

Sida Projects in the Forestry Sector in Poland

**Kristina Flodman Becker
Roland Öquist**

**Department for Central and
Eastern Europe**

Sida Projects in the Forestry Sector in Poland

Kristina Flodman Becker
Roland Öquist

Sida Evaluation 99/26

**Department for Central and
Eastern Europe**

Evaluation Reports may be ordered from:

Infocenter, Sida
S-105 25 Stockholm
Telephone: (+46) (0)8 795 23 44
Telefax: (+46) (0)8 760 58 95
E-mail: info@sida.se, Homepage <http://www.sida.se>

Authors: Kristina Flodman Becker, Roland Öquist.

The views and interpretations expressed in this report are the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Sida.

Sida Evaluation 99/26
Commissioned by Sida, Department for Central and Eastern Europe

Copyright: Sida and the authors

Registration No.: öst-1998-02736
Date of Final Report: June 1999
Printed in Stockholm, Sweden 1999
ISBN 91 586 7827 1
ISSN 1401-0402

SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY

Address: S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden. Office: Sveavägen 20, Stockholm
Telephone: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Telefax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64
Telegram: sida stockholm. Postgiro: 1 56 34-9
E-mail: info@sida.se. Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>

Table of contents

1	Background	1
2	The scope of work of the evaluation mission	1
3	Evaluation methods	2
4	The context of Swedish support to the Polish forestry related sector	2
5	Project descriptions and analyses	3
	5.1 Planning of Afforestation Structure at Regional and Local Administration Levels	3
	5.2 Polish-Swedish Co-operation in Trade and Marketing	5
	5.3 Financial and Accounting Control Systems	6
	5.4 Sawmill Training	8
	5.5 Waste Paper Seminar	10
	5.6 The Development of Polish Forestry Staff	11
	5.7 Education and Training in Production of Containerised Seedlings	12
6	Analysis	14
	6.1 Project identification	14
	6.2 Project initiation	14
	6.3 Project objectives	15
	6.4 Project implementation and monitoring	16
	6.5 Project completion	17
7	Summary of main recommendations and conclusions	20
Appendix 1	Terms of Reference	22
Appendix 2	List of persons met	25
Appendix 3	Summary of project assessments	27

1 Background

The Swedish Board for Investment and Technical Support (BITS) and subsequently Sida's Department for Eastern and Central Europe (Sida Öst) have supported seven (7) technical assistance projects in the forestry related sector in Poland between 1995 and 1998. Technically, however, the number of supported projects is ten (10) as one project consists of three (3) phases and one of two (2) phases.

The projects are as follows:

1. Planning of Afforestation Structure at Regional and Local Administration Levels (3 phases); the Swedish consultant is Satellitbild AB and the Polish counterpart is Instytut Badawczy Lesnictwa (IBL).
2. Polish-Swedish Co-operation in Trade and Marketing; the consultant is Swedforest/ Scandiaconsult and the counterpart is the State Forests Organisation.
3. Financial and Accounting Control Systems; the consultant is Jaakko Pöyry AB and the counterpart is the State Forests Organisation.
4. Sawmill Training (2 phases); the consultant is Stiftelsen Skog och Trä and the counterpart is the Polish Economic Chamber of Wood Industry (PECWI).
5. Waste Paper Seminar; the consultant is ÅF (Ångpanneföreningen)-IPK and the counterpart is the Polish Papermakers Association (PPMA).
6. Development of Polish Forestry Staff; the consultant is Kungliga Skogs- och Lantbruksakademien and the counterpart is the Forestry Faculty of the Agricultural University of Poznan.
7. Education and Training in Production of Containerised Seedlings The consultant is Björkemmar Construction and Consulting AB (BCC) and the counterpart is Nedze Nursery, the Regional Directorate of State Forests.

The total contribution of these projects is approximately 12.8 million SEK.

2 The scope of work of the evaluation mission

Sida's Plan of Operations of 1997 stated that these projects were to be evaluated during 1998. In February 1999, Sida commissioned two consultants to perform this evaluation: Ms Kristina Flodman Becker, Economist, as the team leader, and Mr Roland Öquist, Senior Forest Economist. The scope of work of the mission is defined in the attached Terms of Reference (Appendix 1). The evaluation will encompass the years 1994–1998. Two of the projects, i.e. Sawmill Training as well as Education and Training in Production of Containerised Seedlings, are still ongoing. The Terms of Reference of the evaluation mission are attached as Appendix 1.

3 Evaluation methods

In order to perform the evaluation, we have read the project agreements, all BITS and Sida decisions, project documents, project reports and final reports. We have interviewed all the Swedish consultants in Sweden as well as all the Polish counterparts in Poland. The list of persons met is attached as Appendix 2. As the evaluation includes seven separate projects and as the time available for the evaluation has been limited, we have only been able to interview 3–4 people for each project. Nevertheless, we are confident that the information that we have collected is sufficient for a relevant analysis.

The project descriptions of the evaluation include project objectives, expected and achieved results, relevance and project impact. All objectives are taken from the BITS/Sida decisions and/or from the project agreements. The results have been established through interviews and project reports. The conclusions regarding relevance and impact of the projects are mainly to be attributed to the evaluation team. A summary of the project descriptions is attached as Appendix 3.

There is some confusion in the project documents regarding the use of terms. Objectives are confused with activities or results are confused with effects. The inadequate use of terms becomes a problem when performing an evaluation. We have, when deemed necessary, attempted to clarify which objectives actually prevail and evaluated the projects according to those perceived objectives.

4 The context of Swedish support to the Polish forestry related sector

The “Programme of Development of Selected Forestry Branches and Protection of Ecosystems in National Parks in the Years 1993–1997” was a programme financed by The World Bank and the European Investment Bank. The total contribution amounted to 335.3M US\$ and the World Bank contribution was 163M US\$. The loan agreements were signed at the end of 1993. In 1996, the World Bank loan was reduced to 104 M US\$.

In 1994, BITS was approached by the World Bank with enquiries regarding possible funding by BITS. Some of the potential projects were identified in February 1994 in a study by Lars Erik Martens commissioned by BITS, “Poland – Definition and Evaluation of Four Forestry Project Proposals”. The projects identified do not exactly correspond to implemented projects, but the report has in principle identified the following projects: Planning of Afforestation Structure at Regional and Local Administration Levels; the Polish-Swedish Co-operation in Trade and Marketing; the Financial and Accounting Control Systems project.

BITS initially financed the Planning of Afforestation Structure and the Sawmill Training projects. When BITS was merged into Sida in July 1995, Sida took over the financing of these projects. Sida has financed the remaining five projects. Agreements for all projects were concluded between 1995 and 1997.

State Forests is a Government Organisation responsible for all government-owned forests in Poland, i.e. 80% of all forest land. It comprises the national General Directorate, 17 regional directorates, 438 forest districts as well as a number of special task institutions such as the forestry research institute IBL. The State Forests Organisation employs approximately 70 000 people and is a self-financing unit. State Forests is the direct counterpart in three of the projects and all evaluated projects are somehow connected to the State Forests Organisation.

5 Project descriptions and analyses

5.1 Planning of Afforestation Structure at Regional and Local Administration Levels

This project was identified in the Martens study and initially financed by BITS. It subsequently became included in the World Bank programme mentioned above. The project was initiated by Instytut Badawczy Lesnictwa (IBL), the Polish Forestry Research Institute. IBL is a research institute belonging to the Ministry of Environmental Protection, Natural Resources and Forestry and gives scientific support to the State Forests Organisation. IBL requested assistance from Satellitbild AB for the implementation of the project, as IBL had successfully co-operated with Satellitbild AB in the beginning of the 1990's. Thereafter, a study of the project was developed jointly by IBL and Satellitbild AB.

The joint proposal was sent to BITS and approved, after some amendments, in April 1995. The agreement between IBL and Satellitbild AB was signed in May 1995. The implementation has been divided into three phases and the project was concluded in December 1998. The total Sida contribution is 3.95 million SEK.

The *objective* as formulated in the initial BITS decision is that the project should establish methods for reforestation of abandoned agricultural land, with respect to the environmental and social characteristics of the Polish-Baltic region.

