Sweden's and Holland's Strategies for the Promotion of Gender Equality in Bolivia

Tom Dahl-Östergaard Sarah Forti Mónica Crespo

Sweden's and Holland's Strategies for the Promotion of Gender Equality in Bolivia

Tom Dahl-Östergaard Sarah Forti Mónica Crespo

Sida Evaluation 02/09

Department for Latin America This report is part of *Sida Evaluation*, a series comprising evaluations of Swedish development assistance. Sida's other series concerned with evaluations, *Sida Studies in Evaluation*, concerns methodologically oriented studies commissioned by Sida. Both series are administered by the Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit, an independent department reporting directly to Sida's Board of Directors.

Reports may be *ordered* from:

Infocenter, Sida S-105 25 Stockholm

Telephone: (+46) (0)8 506 423 80 Telefax: (+46) (0)8 506 423 52

E-mail: info@sida.se,

Reports are also available to download at:

http://www.sida.se/evaluation

Authors: Tom Dah-Östergaard, Sarah Forti, Mónica Crespo.

The views and interpretations expressed in this report are the authors and do not necessarily reflect those of the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Sida.

Sida Evaluation 02/09 Commissioned by Sida, Department for Latin America

Copyright: Sida and the authors

Registration No.: U 11/Vbo 16.3-5 Date of Final Report: April 2002 Printed in Stockholm, Sweden 2002 ISBN 91-586-8709-2 ISSN 1401-0402

SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY

Address: S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden. Office: Sveavägen 20, Stockholm

Telephone: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Telefax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64

Telegram: sida stockholm. Postgiro: 1 56 34–9 E-mail: info@sida.se. Homepage: http://www.sida.se

Table of Contents

Exe	Executive Summary 1		
1	Introduction 1.1 Purpose of the evaluation 1.2 Methodology 1.3 Key concepts 1.4 Structure of the report	4 4 5	
2	Gender Equality in Bolivia		
3	Donor Co-operation with Bolivia	9	
4	Policy Framework	10	
•	 4.1 The International Gender Framework – Beijing and CEDAW	10 10 12	
	4.4 Key findings		
5	Strategic gender dialogue and co-operation mechanisms 5.1 Government 5.1.1 Background 5.1.2 Mechanisms of dialogue with the Government 5.2 Civil Society 5.2.1 Women's networks 5.2.2 Delegated NGOs 5.2.3 Direct support to projects 5.2.4 Assessment of the importance of dialogue with civil society 5.3.1 Gender donor committee 5.3.2 Sector co-ordination 5.3.3 World Bank 5.4 Key findings	18 18 18 21 21 21 22 22 22 23 23	
6	Gender Mainstreaming in Holland's and Sweden's country programmes 6.1 Holland 6.2 Sweden 6.3 Common strategic aspects to Holland and Sweden 6.4 Key findings	25 26 27	
7	Gender Mainstreaming in Selected Sectors and Programmes 7.1 Gender specific programmes 7.1.1 National Gender Equality Plan, VAGGF	29 29 29	

	7.2 The Democratic Governance sector	31
	7.2.1 Institutional Reform Programme	31
	7.2.2 Improving the political participation of women	31
	7.2.3 Decentralisation	32
	7.3 The Education sector	32
	7.3.1 Education Reform Program (PRE)	32
	7.3.2 The UNICEF supported programme on Women's Alphabetisation	
	7.4 Key findings	34
8	Conclusions and Recommendations	35
	Conclusions and Recommendations nex 1 Terms of reference	
Anr		39
Anr Anr	nex 1 Terms of reference	39 43
Anr Anr Anr	nex 1 Terms of referencenex 2 Abbreviations and Acronyms	39 43

Executive Summary

Introduction

Bolivia is the poorest country in South America and women are affected by poverty to a much greater extent than men are. The achievement of gender equality is a declared policy objective of the Bolivian Government. Gender equality is an objective in its own right, but it also reflects the connection between improved gender equality and poverty reduction.

Sweden and Holland collaborate closely, in partnership with the Bolivian Government, to achieve gender equality in Bolivia. Together they support the Vice Ministry for Gender, Generations and Family issues (VAGGF).

The purpose of the present evaluation is to assess to what extent the Swedish and Dutch contributions (since 1998) have been effective in relation to the following: International gender policies, Bolivian national gender policies, and the gender policies and guidelines that are supposed to govern the Swedish and Dutch development co-operation with Bolivia.

The Evaluation Team (hereafter the Team) worked in Bolivia 18–27th March 2002. The Team consisted of Mr. Tom Dahl-Østergaard (Team Leader, COWI), Ms. Sarah Forti (COWI) and Ms. Mónica Crespo (Independent Consultant).

The Team carried out approximately 30 interviews while in Bolivia. The respondents included the following: Government ministries, the Heads of Co-operation and all the sector specialists and those responsible for the cross cutting issues at the Swedish and Dutch embassies, other donor representatives and civil society organisations.

A careful review was undertaken of a range of policy and strategy documents, monitoring reports and minutes from meetings. A few projects, programmes or interventions within three thematic areas were selected for closer analysis: i) the gender specific programmes supported through the VAGGF, INE/SIIG and INE/MECOVI; ii) the democratic governance sector; iii) the education sector. A total of seven interventions were examined.

Conclusions and recommendations

The nearly 10 years of existence of the Vice Ministry for Gender (VAGGF) and the important achievements this has fostered in the policy area – the National Plan for Gender Equality, the Programme for the Reduction of Women's Poverty, and the National Plan for the Prevention and Eradication of Gender based Violence – provide an excellent platform for the promotion of gender equality in Bolivia.

The challenge for the future is to transform this into implementation. VAGGF will have an important role to play in this connection, but the Bolivian Government – all its ministries – and civil society must assume the challenge. On the basis of their strong previous involvement, Holland and Sweden would be natural partners in the next phase: implementation.

Overall

Sweden and Holland should continue to support the promotion of gender equality in Bolivia. Both modalities of support – strategic aspects through VAGGF and gender mainstreaming in sector wide support programmes – have been important and will continue to be so.

With regard to the future country strategy for Sweden's development co-operation with Bolivia, the Team recommends that the strategic support for gender mainstreaming at the national level is maintained on the basis of the strong links with poverty reduction. The gender specific programmes such as UNICEF and UNFPA should also be maintained but institutionalised within the relevant Ministries for better sustainability.

Mechanisms to reach civil society and women at grass root level need to be put in place. For this to be effectively implemented, both Embassies need to have an overview of key grass root movements and associations across the country.

Gender capacity within the Embassies

The Swedish Embassy should strengthen its capacity for gender analysis and gender mainstreaming in order to improve the implementation of the gender policies of Sida. A better balance needs to be struck between the policy ambitions and the operational capacity.

With regard to the gender expertise within the Swedish Embassy, there are basically two options: 1) assign the responsibility of mainstreaming gender to a full time expert or appointed official who has gender expertise; 2) adapt its gender policy to SWAP and provide the necessary gender training and tools to the sector officials for an effective implementation.

Given the anticipated expansion of the Swedish budget for the co-operation with Bolivia, the Team recommends that staff be allocated to the Embassy to ensure the presence of a gender specialist. If it is decided to revise the organisational structure at the Swedish Embassy, then it is the view of the Team that much could be learned from the positive experience of the organisational structure at the Dutch Embassy. At any rate, the policy priority to promote gender equality ought to be mirrored in the organisational structure of the Swedish Embassy.

The Dutch Embassy should promote a more effective dialogue to integrate and link the three cross cutting issues and explore their bearing on the overall objective to reduce poverty.

The Swedish and Dutch embassies should promote a more systematic integration of the gender perspective throughout the programme cycle. Qualitative and quantitative gender indicators should be explicitly included in the different phases of programmes. Where relevant, gender expertise should be included as part of the planning, review and evaluation of the different sector programmes.

Donor co-ordination

On the basis of their present leadership role in the Donor Gender Committee, Holland and Sweden should make it a priority to establish a clear mission and working agenda for this committee. The purpose of the Donor Gender Committee should be reconsidered and it needs to be discussed whether it should encompass a national dimension and selected key strategic members.

Gender Programmes

The Bolivian Government urgently needs to formulate an operational strategy for the achievement of gender mainstreaming within the various line ministries. In this connection, the role of VAGGF should also be clearly defined. Holland and Sweden should offer to assist the Bolivian Government in this regard. Such assistance may be in the form of a consultancy to develop different operational options to this end.

The Swedish support to both of the INE projects (SIIG and MECOVI) is coming to an end in 2002. With regard to the future production of sex disaggregated statistics, the demand for this is crucial. The fundamental challenge appears to be that of fostering a culture of reliance upon and use of statistical information within the Bolivian Government and the society at large.

Future support to the UNPFA project on sexual and reproductive health, which is an important and strategic theme, should be directed at the institutionalisation of the project in the relevant ministries and its monitoring done through the VAGFF. In order to continue reaching the grass root level, the institutionalisation and ownership of the project should also maintain the decentralised approach.

Democratic governance

The initiative of the PRI Technical Unit to prepare a strategy for the incorporation of gender equality in the PRI (Estrategía para Incorporar una Contribución Equitativa de Hombres y Mujeres en el Programa de Reforma Institucional) should be followed closely.

In regard to decentralisation, the Dutch and the Swedish embassies should make a concerted effort to incorporate gender equality into the PAD. One way of doing this might be to assign (and pay for) a gender specialist to the next joint-donor review of the PAD.

The future support for the promotion of gender equality through civil society organisations should be based on an analysis of the actual situation and context for the strengthening of civil society. Alternative counterparts should be defined that would enable Sweden and Holland to reach a more representative selection of the existing women's movement organisations in Bolivia. In this connection, mechanisms should be defined for the channelling of financial support to these.

In order to better monitor and account for the Dutch and Swedish contribution towards gender equality in Bolivia, a "baseline" should be constructed with simple indicators for the main sectors receiving support. Consideration should also be given to supporting a systematisation and analysis of already existing quantitative studies, and complementing this, where necessary, with new more qualitatively oriented research.

Education

Sweden and Holland should continue with a constructive dialogue with the Ministry of Education and maintain specific support with gender expertise. Clear and well defined gender indicators should be included in the jointly supported programme to the PRE.

A close follow up should be undertaken to ensure the maintenance of the achievements that have already been made within the curricular reform and the further mainstreaming of gender within the institutional component.

The plan for the institutionalisation of the UNICEF supported project on Women's Alphabetisation in the Vice Ministry for Alternative Education should be strongly supported. This should continue to include the valuable component of training women community leaders. Through the support to the VAGGF, both Embassies should ensure that gender is mainstreamed within the Vice-Ministry for Alternative Education's strategies and policies.

1 Introduction

Bolivia is the poorest country in South America and women are affected by poverty to a much greater extent than men are. The achievement of gender equality is a declared policy objective of the Bolivian Government. Gender equality is an objective in its own right, but it also reflects the connection between improved gender equality and poverty reduction.

Sweden and Holland collaborate closely, in partnership with the Bolivian Government, to achieve gender equality in Bolivia. Together they support the Vice Ministry for Gender, Generations and Family issues (VAGGF). Indeed, Holland and Sweden are the only donors that provide institutional support to this Vice Ministry with the objective to strengthen national gender policies and gender mainstreaming throughout the society.

1.1 Purpose of the evaluation

Both countries are currently reassessing their gender co-operation with Bolivia. In the case of both co-operations, the present bilateral agreement with VAGGF will end in 2002. In the case of Sweden, a new five-year-strategy for Swedish co-operation with Bolivia is due to be initiated in 2003. The present evaluation is meant to serve as an input to these processes.

More specifically, the purpose of the evaluation is to assess to what extent the Swedish and Dutch contributions (since 1998) have been effective in relation to the following: International gender policies, Bolivian national gender policies, and the gender policies and guidelines that are supposed to govern the Swedish and Dutch development co-operation with Bolivia.

1.2 Methodology

The Evaluation Team (hereafter the Team) worked in Bolivia 18–27th March 2002. The activities of the Team were concentrated in La Paz, but supplementary interviews were undertaken in Cochabamba by one of the team members, a national consultant, whose deep knowledge of the gender situation in Bolivia also contributed to the findings of the Team.

The Team consisted of Mr. Tom Dahl-Østergaard (Team Leader, COWI), Ms. Sarah Forti (COWI) and Ms. Mónica Crespo (Independent Consultant).

