

Swedish Support to Local Self Governance in Mongolia

**Nils Öström
Lennart Lundquist**

**Department for Infrastructure
and Economic Cooperation**

Swedish Support to Local Self Governance in Mongolia

**Nils Öström
Lennart Lundquist**

Sida Evaluation 2000/1

**Department for
Infrastructure and Economic
Cooperation**

Evaluation Reports may be ordered from:

Infocenter, Sida
S-105 25 Stockholm
Telephone: (+46) (0)8 795 23 44
Telefax: (+46) (0)8 760 58 95
E-mail: info@sida.se, Homepage <http://www.sida.se>

Authors: Nils Öström, Lennart Lundquist.
Stockholm Group for Development Studies
The views and interpretations expressed in this report are the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Sida.

Sida Evaluation 2000/1
Commissioned by Sida, Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation

Copyright: Sida and the authors

Registration No.: INEC-1995-0066
Date of Final Report: December 1999
Printed in Stockholm, Sweden 1999
ISBN 91 586 8964 8
ISSN 1401-0402

SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY
Address: S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden. Office: Sveavägen 20, Stockholm
Telephone: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Telefax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64
Telegram: sida stockholm. Postgiro: 1 56 34-9
E-mail: info@sida.se. Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>

Table of Contents

Executive summary.....	1
1. The context.....	3
1.1 Public sector reform in Mongolia	3
1.2 Programmes supported by UNDP and other donors	4
1.3 Support for decentralisation.....	4
2. The Evaluation.....	6
3. Findings and conclusions	8
3.1 Activities, results and impacts per component	8
3.2 Summary of conclusions	17
3.3 Summary of recommendations for future cooperation.....	19
3.4 Comment on the proposed energy project	19
4. Lessons learned	21

Annexes

1. Terms of Reference	22
2. List of Documents	28
3. Programme for Sida Evaluation 3–24 November 1999 of capacity building for local self governance in Mongolia.....	30
4. Budget follow up capacity building for local self government in Mongolia 1997–1999	33

Executive summary

Sida contracted the Stockholm Group for Development Studies, Nils Öström and Lennart Lundquist, to perform an evaluation of the support to Capacity Building for Local Self Governance in Mongolia from 3 to 24 November 1999. The project includes training of local politicians and administrative staff, twinning collaborations with local governments in Sweden, strengthening of the national support association and policy research institutions. The Swedish Association of Local Authorities has, in cooperation with SIPU International, provided consultancy support to the project. The main conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation are as follows.

Although the implementation of the *training* is very recent (1998–1999), there is clear evidence of increased knowledge and capacity of elected local representatives and local government officials, as well as of several actions and initiatives taken as an effect of the training in all nine aimags visited. From this it could be expected that the results and effects would be similar in the rest of the aimags in the country and that the expected results of the training component have been well achieved. A main impact of the training has been the positive response and understanding of the importance of participatory methods to be used in different forms of training, but also as a method for daily work contacts in local government offices and for the involvement of citizens.

Another important factor for the success of the project is that the subjects of the training have proved to be valid for the daily work situation of the participants. The general issues of local governance seem to have a universal applicability in the sense that there are topics and problems in common regardless of the fundamental differences between two countries such as Mongolia and Sweden.

Three *twinning* cooperations have been established and resulted in exchange visits. There are also evidence of these exchange visits having contributed to the understanding and increased knowledge of the role and performance of local government. It could therefore be concluded that the expected result of the twinning component has been achieved and has had some effect so far. However, the longer term perspectives and effectiveness of these cooperations depend on several critical factors.

The direct results of the support to the Mongolian Association of Local Authorities, *MALA*, so far, are improvement of its statutes and of information through its quarterly journal, as well as the identification of areas in need of development for the future. In view of its limited resources and staff situation, a strengthened role for MALA, as representative of, and adviser to the local governments has to be seen in a longer term perspective, than the present project period.

The expected result of the *research* component of the project has been achieved in so far as a contact has recently been established between relevant Mongolian and Swedish institutions.

The planned cooperation seems to be linked to the future training in general by including training in systematic follow up and evaluation in the revised training material and continued training courses.

The *relevance* of the Capacity Building Project for the process of decentralisation in Mongolia seems high. This is due to the fact that the training activities of the project have been able to strengthen the knowledge and capacity of local government representatives and staff in their daily interactions, as well as in their contacts with the central government institutions. This strengthened capacity is fundamental for the balance of power between the central and local levels of society and for the development of democracy in general.

There is already some evidence of the sustainable effects of the project in so far as several aimags have conducted further training and allocated resources on their own initiative. Some have also declared

that they would continue these training activities with or without further support. The conclusion of the evaluation is, however, that the long term sustainability of capacity building for local government has not yet been achieved.

Therefore it is recommended to *continue support* to consolidate the achievements reached so far. Training Mongolian trainers to train trainers will make the competence deeper and the capacity broader. Ongoing training programmes will be more stable in their function as a general support to the development of local government in Mongolia and a permanent function for coordination and follow up of training experiences could be established. It is recommended that the future support should stick to the same model and be carried out along the same lines as the previous phase.

It is furthermore recommended to continue support to strengthen MALA as representative, supporter and coordinator of joint activities for the local governments. It is also recommended to continue research cooperation closely connected to the training activities in general.

The main lesson learned from this project is the mutually reinforcing factors of the process and content of the training. Learning about local democracy has been promoted through basic democratic methods.

1. The context

Sida has supported the project “Capacity Building for Local Self Governance” in Mongolia for the period June 1997–December 1999. This project is part of the support for public sector reform and decentralisation in Mongolia coordinated by UNDP.

In October 1999 Sida contracted the Stockholm Group for Development Studies to perform an evaluation of the support to Capacity Building for Local Self Governance, in accordance with the Terms of Reference dated 1999-10-07 (enclosed in Annex 1). The evaluation was performed by Nils Öström and Lennart Lundquist, who visited Mongolia from 3 to 24 November 1999.

1.1 Public sector reform in Mongolia

The Constitution of Mongolia adopted in 1992, provides for a governance system based on democratic values and human rights and defines the nature of decentralisation and local self governance. The Law on Territorial and Administrative Units and their Governance, from 1992, defines the structure and functions of the local authorities and the elected self governing bodies, and the main areas of responsibilities of the territorial units. At the first level, these units are 21 “aimags” and the capital city, Ulaan Baatar. The aimags are divided into 332 “soums”, and under them 1 650 “bags” (13 districts and 120 *horoos* in Ulaan Baatar). At each level there is an elected assembly, “hural” and an administration headed by a “governor”. The governor is nominated by the hural at each level, but finally approved by the next levels governor, or by the Prime Minister in the case the aimags. The aimag governor is both representing the central government in the aimag and responsible to the elected aimag hural for the local government administration. The chairman and secretary of the aimag hural are employed full time, with civil servant salaries paid from the local budget.

The relations between local government bodies and central government institutions are still not clearly defined in practise. In principle the aimags and soums shall be the providers of public services under the normative guidance of central ministries and agencies. For the financing of these services they rely on a mix of government contributions and local tax revenue collection. This mix varies depending on the socio-economic conditions of the aimag, but most of the aimags are dependent on government contributions to more than 60%. Apart from these two sources of finance, which form the local government budget, there are special contributions from central ministries or external aid programmes channelled directly to implementing agencies for specific activities. At the local levels, the relationship between the elected hural and the governor, as well as between the different levels of hurals and governors, had also been unclear, with a traditional inclination of power towards the governors.

A new law on Public Sector Management and Finance is presently pending a second reading and approval in the Parliament. This law will, among other things, introduce closer central government guidance and control over the local budgets for health and education. Earmarked funding for these sectors will be channelled through the local government to schools, hospitals and health centres in accordance with contracts between the central ministries and the aimag governors on the one hand, and the aimag governors and schools and hospitals on the other hand. The other core functions of the local government will continue to receive a state contribution, if local revenues are not enough to cover the costs for these functions.

1.2 Programmes supported by UNDP and other donors

UNDP supports a number of different projects under its Country Cooperation Framework 1997–2001. These projects cover three main programme areas – Governance and Economic transition, Poverty, Environment. Support for Decentralisation and Democracy and Capacity Building for Local Governance are part of the first programme area. In the poverty programme area, both UNDP and Sida (through UNDP) give substantial contributions (2 MUS\$ each) to the National Poverty Alleviation Programme (1996–1999), to which the World Bank is the main contributor (10 MUS\$).

The Poverty Alleviation Programme (PAP) is financing projects for income generation, public works, education, health care, etc, which are developed and implemented at the local levels by the local governments, public service providers or NGOs. Local Poverty Alleviation Councils are formed, headed by the governors and with participation of staff from the local administration, service providers and NGOs.