The *agreement* lists ten main "aims" that more specifically describe the techniques to be used. The objective is, according to our interpretation, to use satellite images for the production of land use maps, including forests and areas for reforestation or afforestation. It is noteworthy that the objective stated in the Sida decision makes no reference to the use of satellite images.

The planned activities were to produce land maps on a scale of 1:200 000 during phase I, of 1:100 000 during phase II and on scale of 1:25 000 during phase III. In addition, IBL key staff would receive on-the-job training by Satellitbild in Sweden on the interpretation of satellite images and how to use these results to create a database with Geographical Information System (GIS) technology. Finally, eight Polish specialists would be trained on forest management and the use of GIS (Geographic Information Systems) in planning and monitoring work. *The expected result* was the creation of a database for environmental and economic planning for the Polish Baltic Sea Region that would provide the basis for an operational afforestation model, both on regional and district levels.

During the first project period between June and December 1995, Satellitbild began to elaborate a database using the Geographic Information System (GIS) technology. Six maps sheets on a scale of 1:200 000 based on Landsat satellite images of the selected area were produced and processed by Satellitbild. During the same period, three IBL key staff received on-the-job training by Satellitbild in Sweden on the interpretation of satellite images and how to insert these results into the database with GIS technology. The team also participated in field reconnaissance activities and the subsequent interpretation work. These activities were lead by Satellitbild.

During 1996, the development of the database with focus on the possibilities for afforestation from a physical and environmental point of view was further pursued. 28 SPOT XS scenes as well as twelve map sheets based on Spot satellite images on a scale of 1:100 000, were produced. Moreover, a three-week training course took place at the Department of Physical Geography at the Stockholm University. The course consisted of training in digital (satellite) image analysis. The same team from IBL participated together with a professional from the Ministry of Environmental Protection, Natural Resources and Forestry. During the autumn, the team received further on-the-job training through Satellitbild. In the same way as previously, the team performed field reconnaissance as well as land cover and land interpretation work.

Between mid-1997 and the end of 1998, 24 maps on a scale of 1:25 000 were produced to cover an area selected by IBL. These maps were also interpreted through fieldwork. The database was installed at IBL following two seminars on the subject in Poland and in Sweden. No further training was considered necessary for the implementation of this phase.

To summarise, the following *results* have been achieved. Maps have been produced and a database has been created. The developed material is of high quality and the information thus made available can be of benefit to Poland.

The Polish forestry research sector has been provided with a highly qualitative material that could partly serve as a basis for decision making regarding afforestation policies. In addition, the maps have served as input for other studies, for example on hydrology and geomorphology, indicating that these maps can be used for other purposes.

The Polish staff has received training of a high standard in GIS technology and in the processing of satellite pictures. However, two staff out of three trained have been recruited by other Government organisations. The knowledge acquired by the IBL staff has nevertheless increased the Polish competence in this field.

The project has progressed smoothly and efficiently, with the exception of a delay caused by the passing away of the chief executive of the Forestry Research Section at IBL. The support provided by Satellitbild AB has been viewed as competent and professional and the counterparts provided by IBL have been judged as qualified. However, the *relevance* of the project should be assessed in the light of the expected results, i.e. the creation of a database that would provide input into an operational model for afforestation. The question is whether the information is specifically relevant as a basis for decision making on afforestation issues.

The database has been completed in accordance with the project objectives, but the information has so far not been used for decision making regarding afforestation planning and policies. The project *impact* is therefore presently limited. The reorganisation of State Forests and the fact that only one person trained by the project remains at IBL, makes uncertain to which extent the material will be used. However, the material has been used as input for other studies as mentioned above.

5.2 Polish-Swedish Co-operation in Trade and Marketing

An area of concern identified in the Martens report was the lack of experience in the marketing of wood from state owned as well as privately owned forests. The project proposal was to organise two seminars in Poland to be attended by representatives from the Trade and Marketing Departments of the State Forests Organisation and its Regional Offices (17). Sida formally agreed to support the project in September 1995 as part of the “Program of Development of Selected Forestry Branches and Protection of Ecosystems in the National Parks in the years 1993–1997”.

Swedforest was commissioned as the implementing consultant and the agreement between Swedforest/Scandiakonsult and the State Forests Organisation

was signed in December 1995. Two main topics were to be addressed: (1) the organisation principles and methods for turnover of wood between forests owners and purchasers and (2) the betterment of market methods. Two seminars were conducted in April and October 1996. The final report was submitted in December 1997. The total Sida contribution was 1.26 million SEK.

The *objective* of the support was to train 32 Polish managers (target group) in modern methods for trade and marketing, with the purpose of introducing these methods to Poland. An increased awareness would be created for the need of continuous improvement of skills in the areas of marketing and trade within the Polish Forestry Sector. The actual organisation of the seminars was to be handled by the Trade and Marketing Department of the General Directorate of State Forests.

The *expected results* were stated in Sida´s decision protocol of September 1995. After the two seminars, the participants should have acquired insights into the following areas:

- how the Swedish round wood market functions;
- the roles of sellers and buyers on the market;
- the role of the State in a market economy;
- how sales take place on the domestic as well as on the export markets.

Furthermore, discussions taking place during the seminars should lead to a plan of action for how to create a trade market for wood.

At the initial stage, the Polish counterpart did not show a very keen interest in implementing these seminars. Accordingly, the consultant was the driving force behind this implementation. This lack of interest seems to be the reason behind the delay from 1995 to April 1996.

The *results* are as follows: two three-day seminars were conducted in April 1996 and October 1996. The first seminar had 35 participants and the second 25 participants. These were mainly representatives of the Trade and Marketing Unit of the General Directorate and the 17 Regional Offices. We thereby assume that the target group has been reached. However, the requested list of participants has not been provided to us. In actual facts, we have received very little information pertaining to the seminars although it was repeatedly requested.

All participants have been provided with seminar documentation in Polish, in particular as regards the Swedish round wood market as well as environmental aspects. Discussions were initiated and the participants were given some insights into the functioning of market economies.

No plan of action resulting from these discussions has however been elaborated. No formal evaluations of the seminars have been conducted.

The first seminar was elaborated with great detail, whereas the second seminar seems to have had less of a focus on the main subjects that were to be addressed. The second seminar only contained a computer simulation game on the functioning of companies and discussions on the subject "Finance".

The *relevance* of the project is limited to that these seminars have given the participants information partly related to the round wood market, which was an issue of concern to the State Forests Organisation at that time.

The only project *impact* is that the seminar documentation is available at the Marketing and Trade Unit. According to the executive of the unit, the information is occasionally used and referred to. The overall impact of the seminar appears to be limited.

5.3 Financial and Accounting Control Systems

In the Martens report, the elaboration of methods for measurement and classification of wood as well as pricing methods are mentioned as priority areas. In 1995, State Forests identified a project regarding the development of their financial and accounting systems. They submitted a request to Sida in November 1995. Thereafter, Jaakko Pöyri Consulting AB was commissioned as the implementing consultant. The agreement between the consultant and State Forests was signed in April 1996. The process from the identification of the project to its actual implementation was quite lengthy, allegedly depending on the lack of consensus within State Forests regarding the project outline.

The project was initiated in March 1996 and the final project report was submitted in August 1997. However, the bulk of the project took place during 1996. The total Sida contribution to the project was 1.62 million SEK.

The *objective* stated in the Sida decision was to perform studies within a selected number of areas. State Forests would thereby be provided with basic knowledge of financial accounting and control. The possibility for using Swedish methods would be established. The studies would cover the following areas:

- Valuation of forests and forest land;
- Objective comparison of profits and expenditures;
- Time and costs calculations and establishment of norms and standards of forestry operations;
- Calculation of administrative and other overhead or indirect costs;
- Prospects of restructuring of forest enterprises.

The long term *expected results* were to establish more efficient principles in order to perform better valuations of forest land, to develop new principles for financial control of forest businesses and to establish a more appropriate structure for the State Forests Organisation and the companies belonging within the organisation. We note that, in the Sida decision document, the objective of the project is referred to as the expected result. The expected long-term results are called expected effects. We have tried to apply the appropriate terms for the purpose of the evaluation.