The Team carried out approximately 30 interviews while in Bolivia. The respondents included the following: Government ministries, the Heads of Co-operation and all the sector specialists and those responsible for the cross cutting issues at the Swedish and Dutch embassies, other donor representatives and civil society organisations.

A careful review was undertaken of the following types of documents: International gender policy documents; the Swedish and Dutch gender policies, gender guidelines and country strategy documents; minutes from meetings in the sector groups at the Dutch Embassy; minutes from Annual Negotiations and annual/semi-annual reports to donor headquarters; project documents and evaluation reports covering selected sectors.

In order to be more detailed, the Team selected for closer analysis a few projects, programmes or interventions within three thematic areas: i) The gender specific programmes supported through the VAGGF, INE/SIIG and INE/MECOVI; ii) the democratic governance sector; iii) the education sector. A total of seven interventions were examined.

The Team was guided by the traditional evaluation criteria of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability. In order to assess whether and how gender mainstreaming takes place, the Team attempted to explore the following parameters in all interviews: i) Explicit gender equality goal; ii) gender analysis; iii) mechanisms for gender mainstreaming; iv) gender skills; v) gender networking.

1.3 Key concepts

The following gender concepts are used in the report. For a further discussion of various gender concepts, please refer to Annex 4.1

Gender refers to the attributes and opportunities associated with being male or female and the sociocultural relationships between women and men and girls and boys. These attributes, opportunities and relationship are socially constructed and are learned through a socialisation process.

Gender equality refers to equal rights, responsibilities and opportunities of women and men and girls and boys. Gender Equality therefore is not only a "women's issue" but should concern and engage men as well as women. Equality between women and men is seen both as a human rights issue and a precondition for and indicator of sustainable people-centred development.

Gender mainstreaming implies that attention to equality between women and men should pervade all development policies, strategies and interventions. It involves giving attention to equality in relation to analysis, policies, planning processes and institutional practices which set the overall conditions for development. It requires that analysis is made of the potential impact on women and men of development interventions in all areas of societal development.

1.4 Structure of the report

The remainder of this report is structured as follows: Chapter 2 describes the gender situation in Bolivia; Chapter 3 presents the CDF-framework for donor co-operation with Bolivia; Chapter 4 provides an overview of the policy framework; Chapter 5 analyses the strategic gender dialogue and co-operation mechanisms; Chapter 5 discusses gender mainstreaming in Sweden's and Holland's country programmes; Chapter 6 assesses gender mainstreaming in selected sectors and programmes; and Chapter 7 presents conclusions and recommendations.

¹ The definitions are derived from the Sida Action Programme for promoting equality between women and men in partner countries. The Annex may serve as a useful tool for staff at the embassies.

2 Gender Equality in Bolivia

Bolivia's population began the new century numbering approximately eight million inhabitants (8,328,700), with very slightly more women (51%) and an overwhelming majority of young people and children (68% under 15 years of age). Reinforcing the Latin American tendency for growth in cities to outweigh that of the rural areas to the detriment of the latter, the cities of Bolivia are inhabited by the majority of the population (5,307,638). More than three million people live in the rural zones and it is here that extreme poverty and the lowest human development indicators are concentrated. The rural population and a considerable percentage of the urban population belong to 37 distinct indigenous nations which are situated in different ecological levels which vary from the high mountains of the Andes to the Amazonian plains. Gender Equality issue is closely linked to the issue of Poverty, not only in terms of unequal distribution of financial resources, but also in terms of unequal access and control of resources in all crucial development spheres of society such as Health, Education, Democratic Governance and Rural Development.

Gender relations are framed within multiple *patriarchal gender systems*² which are interrelated with levels of class status and membership of specific cultures. In all these systems, men, because of their sex, tend to enjoy greater advantages, possibilities, and conditions in almost all aspects of life. As a general tendency, the position of women is more unfavourable.

It is nevertheless important to qualify the above. Women from the ruling classes have little in common, except their gender, with indigenous women. At the same time, the differences between men from different regions of the country (for example, "Cambas", i.e., people from Santa Cruz, and "Qollas", i.e., people from the Altiplano), can be bigger than those between young girls and boys from the urban middle classes.

To have a stable and well paid job in Bolivia is a privilege. The formal labour market is very restricted and, as a general rule, is witness to discrimination based on gender, as regards level of income as well as regards working conditions, salary levels, and promotion.

A great part of the urban population is under employed and concentrated in informal sector services and commerce, working independently and working in family businesses. 62% of them are women. This sector is characterised by low levels of productivity and income, precarious labour conditions, vulnerability, low levels of qualifications, low investment levels, and in many cases, by conditions of subsistence.

From childhood, men and women in the rural areas actively participate in different tasks that must be carried out in the household production units according to a relative and very dynamic differentiation of tasks based on gender which varies according to the agricultural calendar and seasonal migration. However, male work is generally valued more than women's work both internally and externally. In the development context, external agents such as the State and NGOs have favoured their relationship with the "male heads of family".

The households which have the greatest problems of access to social, economic, and political resources are those which are headed by women, both in urban as well as rural areas. On the poverty "scale", these households confront destitution.

² Based on studies by S. Rivera, S. Paulson, and Z. Lehm between 1995 and 2001.

Among the greatest problems faced by women, as a product of their devalued gender condition, are those of harassment, which is expressed in psychological and physical violence within the family, sexual harassment, labour discrimination, and violence at school. A number of judicial and procedural norms now exists that has enabled violence within the family to be brought out from the private arena, and that has institutionalised it as part of the agenda of public politics. But which has not yet managed to make any significant contribution to putting a stop to this phenomenon.

2.1 Overview of Gender Equality within Education, Health and Good Governance

The majority of illiterates (14%) are rural women (one in two women). It is also women who have lower levels of educational instruction. In general males have greater possibilities of continuing secondary and tertiary studies. Thus, among the scant population that does manage to become educated to the professional level, women represent the smallest percentage of it. There still exists a series of stereotypes and prejudices concerning the need to educate women, which are also associated with conditions of poverty, according to which parents must *prioritise* access to education for their sons.

Behind the high infant mortality rate (92 per 1,000) and the high maternal mortality rate (390 per 100,000), there are women who still do not have many alternatives for controlling their fertility, who do not trust public health services, and who must bring up their children in very poor housing conditions and in an absence of basic services. This demonstrates that there is an insufficiency of health programmes of sufficient coverage and quality, and that health programmes and expenditure in health have not reached those who are most in need of them.

Bolivia has a great tradition and capacity for organisation. The social organisations, whether peasant, union, guild, community- or ethnic-based, and other types, which are at the same time organisations that take political decisions and which are actors in the Bolivian social movement, have been led and are mainly led by men. Participation by women was and is always active, but is still symbolic. Women do not participate under the same conditions of representation in debates and discussions, the writing of proposals, the working out of strategies and in the defence of the central problems that involve women. This situation is evident in all the social and political organisations in Bolivia, from peasant and indigenous organisations to urban union confederations. Within these organisations, in recognition of the presence of women, there are *carteras, comisiones or secretarías*, positions which refer to women's matters, a situation that is accepted by women, and which in practice is still a symbolic recognition only.

This situation is defined not only by cultural gender systems that determine public roles such as male ones, but also involves the accumulated disadvantages that women suffer when trying to gain social access and when trying to get represented, such as level of education, Spanish language fluency (in the case of women peasants), and knowledge of social and political dynamics outside the immediate arena of the family and community. This is basically because domestic and productive responsibilities fall upon women, and these tasks are difficult to delegate or to abandon. Faced with this situation, peasant women and indigenous women are the most subjugated citizens of the country. They are excluded from Bolivia's political and social processes. In the last decade of the last millennium there were few initiatives and little progress made to remedy this situation.

The political reforms that took place in the previous decade, such as decentralisation and popular participation, have brought about an unusual political dynamic in the municipalities, especially in the rural ones, which has generated processes bringing citizens closer to local power, access to financial and technical resources, and the emergence of local leaders. As with the others, this is an arena which is still the preserve of males. The leaders of the political parties that support them in this new rural democracy are in the main male.

At the level of the municipality, despite the rules set out under the Law of Popular Participation⁴, and in the OTBs and in the Vigilance Committees, there are few women who have access to the training, participatory planning and the arenas of local decision-making. This state of affairs could lead to a situation whereby the evident inequalities between men and women are actually worsened.

The applying of laws aimed at setting standards for the participation of women in electoral contests⁵ has permitted a significant increase in the number of women town counsellors and women mayors, and who face many challenges related to a multiplicity of demands and scarce resources and support.

The democratic system in place in Bolivia still excludes women from the public arenas of decision, power, and representation. It also excludes men, women, and young people belonging to the majority, subordinated classes and cultures, a situation which prevents the collective and qualitative progress of democracy and the exercising of citizens' rights. Although progress has been made on the legal front, i.e., laws that set out minimum quotas of women's participation, the progress has not been up to now either sufficient or effective.

³ Carteras, comisiones and secretarías refer to organisational positions filled by women.

⁴ The Law of Popular Participation provides for the fact that participation in the different fora of local power must be equal between the sexes: 50% men and 50% women.

⁵ In 1995 there were 135 female town counsellors in office (8%). In the last elections in 1999, there were 542 female town counsellors (32%).

3 Donor Co-operation with Bolivia

Bolivia has been in the forefront since the World Bank launched the Comprehensive Development Framework (CDF) process in early 1999.

The CDF is an approach by which countries can achieve more effective poverty reduction. It emphasises the interdependence of all elements of development – social, structural, human, governance, environmental, economic, and financial. It advocates: a holistic long-term strategy; the country in the lead, both "owning" and directing the development agenda, with the development partners each defining their support in their respective business plans; stronger partnerships among governments, donors, civil society, the private sector, and other development stakeholders in implementing the country strategy; and a transparent focus on development results to ensure better practical success in reducing poverty.

As an integral part of the CDF process, Poverty Reduction Strategy Papers (PRSP) are to be prepared by national authorities, in close collaboration with the World Bank, in all Low Income countries receiving support from IDA and ESAF.

The PRSP has been finalised in Bolivia, and all the official donors have agreed to work within the new framework, which is referred to as the *Nuevo Marco de Relacionamiento con la Cooperación Internacional* (see section 5.1.2).

The Swedish and Dutch development co-operation with Bolivia – including their efforts to promote gender equality – should therefore be seen in the context of the CDF process to improve the relationship between donors and recipients.

4 Policy Framework

4.1 The International Gender Framework – Beijing and CEDAW

The creation of a specific international legal instrument for women's rights was facilitated by the first global conference on women, i.e. the 1975 International Women's Year Conference in Mexico City. The CEDAW Convention emerged in 1979 as the most comprehensive treaty on women's human rights. The Convention encompasses all rights within the following areas: gender equality goal; the elimination of customary practices and stereotypes; suppression of trafficking and exploitation of prostitution; political rights: participation and representation; citizenship; education; work; self-employment and employment; health; social rights; rural women; legal and contractual capacity and marriage and family. Within these areas, the key features of the CEDAW Convention are:

- Formal recognition that all human rights and fundamental freedoms apply to women as they
 do to men;
- Prohibition of discrimination in the enjoyment of those formally guaranteed rights and creation
 of equal opportunities for women to exercise all rights and freedom; and
- Identification and elimination of genderspecific obstacles to the equal enjoyment of rights and freedoms.

The importance of development was also highlighted in the CEDAW Convention without any dissent. Sweden was the first country to commit itself to CEDAW and ratified in 1980. Bolivia ratified in 1990, and the Netherlands in 1991. All without reservations.

The number of governments that ratified the Convention increased from 114 at the end of 1992 to 153 at the time of the Beijing Conference in 1995. CEDAW and Beijing Fourth World Conference followed parallel processes and the UN, hence broadened its methods of work from the slow process of negotiating conventions to the adoption of global plans of action by inter-governmental conferences. One of the most important but difficult mandates of the Beijing Fourth World conference, is the imperative that equal status and the human rights of women should be integrated into the *mainstream* of the United Nations' system-wide activity and be *regularly and systematically* addressed throughout relevant United Nations bodies and mechanisms. In this respect the creation of women's machinery within national government is key to ensure that a gender equality action plan is translated at national level and mainstreamed across the governmental apparatus and the ministries. The turning point and objective was to put gender equality on the political agenda at national level and ensure that it is mainstreamed across the different sectors and at all levels of society.