Both the projects in the area of Governance and Economic transition and the PAP have been evaluated in September–October 1999 (see list of documentation in Annex 2). Main recommendations of the first evaluation are that UNDP should support the development of a clear economic and social policy aimed at equitable human development and eradication of poverty, and to integrate or closely coordinate projects for Governance and Economic transition with the future PAP. The evaluation of PAP is critical to many aspects of the programme, but concludes that it has created effective means of channelling resources to local governments. The PAP evaluation further recommends that the continued programme (proposed to be named Sustainable Livelihood Development Programme) supports a local government revolving fund and small scale social and economic infrastructure.

1.3 Support for decentralisation

The Decentralisation and Democracy Support Project (DDSP), which started in 1997, is aimed at strengthening citizen's participation in the democratic society and the capacity of local government to respond to the need of the population. DDSP is funded by UNDP and includes Citizen Information Centres in aimag capitals, Democracy and Development Fund for micro projects and some other activities. UNESCO/DANIDA have been supporting a project on Democratic Governance and Human Rights at the bag level, and ADB has supported a project for Institutional Strengthening and Financial Administration of local government. These projects have mainly been implemented in the six pilot aimags Khovd, Tov, Khuvsgol, Sukhbaatar, Uvurhandgai and Dundgovi, and share a Project Coordinating Unit with the Capacity Building project. This coordinating unit has three staff, is financed by UNDP and located within the Cabinet Secretariat.

DDSP has been reviewed and evaluated by independent consultants contracted by UNDP in December 1998 and in October 1999 (above mentioned evaluation of support to Governance and Economic transition). Positive results and effects of the Capacity Building project supported by Sweden have been noted in the reports of both these evaluations.

The project Capacity Building for Local Self Governance started in May 1997 with the signing of an agreement between the Government of Mongolia (Ministry of Finance) and the Swedish Association of Local Authorities (SALA), in cooperation with SIPU International, based on financing from Sida (Sida decision April 1997). According to this agreement, the project includes the following four components:

- Short term capacity building through *training* of aimag hural members in six pilot aimags.

- Long term capacity building for self governing bodies in Mongolia through *twinning* collaborations with local governments in Sweden.
- Strengthen the capacity of local administration support *associations* and foundations.
- Strengthen the capacity of national policy *research* institutions.

During the implementation, the main focus of the project has been on the first component, training. This component has been widened to also include soum hural members, local government staff (governor's office) and representatives from local NGOs and political parties. After a first round of training in the six pilot aimags in the middle of 1998, the training activities were, as from the middle of 1999, implemented in all aimags and in Ulaan Baatar city.

SALA/SIPU have contracted Swedish consultants as project facilitators and trainer of trainers in Sweden and in Mongolia, and organised study visits in Sweden for the Mongolian partners. The Coordinating Unit of DDSP have been coordinating activities and contracting local consultants in Mongolia.

2. The Evaluation

The reasons for the evaluation stated in the Terms of Reference are Sida's general responsibility to follow up the use and effect of its funding and to have a basis for the consideration of possible continued support to the project after the end of the present agreement period (1997–1999). The scope of the evaluation is to assess the result of the project and its possible impact, and to discuss the feasibility of continued support.

In accordance with the Terms of Reference, the evaluation is based on project documentation available at Sida, UNDP in Mongolia and at the Swedish and Mongolian partners in the cooperation (see list in Annex 2); visits to seven aimags; meetings in Ulaan Baatar with representatives of the Cabinet Secretariat, UNDP, the Mongolian Association of Local Governments, the Institute for Administration and Management Development, the Local Government Development Foundation, the Poverty Alleviation Programme and the Public Sector Reform Programme. All work in Mongolia was performed in close cooperation and with the very good assistance of the Coordination Office of the Decentralisation and Democracy Support Project (see programme of the mission in Annex 3).

The visits to the aimags were performed during a 10 days field trip in jeep from 7 to 16 November to the following seven aimags Darkhan-Uul, Orkhon, Bulgan, Uvurkhangai, Bayankhangor, Gobi-Altai and Zavkhan.

The field trip gave practical experiences of two important features influencing the implementation of local government in Mongolia. The first refers to the great distances and the sparsely populated countryside. Mongolia covers an area more than three times that of Sweden, with a total population of 2,5 million. Several aimags have a population density of only 1–2 persons per square km. The total distance covered during the field trip was 2 700 km, which took us from the north to the south of central Mongolia and to the nearest parts of western Mongolia. In the remote aimags visited, we rarely met more than 5–6 cars or passed more than 2–3 communities (soums or bags) per day. Because of the large distances covered, the average stay in each aimag was half a day for meetings and over night rest. The original schedule for the field trip also included Khovd aimag, in the far west of the country. However, the visit to this aimag was suspended during the trip due to snowfall, cold weather and insecure roads and accommodation possibilities.

The second feature is the state of the roads and of the basic infrastructure in the aimag capitals and soums. A part from the areas around Ulaan Baatar, where there are asphalt roads, the great majority of the major roads are just one or several parallel wheel tracks on the step with no special preparation. There are no road signs or indications of directions. The basic infrastructure for electricity production and heating were, in most places, in a more or less advanced state of deterioration, due to a vicious circle of lack of coal, means of transportation, resources for repair and lack of means to pay the fees for these services.

In Ulaan Baatar, the mission also met with a representative of Tov aimag and with the representatives of the Sukhbaatar district. Of the aimags contacted, Uvurkhangai and Tov were pilot aimags, where training started in 1998. These two aimags were also involved in ongoing twinning contacts with municipalities in Sweden.

In the aimags and the Ulaan Baatar district, meetings had been arranged with the trainer (who had been trained in Sweden and then conducted training in the aimag); with the chairman of the aimag hural and/or the aimag governor; and with a group 5 – 10 participants from the training. These participants were members of the aimag hural, aimag governor's office, soum hurals and governor's of-

fices, local NGOs and political parties. Because of the long distances within the aimags, the soum representatives met were mostly from the central or nearby soums of the aimag. On three occasions during the trip, formal or informal meetings with soum hural chairmans and others were held in soums passed on the way. In total more than a hundred persons were met and questioned during the mission (about one fifth of the total number of persons trained in the project).

The questions put to aimag trainers regarded dates for the training, number and background of participants, the trainers own opinion of the training contents and methodology, the trainer's opinion of the results achieved by the participants and the results and effects of training on the ordinary work of hurals and governors offices.

Questions to hural chairmen and governors were focused on their perception of the results and effects of training for the contacts between the representative branch (hural) and the executive branch (governor's office) of local government, especially regarding budget discussions and decisions. Questions also regarded the social and economic situation of the aimag, and especially the balance between the local revenue base and the central government subsidies and other contributions, as well as the role and functioning of MALA.

The participants were asked about their opinion of the training content, performance and methodology; about what field work they had performed as part of the training and specifically about what consequences the training has had for their own work and the functioning of the local government bodies and other actors in their aimag.

Before going to Mongolia, the evaluators met with Björn Jonzon (project director, SALA) and Bengt Göran Carlsson (training consultant, SIPU International). After returning from Mongolia, meetings were held with researchers from Novemus, Örebro University and two visiting Mongolian researchers; and with Björn Jonzon (SALA) and Leif Wisén (SIPU International).

3. Findings and conclusions

This part of the report includes one section for each of the four components and main expected results of the project. Each section starts with a summary of activities performed, continues with a presentation of findings about results and possible effects obtained during the evaluation and ends with a conclusion comparing obtained results with what was expected. Each section also includes a part with recommendations regarding possible future cooperation related to each component. Both the conclusions and the recommendations are then summarised in the two last sections.

3.1 Activities, results and impacts per component

3.1.1 Training

The *expected results* of the activities in this module are increased knowledge and capability by the local hurals (and other representatives later included in the training) in matters related to decentralisation.

In October/November 1997 fifteen Mongolian trainers were trained in Sweden. Back in Mongolia the trainees made an extensive investigation on the training needs of the hural members. The investigation and the analyses of the results were carried out according to specific methods provided and supervised by the Swedish training team at a distance from Sweden.

Another step was taken in March 1998 when 20 trainers and experts participated in a two weeks' training workshop in Ulaan Baatar. The workshop was conducted by the Swedish training team. To support the local training to be conducted by the Mongolian trainers, one Trainers Handbook and one Participants Handbook were developed under the guidance of the Swedish training team and based on the needs assessment made.

Training in the six pilot aimags took place in June–August 1998. About 150 hural members were involved, the programmes were conducted by the Mongolian team of trainers and each of them was supported by a Swedish trainer. The standard training programme includes one week's preparatory workshop, about 20 hours' fieldwork during a couple of weeks and one week's follow-up workshop.