The project was started through a fact-finding mission by the consultant in Poland in March 1996. Thereafter, a study tour to Sweden took place May 5–17 1996, during which 32 people participated from Poland, mostly upper management staff. 18 persons attended the whole programme whereas some staff participated during the first week and others during the second week. The study tour consisted of seminars, visits to forest companies and research organisations as well as a summing-up workshop. The subjects covered the priority areas identified by State Forests. The study tour was an introduction to the different subjects so that the Polish staff could participate in the preparation of the subject studies. No target group for the study tour was identified.

In July that same year, consultants from Jaakko Pöyry visited Poland for data collection and to suggest the approach to the issues included in the project. Subsequently, the consultant presented the suggestions and findings in a series of reports that were worked out in Sweden, translated into Polish and commented by State Forests during a meeting in Poland in October. The final compilation of the reports then took place. The following reports have been produced:

- Forest Valuation.
- Objective Comparison of Profits and Expenditures between Forest Regions and Districts;
- Establishment of Norms and Standards in Polish Forestry Operations;
- Administration and Other Overhead or Indirect Costs;
- Restructuring of Enterprises.

The reports were produced during a short period of time and mainly in Sweden. The question is therefore to what extent the Polish counterpart has been able to influence the contents of the reports. The consultant spent four days in Poland in July and then completed the draft reports, which were discussed during three days in October. On an overall basis, we nevertheless consider the implementation of the project as efficient. No further support has so far been agreed upon.

The formulation of the long-term results, i.e. to establish more efficient principles and structures within State Forests, has been interpreted by both the Swedish consultant and the Polish counterpart as if the project was the first stage of a more comprehensive intervention. All the reports therefore include a Plan of Action.

The reports outline the main features within the identified problem areas and should be considered as a starting-point for further support. These reports are presently the only tangible *result* of the project. In our view, the project can not be deemed *relevant* if seen as delimited and should therefore be evaluated as a first stage. In 1997, State Forests expressed interest for a project continuation. A tentative request was accordingly submitted to Sida through the consultant at the end of 1997. However, Sida's standpoint was that no request could be processed until a formal evaluation of the project had been performed.

As no target group was identified, we can not assess whether the appropriate group of people has benefited from the training. No formal evaluations by the participants of the study tour have been made. In addition, we were not able to meet with any of these participants during our visit to Poland. Therefore, the *results* of the study tour can not be properly assessed.

In our view, Sida should have evaluated this first stage upon completion in order to establish whether a continuation of the project was advisable. The *impact* of the project without a continuation is limited. The reports could possibly be used as a support to the ongoing discussion on

the privatisation of forests and forest enterprises. At this stage, it is however questionable whether the project can be pursued, firstly because of the substantial amount of time that has passed, and secondly because the key persons involved in the project have left the State Forests Organisation.

5.4 Sawmill Training

The Polish Economic Chamber of Wood Industry (PECWI) was established in 1994 with the main task to assist the economic activities of the members with technical, financial, economic and marketing information. Its members are private and government-owned primary and secondary wood industries.

The first contact with the consultant “Skog och Trä” took place in 1994 at the Polish Wood Technology Institute. “Skog och Trä” subsequently informed PECWI of the possibilities for funding through BITS. In June 1994, PECWI submitted a formal request to BITS through the Ministry of Environmental Protection, Natural Resources and Forestry. The request suggested “Skog och Trä” as the implementing consultant for the project. The decision to support the project was taken in October 1994 and the agreement was signed in December 1994. The project was initiated in March 1995 and was finalised in March 1999. A final report for the whole project will be submitted in September 1999. The total BITS and Sida contribution is 4.34 million SEK.

The project is formally divided into two phases. There are three Sida decisions and three agreements regulating the project. The initial project objectives stated in the BITS decision are repeated in all project decisions.

The *objectives* are as follows:

- to train 150–190 sawmill managers in modern technologies and methods for the management of wood industries of which at least 30 should be women;
- to establish a Wood Industry Training Centre in Poznan;
- to train 24 teachers as lecturers for the Training Centre.

The target group is sawmill managers and teachers in sawmill training, among which at least 30 should be women.

The following *results* have been achieved. A total of 50 sawmill managers were trained during 3 three-week seminars in Sweden between March and December 1995. Furthermore, 76 managers were trained during 5 eight-day seminars both in Poland and Sweden between November 1996 and November 1998. Out of 126 participants, eleven were women. One seminar is currently (March–April 1999) taking place in Poland and Sweden. However, the targeted number of managers to be trained will not be fully reached. In addition, a total of eight teachers were trained during a two-week seminar in Sweden in March 1997. Nevertheless, some of the trained sawmill managers have offered their services for teaching.

A large number of sawmill managers have been trained whereas teachers have been trained to a lesser extent. The target group has been reached, but not to the extent that was anticipated.

The focus has shifted from training teachers to the “training of trainers”. The Training Centre has not been physically established but is functioning in practice. PECWI has carried out a total

of 14 courses between October 1996 and November 1998, involving close to 400 participants. Premises for these courses are available at a vocational training centre in Kepno outside Poznan.

PECWI and “Skog och Trä” have apparently not viewed the actual physical establishment of a training centre as a project objective, whereas BITS followed by Sida are emphasising the physical establishment of the centre in all decisions. The project became focussed towards (a) the training of sawmill managers and (b) the training of trainers to conduct courses in wood utilisation organised by PECWI. Nevertheless, the establishment of a training centre is stated as one of the main project objectives and the evaluation must therefore conclude that this objective has not been achieved. Although the objective regarding training of trainers has not formally been identified as a project objective, we are of the opinion that this approach is as valid as the physical establishment of a training facility. The project has thereby adopted a more realistic approach for addressing the training needs of the sector.

The number of women that have attended the sawmill training courses is below target. The project has therefore not fulfilled the objectives pertaining to the gender participation at the courses.

The time span of the sawmill manager training courses has been cut from 18 to 8 days. The explanation put forward by PECWI is that the managers could not attend courses for three consecutive weeks. Along with the shortening of the time span, the main focus shifted from a more theoretical approach to include more of study visits. Our view is that the course content is still relevant but that the duration of the course may be slightly too short to fulfil the intended purpose. The changes were communicated to Sida, but there are however no documents indicating that these changes were agreed upon.

The above description exemplifies the insufficient communication between PECWI and the consultant on one hand and Sida on the other hand. There is clearly a discrepancy of views regarding the project objectives, in particular concerning the arrangements pertaining to the Training Centre. These differences of views have never been clarified.

During the third project phase, two additional activities were added: to conduct seminars with Swedish lecturers on unspecified subjects for a total of 20 days in Poland and to introduce and install a computer programme at PECWI for simulation of sawmill structures, production and economic planning. These activities were however not implemented and PECWI requested and was granted permission from Sida to use the funds for additional training courses for sawmill managers.

On an overall basis, the project implementation has proceeded in an efficient way and we view the Polish counterpart as competent. Nonetheless, the administrative capacity at PECWI as well as within “Skog och Trä”, is limited and insufficiently comprehensive reports have therefore been prepared.

The project is *relevant* in the sense that Poland is in need of competence building for modernising its wood industry. The project has succeeded in training a substantial number of sawmill managers, but a major achievement is the training of trainers. Partly as an *impact* of the project, PECWI has conducted its own courses since October 1996 as has been mentioned above. At present, PECWI is the only institute in Poland that conducts such training.

5.5 Waste Paper Seminar

In 1995, the Polish Paper Maker Association (PPMA) together with ÅF/IPK, conducted a seminar in Sweden, financed by BITS. The subject of the seminar was the transition from centrally planned systems to market economy. Thereafter, the PPMA wrote a letter to Sida in February 1996 to request support for a seminar on the subject of Waste Paper. PPMA requested that ÅF/IPK should be the commissioned for the implementation.