4.2 Bolivian National Gender Strategy and Policy

In the last 15 years, Bolivia has shown important signs of political will to attend to the obvious differences that exist between the sexes and in recognising openly the specific limitations of the condition of Bolivian women. This is demonstrated by Bolivia being signatory to different treaties and international platforms.

In agreement with the Beijing recommendations, an important advance has been the setting up of the national organism (VAGGF) to promote policies of equal opportunities, which is the governing entity responsible for gender and which enjoys its own forum in the organisational structure of the government.

In the wake of the State's tradition of sidelining the situation of women, in 1993 the Sub-Secretariat of Gender Affairs was set up, with the "status of a body charged with setting guidelines for public policies on gender equality and gender equity" and legal support in order to institutionalise a gender focus, and charged with observing treaties and international compromises. This arena has been maintained during different administrations, under different names and with varying styles and with different degrees of quality of leadership.

The theme of gender has been incorporated as such into the public agenda, understood as an unavoidable question in policies aimed at sustainable human development. Paying attention to gender has made it clear that the problems and inequalities of women are closely related to cultural constructions and their associated values. This has made possible gains in a more ideological and integrated understanding of their causes. It has also made it possible to break down social sector policies and to penetrate all those sectors of the State whose decisions and actions have an effect on men and women and the relationship they have to one another.

The general setting in which gender policies are located is characterised by important institutional and policy reforms concerning the modernisation of the organs of the State. There are important advances in the law-making and policy framework. In this sense, gender policies and national gender plans have been designed on behalf of the government, new problems linked to gender are being dealt with in the dispensing of justice, and legal reforms have been enacted in favour of gender equity in Parliament. This signifies, furthermore, that some institutional supports have been placed in each of the powers of the State in order to promote the policies and practice of equity.

The National Plan for Gender Equity, PNEG (2001–2003) lays out rules and policies aimed at applying the principals of equity and equality of opportunity and rights between men and women. It is based on the proposals set out in a Decree (D.S.24864 of 1997) for equal opportunities for men and women, and its main focus is on creating a fully-rounded citizenry, from a gender perspective, as referring to citizenship, politics, economic and social life.

The Poverty-Reduction programme as it relates to women intends to be advanced based on the original guidelines of the PNEG. It aims at improving capacity and at increasing opportunities of access to services, resources and income of vulnerable categories of women.

The National Prevention and Eradication of Gender Violence programme aims at achieving a reduction in violence. This is one of the themes that have been emphasised by the two government administrations due to the fact that there is a constant demand for tackling the problem.

In recognition of the fact that gender must be included in all areas, the PNEG has been reinforced by a supreme decree according to which all the ministers of the State are charged with applying and fulfilling the plans and programmes in their respective areas of competence. This in some way forces all sectors to consider the policies and measures that they implement to tackle gender equity problems. This cross-cutting application of gender supposes the deployment of forces in each sector, with still few explicit activities, but which do open up arenas and concrete work opportunities.

In order for Bolivia to access the resources available for external debt forgiveness (HIPC), processes of "national dialogue" consultations with civil society were developed. Out of the demands arising from this dialogue, the Bolivian Poverty-Reduction Strategy (PRSP) was designed. Its main goals are aimed at reducing the incidence of poverty, increasing life expectancy, and increasing the percentage of the population's years spent at school. The strategic components of the PRSP are: increase opportunities for employment and income; develop the capacity of the individual; increase the security and protec-

tion of the poor and promote integration and social participation. Each one of these strategies is traversed by the cross-cutting themes of ethnicity, gender, and environment.

The links between the Gender Plan and the PRSP are still weak, in the sense that all the components for operationalisation of the gender cross-cutting theme have not been made explicit. In all cases the challenge of implementing the plans and strategies and of achieving the important and necessary goals that have been formulated remains ahead.⁶

4.3 Sweden's and Holland's Gender Policies, Guidelines and Country Strategies

4.3.1 Gender policies and guidelines

Sweden

The Swedish International Development Agency (Sida), contrary to the Dutch co-operation, is an independent governmental development authority. Sida is in the process of revising its Action Programme for promoting equality between women and men in partner countries including the Experience Analysis, Policy and Action Plan. In addition to the Action Programme, Sida has published a series of guidelines and handbooks on how to mainstream gender in the relevant sectors of development co-operation such as Education, Health, Water and Sanitation.

Sida defines Gender Equality as one of the development goals and gender mainstreaming as the technique to achieve this goal. The Sida Gender Policy has the following main starting points:

- · National priorities and initiatives;
- Commitment to priorities established in Beijing;
- Equality between women and men as an important societal issue;
- Gender as a focus on both women and men.

The policy clearly identifies gender mainstreaming and specific support to women as two crucial and non-contradictory approaches in the promotion of gender equality. In addition, Sida highlights the attention to equality in co-operation and co-ordination with other actors as the third key approach.

The Sida Action Plan 1997 presents a strategy for how equality will be promoted within the context/sector issues with which it is working and underlines the following key issues:

- Attention to equality between women and men at *all stages* of the country strategy development country analysis, results-reporting and development of a concrete strategy;
- Inclusion of an assessment of the appropriateness and impact of efforts to promote equality between women and men in the reporting, with recommendations for improvements;
- Attention to the incorporation of gender equality in dialogue, process and documentation;
- Identification of the major equality problems within the partner country, the actions needed to be taken to rectify the situation, the potential for development co-operation to contribute to this process and more specifically, the role recommended for co-operation agencies;
- The decision on the allocation of funds to the country programme should also take up equality between women and men specifically;

⁶ Account of the support of the international co-operation in Bolivia to the national gender policy. Embassy of the Netherlands, 2001

Use of policy dialogue to reach an agreement on the appropriate goals, targets and indicators of
progress for promoting equality between women and men and start with national commitments to
equality.

In addition, Sida has developed gender guidelines and prompt sheets on how to mainstream gender in the different development sectors. Sida is further expected to provide gender training to all staff at Head Quarters and before they are sent to the field.

Holland

In 1999, there was a radical change in the Dutch gender politics. The emphasis went from gender specific projects to a focus on gender mainstreaming across the different sectors of development cooperation. *Gender Mainstreaming: A strategy for quality improvement, Advisory Report, June 2001*⁷ sets the following basic principle and structure for gender mainstreaming:

"The gender mainstreaming rationale is based on the principle that it gives a significant stimulus to the *quality* of policies not only with regard to Holland's development assistance but also across all national ministries. Whilst the individual commitment is regarded as important, a proper basic structure at institutional level is considered essential to the success of mainstreaming."

The five general preconditions for gender mainstreaming are:

- Commitment at political and official top level.
- · Explicit emancipation policy with clear targets;
- Determination of responsibility;
- Availability of gender expertise;
- Availability of resources (staff and budget) and instruments.

In addition to the basic institutional structure, the following monitoring mechanisms for the gender mainstreaming process have been established:

- *Visitation Committee on Gender mainstreaming* assessing the extent to which gender mainstreaming is integrated into the organisational structure of all ministries/departments and making recommendations on how the process of gender mainstreaming may be improved;
- *Co-ordination of Emancipation policy* providing support in the process of gender mainstreaming through discussion rounds with portfolio holders and *emancipation coordinators* of the departments. Further, tailor made support is provided in the departments' use of instruments, and the acquisition of external information and expertise.

The following instruments are being developed to support the gender mainstreaming process:

- A four year calendar with administrative and political action points for gender mainstreaming;
- A gender sensitive budgeting;
- An interdepartmental knowledge network;
- Databases and strategic information system; expertise database, a summary of good practices and summary of instruments with various search approaches;
- Emancipation expertise modules for regular training sessions and regular courses

⁷ Advisory Report by the Interdepartmental Working Group on Mainstreaming to the State Secretary for Social Affairs and Employment AE Verstand -Bogaert. Commissioned under the Dutch Medium Term Emancipation Policy Plan 2001–2010

In addition, there is an outer shell of actors whose main responsibility is to detect new developments possibilities for policy innovation. They are for instance university experts and NGOs.

4.3.2 Country strategies

Sweden's Country strategy

Sweden has worked in Bolivia since the beginning of the 1980s, but a formal agreement regarding bilateral co-operation was not signed until 1992. The agreement provided a flexible framework without disbursement commitments or time limitations. On this background, the co-operation has been able to evolve gradually over time and in response to developments in the Bolivian reform process.

The country strategy is the Swedish Government's most important instrument for managing the development co-operation with Bolivia. The existing strategy covers the period 1997–2001.

The following three areas of support are emphasised in the country strategy:

- Support to the reform process of the Bolivian Government
- Support to civil society
- Support to the productive sector.

In July 2000, an updated country strategy paper was adopted. It concluded that the 1997–2001 country strategy could be continued with a few minor adjustments on account of the changed context for development co-operation in Bolivia. In order to assist the Bolivian Government in its efforts to implement the new national strategy for poverty reduction (PRSP), Sida placed poverty reduction more firmly in the forefront of its development co-operation with Bolivia. Moreover, the updated country strategy paper emphasised that the Swedish support should move further into the direction of sectorwide assistance.

Sweden's country strategy for Bolivia also emphasises the objective to improve equality between women and men. This should be seen in the context of Sweden's overarching objective to reduce poverty. Poverty is viewed not simply as a question of lack of resources or poor distribution of incomes. It is also seen as a question of power. And since discrimination against women is serious in Bolivia, the promotion of gender equality is part and parcel of the effort to reduce poverty.

In the 1997–2001 country strategy, gender equality is mentioned as an explicit objective of the support to the reform process and to civil society. This is not mentioned, however, in connection with the support to the productive sector.

The areas for direct Swedish co-operation with the Bolivian Government are the support to VAGGF, INE/SIIG and INE/MECOVI. All other major programmes, with the exception of some programmes within the Private Sector and Water and Sanitation, are implemented through co-financing arrangements via multilateral organisations.

In terms of policy dialogue with the Bolivian Government, the country strategy stipulates that Sida should stress the need for giving VAGGF a higher "organisational status" and more political clout. In fact, gender equality is mentioned first – as one of four aspects – to be pursued in the policy dialogue.⁸

The gender programme agreed with the Bolivian authorities in December 1998 for the period until December 2001 included the following components:

⁸ The other three are: indigenous people, ownership and self-financing. Landstrategi för Bolivia, p. 18. Sida. 1996.

The above gender specific components have been selected with the strategic objective to promote gender mainstreaming for the achievement of gender equality in Bolivia.⁹

All Sida's support is provided in the form of grant assistance. According to the country strategy, annual disbursements were planned to be in the order of SEK 130 million. Of this amount, the annual disbursements to VAGGF were to be about SEK 8 million.

The actual disbursements to Bolivia as a whole have been higher, averaging SEK 165 million per year over the period 1999–2001. Disbursement reached SEK 214 million in 2001 and a similar figure is expected for 2002. Moreover, it is envisaged that Swedish support to Bolivia may increase even further in the future. The disbursements to VAGGF, however, did not follow the rising overall trend of disbursements; they remained at SEK 4–5 million per year over the period. The disbursements are selected to the period of the disbursements.

Holland's Country strategy

In contrast with Sida – and most other bilateral donors – Holland does not have a country strategy for its co-operation with Bolivia. A set of principles, strategic decisions and a number of programme specific government agreements guide the Dutch development co-operation.

Previously, the Dutch co-operation supported Bolivia with a large number of projects and programmes in seven different sectors, one of which was gender. In 1999 the Dutch authorities implemented fundamental changes in their development co-operation. First of all, a sector-wide approach was adopted. In Bolivia, this implied that the number of sectors was reduced from seven to three: Decentralisation and Institutional Development; Education; and Productive Rural development. At the same time, it was decided to work with three crosscutting issues – Gender, Environment and Indigenous People – in each of the sectors chosen.

Holland supports two to three programmes within each sector and Holland is not the sole donor in any one of the sector programmes supported. Such programmes are usually supported – through joint-financing arrangements – with two or more other donors.

Budgetary flexibility is a noteworthy feature of Dutch development co-operation. There are no separate budget lines for each of the three sectors. Instead, one single aid budget is allocated to Bolivia each year. The funds available are completely fungible and disbursements are made, therefore, in accordance with the agreements made and the needs of the actual implementation of programmes.