During three weeks in April 1999 twenty new trainers from the 15 additional aimags, Ulanbaatar City and three of its districts were trained in Sweden. All 21 aimags, Ulanbaatar City and districts were then covered with basic training capacity. Training in the remaining aimags took place in June–October 1999. The total number of participants in all 21 aimags and Ulanbaatar is estimated to have been about 500.

A workshop for follow up and planning of further training was conducted in Ulaan Baatar in October 1999. This workshop was also aimed at giving further training to the aimag trainers to become “master trainers”, which implies that they are expected to conduct training of a group new trainers in their respective aimags in the beginning of 2000.

Results

In all of the aimags visited the trainer, which was often an aimag hural secretary, had conducted training for about 20 participants according to the model programme. In addition to the standard programme, the trainers had on their own conducted tailor made programmes and given information for different target groups such as soum hural members, bag governors and in some cases even bag citizens.

Participants of the standard training programme had in their turn often carried out training or information to members of the organisations to which they belong, e.g. soum hural or administration, political parties and NGO:s. In one case a teacher of an institute of technology had conducted several hours of systematised information to the students.

The interviews of the evaluation mission were expressively bent on exploring the results at the process level as well as at the content level.

Concerning the *content* of the training the following findings were noted:

- Trainers and participants in the local training programmes found the content very well suited to their needs for the time being and the near future. Judged by the field works conducted, the most relevant subjects were “legislation”, “the relationship between the functions of the governor and the aimag hural chairman” and “issues of local finances and planning”. In some of the aimags “citizen’s participation” and “gender issues” were strongly underlined as important subjects.
- The trainers and participants were generally satisfied with the well prepared training material (the handbooks for trainer and participants, and also specially prepared handouts by each trainer related to local issues and conditions in each aimag).
- The management at the regional level (aimag governors) confirmed in each of the visited aimags the relevance and adequacy of the content.

As regards the *process* of the training component the following was found:

- The training programmes were conducted with mixed groups of hural members, staff from the administration (governor’s office), political parties and NGOs. Therefore the participants had different backgrounds, professions and functions. They also came from different levels and from different parts of the aimag. Officials from the governor’s office and hural members (in general the presiding members) got time for joint discussions of their roles and regular communication.
- There was generally a good gender balance reported among participants in the training.
- Each of the trainers had successfully mastered the process of training according to the principles of action learning and participation. This was in each case confirmed by their trainees.
- The majority of the participants in the aimag training programmes seem to have carried out and completed their field works. In a few cases, participants visited only parts of the training, always under the excuse of being busy in the regular job.
- The participants were encouraged to work in groups with the field work assignments. The majority seems to have co-operated in the field works. Persons with special interests or knowledge had also got the opportunity to work individually.
- Many participants pointed out that this training was different from other training courses with regard to the process. Thanks to the participatory approach, the output seemed to be more sustainable. The methodology learnt and experienced would make it possible to carry out further training even without continuous outside assistance, they said.

Impact

The training have without any exception been used as an integrated part of the regular local development process. The content part has provided for valid technical knowledge and the process part seems to have given the participants a basic method for development work. In the field work real problems were both identified, treated and sometimes solved.

The following examples are characteristic for the effects which were commonly referred to in the interviews:

- Present legislation had been analysed from a local government perspective and proposals on amendments had been worked out. The local government assemblies (hurals) had discussed the proposals, which were thereafter brought to the Member of Parliament from the aimag and to the Cabinet Secretariat (Project Coordinating Unit).
- The relationship between the governor's office and the hural were analysed and gradually clarified.
- Strategic business plans, e.g. focused on local revenue potential, had been developed. The budgetary planning tried to focus on outputs instead of expenditures.
- The interaction in the economical planning process between the governor's office and the hurals and their officials were changing, which had impact on the quality of the budget. From having merely a monitoring function (monitoring the governor's budget) the hurals now took an active part in the planning process and the setting of development objectives for the respective areas.
- Gender aspects were much discussed and generally accepted as important. The participants noted that although there could be a fair representation of women in the aimag hural, governors and chairmen, as well as leaders in the administration, were always men. Some NGO representatives planned to exert influence systematically on political parties to make them rank women high on the candidate lists of the parties before the elections next year. Others had identified professional positions, which should be earmarked for women at next vacancy.

Conclusions

The training component has not only fulfilled the expectations concerning results, but has also had a substantial impact, in relation to the short time of project implementation, towards full filling both the project purpose and the overall objective for the project. In the aimags the initial training and its contents have been repeated and spread and several specific actions have been implemented or initiated. The Mongolian actors have made use of all the possibilities given by the project, and the Swedish consultants in the co-operation have had the sensibility to match the needs, which had led to a successful result of the training.

This success seems to be based on two main factors. One factor is the process in which the participants were stimulated to active participation. The other important factor is that the subjects of the training proved to be valid for the daily work situation of the participants. The issues of the general functioning of local governance seem to have a universal applicability in the sense that there are topics and problems in common regardless of the fundamental differences between two countries such as Mongolia and Sweden.

The one critical comment refers to the reference often made by trainers and participants to the "the Swedish model". The idea of local self-governance, as well as how it is fulfilled, is similar in the Scandinavian countries and next to what is common in all Western Europe. The model is supposed to

tell us something about the relationship between the local and central levels, about service production on account of the citizens and about democracy. It is important, however, to pay attention to the fact that the model is an ideal one. In reality it presents many problems which the Swedes and others continuously busy themselves with. The central government keeps on interfering with the local self-government and the rules of the game are not stable. There is a trend of declining interest and participation of citizens and the elected politicians have difficulties in catching the attention of their voters.

Local governments are set up both to produce services for its members and to provide for democracy, two aims that easily could be in conflict. Democracy means that different opinions should be openly displayed, which requires a slow process, while effectiveness in production calls for unity and a quick process. This conflicting nature of the reality of the local government seems to have got less attention in the training in relation to the ideal model. This focus on the ideal "Swedish model and experiences" might have been reasonable for the first phase of the cooperation. However, for the future training the problem oriented approach ought to be strengthened.

Future co-operation

Although many aimags already have taken initiatives to continue training independently of continued future support from Sweden, it is recommended that the support continues. The achievements so far are very recent and fragile and in need of consolidation. Therefore another phase of co-operation is recommended. Training Mongolian trainers to train trainers will make the competence deeper and the capacity broader. Ongoing training programmes will be more stable in their function as a general support to development of local government in Mongolia and a permanent function for coordination and follow up of training experiences need to be established. Based on the factors of participation and universal applicability mentioned above, it is recommended that the future support should stick to the same model and be carried out along the same lines as the previous phase.

The proposal from SALA/SIPU for future cooperation includes the development of specific training programmes with a technical content. The themes of these programmes are touching the most far-reaching and large-scale type of problems in Mongolia such as poverty, unemployment, energy, water supply, sanitation, primary health care, local government finance etc. Compared with the more general subjects of local governance, the technical ones have not the quality of being generally applicable. Specific development needs and problems have basically to do with the national and local situation of transition in Mongolia. It is recommended that future Swedish support is focused on promoting strategic planning and priorities, rather than on technical implementation in specific areas. In the strategic planning, the above mentioned areas and problems will be obvious themes for priorities of the local governments, within the limits of available financial resources.

The proposal for further training activities also includes joint training and study visits to Sweden of aimag hural chairpersons and aimag governors. It is recommended that this joint training has its focus on Mongolia, and that it includes interaction between the local and central government levels. This implies an integration of the proposed activities of training hural chairmen and governors with the proposed seminars for central government. This integrated activity could then include well prepared workshops in Mongolia followed by a joint study tour in Sweden.

Finally it is recommended to include regular revisions and development of the training material (hand-books for trainers and participants, etc). For example, it would be important to consider how a possible new Public Sector Management and Finance Act (see page 3 above) would influence the training material. In this connection, it is also recommended to include basic material support for training (copier, overhead projector, etc) to all aimags, similar to what was given to the pilot aimags in 1998.

3.1.2 Twinning cooperation

The *expected result* of this component is the establishment of twinning cooperations between Mongolian and Swedish local authorities, of which at least one is effective.

The twinning cooperation was initiated by a visit to Mongolia from three municipalities (Berg, Bräcke and Ragunda) in Jämtland in October 1997. In February 1998 representatives of the six pilot aimags and the Mongolian Association of Local Authorities (MALA) visited Sweden and spent most of the time in the three Jämtland municipalities. Agreements on future cooperation were then signed between Berg and Sukhbaatar aimag, Bräcke and Tov aimag and between Ragunda and Uvurhangai aimag.