The request was granted and the decision was formally approved in June 1996. The agreement between the PPMA and ÅF was however not signed until February 1998. The reason for this delay was that PPMA wished to await the results of a major study with regard to the recovery and processing of waste paper. The study was being elaborated by a German consultant and was only finalised in March 1999. The seminar was conducted anyway in Sweden in the autumn of 1998. The budget approved by Sida was 770 000 SEK. The total budget was 950 000 SEK. The balance was covered by the Polish counterpart.

The *objective* of the seminar was to improve the know-how of technical staff, production staff, engineers and research departments at Polish paper mills as well as in other related businesses, to use waste paper as raw material. The *expected result* was, through the training of 40 specialists, to increase the use of waste paper in the Polish paper mill industry by 10% each year. The target in the decision from Sida was to reach a level of 40% of recuperation of waste paper and to eventually abolish all import of waste paper before the year 2000.

The PPMA is an association that, among others, conducts seminars on various subjects 3–4 times each year. There was a specific interest in the Swedish know-how in this area. The proposed seminar would enable the participants to learn from the extensive Swedish experience within this area. The target group was 40 top and middle management representatives from the small- and medium-sized paper mills in Poland.

The eight-day seminar took place in Norrköping, Sweden, at ÅF/IPK, in the fall of 1998. The number of participants was altogether 40, of which three were female. The participants were from all major paper mills in Poland. Five days were spent on presentations and three days on study visits. A follow-up meeting with the purpose of evaluating the seminar took place in Poland in January 1999. A formal evaluation was conducted and specifications were requested for the performance of lecturers, company presentations and study visits. The average score on a scale from 1 to 10 was 7,4. The highest score was given to company presentations and study visits.

The *achieved results* are that 40 paper mill experts have attended the seminar and thereby increased their knowledge in the field of waste paper handling and processing. They have also acquired a new network of Swedish experts, which has contributed to a speedier resolution of problems. The target group of 40 professionals has been reached.

However, the seminar has not directly resulted in an increased use of waste paper and thereby a reduced import, as was stated as the project objective. The expected results were disproportionately set in relation to one single seminar and therefore unlikely to be met. It should be noted that Poland has not imported any waste paper since 1998 whereas the seminar took place in the autumn of 1998.

The project is *relevant* because of its timing. The seminar took place during a time period where there were strong pressures from the Polish environmental movement that waste paper should

be recycled. However, the overall efficiency has been affected by the delay of the German study that was allegedly completed recently. The **impact** of the project is difficult to assess as the scope of the project is limited and has taken place very recently.

5.6 The Development of Polish Forestry Staff

The Forestry Faculty of the Agricultural University of Poznan has had contacts with Swedish faculties and companies since the end of the 1970's. In the beginning of the 1990's, the faculty wished to regularise the co-operation with Sweden in order to draw on the Swedish experience in the area of forest operations and techniques. The idea was to organise conferences, seminars and mutual visits with the goal to exchange experiences and to train Polish forestry staff.

Contacts were initiated with the Royal Swedish Academy of Agriculture and Forestry at a seminar in Uppsala, and the formal request was processed through the General Directorate of State Forests. The Forestry Faculty and the Royal Academy jointly formulated a letter of understanding in 1995 with the assistance of a Polish consultant stationed in Sweden. In 1995, the faculty applied to the Polish Government for funding and the request was accepted in 1996.

The agreement was signed in April 1997 between the Royal Swedish Academy of Agriculture and Forestry, the Swedish National Board of Forestry (Skogsstyrelsen), the Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences (SLU) and a consulting company on the Swedish side, and the Forest Faculty of the University of Poznan and the General Directorate of State Forests on the Polish side. The project was initiated in March 1997 and finalised in June 1998. The total Sida contribution was 566 000 SEK.

The overall *objective* of the project, as described in the Sida decision of December 1996, was to train forestry staff, in particular decision-makers at different levels within the Polish State forest organisation (target group) in view of the modernisation and mechanisation of forest management. The subjects would pertain to the areas of forest operations and techniques, sustainable forest management and biodiversity, timber market issues, forest legislation and contractors in forestry. The stated project objective was to contribute to a dialogue between researchers and field staff in Poland and organise yearly conferences.

The Sida document is not very clear regarding the distinction between the overall objective and the project objective. However, in a letter to the Agricultural University, Sida expresses the main goal of the project as the transfer of Swedish know-how and competence in forestry to Poland through a series of conferences in Poland.

The target group is officials/decision makers, i.e. 300 professional foresters within the 17 regions.

The expected results were:

- to provide 300 decision makers with knowledge of the modernisation and mechanisation issues faced by the Polish forestry sector;
- to introduce new ideas on forest management;
- to create networks within Poland as well as between Poland and Sweden.

The project started with a visit to Sweden of a Polish group comprised of three representatives from State Forests and the Professor of the Forestry Faculty at the Agricultural University of Poznan. A preliminary proposal for a conference programme was prepared during the visit.

It was decided that the University of Poznan would document the conferences in Polish. The documentation would be assembled and collected in a publication and printed in 1000 copies.

Four two-day conferences took place in June, September and November 1997 and May 1998, with altogether 282 participants. A group of six qualified Swedish lecturers participated at each seminar. These were high level staff from the Swedish National Board of Forestry, the Swedish Forest Owner's Association, the Agricultural University and the Forest Research Institute of Sweden. Each seminar was followed by a one-day field trip as a practical illustration to the discussions that had taken place during the seminar. The Swedish lecturers would thereby be familiarised with the specific conditions prevailing in Poland.

Although there have been no formal evaluations of the seminars, the persons interviewed have made observations and the Royal Academy has submitted a final report that includes some *results*. The seminars were well attended and the quality of the lecturers was much appreciated. The target group has been reached. The knowledge span of the group of lecturers made it possible for the participants to be highlighted on a varied number of issues. All lectures were simultaneously interpreted from Swedish into Polish, which contributed to the dynamics of the dialogue. Environmental issues were focussed during the seminars. The Swedish legislation equating production goals to environmental goals attracted interest.

The seminars have also contributed to the creation of links between the research community and forestry professionals. Our impression is that the overall results are satisfactory. The Royal Academy has strongly contributed to the positive results as they have succeeded in assembling a very competent group of lecturers for each of the seminars. Although the production of the publication has been delayed, we have been informed that final revisions are ongoing and that the book will be printed shortly.

The project is *relevant* in light of the ongoing modernisation process of wood utilisation methods. The term "eye opener" has been used to describe the conferences. In addition, the creation of contacts between the research community and forestry professionals is important to the sector. The communication between these groups in Poland has traditionally not been very frequent.

The project could make an *impact* in the sense that there is a strong interest from the Polish counterpart to continue with this kind of conferences. The project has also inspired the participants to maintain and develop networks and meet regularly. The distribution of the publication will most probably have an impact through the dissemination of the output of these conferences.

5.7 Education and Training in Production of Containerised Seedlings

Kostrzyca Nursery and Nedza Nursery in Rudy Raciborskie are the two nurseries in Poland which produce all containerised seedlings (9 million out of 2 000 million are containerised seedlings as opposed to bare rooted seedlings). The Kostrzyca Nursery was already in place when plans were made to establish the Nedza Nursery. The Nedza Nursery was established with the support of the World Bank, the National and Regional Fund for Environmental Protection and Water Management as well as the State Forest Regional Department. The total funds amounted to 4 million USD. The reason behind the establishment of the Nedza Nursery was a major fire in 1992 that devastated 10 000 hectares of forest.

BCC had firstly delivered equipment to the Kostrzyca Nursery and was subsequently commissioned by the World Bank to supply some of the equipment to the Nedza Nursery. Through this

co-operation, the Polish counterpart became interested in the knowledge prevailing in Sweden in this area and therefore approached Sida for funding in 1996. The request was for the training of Polish specialists on the production of containerised seedlings. Sida granted the request and a decision was formally approved in July 1997 for a project between 1997 and 1999. The agreement between BCC and the State Forests Organisation was signed November 4 1997. The funds made available were 268 000 SEK to be disbursed over a period of 2,5 years.