A separate budget of Euro 2 million per year is set aside for specific gender activities over and above the resources needed in connection with the endeavour to mainstream gender in all the programmes

15

⁹ The support to INE actually comprises two separate projects: SIIG (Sistema de Indicadores de Igualdad de Género) and MECOVI (Mejoramiento de las Encuestas y Medición de las Condiciones de Vida).

¹⁰ The indicative planning figures from 2001 to 2003 show an increase of 24 percent (this does not include balance of payment support). Minutes from the Annual Negotiations held in December 2001, Annex 2-1.

¹¹ The disbursement figures cited are derived from the Swedish Embassy reports that are issued every 6 months on the development co-operation with Bolivia: *Utvecklingssamarbetet med Bolivia – Halvårsrapport*. A report from VIPFE: *Situación de Cartera de Programas y Proyectos Financiados por el Gobierno de Suecia en Bolivia a Diciembre 2001* (February 2002) states that disbursements to VAGGF had reached SEK 7.4 million by the end of 2001. The government agreement for this programme runs over the period 1998–2002.

supported. The rationale for this is the continued need for certain WID-specific activities, coupled with the desire to reach the grassroots and achieve poverty reduction.

One quarter of the above amount is provided to the VAGGF. The Dutch disbursements to this Vice Ministry are, therefore, of the same magnitude as the Swedish disbursements. In fact, the Dutch and the Swedish each provide 50 percent of the external funds that are given to VAGGF. The remaining three-quarters of the special gender budget are currently provided to eight separate gender projects. The titles of the projects give a flavour of the type of activities that are supported:

- · Centre for rehabilitation of young women
- · Articulation of women
- · Master's degrees in gender
- Political participation of women
- · Household economics and management
- · Network against violence
- · Gender mainstreaming in radio communication
- Capacity building of female-headed households.¹²

Overall, the Dutch disbursements to Bolivia averaged EUR 23 million per year over the period 1998–2001. For comparative purposes, this corresponds to approximately SEK 207 million, which is about 25 percent higher than Sweden's average annual disbursements. Over the same period, the average annual disbursements to gender projects (including the support to VAGGF) were EUR 410,350, or two percent of total disbursements. This amount corresponds to about SEK 3.7 million. In other words, the Dutch and Swedish financial contributions to specific gender projects and programmes have been of the same magnitude.

4.4 Key findings

Although it is not the objective of the evaluation to make a strict comparison between the two countries' gender policies and guidelines, the following should be noted:

- It is clear that Sweden and Holland's gender approaches are in line with the international gender
 policy framework. This is exemplified through the strategic choices of programme support to
 women's national machineries, sex-disaggregated statistics, education, women's alphabetisation programmes and sexual and reproductive health.
- Sida's gender policies and guidelines are in line with the Beijing Platform for Action and the CE-DAW convention. The weakness does not lie with the content of Sida's gender policies and guidelines, but with their implementation. Whereas Holland does not have the same spectrum of publication in terms of gender policies and guidelines, the focus of its gender mainstreaming strategy is on its *effective* implementation in all sectors. The Dutch have considered allocations of adequate human and financial resources, combined with the establishment of appropriate monitoring mechanisms, as *pre-conditions* to the effectiveness of gender mainstreaming.

¹³ List of projects (in Spanish titles) provided by the Dutch Embassy. The total financial commitment to these ongoing projects is EUR 2.5 million (different implementation periods for each project).

¹⁴ The conversion is based on the exchange rate between EUR and SEK on 5 April 2002. The figures were provided to the Team by the Dutch Embassy in La Paz.

- It must be emphasised that Sweden's political role in advancing the concept of gender equality in development co-operation has been at the fore-front of international co-operation in Bolivia. Sweden has prioritised its support towards mainstreaming gender at national level rather than allocating financial resources for gender expertise within its organisational structure. Whilst Sweden's focus on mainstreaming gender at national level has been instrumental and strategic, the lack of emphasis on the organisational structure and gender expertise has limited Sweden's scope for a systematic gender mainstreaming across the different sectors of its development co-operation. In this context, the high number of sectors the Swedish development co-operation is covering adds to the complexity of mainstreaming gender within the Sida supported programmes.
- Sweden has not focused on gender mainstreaming within the sector programmes. Instead, Sweden has supported some important gender specific programmes with the overall strategic objective to promote gender mainstreaming at the national level, and thereby to achieve gender equality in the Bolivian society as a whole. This approach has been appropriate, given the limited size of the Swedish country programme in the early years and the relatively small number of staff at the Embassy.

5 Strategic gender dialogue and co-operation mechanisms

The importance of Holland's and Sweden's support for the promotion of gender equality in Bolivia goes far beyond the projects and programmes they support. On balance, the strategic gender dialogue that is maintained between the authorities of these two countries and a range of different interlocutors (government, civil society and other donors) in Bolivia may be of equal importance.

5.1 Government

5.1.1 Background

Attention paid by the State to the explicit disadvantages of Bolivian women was traditionally afforded second place. Institutionally, women were considered to be a "vulnerable group", together with orphans, old people and the handicapped.

In the beginning of the 1990s, a group of women linked to feminist NGOs designed a programme, still within the traditional state structure, with an innovative focus, out of which the structural inequalities and problems of Bolivian women came to light. This programme set out to deal with gender inequalities, to define policies, to propose laws and to push through and implement the commitments that the country was signing up to. The creation of the Sub-Secretariat of Gender Affairs, now the Directorate of Gender Affairs¹⁴ under the VAGGF, was also promoted and strengthened from outside, by a movement made up of professional women linked to NGOs and universities.

The international co-operation, particularly Canada, Sweden, Holland, Switzerland and Germany, offered support in this process which quite definitely permitted the consolidation of gender concerns, a support that continues up to the present.

5.1.2 Mechanisms of dialogue with the Government

The strategic gender dialogue between Sweden/Holland and the Bolivian Government is carried out at several levels and in different fora:

Consultative Group Meetings

The CG-meetings provide an annual forum in which the Bolivian Government meets representatives from all the official donors – bilateral and multilateral – that co-operate with the country. During these meetings national development plans and other important matters are discussed and pledges are made by the donor community. CG-meetings, in general, are held in Paris under the chairmanship of the World Bank.

In the case of Bolivia, the CG-meetings have become an important forum for dialogue and co-ordination with a high degree of Bolivian ownership. Since 1999, the CG-meetings have been held under chairmanship of the Bolivian Government in accordance with the *Nuevo Marco de Relacionamiento con la Cooperación Internacional.* Moreover, the CG-meetings have come to represent the annual culmination of the ongoing dialogue between the donor community in Bolivia and the Bolivian Government. Since 1999, working groups have been established – also under the chairmanship of the Bolivian Government – to follow up on the CG-meetings and prepare for the next ones coming. The above is in full agreement with the principles of the CDF, which stresses government ownership and donor co-ordination. On this background, the CG-meetings provide an essential forum for dialogue on gender equality.

¹⁴ Dirección General de Asuntos de Género, dependiente del VAGGF.

According to the half-yearly reports from the Swedish Embassy in La Paz,¹⁵ the key issues on the agenda for the CG-meetings in 1999 and 2000 were the following: Follow-up on the performance indicators of the Government programme for poverty reduction¹⁶, the Public Expenditure Review, and overall questions like gender equality and environmental issues. The CG-meeting in 2001 focused on the PRSP and the implementation of President Quiroga's 12-months emergency programme.¹⁷

During CG-meeting in September 2001, the Head of Sida, La Paz, made a presentation entitled "The Mainstreaming of Gender." In this speech, he expressed concern that the Government's documents presented for the donors at the CG-meeting, including the 12-months programme, did not deal sufficiently with the gender issue. He also pointed out that the absence of the gender issue had been commented upon during the previous three CG-meetings.

It can be concluded from the above that the Bolivian Government did not place the gender issue on the agenda for the CG-meetings. It appears that Sweden's participation in these meetings did ensure that gender became an issue after all.

Annual Negotiations

Holland and Sweden each have annual negotiations (bilateral) with the Bolivian Government. During these, a high level delegation from donor headquarters carries out a series of negotiations with representatives from the Bolivian Government. The format typically comprises the following: (i) discussion of political and economic issues and development policies of the Bolivian Government; (ii) discussion of Dutch/Swedish development co-operation policies and principles; and (iii) review of the portfolio of projects and programmes supported.

Sweden, in particular, has seized the opportunity of the annual negotiations to stress the importance it attaches to gender equality. In 1998, for example, the Swedish delegation (headed by Sida's Director General for Latin America) stated that equality between men and women constituted one of the principal priorities of its co-operation. In 2001, the same point was repeated in the Swedish delegation's opening statement at the annual negotiations.¹⁸

The support to VAGGF has featured prominently in the annual negotiations. In 1998, for example, the Swedish delegation urged the Bolivian Government to ensure that salaries at VAGGF were paid by Bolivian counterpart funds. This pressure has borne fruit. Today, the Bolivian Government pays roughly 90 percent of the salaries in VAGGF (the balance being financed by Sweden and Holland).¹⁹

In the 1999 annual negotiations, the Swedish delegation had a rather firm dialogue with the Bolivian Minister for Sustainable Development, under which VAGGF belongs. The Swedish delegation stated that Sweden and Holland, together, felt the need to propose a series of changes in VAGGF and look for solutions through a *Plan de Transición*. The background for this was an institutional crisis in VAGGF, lack of clarity about its mission, personnel problems rooted in political quotas rather than competence, and lack of political will to support VAGGF. If this were not addressed, then it would not be possible for Sweden and Holland to continue justifying the support to VAGGF.

¹⁵ The Team reviewed five of these, covering the period May-October 1999 to April-September 2001.

¹⁶ Sweden and Holland lobbied intensively for the incorporation of a gender perspective in the performance indicators.

¹⁷ The economic crisis affecting Bolivia caused average incomes to decline 10 percent between 1997 and 2001.

¹⁸ Minutes from the annual negotiations between the Governments of Bolivia and Sweden, 1998–2001.

¹⁹ Over the period 1998–2001, the total budget of VAGGF has averaged around USD 1 million per year (including programme costs).

Subsequently, Sweden and Holland – the only donors to VAGGF – actually stopped disbursements to VAGGF (latter half of 1999 and all of 2000) and demanded a reorganisation of this Vice Ministry with clear priorities and a realistic political plan of action.

As a result of this strong pressure – a point that has been corroborated during the Team's interviews with third parties in La Paz – VAGGF did reorganise itself, in accordance with the recommendations following from a Dutch and Swedish financed consultant's report. Moreover, in March 2001 three National Gender Plans were presented. They were transformed into state policy (*Decreto Supremo 26350*) by 11th October 2001.

Meetings with VAGGF

Sweden has held semi-annual meetings with VAGGF from the beginning of its support to this Vice Ministry. Holland, on the other hand, has not maintained this kind of dialogue. As from 2001, however, the Dutch Embassy in La Paz has joined these regular meetings with VAGGF. Moreover, as several of the programmes are financed jointly, VAGGF need only prepare one common set of technical and financial reports in relation to the Swedish and Dutch support.

The degree of strategic dialogue at these semi-annual meetings appears to be limited. They seem to focus on a technical and financial review of all the VAGGF supported activities. As such, they serve as an important monitoring instrument and a means to exert influence at the operational level.

Furthermore, a very close and continuous dialogue takes place between VAGGF and the gender specialist at the Dutch Embassy as well as the Swedish Embassy officer in charge of the support to the VAGGF programme.²⁰ The Vice Minister at VAGGF expressed her appreciation of this close dialogue in an interview with the Team. She referred to it as *asesoria permanente*, implying that this dialogue is valued as a permanent support. There is little doubt that elements of both Swedish and Dutch gender policies find their way into the activities of VAGGF through this level of dialogue.

Other ministries

Apart from the above, Sweden and Holland pay attention to gender equality via the direct and indirect relations that they maintain with other ministries of the Bolivian Government.

As Sweden mainly works through multilateral agencies represented in Bolivia, the ability to influence is largely indirect. Sweden therefore endeavours to ensure that there is a reasonable degree of gender sensitivity in the programmes that they support through the World Bank, UNICEF and UNFPA. They do this through annual consultations with these agencies and participation in their regular programming and monitoring meetings. Sweden's ability to guarantee a strong focus on gender issues is, of course, constrained by the fact that Sweden is one among several donors funding the programmes of the World Bank and the UN agencies.