In June 1999 representatives from the Swedish municipalities visited their Mongolian counterparts. During these visits the Swedes conducted seminars on Swedish experiences of local government and discussed specific themes such as; the role of local mass media (Bräcke–Tov), organisation of aimag administration (Berg–Sukhbaatar) and the development of small scale tourism industry (Ragunda–Uvurhangai). In September 1999 representatives from the three aimags visited their counterparts in Sweden. These exchange visits during 1999 have been financed outside the Capacity Building project from Sida's special fund for municipality twinning.

During the training of trainers course in Sweden in April 1999, agreements on twinning cooperation were signed between six other aimags and municipalities in Sweden (Berg – Dondgovi, Bräcke – Khovd, Ragunda – Khuvskul, Götene – Bulgan, Lidköping – Bayanhangor, Skara – Darkhan). These cooperations have so far not materialised in the form of exchange visits, as the themes of cooperation have to be specified and financial support has to be applied for.

Results and effects

The main result of the twinning component is the establishment of three cooperations where exchange visits have been performed and the initial agreement signed for six more cooperations. The representatives of twinning aimags met during the evaluation were from Uvurhangai (field visit) and Tov aimag (meeting with Hural Chairman in UB). As to effects of the twinning, both referred to the contacts with Swedish experiences as important examples and inputs for the development of local government in Mongolia.

In Uvurhangai aimag the Hural Chairman specifically mentioned the clear division of responsibilities between central and local government and the handling of proposal from citizens, that he had noted during his visit in Sweden in September. It was also important that both the hural chairman and the aimag governor had participated in the visit to Sweden, which had contributed to the understanding and implementation of interactions between the hural and the executing branch of the local government.

The Hural Chairman from Tov aimag, mentioned the formation of working groups for collecting of background information and development of proposals for decisions by the municipal council. This was a working method that had been learnt from Sweden and which was now used in the work of the hural. Examples of issues studied thoroughly by such working groups were the social situation of livestock herders and studies of sums with different basic conditions as background for allocation of poverty alleviation activities. Tov aimag has had cooperation for longer periods with municipalities in Russia, China, Japan, Korea and Germany and has presented the experiences from these cooperations to Bräcke and SALA, as basis and ideas for further twinning activities with Sweden. Together with Bräcke, Tov aimag will present a proposal to the TACIS programme of EC for a joint project on education. Another joint project regarding social care has been initially discussed.

Conclusion

From the above it could be concluded that twinning cooperations have been established and are effective based on initial contacts financed by the Capacity Building Project, and with further exchange visit activities financed by other funds. From the comments of aimag representatives it seems that the contact with Swedish experiences has contributed to the general knowledge and understanding of local government, as well as to the initiating or strengthening of some specific activities.

In view of the great differences in social and economic conditions, as well as the geographical and cultural distance between the Swedish and Mongolian municipalities, the results and initial impact of the present twinning cooperation seem reasonable in the short term perspective of the three year project period. The further development of the ongoing and recently initiated twinning cooperations will be dependent both on the interest and willingness of both partners to pursue and define areas of cooperation, and on the access to external financial support for this cooperation. It seems realistic to assume that all these cooperations would not continue actively in a longer term perspective, due to the differences mentioned above.

Future cooperation

It is recommended that general twinning cooperation should continue to be financed from Sida's special fund for twinning or other sources. However, specific study visits or other activities involving Swedish municipalities that have had some contacts in Mongolia, could be planned and financed as an integrated part of a continued support to the Capacity Building Project.

3.1.3 MALA

The formulation of expected results and indicators related to the third component of the project differs slightly between different basic documents. The evaluation mission understands the *expected result* of this component to be "the Mongolian Association of Local Government, MALA, is strengthened in its role to represent and support local government institutions".

The Mongolian Association of Local Authorities (MALA) was established as an NGO in 1995, with the overall mission to represent and support local self government institutions. All aimags and Ulaan Baatar city are members of MALA. The specific aims of the organisation are to safe guard local government interests in relation to the parliament and the central government, develop the work of the hurals, develop democracy and democratic society through promotion of citizens participation, build capacity for local government, promote exchange of experiences and research on local government and its legal framework. The main activities are annual meetings, seminars, training and information through a quarterly journal. MALA has, so far, no staff and is based on voluntary work by members of its board and others.

The support to MALA started with a visit to Sweden by a group of representatives of MALA in February 1998. During this visit an agreement of cooperation was signed with the Swedish counterpart the Swedish Association of Local Authorities, SALA. A SALA consultant has visited Mongolia in March and October 1998 to give advice on organisational developments of MALA. Seven areas of development were defined – involvement of members, relations to central government, formal organisational platform, financial base and accountability, international cooperation, external information and research, training and consultancy services.

In March 1999 three representatives of MALA visited SALA. The project has also given financial support the publishing of 3 issues of the MALA journal during 1999 and a Swedish journalist working for the SALA journal visited MALA in June 1999.

Results

The immediate results of this support and advice have been a proposal to change the statutes of MALA, including the timing of its congress to be held after the local hural elections (next in October 2000), and regarding the interaction between its members. This proposal is being presented and discussed at the annual MALA conference 24–26 November 1999. Another result is improved demand and response of the MALA journal. The training component of the project and the existence of a well trained group of master trainers is a significant asset for MALA, as basis for future joint training activities for the aimags. Following its aim to support training activities for the local governments, MALA intends to set up its own Training Centre.

Opinions from hural chairmen, governors and other representatives in the aimags visited on the field trip all stressed the importance of having a national organisation as MALA and to strengthen its capacity, which was still considered to be weak because of limited resources and staff. Specific comments expressed were that MALA ought to have a full time director; that more people from the aimags should be involved in the regular work of MALA and not only people from Ulaan Baatar; that MALA should have a permanent coordinating role for training activities, including those now supported by Sweden. It was also considered important to involve the aimag governors in MALA and not only the hural representatives. Finally it was noted that MALA had played an important role in influencing the parliament and the central government to transfer ownership and responsibility for local state assets (property) to the aimags and sums.

Conclusion

MALA is an established and clearly recognised organisation representing local self government institutions in Mongolia, although it has very limited resources and need further strengthening and development. The support to MALA has had some immediate practical results regarding its statutes and information through the quarterly journal, and for identifying areas in need of development for the future. In view of the limited resources and staff situation, these results seem reasonable in relation to the activities supported under this component. A substantially increased role for MALA as representative of, and adviser to, the local governments has to be seen in a longer term perspective, than the present project period.

Future cooperation

MALA has an important function in supporting and representing local government institutions. In view of its present limited resources and capacity, it is recommended to continue support to MALA in the form of consultancies for organisational development; as permanent coordinator of training activities for local governments (similar to the training component of the present project); and for information activities, including the MALA journal. The possibility of giving a limited financial support to staff and operational costs should also be considered. It would, however, be important to connect this kind of support to clear plan for the gradual shift of financing of these local costs to national sources of financing, such as increased member contributions and fees for services rendered.

It is not recommended to support the establishment of special MALA training centre if it involves substantial investment, as these kind of investments often have shown not to be cost-effective. Instead, MALA should be advised to invite competition for the practical organisation of training and seminar activities designed and decided by MALA.

3.1.4 Research cooperation

The *expected result* of this component is the establishment of contacts between national research institutions on local government policies and issues in Mongolia and Sweden.

Two national research and training institutions have been involved in the training component in different ways. The Institute for Administration and Management Development (IAMD) is a national research and training institute with central government funding. Representatives of IAMD's Public Administration department have been involved as trainers for pilot aimags and especially in the development of the training handbooks. This institute has earlier also been receiving Swedish support and been engaged in training of the Cabinet Secretariat supported by Sweden through SIPU.

The Local Government Development Foundation (LGDF) is an NGO established in 1995 by individual researchers, teachers, politicians and civil servants. The aim of LGDF is to promote research, analysis, discussions and training related to local government. Since 1998 the Foundation has established the Tsetsegun Management College, which gives undergraduate management training for the public and private sector. The Foundation and the College are financed through project support, fees for consulting services and revenues from publishing.

The executive director of the Foundation has been involved as trainer for pilot aimags and also as a consultant to ADB for the Institutional Strengthening and Financial administration of local governments (see under 1.3 above).

Activities under the research component of the project first started in 1999 with the selection of the University of Örebro as the Swedish partner and the Tsetsegun Management College of LGDF as the Mongolian partner. A reason for the selection of LGDF as the Mongolian partner was the fact that this organisation is not financed by, or dependent on, the central government. In June 1999, three researchers from Örebro visited the Mongolian partner and agreed on initiating a joint research cooperation. During November researchers from the Tsetsegun Management College visited Örebro for further discussions on the contents of the cooperation.