The project was comprised of a total of nine two-day seminars attended by a group of ten specialists. The same group would participate at all seminars. The seminars would take place at Nedza and the participants would be specialists from the two above-mentioned nurseries.

The *objective* of the seminars was to teach the Polish specialists to produce containerised seedlings of high quality at the lowest possible cost, for the purpose of reforestation in Southern Poland. The seminars would give the participants an understanding of the potential of using containerised seedlings. The target group was heads of forest nurseries and other key persons.

The seminars took place in December 1997, January 1997, July 1998 and December 1998. After the completion of the first seminar, the Polish counterpart was very satisfied with the results. They therefore requested the permission from Sida to double the amount of participants at each seminar while maintaining the same budget.

In order to handle the increased working load, a Polish-Swedish forester was hired by the District Inspectorate in Poland. The advantage was that the seminars could therefore be held in Polish. BCC committed itself to finance the travelling costs of this forester.

A general outline of the contents of all seminars was elaborated at the beginning of the project. However, as the group of participants was the same, there was a possibility to discuss, during and after the seminars, what topics to raise during the coming seminar. The content of each seminar has therefore been modified according to the conclusions and observations of the previous seminar and adapted to the areas of interest of the participants.

The extensive dialogue between BCC and the Polish participants has resulted in that the seminars have taken place at a slower pace than intended. One seminar took place in 1997, three in 1998, three are planned for 1999 and the remaining two for 2000. No formal evaluation of the training programme has been done so far.

The following *results* can be observed: although the seminars have not taken place in the pace that was anticipated, the overall efficiency of the project has been substantial. The number of participants has been increased, seemingly without influencing the quality of the output. The target group has been reached. The seminar contents have been subject to continuous change and adapted to the wishes and concerns of the participants. The fact that the same people have participated each time has added to the dynamic process. The participation of the Swedish-Polish forester has contributed to the efficiency as language problems have been minimised.

The *relevance* of the project is considerable, in particular in light of the problems that Poland faces in the area of reforestation. The use of containerised seedlings decreases the costs per hectare of replanting. In addition, the seminars have addressed subjects relevant to the participants as they have contributed themselves to the elaboration of these seminars.

The project will have a sustainable *impact* as the Polish Regional Directorate has decided to continue investing in nurseries for containerised seedlings. An investment plan has been agreed. No further Sida support is needed and the Directorate will conduct the training through the pro-

gramme developed by BCC. Funds are available for the implementation of the remaining seminars. However, we find it noteworthy that this project has required Sida support, when considering the magnitude of the World Bank funding.

6 Analysis

As the above description shows, the seven projects evaluated are very varied, both in size and content. Some projects only comprise one single seminar whereas other projects stretch over several years and include different components. The size of funds varies from less than 300 000 SEK to over 4 million SEK. The training component is the main feature of all projects.

6.1 Project identification

The study by Lars Erik Martens in 1994 is seemingly the only document that could be viewed as a feasibility study for these projects. The main projects supported within the forestry sector were derived from this study. In our opinion, the project suggestions in the Martens study are not clear. The document does not outline a coherent support and the objectives for the support as well as for the specific projects, are not sufficiently elaborated. Sida and *BITS* *should not have considered this document as a sufficient basis for decision making and should have commissioned further feasibility studies.*

As an example, within the Trade and Marketing project as well as within the Financial and Accounting Systems project, both the consultants as well as the Polish counterpart were anticipating a continuation of the projects. The projects were implemented in this spirit, especially the F&A project. *A proper feasibility study would probably have contributed to a more comprehensive and transparent approach regarding the implementation of the various projects. Otherwise, the risk is that the consultants could influence the project contents according to the competence available.*

6.2 Project initiation

The initial project ideas have originated from the Polish side. The local counterpart has mostly taken the initiative to contact the consultant for the implementation. In several cases, the consultant was already known to the counterpart. Therefore, many of the consultants have been mentioned by name in the Polish requests. The consultants have sometimes, but not always, been selected through competitive tender processes.

Sida should preferably assume an active role in the project preparation phase, but this is not always the case. The objectives stated in the Sida decision documents are sometimes unclear. Some project objectives are formulated differently in the various documents. A more thorough analysis of the project objectives will be performed in section 6.3.

The Sida staff responsible for handling the above projects could sometimes have required additional competence when assessing the project contents. To exemplify, the objectives of the “Planning of Afforestation Structure” project have been described differently in the same document, i.e. (a) reforestation of abandoned forest land and (b) reforestation of abandoned agricultural land. In the first agreement, the project has yet another objective, namely “Mapping of

Land Cover and Creation of Environment and Economic Planning Database”. In addition, the project has been continuously referred to as “Planning of Afforestation Structure at Regional and Administrative Level”. The implications of the objectives are different, which allows for speculation on which objective should be fulfilled. *We believe that it would have been appropriate to submit the project proposals for scrutiny by staff with forestry competence at Sida’s Department for Natural Resources (Sidas avdelning för Naturresurser och Miljö).*

No environmental impact assessments have been made for any of the projects during initiation. The responsibility for performing environmental impact assessments lies with the project owner, i.e. the Polish counterparts. *We recommend that these assessments should be made initially by Sida to allow for impact studies at project completion.*

6.3 Project objectives

We have made a number of observations pertaining to project objectives.

Project objectives are formulated in several documents, i.e. in Sida decisions, in agreements, in consultancy inception reports as well as in project reports. These objectives are sometimes formulated differently between the documents. The implications are that the stated objectives can create inconsistencies in the project. *During project implementation, lack of consensus regarding project objectives has created confusion and makes an evaluation more difficult.*

There are inconsistencies in several project documents regarding the overall use of terms, i.e. objectives are confused with activities or results, results are confused with effects, etc. It is not an objective to train a certain number of persons, that is the activity through which the objective will be achieved. In this case, the objective could be to increase the know-how within a specific area. *The Logical Framework Analysis (LFA) method has apparently not been used for preparing any of the projects evaluated. The structure of the LFA method would initially have clarified the project documents and contributed to some consistency in the use of terms.*

The scope of the project has changed during the implementation without any modification of the stated objectives. As an example, one of the initial objectives of the Sawmill Training project was to establish a Training Centre. The actual physical establishment of the training centre has, however, never been perceived as an objective by the Polish counterpart. The interviews have shown that PECWI does neither acknowledge nor recognise this formulation. Nevertheless, this objective is clearly stated in the BITS and Sida decision documents and results therefore have to be assessed in relation to that objective. As it is our opinion that the project successfully laid the ground for a large training programme conducted by PECWI, it is regrettable that the situation has not been clarified earlier. *Any major changes in project objectives must be clearly stated and considered in all relevant documents.*

Sometimes, objectives are too general or disproportionate in relation to the scope of the project. As an example, a stated objective of the Waste Paper Seminar is to increase the efficiency of the Polish paper mill industry. *Measurable objectives must be set in relation to results so that these objectives can be properly evaluated.*

If Sida’s resources for follow-up are limited, efforts should initially be concentrated on a clear and relevant formulation of objectives in the Sida decisions. These objectives must be revised if necessary.

6.4 Project implementation and monitoring

The supported projects have not been co-ordinated at all. BITS and Sida have handled the projects separately. The projects are connected only in the sense that they all have some relation to the forest and/or forest industry sectors.

Within all projects, the counterparts have assumed all local costs in Poland for the Polish participants and often for the consultants. The size of the Polish contribution is not always stated in the documents.

The Polish side views the projects as mutually beneficiary rather than as assistance projects. These views have been clearly expressed during most interviews, in particular in the case of the Waste Paper Seminar and the Development of Forestry Staff project. In general, the co-operation between the consultants and the Polish counterparts is clearly on equal terms. All projects have a significant transfer of knowledge component and transfer of knowledge has occurred both ways.

The agreement parties are, in all cases, the consultants and the Polish counterparts. Sida's role is legally only one of a funding agent, and as such issues letters of confirmation of the financing to both parties. Within these projects, it is assumed that the legal parties are capable to assume the full responsibility of the running of the project.