While Holland is involved in direct support to some Bolivian line ministries (education, rural development and popular participation), some of the above mentioned limitations also apply to their degree of influence with the Bolivian authorities. The reason is that Holland works almost exclusively through sector-wide support programmes in close co-ordination with other donors and the Government. This implies that Holland's desire to focus on gender equality has to be agreed with the other donors supporting the sector programmes.

²⁰ The gender specialist at the Dutch Embassy stated that she has at least three formal meetings a month with VAGGF and regular, if not daily, contact with staff in VAGGF.

It should be stressed that Sweden also participates in sector-wide support programmes (e.g. within the area of education) with other donors, despite the observations noted above regarding the different approaches of Sweden and Holland. It is a Swedish policy goal to support the implementation of the *Nuevo Marco de Relacionamiento con la Cooperación Internacional* (ref. section on CG-meetings above).

Moreover, Sweden's support to the National Institute of Statistics (INE), which seeks to create a national system of indicators to be able to measure and analyse the quantitative and qualitative gender aspects in Bolivia, will lead to the integration of a gender perspective in the official statistical system. This will be most important for the understanding of the gender situation in Bolivia and hence for gender mainstreaming throughout the society.

5.2 Civil Society

The Dutch/Swedish strategic gender dialogue with civil society in Bolivia is undertaken through at least three different modalities:

5.2.1 Women's networks

Swedish and Dutch co-operation has contributed to strengthening women's movements in Bolivia. Since the early 1990s, the main beneficiaries of this co-operation have been women's inter-institutional networks and women's policies. These networks constitute the formal reference point of a movement which is lead by professional, middle class women. Out of these networks and fora several arenas, some temporary, others permanent, have been created, in which proposals and appeals have been publicly and formally aired before the different authorities of the State. However, these arenas have not been able to become horizontally and permanently linked to other fora that bring women together, such as peasant base organisations and urban organisations. The applicability of these women's networks derives from their being able to access the financial resources of the international co-operation and the official know-how concerning gender.

The support to the Co-ordinator for Women (directly in the case of Holland and indirectly in the case of Sweden, through Diakonia) has been the central reference for the work with civil society undertaken by both donors. This support allows developments among women's organisations, in other sectors, in the guilds, and in other areas of the country to be mediated by these networks.

5.2.2 Delegated NGOs

Both donors delegate the administration of resources to NGOs from their own countries: Diakonia in the case of Sweden, and SNV and the Catholic Church's Pastoral Care Wing for the Dutch. These organisations support other Bolivian NGOs and organisations that have concrete projects. SNV and Diakonia use clear criteria considering a gender focus and they take this into account when appraising projects. Both SNV and Diakonia also make available discussion for on gender for their personnel and people outside the organisations.

5.2.3 Direct support to projects

Both donors also directly support specific gender projects. Areas that are supported concentrate on sexual and reproductive health, political participation, education, and human rights. By being able to draw on earmarked funds for the above-mentioned types of project, the institutional setup and follow-up for these interventions is direct and personal.

²¹ Diakonia's gender equality criteria reads as follows: "Partner organisations must have (or have an ambition to develop) a clear gender perspective in their work and within their organisation" (own translation from Swedish). Diakonia is currently devising criteria for how their partners ought to deal with gender mainstreaming in their activities.

5.2.4 Assessment of the importance of dialogue with civil society

The relationship with women's inter-institutional networks, for example with the *Coordinadora de la Mujer*, has been the primary beneficiary of the support over several years. This support has been effective at national policy level with regard to women's rights and lobby in international fora. For example, the *Coordinadora de la Mujer* has contributed to the following: the Government's decision to introduce quotas for the participation of women in elections; the setting up of municipal mechanisms to reduce violence against women; and the debate on freedom of abortion. On the other hand, the strong focus on supporting the *Coordinadora de la Mujer* has promoted the continued existence of this grouping of urban-based women, who are not representative of Bolivian women at large. As a result, there is little knowledge about local realities concerning the base organisations, to which the bulk of the women that suffer discrimination are affiliated.

5.3 Donor agency co-operation mechanisms on gender issues

5.3.1 Gender donor committee

The Gender Donor Committee has been an innovative and important process lead by Holland and Sweden until 2000 and presently under the chairmanship of UNFPA and Cida.

The Committee is a unique space for dialogue and reflection on the theme. Certain donors, like UNFPA and Cida, have expressed the need for a stronger and more permanent leadership of Sweden and Holland than is presently executed.

The Committee is a Donor network. The Bolivian State does not therefore have representation in the Committee and there are no connections to specific programmes or Bolivian institutions. In the same way, Bolivian civil society does not have representation in the Committee, but is only invited, like VAGGF, on an occasional basis. Unlike other inter-sectoral committees, the Gender Donor Committee is not organised within the NMR/CDF framework.

Although considerable efforts have already been taken by the gender specialist at the Dutch embassy to reach grass roots movements outside La Paz, the dialogue seems still to be concentrated to the well known organisations in and around La Paz. In this respect, the Committee might benefit from for a diversification of interlocutors within civil society, such as associations of indigenous women, labour women and other grassroots associations.

Notwithstanding that the Gender Donor Committee had a yearly agenda for 2001 and attempts were made to evaluate it in the first meetings of the year, the methodology of the Committee is lacking of clear and precise orientation, mission, strategy and action plan which would strengthen the scope and effectiveness of its activities and *raison d'être*. The lack of a focused strategy might have limited the scope of the implementation of Committee's objectives.

5.3.2 Sector co-ordination

Apart from the above, Holland, in particular, manages to incorporate a measure of gender sensitivity in the programmes that are jointly financed with other donors. This is due to the systematic emphasis of the Dutch Embassy on gender mainstreaming and the special sector co-ordination groups that have been established within each of the three focus areas for the Dutch development co-operation.

In the area of rural development, for example, the sector co-ordination – spear-headed by the Dutch Embassy – has worked well. The Productive Rural Development group at the Dutch Embassy, which comprises two professionals who work full time on this theme, collaborate closely with the other main donors within the sector: GTZ, DFID, COSUDE, DANIDA and the IDB. The sector co-ordination group met eight times in the course of 2001. The objectives of the group are defined as follows: i)

Discuss sector policies and programmes, ii) promote the incorporation of cross cutting issues (like gender), iii) promote the institutionalisation of programmes and projects at the sector level; iv) coordinate activities and exchange experience; v) monitor joint initiatives within the sector. The other sector co-ordination groups have similar objectives.

The rural development sector co-ordination group has generated a series of positive results, including the following:

- The National Land Reform Institute (INRA), which is the focus of one of the Dutch supported programmes within the sector, has now established a "gender desk" to ensure that women are granted title to their landholdings.²²
- Having participated in the sector co-ordination group, the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MAGDR) asked the Gender Specialist at the Dutch Embassy to ensure that gender was taken into consideration as a selection criteria under an agricultural technology (SIBTA) programme supported by Holland.
- On several occasions during 2001, the sector co-ordination group discussed a proposal for a rural
 development programme that the IDB wanted to fund and implement in Bolivia. The presence in
 these meetings of the Gender Specialist from the Dutch Embassy ensured that certain gender
 weaknesses in the early versions of the IDB-proposal were addressed.

5.3.3 World Bank

The World Bank is one of the largest donors to Bolivia.²³ It has major influence on the programmes it co-finances with other donors within the Comprehensive Development Framework. At the same time, the World Bank is internationally recognised to be a strong proponent of gender equality, and its operations usually draw upon high quality gender guidelines and other instruments.²⁴

Against this background, the World Bank appears to be playing a surprisingly weak role in the promotion of gender equality in Bolivia. The World Bank is active within 6–7 sectors and it has a staff of 8–10 professionals at its La Paz office. None of these are gender specialists. The Team was given the impression that the World Bank, owing to its adherence to the principle of government ownership, endeavours to avoid any conflict with the Bolivian Government. As the latter has not shown the interest in gender equality that the donor community had expected, the World Bank apparently does not to see it as their role to look for ways to encourage the issue. It is the Team's impression that less of a "hands-off approach" and more encouragement, e.g. in the form of dialogue and active participation in the Gender Donor Committee, would be conducive to the mainstreaming of gender within the programmes that are co-financed with the World Bank.

5.4 Key findings

 The Swedish and Dutch co-operation have been of strategic importance in the promotion of gender equality. This has been substantiated by a unanimous opinion of all members of the donors' community that were interviewed by the Team.

²² It is reported that around 50 percent of all INRA land titles to be issued to individuals in the Chuquisaca Department will be in the name of women (interview with the Specialist in Productive Rural Development at the Dutch Embassy, 21 March 2002).

²³ Together with the IDB and CAF, the World Bank provides almost half of the total development assistance to Bolivia.

²⁴ In a meeting with the World Bank in La Paz, for instance, the Team was shown a new and highly pertinent publication:

[&]quot;Integrating Gender into the World Bank's Work" (January 2002), World Bank, Washington, D.C.

- The strong support to the *Coordinadora de la Mujer* has enhanced the lobby of gender issues at political level, but it has also limited the scope for direct dialogue with indigenous women. Although certain gender interests are defended, the *Coordinadora de la Mujer* is not representative of all Bolivian women's practical and strategic interests at large. Indigenous women are therefore lacking representation in the international and donor fora of dialogue.
- The central question for the Gender Donor Committee remains whether it wishes to continue being a donor agency committee or whether it should try to include the relevant Bolivian National authorities and civil society towards a greater national ownership of the gender related dialogue.
- The sector co-ordination groups have served as a useful platform to discuss the objective of gender equality. The Bolivian Government and other donors have benefited from the Gender Specialist at the Dutch Embassy and the systematic manner in which this person is involved in the activities of the sector co-ordination groups.

6 Gender Mainstreaming in Holland's and Sweden's country programmes

6.1 Holland

As mentioned in section 2.2.2 on the country strategy, the Dutch provide development assistance to Bolivia within three sectors and each programme is articulated with regard to three crosscutting issues.

The organisational structure of the Dutch Embassy reflects the importance that is attached to dealing with the crosscutting issues. The professional staff that works with development co-operation is divided between the sectors and the crosscutting issues as follows:

	Staff
Head of Co-operation	1
Productive Rural Development	2
Decentralisation and Institutional Development	3
Education	2
Crosscutting issues:	
- Gender	1
- Environment	1
 Indigenous people 	1

The Head of Co-operation, one person from each of the sectors and the environmental specialist are from Holland. The rest of the staff is Bolivian nationals. Furthermore, the above staff can draw on the services of two Dutch embassy staff who work in the area of finance.

Even the physical placement of the specialists on the crosscutting issues reflects the desire to address these issues in all the sector programmes; their offices are located in the centre of the embassy and the offices of the sector staff are situated around these. This structure encourages frequent contact and serves as a constant reminder to incorporate the crosscutting issues.

Since the beginning of its development co-operation with Bolivia 14 years ago, Holland has always had a gender specialist at the embassy. Until recently the gender specialists were Dutch nationals. Since June 2000, a Bolivian woman has held the position as technical gender specialist at the Embassy. Over the years, each gender specialist has had her personal style, strategy and influence within the gender theme – internally at the embassy, as well as in the embassy's external relations. It is the impression of the Team that the current Bolivian gender specialist is very capable and highly respected among embassy staff, other donors and the Bolivian counterparts. Given her insights and knowledge of the Bolivian context, it would probably be difficult for any Dutch specialist – who would be in Bolivia for only a limited number of years – to match her performance.

In 1999, when the Dutch implemented the fundamental changes in its development co-operation, the role of the gender specialist at the embassy changed. Hitherto, she had been working on WID programmes, alone, and more or less in isolation from the other programmes supported by Holland. After the decision was taken to mainstream gender into the sector programmes, the gender specialist has worked in a close and integral manner with the staff assigned to the sectors. According to her own estimate, the gender specialist uses about 70 percent of her time working on the sector programmes (the remainder being used on the gender specific programmes).

A modus operandi has been established at the Dutch Embassy whereby the three specialists on the crosscutting issues have to be involved in all major stages of the programme cycle (identification, formulation, appraisal, implementation and evaluation) within each of the sectors. Those who are responsible for the sector programmes have an obligation to mainstream gender (as well as environment and indigenous people) into all activities supported. Moreover, it is an administrative prerequisite that the gender specialist signs her approval of every document that authorises Dutch financial support to sector activities. Apart from this, the sector staff decides when it is necessary to call upon the assistance of the gender specialist in connection with internal meetings, meetings with other donors or Bolivian counterparts.