The cooperation is planned to consist of three inter linked parts. One part is training of local politicians and public servants in the aimags in evaluation and research methods in order to develop the ability to plan, follow up and evaluate political decisions in a systematic way. Another part of the cooperation is to strengthen the research organisation (LGDF) in its role to perform the training indicated. The third part of the cooperation is a joint research project as an example and test case of the methods learnt. The theme chosen for this joint project is politics and ethics. The training and other activities in the research cooperation are planned to be closely linked to the future training activities in general.

Conclusion

The expected result has been achieved in so far as a research contact has recently been established. The planned cooperation seems to be linked to the future training in general by including training in systematic follow up and evaluation in the revised training material and continued training courses. It would be a positive achievement if basic research methods and reporting could be built into the general training of politicians and public servants for local government. Although the theme for the joint research project could be complex and sensitive, it could have the advantage of promoting and establishing an open and regular discussion on the ethical aspects of local politics.

Future cooperation

It is recommended that the planned research cooperation is supported as a component of a continued Capacity Building Project, with close links to future training activities and capacity building in general,

and also as part of the dissemination of information and the promotion of discussion on important aspects of the performance of local governance.

3.1.5 Costs and cost-effectiveness

The total Swedish contribution to the project has been 6,1 MSEK, of which around 65% has been used for Swedish consultancies (107 person weeks) in Sweden and Mongolia. The other 35% of the Swedish contribution has been used for costs in Sweden for visitors from Mongolia (60 persons).

Local costs related to the training (travel and DSA for participants in training courses in UB and aimags), local consultants and translation, have been covered by UNDP in accordance with agreements with Sida, the Swedish consultants and Cabinet Secretariat. The local costs covered by UNDP have also included airfares for Mongolians visiting Sweden and costs for local travel and DSA for Swedish consultants, when outside Ulaan Baatar. In total these costs have amounted to approximately 1 MSEK, out of which 6% refers to the costs for Swedish consultants in Mongolia. UNDP had also financed salary and operating costs of the Coordinating Unit for the Decentralisation and Democracy Project, which had served as the central contact point (planning, translation, transportation, etc) for Swedish consultants in Mongolia.

Most of the aimags visited have allocated funds from their local government budgets for additional costs for the performance of the initial training and even more so in the cases where the aimag has performed its own additional training activities after the completion of the first training course supported by the project. One aimag had already allocated funds for 3 training courses during 2000. In view of the limited budgets available to the aimags, this fact is evidence of the importance attached to the training by the local government bodies.

The major cost item of the Swedish support is the costs for Swedish consultants. The unit price for this item (fee level) is given by the market situation in Sweden. Thus it is basically the volume of consultancies that has to be assessed in relation to the results in order to determine the cost-effectiveness of the support. The total 107 person weeks mentioned above divided on project management, 2 main consultants for the training component and 2 for the MALA component have to be regarded as reasonable in relation to the good results achieved.

In relation to future cooperation, it could be noted that UNDP has informed that they would not have financial possibilities to continue supporting local costs from their regular resources (other than possibly the costs of the Coordinating Unit). This implies that local costs have to be part of a continued Swedish support to the project. Due to the economic situation and the limited resources available to the Government of Mongolia, it seems reasonable to include a minimum amount of local costs in a possible future Swedish support, in order to be able to continue the project.

3.1.6 Roles and performance of the main actors

The Cabinet Secretariat, and specially the Coordinating Unit for the Decentralisation and Democracy Project, seem have played an active and supportive role in assisting the Mongolian partners and trainers, as well as Swedish consultants, in the performance of their tasks.

The work and performance of the Swedish consultants was praised by all Mongolian representatives contacted during the evaluation for being of high competence, serious and active. All assignments seem to have been very planned, prepared, implemented and followed up.

All trainers met in aimags and in Ulaan Baatar were very positive to the training as trainers, which they had been given in the project. They seemed to be very secure in their role, as well as competent and suitable, for the training task. This impression was also supported by many positive remarks about the trainers from the participants met.

Aimag Hural Chairmen and Governors met also expressed positive opinions about the importance and the effects of the training, often not only in general terms, but through specific references to the training methodology and to examples of results in the ordinary work. It seems to have been a well founded strategy to choose the trainers from central functions in the local government such as hural secretary, hural chairman, deputy governor or head of department in governors office.

The support from the UNDP office in relation to local costs and other administrative matters seemed to have been functioning well according to both UNDP and SALA/SIPU. The good results and positive acceptance of the participatory methodology of the training activities in the Capacity Building Project could, however, be further utilised for coordination and cross fertilisation with other projects, both within and a part from the Decentralisation and Democracy Project. Both this project and the Poverty Alleviation Programme would most probably have much to gain from closer contacts and coordination, as the latter programme is planned and implemented at the local level by local governments and other local actors.

Several Mongolian representatives were also positively commenting on the interest shown by Sida and Swedish Embassy staff for the progress and follow up of the project, including the contracting of the present evaluation.

3.2 Summary of conclusions

This summary is based on the findings and conclusions presented above and related to the stated objectives and expected results of the project. In this connection, it should be noted that there are some differences in the formulation and presentation of the expected results and indicators for project purpose and results between the original Project Document dated November 1995, the Decision Memo of Sida dated April 1997 and the Terms of Reference for the evaluation. Furthermore the objectives and expected results have not been reformulated in relation to the extension of the training component of the project in 1999 to all aimags of the country.

3.2.1 Activities

Based on the comments referred to in the above sections, it could be concluded that the activities performed in project, and especially those related to the main component, training, have been most relevant for achieving the results expected. The activities seem also to have been effectively prepared and performed, at reasonable costs in relation to the results achieved.

3.2.2 Results

There is clear evidence that the *training* had resulted in increased knowledge and capacity of elected local representatives and local government officials in all aimags visited. There is furthermore evidence of closer and increased cooperation between the hural and governors offices, and of a gradually increased role and influence of the hurals (presidium and committees) in the discussions and decisions, including the local budget. However, these results have to be seen within the limits set by the actual degree of decentralisation and access to financial and other resources, as well as the short time of implementation of the project.

These developments were evidenced in all of the nine aimags and districts visited, with minor variations between aimags with different geographical, social and economic conditions. The pilot aimags seemed to be slightly more advanced due to the fact that they had been able to conduct a second training course this year (without project support), and also because they had had longer time for developing and implementing new proposals and ways of working. Based on the above it could be expected that the results and effects would be similar in the rest of aimags in the country and that the expected results of the training component have been well achieved.

Nine *twinning* cooperations have been initiated and three had resulted in exchange visits. There are also evidence of that these exchange visits have contributed to the understanding and increased knowledge of role and performance of local government. It could therefore be concluded that the expected result of the twinning component has been achieved and has had some effect so far.

The direct results of the support to *MALA*, so far, are improvement of its statutes and of information through its quarterly journal, as well as the identification of areas in need of development for the future. In view of its limited resources and staff situation, a strengthened role for *MALA*, as representative of, and adviser to, the local governments has to be seen in a longer term perspective, than the present project period.

The expected result of the *research* cooperation has been achieved in so far as a contact has been established. The planned cooperation seems to be linked to the future training in general by including training in systematic follow up and evaluation in the revised training material and continued training courses. It would be a positive achievement if basic research methods and reporting could be built into the general training of politicians and public servants for local government. Although the theme for the joint research project could be complex and sensitive, it could have the advantage of promoting and establishing an open and regular discussion on the ethical aspects of local politics.

3.2.3 Impact

The *general impact* of the project is limited by the fact that the main part of activities regarding training and consultancies have taken place since the middle of 1998, and for the majority of aimags since the middle of 1999. However, as shown under section 3.1.1 above, a main impact of the training has been the positive response and understanding of the importance of participatory methods, to be used in different forms of training, but also as a method for daily work contacts in local government offices and for the involvement of citizens, which is important from a general point of view of promoting democratic values. Furthermore there is evidence of several specific actions, proposals and decisions taken as a consequence of the training.

Regarding the impact of the training from a *gender* perspective, it could be noted that there has been a good gender balance among the participants in the training itself. Gender has furthermore been a theme in the training and several participants have worked on this theme in their training field works. Specific effects of this work have been the mobilisation of women candidates for the local elections next year and the designation of posts within the local government administrations that in a medium term perspective should be filled by women.

The process of establishing local governments and introducing *decentralisation in Mongolia* has only been going on for 6–7 years. Independently of the possible variations in central political will and action, the relevance of the Capacity Building Project for this process seems high. This is due to fact that the training activities of the project have been able to strengthen the knowledge and capacity of local government representatives and staff in their contacts with the central government institutions, which is fundamental for the balance of power between the central and local levels of society and for the development of democracy.

