
- 96/20 The Swedish Fisheries Programme in Guinea Bissau, 1977-1995. Tom Alberts, Christer Alexanderson
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/21 The Electricity Sector in Mozambique, Support to the Sector By Norway and Sweden. Bo Andreasson, Steinar Grongstad, Vidkunn Hveding, Ralph Kårhammar
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/22 Svenskt stöd till Vänortssamarbete med Polen, Estland, Lettland och Litauen. Håkan Falk, Börje Wallberg
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/23 Water Supply System in Dodota - Ethiopia. Bror Olsson, Judith Narrowe, Negatu Asfaw, Eneye Tefera, Amsalu Negussie
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/24 Cadastral and Mapping Support to the Land Reform Programme in Estonia. Ian Brook
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/25 National Soil and Water Conservation Programme - Kenya. Mary Tiffen, Raymond Purcell, Francis Gichuki, Charles Gachene, John Gatheru
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/26 Soil and Water Conservation Research Project at Kari, Muguga - Kenya. Kamugisha, JR, Semu, E
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 96/27 Sida Support to the Education Sector in Ethiopia 1992-1995. Jan Valdelin, Michael Wort, Ingrid Christensson, Gudrun Cederblad
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/28 Strategic Business Alliances in Costa Rica. Mats Helander
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/29 Support to the Land Reform in Lithuania. Ian Brook, Christer Ragnar
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/30 Support to the Land Reform in Latvia. Ian Brook, Christer Ragnar
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/31 Support to the Road Sector in Estonia. Anders Markstedt
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/32 Support to the Road Sector in Latvia. Anders Markstedt
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/33 Support to the Road Sector in Lithuania. Anders Markstedt
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/34 Support to the Maritime Sector in Latvia. Nils Bruzelius
Department for Central and Eastern Europe

- 96/35 Sida/SAREC's Marine Science Programs. Jan Rudengren, Per Brinck, Brian Davy
Department for Research Cooperation, SAREC
- 96/36 Support to the Development of Civil Aviation Administration in the Baltic States. Johan Svaningsson
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/37 The Opening of the two Road Corridors in Angola. C H Eriksson, G Möller
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/38 Statistikproduktion i Nordvästra Ryssland. Lennart Grenstedt. Also available in Russia
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/39 Sri Lanka - Swedish Research Cooperation. Nimal Sanderatne, Jan S. Nilsson
Department for Research Cooperation, SAREC
- 96/40 Curriculum Development in Ethiopia, A Consultancy Study for the Ministry of Education in Ethiopia and for Sida. Mikael Palme, Wiggo Kilborn, Christopher Stroud, Oleg Popov
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/41 Sida Support to Environmental Public Awareness and Training Projects through The Panos Institute, Gemini News Service and Television Trust for the Environment. Leo Kenny, Alice Petren
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/42 Concessionary Credits in Support of Economic Development in Zimbabwe. Karlis Goppers
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/43 Botswana Road Safety Improvement Projects. Rob Davey
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 96/44 Programa de Estudo Pos Graduacao - PEP Guinea Bissau 1992-1996. Roy Carr Hill, Ahmed Dawalbeit
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 96/45 Capacity Building and Networking, A meta-evaluation of African regional research networks. Jerker Carlsson, Lennart Wolgemuth
Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit
- 96/46 Support to the Maritime Sector in Lithuania. Nils Bruzelius
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 96/47 Local Development Programme in Nicaragua, PRODEL. Irene Vance, Jorge Vargas
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Development
- 96/48 The Planta Nicaragua Rehabilitation Programme. Consulting Services. Judith Muller, Per-Johan Svaningsson
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Development
- 96/49 Sida Support to the International Institute for Educational Planning, IIEP. Peter Williams, Lees Maxey
Department for Democracy and Social Development

Sida Evaluation reports may be ordered from:

Bistandsforum, Sida
S-105 25 Stockholm
Phone: (+46) 8 698 5722
Fax: (+46) 8 698 5638



SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY

S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden

Tel: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Fax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64

Telegram: sida stockholm. Postgiro: 1 56 34-9

E-mail: info@sida.se. Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>