Although we consider the Polish counterparts as very competent, the administrative capacity is in some cases very strained. Due to this limited capacity, project monitoring has been irregular. The counterpart is generally not responsible for the reporting. *The existing administrative capacity should be assessed early in the project implementation in order to allow for its strengthening if necessary.*

The reports provided by the consultants do not always supply Sida with sufficient information for proper project follow-up. The consultant often assumes the role of the communication agent between Sida and the project. Considering the amount of projects currently handled by the Sida desk officers, it is not possible for Sida to assume a satisfactory follow-up of the projects unless comprehensive reports are forthcoming. The consultant reports do not necessarily provide all the information needed. It is our view that the role of the Polish counterpart in this regard must be strengthened.

The main responsibility for reporting and informing Sida should be assumed by the counterpart. This responsibility adds to the sense of project ownership. Sida should ensure that the counterparts, early in the project process, realise the mutual benefit of closer links with Sida.

The frequent change of BITS desk officers as well as the merging of BITS into Sida in July 1995 has contributed to irregular project follow-up. This has particularly affected the earlier projects.

The overall impression is that the Polish counterparts are highly qualified and we consider the absorptive capacity on the Polish side as high. The professionals assigned for the projects have generally been appreciated. A major impediment mentioned by the counterparts is the general lack of resources available for investments.

6.5 Project completion

6.5.1 Relevance

The evaluation shows that most of the projects are relevant when assessed separately. The projects viewed as the least relevant, are those that have actually not been fully completed. The Financial and Accounting Control Systems project had the potential to become successful but was initially not properly assessed. The project is so far only relevant as a first stage in a longer process. In addition, the Planning of Afforestation Structures project did not actually reach its final goal and would have necessitated additional support to become fully relevant.

The support as a whole would have become more relevant through a co-ordination between the projects, particularly in Poland. The State Forests Organisation is the counterpart in five of the projects, and Polish Forestry staff is the target group. As the major part of the evaluated projects is totally or partly connected to State Forests, they could have assumed the role of project co-ordinator.

The project stakeholders are sometimes aware of each other, but *there has generally been no communication between the projects, even at times where exchange of information would have been beneficial.* For instance, projects involving the same target groups have sometimes included study tours to Sweden, sometimes not, without any obvious reason.

All projects have been handled separately with different reporting requirements and budget periods. *A more co-ordinated support would have facilitated the follow-up of the projects by the Sida desk officers.*

Consequently, the projects would have been more relevant as parts of an integrated and coherent support than as separate entities. We therefore strongly suggest that any future support should be co-ordinated in order to avoid the overlapping of activities and to make relevant priorities.

6.5.2 Impact and Sustainability

The impact and sustainability of projects and programmes can generally only be assessed in the longer run. This applies for forestry programmes in particular. The impact of the evaluated projects can therefore not yet be fully determined. We have, however, attempted to identify the major project impacts that can be observed at this point.

The future impact of the project for Planning of Afforestation Structure is depending on the ongoing restructuring of IBL and on whether qualified staff can be recruited. The project impact will otherwise be limited.

The impact of the Trade and Marketing Seminar as well as of the Financial and Accounting Control Systems project is limited because of the current reorientation of the Forestry Sector in Poland and of State Forests in particular.

The impact of the Waste Paper Seminar depends on the possibilities for further investments in appropriate equipment.

The projects with a tangible impact are those where the counterparts have brought the project further and are running it themselves, i.e. the Sawmill Training project, the Development of Polish Forestry Staff as well as the Education and Training of Containerised Seedlings project.

The sustainability of the projects can not possibly be determined so shortly after completion. *However, the projects that show a potential for becoming sustainable are those where the counterpart takes ownership of the programme. In addition, a more integrated support programme would have increased the possibilities of*

both impact and sustainability. Some of the projects that now seem to be unconnected to each other could have gained importance in the overall context.

6.5.3 Environmental impact

No initial environmental impact assessment was made for any of the projects.

Training is the main feature of all projects. Any impact on the environment can not be directly linked to the implementation of a course or seminar. Therefore, none of the evaluated projects have any direct effects on the environment. There are, however, indirect effects in the sense that information in this regard is disseminated or approaches to environmental issues are influenced.

On multiple occasions, the training component has included references to environmental aspects. These aspects have been frequently emphasised during the study visits in Sweden. As examples, we can mention the Trade and Marketing seminars, the Waste Paper Seminar and the Sawmill Training programme during which environmental aspects were integrated into the training programmes. One of the strategies within the Polish Forestry Policy is that forestry should be in “harmony with nature”. The Polish environmental movement is strong and influential. The absorptive capacity of the Polish counterparts for taking into consideration environmental aspects is considered high in general.

All the projects could have an indirect environmental impact, in particular if funds for investments are made available.

6.5.4 Cost-efficiency

Generally, all assessments regarding cost efficiency are rather superficial. One way to measure cost-efficiency is to relate costs to results. The analysis depends on how the output is valued in relation to incurred costs. It should also be determined whether the output is relevant in relation to the expected results. A highly valued output can motivate a higher cost. It is, however, difficult to give a value to the output. To render such an analysis possible, it is preferable to determine how to value the project output early in the process.

Another way to measure cost-efficiency in this context could be to set project co-ordination costs in relation to total costs. We consider that project co-ordination costs should not exceed 25% of the total costs, although a long-term project will probably have a proportionately lower co-ordination cost than one single seminar. These costs vary between the projects from 20% to 45% of the total cost. The cost of training per participant could also be an indication of cost-efficiency. The project costs are set in relation to the Sida contribution only.

Satellitbild AB has devoted much time and resources to the implementation of the Planning of Afforestation Structure project. In relation to the costs, the output in the form of data and training is substantial and of high quality. The consultant has provided the expected output and has achieved a transfer of knowledge on the use of satellite images. However, the major concern is whether the project has delivered the expected results. Nevertheless, we view the project on a whole as cost-efficient.

Almost half of the costs of the Trade and Marketing Seminar of 1.26 million SEK consist of the preparation and co-ordination. The costs amount to 540 000 SEK, i.e. almost 45% of the total costs. We view these costs as disproportionately high in relation to the output. However, we note that Sida initially approved the budget. In addition, the average cost for each participant is almost 40 000 SEK for a 6 day course in Poland. We therefore do not consider the project as cost-efficient.

As the impact of the Financial and Accounting Control System project without a continuation is limited, our opinion is that the project is only cost-efficient if perceived as a first project stage. The consultant was envisaging a long-term involvement and therefore devoted much time and resources to the project. The output that has been produced is substantial in relation to the costs incurred.

The cost for co-ordination on the part of the consultant for the Sawmill Training project is less than 20% of the total costs, which we perceive as reasonable. The costs per participant amounts to less than 25 000 SEK. We therefore consider the project to be cost-efficient.

Approximately 20% of the total costs have been used for project co-ordination of the Waste Paper Seminar. The average cost for each participant is less than 20 000 SEK for an 8 day seminar in Sweden, which is half of the cost of the Trade and Marketing seminar. We therefore consider the project as cost-efficient.

The cost-efficiency of the Development of Forestry Staff project is high. The fees of the lecturers have been kept at a low level but a high quality has been maintained. In addition, the project co-ordination costs are low, as the major part of these costs has not been billed. The cost per participant is very low, i.e. 2000 SEK.

We consider the Education and Training in the Production of Containerised Seedlings project to be cost-efficient. The number of participants has increased without additional funding. The cost per participant is less than 15 000 SEK. We would like to note, however, that as funds have been available for other purposes through the World Bank programme, it has been possible to use the Sida funds in a very efficient way.

More co-ordination between the projects could have resulted in the integration of some of the smaller projects into the larger programmes. The co-ordination cost for all projects would thus have been reduced.

6.5.5 Gender

Only one project takes gender aspects into account. The Sawmill Training project has formulated the target to train a certain number of women. No target groups in any of the other projects include women or show any intent to achieve a gender-balanced participation in the training programmes. We asked all projects about the proportion of women having attended training programmes but only a few are able to assemble any gender specific data. We recommend that gender targets are set, in particular for training programmes. We have been informed by the projects that there are few women in the forestry sector, which makes it even more important to include as many women as possible in the programmes.