These mechanisms to mainstream gender are quite impressive. They ensure that gender is on the agenda in all phases of the programme cycle and in each of the three sectors of priority. Moreover, the space that is created within the Embassy for dialogue on the gender issue means that the sector specialists are continuously sensitised to the issue. Great care needs to be exercised, however, to ensure that the limited time of the gender specialist is primarily spent within the areas that hold the greatest potential for gender mainstreaming, such as education and rural development.

Finally, the personal commitment of the Head of Co-operation to mainstream gender has played an important role. His positive attitude to promotion of gender equality provides the kind of leadership that both enables and ensures that the staff at the embassy deals with the issue. The organisational structure of the Dutch Embassy and the administrative procedures that have been adopted to ensure gender mainstreaming probably would not have been implemented to the same extent without the full support of the Head of Co-operation.

6.2 Sweden

Sweden provides development assistance to Bolivia within five sectors. The professional staff that works with development co-operation is divided between the sectors as follows:

The Embassy now has a professional staff of six, including the Head of Co-operation. They are divided between the sectors as shown below:

	Staff
Head of Co-operation	1
Social Sector	1
Democratic Governance	1
Education	1
Private Sector	1
Water and Sanitation	1

The Head of Co-operation, the social sector and democratic governance officials are from Sweden, the rest of the staff is Bolivian nationals.

Sweden began its co-operation with only two permanent officials at Embassy level including the Head of co-operation. At the time, Sweden did not foresee the need for a full time gender specialist as staff member. Human resources quickly grew to a total of six and the gender expertise was integrated as part of the Social Sector. The allocation of resources were prioritising the financing of gender specific programmes, such as VAGGF, INE/SIIG/, INE/MECOVI, UNFPA and UNICEF with the overall objective of mainstreaming gender at national level rather than the presence of a full time gender expert at Embassy level.

Although gender mainstreaming tools and documents are available at the Embassy, they are not consistently nor systematically used by the officials. The officials have not received the necessary training and guidance on how to use gender-mainstreaming tools within their specific sectors. There seems to be a shared need among the embassy staff to have a more regular and structured form of interchange on the cross cutting themes and especially on gender. Certainly, officials feel the need for specific gender training at sectoral level tailor made to their relevant sector. This is not particular to Sweden's embassy in La Paz but has been the subject of recurrent finding in other Sida offices and Sida Headquarters in the latest Sida Gender Equality Evaluation in 2001.²⁵

6.3 Common strategic aspects to Holland and Sweden

The two embassies have common gender objectives and strategies, and they display a particular and common willingness to work in partnership on this theme. The close and constant co-operation between the two embassies and the national women's machinery, through their joint supported programs and regular contacts with the VAGGF, is viewed by all stakeholders as exceptional and unique. Sweden and Holland have thus formed a crucial strategic alliance in the creation of the Gender Donor Committee. Both embassies are jointly promoting and supporting gender equality at bilateral and multilateral levels.

Both co-operations have together proposed that VAGGF should take the lead and elaborate a country gender analysis covering the whole Bolivian society. VAGGF has in fact presented a proposal for terms of reference based on the Sida model and the draft has been commented upon by Sida gender experts at the policy department. This is a forward-looking step as there seems to be a lack of research and knowledge in certain sectors of society and especially with regard to conditions of indigenous women, who form a majority in Bolivia. Such knowledge would greatly enhance the scope of the embassies to identify the channels through which to reach to the grassroots and have an impact that is more visible at this level.

A general level of gender awareness can be identified in the sector programme officials in both embassies, but the in-depth knowledge and level of application of gender mainstreaming varies according to the official's knowledge of gender in the different sectors. The lack and need for gender training programmes can be noted in both Embassies. Gender training, whether in the form of a workshop or platform for discussion, would alleviate the gender specialist's workload (Dutch Embassy) and increase her capacity to effectively monitor and follow up gender mainstreaming in the different sectors.

Further, there has not been a mechanism to ensure that evaluations in the different sectors have included gender specialists, or that a gender perspective has been consistently taken.

6.4 Key findings

- Although the organisational structures and strategies differ, the common gender equality objective of each embassy has been perceived by the main stakeholders as equally strong and persistent.
- The presence of a gender specialist at the embassy depends on the financial resources that are being allocated for cross cutting issues (like gender) and the management commitment in the head quarters of the respective donor.

²⁵ The Sida Gender Evaluation in 2001 highlighted that without a defined organisational structure and assignment of administrative responsibility for the monitoring of gender mainstreaming, the systematisation of gender mainstreaming and the degree and depth of its implementation in the different sectors would be weakened.

- Sida's gender policies were developed before the Swedish Embassy's rapid growth in human and financial resources and have therefore not been adapted to the new Sector Wide Approach. As a result, the Embassy is left with an increasing workload and without the necessary gender tools and sufficient gender expertise to *effectively* and *systematically* mainstream gender in all sector programmes.
- The promotion of gender mainstreaming at national level does not prevent the embassy from pursuing gender mainstreaming in the different sector programmes. Both strategies need to be followed and complement each other. For instance, ensuring on a more systematic basis, that gender is integrated in Evaluations and Reviews would offer an opportunity to identify appropriate gender indicators and provide specific input to the theme within the different sector programmes. This would in turn provide grounds to focus on sector specific issues with VAGGE.

7 Gender Mainstreaming in Selected Sectors and Programmes

The Team examined seven interventions within the following areas: i) The gender specific programmes supported through the VAGGF; ii) the democratic governance sector; iii) the education sector.

7.1 Gender specific programmes

7.1.1 National Gender Equality Plan, VAGGF

The support of both embassies to VAGGF since its beginnings has been decisive in maintaining it and in keeping it relevant within the systems of the State.

There is a general opinion concerning the vital importance of the co-operation in this Vice Ministry, both concerning economic and also technical dimensions. This has signified for both donors close, continual follow-up, which has in some cases been interpreted as interference and in others as vital in the face of obvious operational weaknesses in VAGGF.

Initially, the co-operation covered 100% of VAGGF's costs, including salaries and the implementation of programmes that were jointly planned.

In the last government administration some important steps and signs have emanated from different levels. Among these is the taking-over of wages and salaries by the State of basic staff of VAGGF at central level. In the departments, some prefectures are covering operational and staff costs in the gender offices (direcciones de género) that were set up by the former Under-Secretary of Gender and which were also financed by the co-operation. At the level of the municipalities, more than 60 have absorbed within their costs the Integrated Legal Services (SLI) which deal with cases of violence within the family. In other municipalities, there are children and family protection units through which programmes aimed at women are dealt with and administered.

These signs are evidence of a certain amount of political will on the part of the State to consolidate legislation to deal with themes related to gender, especially the accumulated disadvantages suffered by women. The plans and programmes mentioned above and the attempts at introducing gender as a cross-cutting issue show that there are efforts being made to make progress on the gender front.

Of note are the institutional arrangements of the embassies concerning their technical support to VAGGF. By means of timely consultancies and permanent TA, the embassies' support has indisputably contributed technically, but this has not always resulted in enhanced capacity within VAGGF.

7.1.2 INE/SIIG and INE/MECOVI

Two of Sweden's four strategic gender projects are executed through Bolivia's National Institute of Statistics (INE). One of these projects (SIIG) aims to develop gender equality indicators that would provide sex disaggregated statistics through the official statistical information system of the country. The SIIG project is implemented by INE in collaboration with the Department of Post-Graduate Development Studies at the *Universidad Mayor de San Andres* in La Paz (CIDES-UMSA). The other project (MECOVI) seeks to improve household surveys on living conditions that are carried out systematically every year. These surveys cover the households' social and demographic situation, economic activities, educational achievement and health situation. Apart from Sweden, the World Bank, UNDP-CEPAL and the IDB also support the MECOVI project. The Swedish contribution to these two projects amounts to SEK 9.2 million over the period 1998–2002.

Considerable progress has been achieved in the production of sex disaggregated statistics within the areas of education and health. Apart from this, Sida has provided technical advice and training activities for users and staff at the INE. The training has been carried out by a consultant, Birgitta Hedman, who is an international capacity within the area of gender statistics. Some of the results can be seen at INE's web page on the Internet (www.ine.gov.bo).

The statistics will no doubt serve as an important input in connection with future endeavours to main-stream gender within all sectors of the Bolivian society. Sex disaggregated statistics are a prerequisite to analyse the degree of gender equality in all sectors. The main challenge – after the projects end in late 2002 – is to ensure that the results become institutionalised within the INE in order to become a permanent improvement of the official statistical information system of Bolivia. In this connection, the Team was told that Sida has not supported INE strategically in its relations with the Bolivian Government. However, the main difficulty regarding sustainability seems to be that there continues to be a rather weak demand for statistics from the State and the public sector in general. It must be recognised, therefore, that it is a long-term process to develop a society that acts upon the basis of statistical information and, hence, require statistical information.

7.1.3 The UNFPA supported project on Sexual and Reproductive Health

Sida has supported the UNFPA project "Gender Equality and Sexual and Reproductive Health for Teenagers" since 1999. The project operates within the framework of national policies developed within the Ministries of Education, Health and Sustainable Development and Indigenous Affairs. The objectives of this project are: 1) to contribute to the improvement of sexual an reproductive health of teenage girls and boys; 2) to strengthen the construction of gender equality through an integral approach that includes formal and informal education and gender sensitive provision of health services.

So far the result obtained have been as follows: 1) the training of health staff in five district in La Paz, El Alto and Santa Cruz. 2) the training of more than 2500 teachers in these three towns; 3) an analysis has been performed based on a survey which justifies the need for action targeting adolescents and teachers given the high the level of early pregnancies; 4) relevant training materials have been published and disseminated; 5) co-ordination of this project with the PRE has taken place so that the element of sexual and reproductive health is one of the four cross-cutting issues within the curricular reform.

In order to increase the chances of institutionalisation and ownership of the project within the governmental authorities, the project has tried to co-ordinate with the relevant Ministries and the VAGGF both at national and departmental levels. Further, it has attempted to discuss the role of the relevant ministries in the project.

There is no doubt that the crucial importance of the project with regard to gender equality is of practical and strategic nature. A better health and reproductive education would enhance the chances of girls and boys to continue with education and increase their chances to make choices in their lives towards improved living conditions. Moreover, given that the project has a decentralised approach, it has greater scope for reaching the grass root level outside La Paz. The links between gender and poverty reduction are therefore evident in this project and, in this sense, Sweden has been strategic in its choice to support the project.

7.2 The Democratic Governance sector

7.2.1 Institutional Reform Programme

One of the most important initiatives in recent years within the area of democratic governance is undoubtedly the Institutional Reform Programme (PRI). This programme finances the components regarding *Modernisation of the State and the Struggle Against Corruption*, both of which form integral parts of the institutional pillar of the development plan of the Bolivian Government. It is co-financed by Sweden, Holland, Denmark and the World Bank. Germany provides parallel financing towards the same objective. The PRI was launched in January 2000, following over 10 years of previous work and discussions within the area of civil service and personnel reform. The objective is to improve the quality of service and client orientation of government operations by creating more honest, cost-efficient and result-oriented public institutions.

Until recently, the gender sensitivity of the PRI has been very limited, if not non-existent.²⁷ Sida has fielded three missions to monitor the progress of the PRI and the Swedish support to this.²⁸ The report from the first of these missions (March 2001) was totally gender blind. The report from the second mission (October 2001) stated that "the PRI Technical Unit has accepted the idea of gender and indigenous sensitivity issues being raised in the new TOR being developed." The report also stated that of 66 new staff selected through the new recruitment process in the Ministry of Agriculture, only 3 were women. Based on this – less than five percent of the recruited being women – the report recommended that a gender specialist carry out an evaluation and audit of the process. The third report (February 2002) indicated that gender had been placed on the PRI agenda and that suggestions had been made to develop mechanisms that could both monitor the selection process and provide practical suggestions for guaranteeing greater diversity and representation within the emerging new Bolivian civil service.²⁹

While the Team worked in La Paz (March 2002), it had the opportunity to meet with the Bolivian consultant who had been hired by PRI with the objective to incorporate gender equality in the PRI. The ambition of the PRI Technical Unit is to increase the number of women in management positions to at least 15 percent and to ensure that the women, who are actually employed, succeed in their positions through a system of capacity building activities directed at them.

The latest developments relating to the PRI are, of course, encouraging. But owing to the lateness to deal with the gender issue, there is still a risk that it is treated like an "add-on" and not as an integral part of the programme.