There is already some evidence of the *sustainable effects* of the project in so far as several aimags have conducted further training and allocated resources on their own initiative. Some has also declared that they would continue these training activities with or without further support. The conclusion of the evaluation is, however, that the long term sustainability of capacity building for local government has not yet been achieved. This refers mainly to the understanding and willingness of central government institutions to accept and support local self government and also to the role and capacity of MALA to represent and give support to its members.

3.3 Summary of recommendations for future cooperation

Although many aimags already have taken initiatives to continue *training* independently of continued future support from Sweden, it is recommended that the support continues. The achievements so far are very recent and fragile and in need of consolidation. Therefore another phase of co-operation is recommended. Training Mongolian trainers to train trainers will make the competence deeper and the capacity broader. Ongoing training programmes will be more stable in their function as a general support to development of local government in Mongolia and a permanent function for coordination and follow up of training experiences need to be established.

It is recommended that the future support should stick to the same model and be carried out along the same lines as the previous phase, based on the factors of participation and universal applicability mentioned under conclusions above. It is further recommended to integrate training of governors and hural chairmen with representatives of the central government institutions.

Based on the fact that there are already three *twinning* cooperations established and nine more initiated, it is recommended that future twinning cooperation should be financed from Sida's special fund for twinning or other sources. However, specific study visits or other activities involving Swedish municipalities that have had some contacts in Mongolia, could be planned and financed as an integrated part of a continued support to the Capacity Building Project.

In view of its important function in supporting and representing local government institutions, but its present limited resources and capacity, it is recommended to continue support to *MALA* in the form of consultancies for organisational development, training and information activities, including the *MALA* journal. The possibility of giving a limited financial support to staff and operational costs should also be considered. It is not recommended to support the establishment of special *MALA* training centre. Instead, *MALA* should be advised to invite competition for the practical organisation of training and seminar activities designed and decided by *MALA*.

Future support to the planned *research* cooperation is recommended, as part of the next phase of the Capacity Building with close links to future training activities and capacity building in general, and also as part of the dissemination of information and the promotion of discussion on important aspects of the performance of local governance.

3.4 Comment on the proposed energy project

In relation to the Capacity Building Project a separate support has been proposed by *SALA*, with the aim of improving energy savings in the Zavkhan aimag. There are references to similarities in climate between Sweden and Mongolia and the dependence on houses with good insulation, efficient heating systems and reliable electricity utilities. There is also a reference to the experiences of energy saving

programmes conducted by the Swedish municipalities in the seventieth. The proposal includes the following activities:

- Energy analyses.
- Small scale activities to lower energy costs for schools and health clinics.
- Development of a group of Local Energy Advisors.
- Feasibility study for construction of a pilot Sida school building by a Swedish house construction company.
- Handbook on small scale energy savings.
- Replication programmes.

The situation perceived by the evaluation mission after the visit to the Zavkhan aimag centre, Uliastai, was that the heating was based on obsolete and deteriorated Russian coal burning technology. More than 70% of the energy is lost in the production and distribution process. The supply of coal for the coming winter was insufficient. Because of rationing of fuel there had been a severe lack of means of transport. There are no real roads to this town and the possibilities to transport coal in wintertime seem to be limited. The inhabitants can not afford to pay the fees for heating because of poverty. Since the producers do not get paid they can not maintain the plants and the installations or invest in modern technology.

As an illustration of the situation, we experienced the following during our night's stay in Uliastai. A short stop of the electricity generating diesel engine caused the circulation pump to stop. The pipes were soon frozen and the radiators in a housing block burst, when the hot water came on again. Unfortunately, small scale activities to save energy, energy advisers and a handbook will only contribute marginally to solve this basic problem.

The conclusion of the evaluation mission is that the proposed energy project is not relevant in Zavkhan. An alternative, and possibly more efficient, way of supporting improvement of the energy situation seems to be ongoing components in the Poverty Alleviation Programme dealing with energy problems. These components equip schools with stoves which can be fuelled with dung and other stuff available, and offer a isolating materials for the construction of new hospital (straw bale).

4. Lessons learned

The main lesson learned from this project is the mutually reinforcing factors of the process and content of the training. Learning about local democracy has been promoted through basic democratic methods, as shown by the following facts:

- The training has been arranged in balance with the ongoing political and administrative transition process (political will, laws and regulations).
- The participatory method of performing project activities has been well accepted and proved to be a model also for regular work (active learning, personal responsibility, cooperation the common interest, equality between men and women, etc).
- The systematic approach of training of trainers and participants, who continue to spread and disseminate information and knowledge acquired.
- The subjects of the training and the Swedish experiences presented have been highly relevant and of strategic importance in contributing basic competence in response to actual needs of the participants, independently of the great differences between the two countries.

Annex 1

Terms of Reference for the evaluation of Sida's support to capacity building for local self governance in Mongolia.

1 Background

In 1991 the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida)/BITS started to cooperate with Mongolia within the public administration sector. The cooperation has mainly taken place within the extensive management programme “the Mongolian Management Development Programme (MMDP)” supported by UNDP. The programme is of strategic importance in Mongolia's efforts towards the creation of a democratic development and introduction of a market economy. The programme, which started 1994, is to be implemented during a five year period. The total budget is USD 17 millions. UNDP has the coordinating role.

The MMDP is divided into six sub-programmes, where each sub-programme consists of several sub-projects. The formal request for Swedish support to the *sub-project* “*Capacity-building for Local Self Governance*” was submitted to Sida in October 1995.

In April 1997 Sida decided to finance consultancy services during a period of 2 years. Totally SEK 6 110 400 were set aside for the project. The Swedish consultants Svenska Kommunförbundet and SIPU International were contracted for the implementation of the project in six aimags (pilot aimags). In April 1999 Mongolia's remaining 15 aimags and Ulaan Bataar City were included in the project (extended pilot aimags).

2 Purpose and Scope of the Evaluation

Sida has a general responsibility to monitor and report on how its funds are used. Any major cooperation should, according to Sida's policy, be subject to some kind of evaluation.

Another reason for this evaluation is that a preliminary request for financing continued assistance has informally been submitted to Sida. In order to be able to consider further support, Sida needs an assessment of the past/on-going cooperation as well as information about the present situation for local self governance in Mongolia.

The evaluation, which will be executed during the final stage of the on-going project implementation, shall analyse the results of the project and its impact on the development of the democratic process in Mongolia.

The findings and recommendations made during the evaluation will be used by Sida when discussing a potential continued support with the Mongolian authorities and potential Swedish consultants.

3 The Assignment

The evaluation consists of three parts. The *first* shall focus on the results of the project, the *second* shall analyse the impact of the project and the *third* shall, on the basis of the evaluation of results, impact, conclusions and the draft proposal for a continued cooperation, discuss the feasibility of continued collaboration between Sweden and Mongolia.

Target group

The target group for the project consists of selected members of the local government (Khural) in the six pilot territorial units (aimags) and the fifteen later added aimags and Ulaan Bataar City. The beneficiaries are the local people in the 22 territorial units.

3.1 Evaluation of activities, project purpose and results of the past/on-going project.

The Consultant shall make a thorough review of the Swedish assistance to the project “Capacity-building for Local Self Governance in Mongolia”, in which Svenska Kommunförbundet och SIPU are the implementing consultants and Cabinet Secretariat in Ulaan Bataar is the Client.

Background description

The Consultant shall start his report by giving a background description of:

- the institutional structure, including roles and responsibilities, for local self governance in Mongolia
- the project; its objectives, purposes and planned results
- other donors’ activities within the local governance sector.

Evaluation of Activities

When evaluating the activities the Consultant shall primarily verify whether the activities were performed according to plan and if not, which were the reasons for not doing so.

The Consultant shall:

- analyse if the activities were relevant for achieving planned results
- analyse the efficiency of the twinning model
- if possible, estimate the contributions made by the project participants to the project but which are not covered by the project budget
- the project’s efficiency in providing the target groups with adequate training, consultancy, manuals and documents for extended local self governance
- the efficiency of the project implementation. The fulfilment of the roles and responsibilities of the parties involved, i.e the Mongolian parts, the Swedish consultants and UNDP
- the cost-effectiveness of the project activities carried out
- the efficiency of having local costs covered by UNDP (co-financing)

Evaluation of Results

Planned results (for the six pilot projects)	Sources of verification
1. Activities and expenditures of the resp Govonor's office in cooperating aimags are open for scrutiny by the Khurals at least quaterly and the Khural's findings are made public at least annually. 2. National support organizations are formally engaged as advisory bodies to the Khural in planning and monitoring to government activities of at least 50% of the cooperating aimags. 3. The Khurals in 50% of the cooperating aimags are capable of providing logical and substantive comments on the preparation, review and monitoring of the local government budget. 4. Locally applicable public service production standards are applied in an open and transparent manner in at least 25% of the cooperating aimags.	1. Publications been published. 2. Contracts with civil society organizations or other proof of them being used. 3. Written documentation of their comments and the effects of this on the Governor's office. 4. Written documentation.