7 Summary of main recommendations and conclusions

The Logical Framework Analysis (LFA) method has apparently not been used for preparing any of the projects evaluated. The structure of the LFA method would initially have clarified the project documents and contributed to some consistency in the use of terms. As an example, lack of consensus regarding project objectives has created confusion and makes an evaluation more difficult.

A proper feasibility study would probably have provided the basis for a more comprehensive and transparent approach regarding the implementation of the various projects. Otherwise, the risk is that the consultants could influence the project contents according to the competence available.

If Sida's resources for follow-up are limited, efforts should initially be concentrated on a clear and relevant formulation of objectives in the Sida decisions. These objectives must be revised if necessary. Any major changes in project objectives must be clearly stated and considered in all relevant documents. Measurable objectives must be set in relation to results so that these objectives can be properly evaluated.

The main responsibility for reporting and informing Sida should be assumed by the counterpart. This responsibility adds to the sense of project ownership. Sida should ensure that the counterparts, early in the project process, realise the mutual benefit of closer links with Sida.

The administrative capacity of the counterpart should be assessed early in the project implementation in order to allow for its strengthening. The maximum impact and sustainability of a project is ensured when the counterpart takes ownership of the programme.

We believe that it would have been appropriate to submit the project proposals for scrutiny by staff with forestry competence at Sida's Department for Natural Resources (Sidas avdelning för Naturreсурser och Miljö).

The overall organisation of the State Forests in Poland is undergoing some changes. There are intense debates on whether to privatise parts of the forest land presently owned by Government. The State Forests Organisation is being reorganised which is affecting the running of its operations. We therefore believe that any project initiated at present could not be implemented in an optimal way.

Among the projects that have been implemented, there are additional needs for support if a maximum impact is to be ensured. The Planning of Afforestation Structure project as well as the Financial and Accounting project would require a final assessment on how to use the developed material for the initially intended purposes.

We recommend that projects of an institutional co-operation character between Polish and Swedish institutions, should be supported. The project for Training of Forestry Staff has proven to be successful in this regard.

We also recommend that the continuation of the Sawmill Training programme should be supported, possibly focussing on new areas for training, i.e. maintenance of wood working equipment.

The support as a whole would have become more relevant through a co-ordination between the projects, particularly in Poland. There has generally been no communication between the proj-

ects, even at times where exchange of information would have been beneficial. In addition, a more co-ordinated support would have facilitated the follow-up of the projects by the Sida desk officers. We therefore strongly suggest that any future support should be co-ordinated in order to avoid the overlapping of activities and to ensure that relevant priorities are made.

1999-02-02

Terms-of-Reference

Evaluation - Projects in the Forestry Sector in Poland

Decision ÖST 61/99

Background

A large part of the development cooperation that Sida involves in, in Eastern and Central Europe, is financing Technical Assistance where a Swedish consultant is supplying a local party with expertise that is requested by that party.

Sida shall see to that the means are used in an efficient way and in such a way that the best value is accruing to the local party compared to the volume of means.

Sida-Öst has supported a number of Technical Assistance-projects in the forestry-sector in Poland during the last few years. Sida said in its plan of operations made up during 1997 that these projects were to be evaluated.

The number of projects to be evaluated are ten. The projects are (incl. respective BITS/Sida decision numbers):

- * Reforestation Structure at Regional and Local Administration Levels (3 phases), BITS 145-94/95, 58/96, 153/97
- * Polish-Swedish Cooperation in Trade and Marketing, 26/95, 118/95
- * Financial and Accounting Control Systems, 139/95, 219/96
- * Sawmill Training (2 phases), BITS 55-94/95, 70/95, 192/96
- * Waste Paper Seminar, 158/96
- * Development of Polish Forestry Staff, 303/96
- * Education and Training in Production of Containerized Seedlings, 204/97

For further information on the different projects see each Sida decision.

The evaluation

Sida-Öst decided 1997 that an evaluation of the projects supported by Sida-Öst in the forestry sector in Poland was to be carried through by an independent consultant.

Sida-Öst has decided to contract Orgut Consulting AB and Sponte Sua AB to do the evaluation. (For a budget of the evaluation see appendix B.)

Purposes

The purposes of the evaluation of the above mentioned projects are:

- * to evaluate the relevance, impacts, and sustainability of the support provided by Sida-Öst
- * to evaluate the over-all effectiveness of the support provided by Sida-Öst to the Polish parties, so that future decisions can be improved, if possible, and in this process also place special weight on cost-effectiveness aspects
- * to identify major issues with respect to project identifications and implementations
- * to identify deviations from the original project plans, in case such have occurred, and major reasons for such
- * to review the needs for and relevance of possible further support to the sector

Scope of work

The scope of work includes, but will not necessarily be limited to, the following:

- * studying and evaluating the project objectives, in order to assess the projects' original feasibility and prospects of success
- * studying and evaluating the arrangements and absorptive capacity on the Polish side
- * studying the achievements and results in relation to the objectives of the projects, and in relation to the time consumption
- * studying the efficiency, i.e. output and results in relation to costs
- * to carry out an Environmental Impact Analysis regarding the 10 projects

The consultant is responsible for all practical arrangements and administrative work in relation to the mission.

Methodology

The Consultant will have access to, and use, relevant documentation at Sida-Öst, and the different Polish parties. Interviews shall also be made with relevant persons at the different organisations.

The mission includes one trip of 5 resp. 10 days to Poland. The objective of the journey is to gather information necessary to achieve the objectives of the evaluation by the conducting of interviews with relevant parties in Poland.

The evaluation shall take gender aspects especially into consideration, and all data should be gender specific, where relevant.

An Environmental Impact Analysis of the 10 projects shall be carried out by the consultant Roland Öqvist to be used in the conclusions of the evaluation.

Team for the mission

The team shall consist of Roland Öqvist and Kristina Flodman, who are seen as having the necessary competence (see Cvs in appendices C and D).

The Consultants are equally responsible for the mission and the report. Roland Öqvist has the responsibility to perform the Environmental Impact Analysis.

Time frame

The work comprises 15 work-days per consultant and will begin at the date of the parties signing the contract and shall be finished May 31, 1999 the latest.

Reporting

A draft report, including the main findings during the follow-up and conclusions in the areas stated above related to the mission, shall in two (2) copies be sent to Sida-Öst not later than March 15. Within 2 weeks after receiving Sida's comments on the draft report, a final version in five (5) copies and on diskette shall be submitted to Sida.

The report shall be written in English and should not exceed thirty (30) pages, excluding annexes. Subject to decision by Sida, the report will be published and distributed. In case of publishing and distributing the Consultants name will be stated as the author of the report.

The report shall be written in Word for Windows 6.0 or a compatible format and should be presented in a way that enables publication without further editing.

Appendix 2

List of persons met

1. Planning of Afforestation Structure at Regional and Local Administration Levels

Satellitbild AB	Mr Hans Rasch , Project Manager Mr Wladyslaw Ludkiewicz
Instytut Badawczy Lesnictwa	Mr Jerzy Wawnoniak, Acting Head of GIS and of the Research Department Mr Wtodziernierz Adamczyk, GIS Researcher

2. Polish-Swedish Cooperation in Trade and Marketing

Swedforest/Scandiaconsult	Mr Mats Blakstad, former Managing Director
General Directorate of State Forest	Mr Sawicui Stawomir, Expert Marketing Department Mr Piotr Ziernski, Worldbank Project Co-ordinator

3. Financial and Accounting Control Systems in the Forestry Sector

Jaakko Pöyry Consulting AB	Mr Anders Olsson, Managing Director. Mr Håkan Liljeblad, Vice President of Forestry and Wood Technology
General Directorate of State Forests	Mr Thomasz Wojcik, expert (former director) Mrs Danuta Wikiet, Accountant Mr Piotr Ziernski, Worldbank Desk Officer

4. Sawmill Training

Stiftelsen Skog och Trä	Mrs Lilian Nihlman, Managing Director
PECWI (Polish Chamber of Wood Industry)	Mr Bogdan Czemko, Managing Director Mrs Elzbieta Dobra, Head of Administration Mr Zdzislaw Nowacki, Director of WITAR sawmill

5. Waste Paper Seminar

ÅF-IPK	Mr Hans Jansson, Project Manager
Association of the Polish Papermakers	Mr Andrzej Jagietto, Chairman Mr Pawet Dziedzic, Expert

6. Development of Polish Forestry Staff

The Royal Swedish Academy of
Agriculture and Science

Mr Bo Carleståhl

Agricultural University of Poznan

Professor Henryk Rozanski
Dr Krzysztof

7. Education and Training in Production of Containerised Seedlings

BCC AB

Mr Stellan Carlsson, Project Manager

Inspectorate of State Forests

Mr Zenon Pietras, Deputy Director

Nedza Nursery

Mr Samuel Sliva, Head of Nedza Nursery

Appendix 3

Summary of project assessments

1) Planning of Afforestation Structure at Regional and Local Administration Levels

The Polish forestry research sector has been provided with a highly qualitative material that could serve as a basis for decision making regarding afforestation policies. The Polish staff has received training of a high standard in GIS technology and in the processing of satellite pictures.