7.2.2 Improving the political participation of women

The Dutch embassy, through its direct support to a Bolivian NGO (Proceso) and the Swedish embassy through Diakonia support in a well conceived way projects aimed at improving women's political participation. The main activities of these projects are forming and training of women leaders by providing them with knowledge and tools to measure their political participation. The great challenge that these projects face is how to monitor positive processes that the women leaders are going to bring about as a result of the training they have received.

²⁶ The Swedish contribution to PRI is SEK 68 million (2000–2005).

²⁷ The donors behind the PRI actually did raise the question about gender equality at an early stage, before the programme was initiated. They were not insisting on this, however.

²⁸ The reports by the consultant, Peter Spink, were available to the Team.

²⁹ This point was also taken up in the aide memoire from the third joint-donor review of PRI (18–22 February 2002), p. 5, item 16.

7.2.3 Decentralisation

Like the Institutional Reform Programme discussed above, the Decentralisation Programme (PAD) is one of the fundamental aspects of the process to reform the Bolivian state and government. Holland and Sweden co-finance this programme along with the United Kingdom and the World Bank (the latter provides 50 percent of the finance).³⁰ The total financial support for the PAD amounts to a budget framework of USD 80 million every two years over a foreseen 10 year period. Other donors that are active within the area, but do not participate with co-financing, form a socalled Parallel Group. These include IDB, USAID, Danida and KfW (*Kreditanstalt für Wiederaufbau*).

The preparations for this ambitious undertaking have lasted nearly two years. Among other things, the PAD aims to contribute to the formulation of a revised government policy for decentralisation and popular participation, building upon the previous laws from 1994. This would also include a new policy and mechanisms to improve fiscal decentralisation.

Although the Gender Specialist at the Dutch Embassy has participated in most of the meetings in the donor co-ordination group on Decentralisation and Institutional Development, so far gender equality has not been incorporated into the PAD as an explicit objective. The Team appreciates that this may be a matter of sequence; doing first things first. Obviously, it a major achievement in itself to get such a large number of donors to agree upon a complex programme such as the PAD. But – as in the case of the PRI (discussed above) – adding the gender issue at a later stage means that there is a risk that gender equality is treated as an "appendix" and that it does not, really, become mainstreamed into the PAD.

In connection with the preparation of the new Swedish Country Strategy, Sida commissioned a study entitled *Participatory Assessment of Key Issues for Bolivia's Decentralisation Process and Strategy Recommendations* (February, 2002). This study, prepared by the *Grupo Nacional de Trabajo en la Partici-pación GNT-P*, included a focus on how the decentralisation process has impacted on women. It was the intention that the study should serve as the starting point for the preparation of Sida's future support within the area of decentralisation. As such, it may also be viewed as an indication of the interest to incorporate a gender perspective in the support to the decentralisation process.

7.3 The Education sector

There are strong links between gender and poverty reduction in the Education Sector. Equality in Education both in terms of gender, ethnic and socio-economic groups responds to the strategic needs of women, and especially poor women, to aspire to sustainable human and economic development. Education is therefore, a particularly strategic sector for gender mainstreaming.

Sweden and Holland are supporting the national Education Reform Programme (PRE). Since 1993, both have promoted gender equality in the education sector through the SAG. In parallel, over and above their joint contribution to the PRE, both embassies have supported specific women's alphabetisation programmes through UNICEF under the Vice Ministry for Alternative Education. This has successfully enabled both co-operations to reach to the grass roots level in the sector.

7.3.1 Education Reform Program (PRE)

The PRE began in Bolivia in the 1990s with two principal components: a strategy for institutionalisation and a curriculum revision. The first one concerns the infrastructures and administrative set up of the educational institutions and the second is concerned with the content of the curriculum. In 1993, SAG introduced the gender equality dimension in the PRE. The first hurdle was to ensure explicit reference to the enrolment and permanence of girls in schools within the new legislation on the Educa-

³⁰ Sweden's contribution is SEK 30 million over the period 2001–2003.

tional Reform. In these early days, Sweden and Germany were supporting SAG 's initiative in this endeavour.

Holland has been supporting technical assistance through the provision of experts within the Ministry between 1997 and 2000. This technical assistance resulted in the following: 1) the institutionalisation of the crosscutting theme unit within the PRE and later in the VEIPS; 2) an input in the planning of the curriculum reform and recently in the training of teachers and 3) the strengthening of national capacity. On the expiry of this technical assistance, Bolivian experts have been taking over these positions.

Although the institutional part of the PRE has not yet fully integrated a gender perspective, through the Educational Reform Law and the PRE strategy several gender issues have being addressed. For instance: the enrolment and permanence of girls in schools, the improvement of the quality of education and the production of relevant sex-disaggregated data. The Ministry's system of information includes those aspects, which signals a recognised correlation between gender and the educational reform.

The publication of teachers' training booklets on mainstreaming gender can be emphasised as one of the major achievements in this area within the PRE. Three important key gender issues have been highlighted in the booklets, as follows, and teachers are expected to integrate them into their teaching:

- The concepts of identity and self-esteem as conditioned by the stereotyped representations of the "feminine" and the "masculine" that establish patriarchy and limit the free expression of feelings, tastes, needs and interests;
- The unbalanced division of labour that leads to unequal and stereotyped socialisation of boys and girls with regard to their rights and responsibilities;
- Discrimination of women in history books and in social and political participation in Bolivia.

Under the last point, it is important to note that Sida and Holland have been supporting the publication of books on influential women figures in Bolivian History. The challenge is now in the distribution of these books in all schools throughout Bolivia and in the provision of adequate and relevant training to the teachers.

The tasks of Sweden and Holland in attempting to mainstream gender in this jointly supported programme is at times complicated by the fact that the joint programme has been funded through the World Bank. The World Bank is not always keen on insisting on the issue of gender mainstreaming (ref. section 5.3.3). This diminishes the scope of influence of Holland and Sweden in promoting gender equality within the PRE.

It is the opinion of the Team that the dialogue between both Embassies and the Ministry of Education on the theme of gender has not always been without difficulties. However, as the differences in the expectations of all parties with regard to the prioritisation of crosscutting issues in the PRE have been accepted, the dialogue has become more open and constructive.

7.3.2 The UNICEF supported programme on Women's Alphabetisation

Under the framework of the *Alphabetisation National Plan for Life and Pro-duction 1998–2002*, Sweden and Holland have supported Women's Alphabetisation programmes through UNICEF in different municipalities outside La Paz. The supported UNICEF programme includes a component on women's leadership in the communities, which is strategically interesting. Although the programme is targeting women, men's access is not denied. It is believed that a great majority of women were alphabetised as a result, but precise sex-disaggregated data to support this view are missing. The effective result of this programme is an increase in the number of alphabetised women in the rural areas.

It is important to note that UNICEF had a gender specialist in the evaluation team, which made the respective evaluation reports particularly gender sensitive. According to the latest evaluation of May 2001, the UNICEF supported programme clearly contributed to the increase in women's self-confidence to undertake other roles within the community. The community leadership training component also gave some women the opportunity to play a leading role and take on different responsibilities in their own communities. Some of them became councillors, managers of small commercial enterprises, or leaders of rural unions. Some also took part in the Training of Trainers and are now teaching alphabetisation to other rural women.

The Swedish and the Dutch Embassies are presently in the process of considering the bridging of the funding for this programme until its institutionalisation takes place within the Vice Ministry for Alternative Education. Indeed, the main weakness of this programme so far, has been the lack of institutionalisation within the Vice Ministry. It is important to note that currently, gender policies have not been elaborated in the Vice Ministry for Alternative Education.

7.4 Key findings

- The continuous Swedish and Dutch support to VAGGF has been of crucial importance. It has facilitated, if not ensured, the survival and role of this Vice Ministry. The Bolivian Government, on its part, has demonstrated political will to consolidate VAGGF through, *inter alia*, the decision to fi-nance 90 percent of the salaries.
- The UNFPA supported project on sexual and reproductive education has been strategic both in terms of gender equality and its links to poverty reduction reaching the grassroots level through a decentralised approach.
- Apart from the support to specific NGO programmes to enhance the political participation of
 women, the attention to gender mainstreaming has been limited within the democratic governance
 sector. On this background, it is positive that the PRI Technical Secretariat in March 2002 hired a
 consultant to suggest ways in which gender equality can be incorporated into the PRI. Moreover,
 the preliminary work of this consultant looks very promising.
- The Team appreciates the complexity of incorporating the gender issue into the PAD, but it is felt nevertheless, that the time has come to make a strong effort to embark on this.
- Whereas the curriculum component of the Education Reform has important elements of gender mainstreaming, the institutional component remains largely gender blind.
- The supported UNICEF programme on women's alphabetisation is one of the most tangible achievements of both co-operations with regard to women's empowerment and the strengthening of women's self confidence at grass root level. Sweden and Holland have indeed shown targeted strategic move in supporting this programme. The institutionalisation of the programme within the Vice Ministry and the support for the mainstreaming of gender within the Vice Ministry are now of crucial importance if ownership and sustainability of the programme are to be achieved.

8 Conclusions and Recommendations

The nearly 10 years of existence of the Vice Ministry for Gender (VAGGF) and the important achievements this has fostered in the policy area – the National Plan for Gender Equality, the Programme for the Reduction of Women's Poverty, and the National Plan for the Prevention and Eradication of Gender based Violence – provide an excellent platform for the promotion of gender equality in Bolivia.

The challenge for the future is to transform this into implementation. VAGGF will have an important role to play in this connection, but the Bolivian Government – all its ministries – and civil society must assume the challenge. On the basis of their strong previous involvement, Holland and Sweden would be natural partners in the next phase: implementation.

Overall

Sweden and Holland should continue to support the promotion of gender equality in Bolivia. Both modalities of support – strategic aspects through VAGGF and gender mainstreaming in sector wide support programmes – have been important and will continue to be so.

With regard to the future country strategy for Sweden's development co-operation with Bolivia, the Team recommends that the strategic support for gender mainstreaming at the national level is maintained on the basis of the strong links with poverty reduction. The gender specific programmes such as UNICEF and UNFPA should also be maintained but institutionalised within the relevant Ministries for better sustainability.

Mechanisms to reach civil society and women at grass root level need to be put in place. For this to be effectively implemented, both Embassies need to have an overview of key grass root movements and associations across the country.

Gender capacity within the Embassies

The Swedish Embassy should strengthen its capacity for gender analysis and gender mainstreaming in order to improve the implementation of the gender policies of Sida. A better balance needs to be struck between the policy ambitions and the operational capacity.

With regard to the gender expertise within the Swedish Embassy, there are basically two options: 1) assign the responsibility of mainstreaming gender to a full time expert or appointed official who has gender expertise; 2) adapt its gender policy to SWAP and provide the necessary gender training and tools to the sector officials for an effective implementation.

Given the anticipated expansion of the Swedish budget for the co-operation with Bolivia, the Team recommends that staff be allocated to the Embassy to ensure the presence of a gender specialist. If it is decided to revise the organisational structure at the Swedish Embassy, then it is the view of the Team that much could be learned from the positive experience of the organisational structure at the Dutch Embassy. At any rate, the policy priority to promote gender equality ought to be mirrored in the organisational structure of the Swedish Embassy.

As an immediate effort, the Swedish Embassy should create a modality through which gender capacity building of its staff could be achieved. A simple suggestion in this regard might be to arrange so-called "brown bag" lunch seminars, or afternoon workshops, where a visiting consultant or a Bolivian resource person could facilitate a discussion about the application of practical and operational tools for

gender mainstreaming. At a more general level, Sida headquarters in Stockholm should ensure that staff who is sent to Bolivia exploit the opportunities that are given for gender training prior to taking up an overseas posting.

Sweden currently works in 5–8 sectors (depending on how these are counted). This broad scope of cooperation limits the degree to which gender mainstreaming can be ensured in all the areas of support. In the view of the Team, the number of sectors should be reduced in connection with the formulation of the new country strategy. This would increase the focus and hence improve the possibility for Sweden to promote its development policy objectives in Bolivia, including that concerning gender equality.

The Dutch Embassy should promote a more effective dialogue to integrate and link the three cross cutting issues and explore their bearing on the overall objective to reduce poverty.