Aimag = Territorial unit/province

Khural = Local government

3.2 Evaluation of the impact

The issue of impact is reflected in the **overall objective** of the project: *"The policies and pratices of the Government of Mongolia enable territorial units to take increasingly greater control over their own development decision making and resource mobilization, resulting in a significant positive impact on sustainable development in Mongolia"*.

The **project objectives** are to strengthen the capacity of selected local self-governance institutions and national self-governance support institutions (NGOs etc).

Project purpose

Planned project purpose
By the end of the project, Khural of six aimags shall be capable of making rational, independant decisions on matters of economic and social life in their resp territorial unit.

It is recognised that it is still too early to evaluate impact in a more careful way. But it is nevertheless of interest to explore the issue to the extent possible.

When evaluating the Consultant shall assess the impact and give the reasons for high/low achievement of goals regarding i.a. organizational, administrative, financial, institutional and other factors.

The Consultant shall assess:

- the achievement of objectives as defined in the contract and in Sida payment approval
- the project impact on the target groups from a gender specific view
- the project's relevance for the Mongolian decentralisation process.
- the side-effects, positive and/or negative effects, which were not foreseen during the planning phase of the project.
- the conditions for sustainable effects of the project.

3.3 Lessons learned and recommendations for the future

Based on findings from the evaluation of the achievement of the objectives, the Consultant shall assess the need for further cooperation in the sector between Sweden and Mongolia. If the Consultant find such a need, they shall prepare a set of recommendations regarding purpose and orientation of the cooperation, a suitable mode of organization of the cooperation, identify parties for the cooperation and their division of labour. When analyzing lessons learned, the Consultant shall in particular look into the requirements for sustainability of the local self governance. The Consultant shall also discuss to what extent any future cooperation can contribute to enhancing the prospects for sustainability.

4. Review of the preliminary project proposal for continued cooperation

The Consultant shall collect information from the Mongolian parties about their opinion regarding the direction of a possible future cooperation.

The Consultant shall thereafter review the draft project proposal for continued cooperation and identify priority issues and needs with regard to:

- proposed long and short term objectives
- organizational strengths and weaknesses of the concerned Mongolian institutions
- foreseen tangible results and long term development effects
- impact on the democratisation process
- need for coordination with both relevant Mongolian institutions in the field and other donors
- relevance and potential impact of the transfer of knowledge from Swedish inputs
- possibilities for cost-sharing in a future project.

Based on the above findings, the Consultant shall give Sida recommendations regarding support to a future project and, if relevant, suggest improvements of the draft proposal with regard to project objectives, organization, activities and other aspects on the project design with the aim of reaching the best possible development effect.

5 Methodology, Evaluation Team and Time Schedule

5.1 Methodology

The Evaluation shall be based on:

- project documentation available at Sida, Svenska Kommunförbundet, SIPU International and UNDP/Ulaan Bataar
- visit to two pilot project areas in Mongolia; Khovd, and Uvurkhangai
- visit to six extended project areas: Darkan-UUL, Orhon, Bulgan, Bayanhongor, Gobi-Altai and Ulaan Bataar/Sukhbataar District
- interviews with related personnel and beneficiaries in the selected project areas
- interviews with related personnel at Cabinet Secretariat, Ulaan Bataar
- interviews with UNDP, Mongolia

5.2 Evaluation team

Sida will contract a consultancy company for carrying out the evaluation. The expert team will consist of two persons. The team leader shall have considerable experience as team manager.

The team shall have expertise with the competence in:

- Development Economics
- Cost-benefit Analysis
- Human Resource Development
- Risk Assessment and Vulnerability in a country in transition
- Institutional Development

5.3 Time Schedule

The total time for the mission in Mongolia is estimated to six to seven man-weeks and reporting (Sweden) is estimated to maximum three man-weeks.

Due to project activities abroad and to the coming winter the evaluation shall take place in November 1999.

6 Reporting

Before leaving Mongolia the Consultant shall present in writing his preliminary findings and recommendations to the Cabinet Secretariat and, if possible, to the concerned Local Governments.

The evaluation report shall be written in English and should not exceed 30 pages, excluding annexes. Format and outline of the report shall follow the guidelines in *Sida Evaluation Report – a Standardized Format* (see Annex 1). Five copies of the draft report shall be submitted to Sida no later than 20 December 1999. Sida and the Cabinet Secretariat will comment the draft report at the latest 30 January, 2000. Within 2 weeks after receiving Sida's and the cabinet Secretariat's comments on the draft report, a final version in 5 copies and on diskette shall be submitted to Sida. Subject to decision by Sida, the report will be published and distributed as a publication within the Sida Evaluations series. The evaluation report shall be written in Word 6.0 for Windows (or in a compatible format) and should be presented in a way that enables publication without further editing.

The evaluation assignment includes the production of a Newsletter summary following the guidelines in *Sida Evaluations Newsletter – Guidelines for Evaluation Managers and Consultants* (Annex 2) and also the completion of *Sida Evaluations Data Work Sheet* (Annex 3). The separate summary and a completed Data Work Sheet shall be submitted to Sida along with the final report.

Contact addresses:

1. **Cabinet Secretariat**

Government of Mongolia

Att: Mr R Rinchinbazar, Deputy Chief of Cabinet
State House
ULAAN BAATAR-12

Tel: 00-976-1-32 64 54

Fax: 00-976-1-31 00 11

E-mail: rinchinbazar@prime.pmis.gov.mn

Project Office

Tel/fax: 00-976-1-32 03 42

2. **Svenska Kommunförbundet**

Att: Björn Jonzon
Stora Brännbo Kursgård AB
Box 65
193 22 SIGTUNA

Tel: 08/592 501 05

Fax: 08/592 553 19

E-mail: bjorn.jonzon@stora.brannbo.se

3. **SIPU International**

Att: Leif Wisén
Torsgatan 4
Box 70 338
107 23 STOCKHOLM

Tel: 08/698 06 00

Fax: 08/698 06 10

E-mail: leif.wisen@sipu.se

4. **UNDP**

7, Erkhuu Street
P O Box 49/207
ULAAN BAATAR

Mr Douglas Gardner, UNDP Res Repr

Tel: 00-976-1-32 15 39, 32 01 40

Fax: 00-976-1-32 62 21

E-mail: douglas.gardner@undp.org

Annex 2

List of documents

Evaluation of Swedish Support to Capacity Building for Local Self Governance in Mongolia

- Project Profile for Sida assistance to Capacity Building for Self-Governance in Mongolia, Government of Mongolia & UNDP, November 1995.
- Sida Decision Memo "Mongoliet: Lokal Demokrati (MNG 0141)", 1997-04-02.
- Agreement on Cooperation between Mongolia and Sweden on Capacity Building for Self-Governance in Mongolia (SALA – Ministry of Finance), 1997-05-29.
- Agreement on Cooperation between the Government of Mongolia, UNDP and SALA within the framework of "Decentralisation and Democracy Support" (cost sharing), 1998-03-17.
- Revised Plan of Operation, Capacity Building for Self-Governance in Mongolia, SALA/SIPU, 1998-10-27.
- Report from Training of Trainers Workshops in Sweden October/November 1997,
- SALA/SIPU
- Progress report Capacity Building for Self-Governance in Mongolia, SALA/SIPU, 1998-03-06.
- Report from in six pilot aimags August 1998, SALA/SIPU
- Report from Training of Trainers Workshops in Ulaan Baatar October/November 1998,
- SALA/SIPU
- Trainers Handbook, Participants Handbook, 1998 (in Mongolian language)
- Instructions for Training Sessions, SALA/SIPU, 1999-04-16.
- Progress report Capacity Building for Self-Governance in Mongolia, SALA/SIPU, 1999-10-27.
- Proposed continuation of Capacity Building for Self-Governance in Mongolia, SALA/SIPU, 1999-10-27.
- Development of Sustainable Local Heating Energy Applications, SALA/SIPU, 1999-10-27.
- Human Development Report, Mongolia, 1997.
- Review Report, Decentralisation and Democracy Support Project, UNDP, December 1998.
- Draft Public Sector Management and Finance Act, Government of Mongolia, July 1999 (after first reading in Parliament).
- Independent Evaluation of the National Poverty Alleviation Programme in Mongolia, Government of Mongolia/UNDP/World Bank, October 1999.