The project has progressed smoothly and efficiently. However, the relevance of the project should be assessed in the light of the expected results. The question is whether the information is specifically relevant as a basis for decision making on afforestation issues. The database has been completed in accordance to project objectives, but the information has so far not been used for decision making on afforestation issues. The project impact is therefore presently limited.

2) Polish-Swedish Co-operation in Trade and Marketing

Two three-day seminars were conducted in April 1996 and October 1996. All participants have been provided with seminar documentation in Polish, in particular as regards the Swedish round wood market. Discussions were initiated and the participants were given some insights into the functioning of market economies.

The relevance of the project is limited to that these seminars have given the participants information partly related to the round wood market, which was an issue of concern to the State Forests Organisation at that time. The only project impact is that the seminar information is available at the Marketing and Trade Unit. According to the executive of the unit, the information was occasionally used and referred to. The overall impact of the seminar appears to be limited.

3) Financial and Accounting Control Systems

The formulation of the long-term results, i.e. to establish more efficient principles and structures within the State Forests Organisation, has been interpreted both by the Swedish consultant and the Polish counterpart as if the project was the first stage of a more comprehensive intervention. All the reports include a Plan of Action, since both the Swedish consultant and the Polish counterpart were anticipating a project continuation. The reports are outlining the main features within the identified problem areas and should be considered as a starting-point for further support. These reports are presently the only tangible result. The project can not be deemed relevant if seen as delimited and should be evaluated as a first project phase.

In our view, Sida should have evaluated this first stage upon completion in order to establish whether a continuation of the project was advisable. The impact of the project without a continuation is limited. On an overall basis, we nevertheless consider the implementation of the project as efficient.

4) Sawmill Training

The results show that a large number of sawmill managers have been trained whereas teachers have been trained only to a limited extent. The target group has been reached, but not to the extent that was anticipated. The Training Centre has not been physically established but is functioning in practice. PECWI has conducted its own courses since October 1996, involving close to 400 participants. At present, PECWI is the only institute in Poland that conducts such training.

On an overall basis, the project implementation has proceeded in an efficient way. The project is relevant in the sense that Poland is in need of competence building for modernising its wood industry. The project has succeeded in training a substantial number of sawmill managers, but a major achievement is the training of trainers. Although the objective regarding training of trainers has not formally been identified as a project objective, we are of the opinion that this approach is as valid as the physical establishment of a training facility. The project has thereby adopted a more realistic approach for addressing the training needs of the sector.

5) Waste Paper Seminar

The achieved results are that 40 paper mill experts have attended the seminar and thereby increased their knowledge in the field of waste paper handling and processing. They have also acquired a new network of Swedish experts, which has contributed to a speedier resolution of problems. The target group of 40 professionals has been reached.

However, the seminar has neither increased the efficiency of the Polish paper mill industry nor resulted in an increased use of waste paper, as was stated as the project objectives. The expected results were disproportionately set in relation to one single seminar.

The project is relevant because of its timing. The seminar took place during a time period where there were strong pressures from the Polish environmental movement that waste paper should be recycled.

6) Development of Polish Forestry Staff

The seminars were well attended and the quality of the lecturers has been much appreciated. The target group has been reached. Environmental issues were focussed during the seminars. The seminars have also contributed to the creation of links between the research community and forestry professionals. Our impression is that the overall results are satisfactory. The Royal Academy has strongly contributed to the positive results as they have succeeded in assembling a very competent group of lecturers for each of the seminars.

The project is relevant in light of the ongoing modernisation process of wood utilisation methods. The project will most probably have an impact in the sense that there is a strong interest from the Polish counterpart to continue with this kind of conferences.

7) Education and Training in Production of Containerised Seedlings

The seminars took place in December 1997, January 1997, July 1998 and December 1998. After the completion of the first seminar, the Polish counterpart was very satisfied with the results. They therefore requested the permission from Sida to double the amount of participants at each seminar while maintaining the same budget.

The overall efficiency of the project has been substantial. The number of participants has been increased, seemingly without influencing the quality of the output. The target group has been reached. The content of each seminar has been modified according to the conclusions and observations of the previous seminar.

The relevance of the project is considerable, in particular in light of the problems that Poland faces in the area of reforestation. The project will have a sustainable impact as the Polish Regional Directorate has decided to continue investing in nurseries for containerised seedlings. No further Sida support is needed.

Recent Sida Evaluations

- 99/13 Cooperation Between Sweden and Ukraine in the Field of Local Self-Government. Lars Rylander, Martin Schmidt
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 99/14 Research Cooperation between Sweden and Uruguay 1986-1995. An evaluation and some general considerations. Osvaldo Goscinski, Mikael Jondal, Claes Sandgren, Per Johan Svenningsson
Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit
- 99/15 Sida Supported Advantage Projects in the Baltic States. Claes Lindahl, Petra Stark
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 99/16 Diakonia Program for Democracy and Human Rights, the El Salvador Case. A qualified monitoring. Vegard Bye, Martha Doggett, Peter Hellmers
Department for Latin America
- 99/17 Dollars, Dialogue and Development. An evaluation of Swedish programme aid. Howard White, Geske Dijkstra, Jan Kees van Donge, Anders Danielsson, Maria Nilsson
Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit
- 99/18 Atmospheric Environment Issues in Developing Countries. Gun Lövblad, Per Inge Iverfeldt, Åke Iverfeldt, Stefan Uppenberg, Lars Zetterberg
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 99/19 Technical Assistance to Central and Eastern Europe. A cooperation between Chambers of Commerce in Sweden and in Central and Eastern Europe. Claes Lindahl, Monica Brodén, Peter Westermark
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 99/20 Sida Support to the Energy Sector in Egypt. Rolf Eriksson, Edward Hoyt
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 99/21 Sida Support to the Energy Sector in Jordan. Rolf Eriksson, Edward Hoyt
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 99/22 Environmental Aspects in Credit Financed Projects. Gunhild Granath, Stefan Andersson, Karin Seleborg, Göran Stegrin, Hans Norrström
Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit
- 99/23 Sida SAREC Marine Science Programs in East Africa. Stephen B. Olsen, James Tobey, Per Brinck
Department for Research Cooperation, SAREC
- 99/24 Sweden's Assistance to Bosnia Herzegovina. A study of aid management and related policy issues. Claes Sandgren
Department for Central and Eastern Europe
- 99/25 Psychiatry Reform in Eastern Europe. Nils Öström
Department for Central and Eastern Europe

Sida Evaluations may be ordered from:

Infocenter, Sida
S-105 25 Stockholm
Phone: (+46) 8 795 23 44
Fax: (+46) 8 760 58 95
info@sida.se

A complete backlist of earlier evaluation reports may be ordered from:

Sida, UTV, S-105 25 Stockholm
Phone: (+46) 8 698 5099
Fax: (+46) 8 698 5610
Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>



SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY

S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden

Tel: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Fax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64

Telegram: sida stockholm. Postgiro: 1 56 34-9

E-mail: info@sida.se. Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>