- Evaluation of the Governance and Economic Transition Projects in Mongolia, Government of Mongolia/UNDP, October 1999.
- Mongolia in Transition, Nordic Institute of Asian Studies, 1996.
- Lonely Planet, Mongolia, 1997.

Annex 3

Programme for Sida Evaluation 3–24 november 1999 of capacity building for local self government in Mongolia

Wednesday 3 Nov. '99 16.30	Arrival to Ulaan Baatar.	
Thursday 4 Nov. '99 9.30	Meeting with Mr. R.Rinchinbazar, NPD, Deputy Chief, Cabinet Secretariat, GoM	Interpreter at all meetings and during the field trip Ms Zolzaya, administrative assistant, DDSP
11.00	Meeting with Mr. Douglas Gardner, RR,UNDP	
14.00	Meeting with UB city hural, Mr.Manaljav Executive Director MALA	
15.30	Meeting with Mr. Enhbayar, Suhbaatar district hural chairman (MT) and with other local government representatives	
Friday 5 Nov. '99 10.00	Meeting with Mr. Dorgorjav, IAMD lecturer.	
14.00	Meeting with Ms. Doljinjav, Executive Director, Local Governance Development Foundation, research institute engaged in the project.	
Saturday 6 Nov. '99	Preparation for the field trip	
Sunday 7 Nov. '99 07.00	Departure from Ulaanbaatar	210 km
11.00	Arrival in Darkhan-Uul aimag. Meeting with Ms. Tsengelsaihan, aimag Hural secretary (MT), with Governor and with participants.	
14.00	Departure to Orhon aimag.	180 km
16.30	Arrival to Erdenet city, Orhon aimag.	

Monday 8 Nov. '99 8.00	Orhon aimag. Meeting with Ms. Altantuya, Human resource manager, Governors office (MT), with Chairman aimag hural and with participants.	
13.00	Departure to Bulgan aimag.	
16.30	Arrival in Bulgan aimag. Meeting with Mr. Dagvadas, aimag hural secretary (MT), with Chairman and Governor and with participants.	68 km
Tuesday 9 Nov. '99 8.00	Departure to Gurvanbulag soum. Visit to livestock herders ger.	
11.30	Meeting with Chairman and Governor of Gurvanbulag soum.	
13.00	Departure to Uvurhangai aimag.	
17.00	Arrival in Arvaykheer, Uvurhangai aimag. Meeting with Mr. Baatar, hural secretary (MT).	450 km
Wednesday 10 Nov. '99 9.00	Uvurhangai aimag (pilot aimag). Visit to Citizen Information Centre. Meeting with hural Chairman and Governor and with participants.	
11.00	Departure to Bayankhongor aimag. Stop in Nariyintel soum, meeting hural secretary.	
19.30	Arrival in Bayanhongor aimag.	200 km
Thursday 11 Nov. '99 09.00	Meeting with Mr. Buuvei, hural secretary (MT) and with participants. Visit to aimag hospital.	
13.00	Departure to Gobi-Altai aimag.	
17.30	Arrival in Buutsegaan soum (accommodation in soum hural session room).	180 km
Friday 12 Nov. '99 08.00	Departure from Buutsegaan soum.	
12.30	Arrival in Gobi-Altai aimag.	190 km
14.30	Meeting with Ms. Ivshnhorol, Aimag hural secretary, with Governor and with participants.	

Saturday 13 Nov. '99 08.30	Departure to Zavhan aimag.	
14.00	Arrival in Uliastai, Zavhan aimag. Meeting with Mr Ganbold, Deputy Governor (MT), with participants and with Chairman and Governor.	195 km
Sunday 14 Nov. '99 09.00	Visit to local coal boiler for heating.	
10.00	Departure to Tosontsengel soum.	
14.30	Arrival to Tosontsengel soum.	180 km
Monday 15 Nov. '99 09.00	Departure to Tsetserleg, Arkhangai aimag.	
17.00	Arrival to Tsetserleg.	350 km
Tuesday 16 Nov. '99 09.30	Departure to Ulaan Baatar.	
12.00	Visit Erdene Zuu monastery.	490 km
18.30	Arrival to Ulaan Baatar.	Total 2.700 km
Wednesday 17 Nov. '99	Internal work, report writing.	
Thursday 18 Nov. '99	Internal work, report writing.	
Friday 19 Nov. '99 10.00	Meeting with Ms Pagma, Director a.i. and A Menamkat, Programme advisor, National Poverty Alleviation Pro- gramme	
11.30	Meeting with Ms. Oyunbileg, National Project Coordinator, DDSP	
14.00	Meeting with Mr Douglas Gardner, RR, and Mr Tserendorj, Programme Officer, UNDP	
16.00	Meeting with Mr Dondog, Hural Chairman, Tov aimag	
Monday 22 Nov. '99 10.00	Debriefing meeting with Mr. R. Rinchinbazar, NPD, DDSP	
14.30	Debriefing meeting with, Mr. Manaljav, Executive Director MALA	
Tuesday 23 Nov. '99 12.00	Meeting with Ms Narantuya, Entity coordinator, Public Administration and Reform Project, GoM	
Wednesday 24 Nov. '99 10.30	Departure	

Annex 4

Budget follow up capacity building for local self government in Mongolia 1997–1999

Budget SALA 1997-09-09

Disbursements report SALA per 1999-12-07

(TSEK)

<i>Component</i>	<i>Budget 1997–1999</i>	<i>Utiliz. 1997–1999</i>
Training	2 797	2 352
Fees	1 757	1 725 (58 weeks)
Reimbursables	1 040	627
Twinning	1 436	1 442
Fees	214	220 (7 weeks)
Reimbursables	1 222	1 222
MALA	921	815
Fees	665	665 (22 weeks)
Reimbursables	256	150
Research	200	177
Fees	200	145 (5 weeks)
Reimbursables		32
Project management	756	597
Fees		
Reimbursables	369	225 (7,5 weeks)
	387	372
TOTAL	6 110	5 747
Fees	3 205	3 222 (107 weeks)
Reimbursables	2 905	2 525

Recent Sida Evaluations

- 99/24 Sweden's Assistance to Bosnia Herzegovina. A study of aid management and related policy issues. Claes Sandgren
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 99/25 Psychiatry Reform in Eastern Europe. Nils Öström
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 99/26 Sida Projects in the Forestry Sector in Poland. Kristina Flodman Becker, Roland Öquist
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 99/27 FARMESA. Farm-level applied research methods in Eastern and Southern Africa. Clive Lighthfoot, William W Wapakala, Bo Tengnäs
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 99/28 The African Association of Universities (AAU) Study Programme on Higher Education Management in Africa. Ad Boeren, Jairam Reddy
Department for Research Cooperation, SAREC
- 99/29 Apoyo al Programa Nacional Indigena en Bolivia. Lars Eriksson, Maria Cristina Mejia, Maria del Pilar Sanchez
Department for Latin America
- 99/30 Support to the Micro-finance Sector in Bolivia. Lars-Olof Hellgren, Leonel Roland
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 99/31 Proyecto VNU Promotores del la Paz en Guatemala. Kristina Boman, Göran Schill, Eberto de León
Department for Latin America
- 99/32 Programme Assistance to Mozambique. A joint donors review. Grayson Clarke, Jens Claussen, Rolf Kappel, Jytte Laursen, Stefan Sjölander
Department for Africa
- 99/33 Technical Assistance to the Ministry of Planning and Finance in Mozambique. Dag Aarnes, Svein Jørgensen
Department for Africa
- 99/34 PROSERBI. Integrated basic services program in Nicaragua. Elisabeth Lewin, Kristina Boman, Marta Medina
Department for Latin America
- 99/35 The Regional Water and Sanitation Group for Eastern and Southern Africa. Åke Nilsson, Knust Samset, Ron Titus, Mark Mujwahu, Björn Brandberg
Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
- 99/36 Support to Collaboration between Universities. An evaluation of the collaboration between MOI University, Kenya, and Linköping University, Sweden. Beht Maina Ahlberg, Eva Johansson, Hans Rosling
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 99/37 Support to Education and Training Unit in South Africa. Annica Lysén
Department for Africa

Sida Evaluations may be ordered from:

Infocenter, Sida
S-105 25 Stockholm
Phone: (+46) 8 795 23 44
Fax: (+46) 8 760 58 95
info@sida.se

A complete backlist of earlier evaluation reports may be ordered from:

Sida, UTV, S-105 25 Stockholm
Phone: (+46) 8 698 5099
Fax: (+46) 8 698 5610
Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>



SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY

S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden

Tel: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Fax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64

Telegram: sida stockholm. Postgiro: 1 56 34-9

E-mail: info@sida.se. Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>