The Swedish and Dutch embassies should promote a more systematic integration of the gender perspective throughout the programme cycle. Qualitative and quantitative gender indicators should be explicitly included in the different phases of programmes. Where relevant, gender expertise should be included as part of the planning, review and evaluation of the different sector programmes. This would ensure a more integrated and co-ordinated approach between the support to the VAGGF and the mainstreaming of gender within the embassy supported sector programmes.

Donor co-ordination

On the basis of their present leadership role in the Donor Gender Committee, Holland and Sweden should make it a priority to establish a clear mission and working agenda for this committee. This would seem to be particularly relevant after a new Bolivian government takes office in August 2002. As a supplementary effort, more clout could be given to the Donor Gender Committee if the Heads of the different agencies participated, on a regular basis (once or twice a year) in their meetings. Holland and Sweden, along with the other members of the Committee, should therefore reconsider the purpose of the Donor Gender Committee and discuss whether it should encompass a national dimension and selected key strategic members.

Gender Programmes

VAGGF

With the adoption as state policy of the three national gender plans (mentioned in the introduction to this chapter), the support of both Sweden and Holland should be focused on the implementation of these

The Bolivian Government urgently needs to formulate an operational strategy for the achievement of gender mainstreaming within the various line ministries. In this connection, the role of VAGGF should also be clearly defined. Holland and Sweden should offer to assist the Bolivian Government in this regard. Such assistance may be in the form of a consultancy to develop different operational options to this end.

Given the level of salaries VAGGF can offer at present, it seems that it cannot attract sufficiently qualified staff to meet the challenge to transform the national gender plans into effective implementation. The salary structure at VAGGF is, therefore, an important issue to be looked into.³¹

³¹ During an interview with VIPFE on 25 March 2002, a representative of this Vice Ministry floated the idea that Sweden and Holland might consider ways to address this problem without jeopardising the principles of the PRI.

INE/SIIG and INE/MECOVI

The Swedish support to both of the INE projects is coming to an end in 2002. Sex disaggregated statistics will continue to be a prerequisite for sound analyses of gender equality in all sectors. Unless a specific request for a new or similar project arises from INE, the fundamental challenge would appear to be that of fostering a culture of reliance upon and use of statistical information within the Bolivian Government and the society at large. The role of Sweden as a donor in that process is less clear. What is certain, however, is that this will be a long-term process.

UNFPA supported project on Sexual and Reproductive Health

Future support to this important and strategic theme should be directed at the institutionalisation of the project in the relevant ministries and its monitoring done through the VAGFF. In order to continue reaching the grass root level, the institutionalisation and ownership of the project should also maintain the decentralised approach.

Democratic governance

The initiative of the PRI Technical Unit to prepare a strategy for the incorporation of gender equality in the PRI (Estrategia para Incorporar una Contribución Equitativa de Hombres y Mujeres en el Programa de Reforma Institucional) should be followed closely. The preliminary work that was presented to the Team in March 2002 was promising. If the final proposal for a strategy lives up to the Dutch and Swedish expectations, then both embassies should use their contacts within the different ministries of the Bolivian Government to lobby for its approval.

In regard to decentralisation, the Dutch and the Swedish embassies should make a concerted effort to incorporate gender equality into the PAD. One way of doing this might be to assign (and pay for) a gender specialist to the next joint-donor review of the PAD. In order to enhance the effect that this might have, Holland and Sweden could commission (and finance) a preparatory study of the gender dimension in relation to the PAD. This study should be distributed to all the members of the joint-donor review before that mission takes place. In order to generate a debate about gender equality within the context of the PAD, draft versions of the *Terms of Reference* for both of these consulting inputs should be submitted for discussion among the donors supporting the PAD.

The future support for the promotion of gender equality through civil society organisations should be based on an analysis of the actual situation and context for the strengthening of civil society. Alternative counterparts should be defined that would enable Sweden and Holland to reach a more representative selection of the existing women's movement organisations in Bolivia. In this connection, mechanisms should be defined for the channelling of financial support to these.

In order to better monitor and account for the Dutch and Swedish contribution towards gender equality in Bolivia, a "baseline" should be constructed with simple indicators for the main sectors receiving support. In this regard, support to projects such as the SIIG at the National Institute of Statistics should continue to be a priority. Consideration should also be given to supporting a systematisation and analysis of already existing quantitative studies, and complementing this, where necessary, with new more qualitatively oriented research.

Education

Sweden and Holland should continue with a constructive dialogue with the Ministry of Education and maintain specific support with gender expertise. Clear and defined gender indicators should be included in the both Embassies' supported programme to the PRE.

A close follow up should be undertaken to ensure the maintenance of the achievements that have already been made within the curricular reform and the further mainstreaming of gender within the institutional component.

The plan for the institutionalisation of the UNICEF supported project on Women's Alphabetisation in the Vice Ministry for Alternative Education should be strongly supported. This should continue to include the valuable component of training women community leaders. Through the support to the VAGGF, both Embassies should ensure that gender is mainstreamed within the Vice Ministry for Alternative Education's the strategy and policies.

Terms of reference Evaluation of Sweden's and Holland's Strategies for the Promotion of Gender Equality in their Respective Country Programmes in Bolivia

1. Background

Bolivia is the poorest country in South America, and the poverty is largely feminised. The mortal rage for maternity related diseases is extremely high, a phenomena which is closely related to the high number of illegal abortions carried out in Bolivia. Girls have a tendency to drop-out from school a lot earlier than boys. Women represent larger numbers of illiterates than men. And there are few women in politics and in management positions in the largest companies.

Bolivia is a country where the development cooperation is very well coordinated. These efforts originate mainly from government initiatives within the CDF framework but have also implications on the international donor committee and its way of seeking common solutions. Sweden and Holland have in this donor coordination many times emphasised the same kind of issues in the dialogue with the Bolivian government (e g gender, popular participation, strong national ownership and human rights' aspects). Both cooperations are also largely supporting the same national reform programmes (e g educational reform, institutional reform and the national ombudsman).

Holland and Sweden have also over the years become the closest partners in the gender field. Together they support the vice-ministry for gender, generations and family issues (VAGGF) as the only institutional donors with the purpose to strengthen national gender politics and mainstreaming in the Bolivian society. Presently, Sweden and Holland are supporting the VAGGF elaboration of a gender analysis which is supposed to form a base-line for the gender activities in all sectors of the Bolivian society. However, not all parts of their respective gender programmes coincide and at times different projects are supported.

To be mentioned is also the close cooperation between these two countries within the OECD/DAC gender policy work, a cooperation which has been strong and likeminded for many years.

Both countries are entering into reassessments of their gender cooperation in Bolivia during 2003. The present consultancy will serve as an input to these processes.

In the Dutch case, the present bilateral agreement with VAGGF will end in 2002. Therefore, it is necessary to prepare inputs for a new decision on how to continue supporting the national gender policy, principally in the cross-cutting capacity of VAGGF. VAGGF has also showed its interest in receiving an opinion about how to continue the cooperation with Holland and Sweden.

Sweden will in 2003 initiate a new five-year-strategy for Swedish cooperation with Bolivia, which will use the national poverty reduction strategy (PRS) as a point of departure. General aspects of Swedish cooperation policies will also be taken into consideration. The Bolivian PRS has included strategies for the national gender work. The government has moreover adopted a specific programme for gender related poverty activities as part of its national gender politics. The last mentioned document is largely supported by Holland and Sweden. The intention of the Swedish strategy process is to generally draw upon national initiatives in order to encourage a strong national ownership for the Swedish supported activities which will follow the strategy.

Despite many similarities in policies and programmes/projects supported, Sweden and Holland have organised their gender work differently in many aspects. The gender specific guidelines are based on different ideas and the way of mainstreaming the programmes/projects have been addressed dirrerently. However, both cooperations believe they have a lot to learn from each other.

2. Purpose and scope of the evaluation

The overall purpose of the evaluation is to assess to what extent the Swedish and Dutch contributions (since 1998) and their respective ways of planning for gender have been strategic in relation to the international gender politics, Bolivian national gender politics and present gender policies and guidelines which are supposed to govern the work of each country programme. The activities shall been considered in the Bolivian context.

Specific purposes are:

- To assess how both cooperations have used the existing policies when organising its work intentially or unintentially and draw conclusions of how this strategic planification could be improved (taken into consideration the resources available for gender related activities at each cooperation agency).
- To give an opinion on how the organisational policies and guidelines of each cooperation agency
 could lead to an improvement of the national gender situation together with international and
 national politics. (Opinion on the usefulness of these documents/how could they best be interpreted to function as tools in the planning work of the cooperation agencies. Could they be improved?)
- To make recommendations on how Sweden might include gender in its country strategy for Bolivia with the purpose of adapting the general guidelines for Sweden's gender policies to the national context
- To present some alternatives on how cross-cutting tools could be improved in order to promote institutional capacity strenghtening (from a gender perspective) (both gender sector institutions and others, like education.

This evaluation will use experiences from two cooperations working in the same environment with some programmes/projects in common to give opinions on strategic ways of addressing gender in their respective country programmes without carrying out a strict comparation.

The results shall be used as an input in Sweden's country strategy process and in Holland's local gender strategy work in 2002. Comments on Sweden's and Holland's gender policies and guidelines shall be used in the dialogue between the field representations and their respective headquarters on policy development in gender, poverty and sectorwide approach and contribute to the definition of the role of both agencies's gender work in the national context.

3. Methods and assignment

- A. The consultants shall develop a good knowledge of international, national and organisational policies/instruments/guidelines against which the supported programmes/projects shall be meassured.
- B. The consultants shall study relevant country related documents in order to get an overview and good knowledge of the national context.
- C. The consultants shall carry out interviews with relevant staff at the embassies (approx 3–4 persons at each office) in order to describe how each cooperation is carrying out strategic planning and monitoring of activities in order to fullfill the strategic gender objectives guiding the cooperation.

- D. The consultants shall assess the analysis, planification and results obtained of important gender specific programmes/projects of each cooperation in relation to guidelines and policies by
 - a) studying project documents, protocols from meetings and reports;
 - b) performing interviews with keypersons at these organisations
 - (approx 7–8 institutions as some are i common for both cooperations).
- E. The consultants shall assess the analysis, planification and results obtained of at least two important common programmes/projects for both cooperations in relation to guidelines and policies on mainstreaming by
 - a) studying project documents, protocols from meetings and reports;
 - b) performing interviews with keypersons at these organisations.
 - (At least two institutions all together).
- F. The consultants shall assess the analysis, planification and results obtained of at least two other programmes/projects representing support given from both cooperation agencies, in relation to guidelines and policies on mainstreaming by
 - a) studying project documents, protocols from meetings and reports;
 - b) performing interviews with keypersons at these organisations.
 - (At least two institutions all together.)
- G. The consultants shall seek second opinions on the role of each cooperation by performing interviews with representatives of public institutions (also at decentralised level) cooperating with Sweden and Holland, feminist organisations, popular movements and other donors. (Approx 10–12 interviews).
- H. The consultants shall present their conclusions in a final report not exceeding 40 pages. Final version shall be presented in both English and Spanish. (Please, see below: "5. Reporting".)

The approx 30 interviews could be concentrated to the La Paz City and its neighbourhoods and to two or three field visits to other parts of Bolivia. Which partner organisations to be chosen and how interviews and information gathering shall be performed, will be a choice for each consultancy team presenting an inception report to Holland and Sweden (on the basis of a list handed over by Holland and/or Sweden).

The consultants shall take into particular consideration how interests of the stakeholders are met and could be improved in order to better reach the empowerment objective of the poverty concept.

All information in the evaluation report shall be gender disaggregated.

4. Competence

The evaluation is to be carried out by a team with advanced experience in:

- A. Gender analysis
- B. Human and behavioural social science
- C. Local context in Bolivia
- D. Gender equality in institutional building
- E. Strategic Planning

The team leader shall have documented experience in management of evaluations.

All team members shall speak and read Spanish.

5. Workplan and other prerequisits

The number of consultants involved may vary from 3–5. The total amount of days of service are 20, out of which ten are supposed to be located in Bolivia.

Workplan:

08.02.02	Tender Invitation sent to approximately ten companies
27.02.02	Deadline for sending proposals/tenders (to Sida/La Paz)
01.03.02	Selection of Consultants (by both cooperation agencies)
18.03.02	Mission in Bolivia starts
28.03.02	Mission in Bolivia ends
08.04.02	Deadline for preliminary report
15.04.02	Deadline for the embassies' comments on this report
19.04.02	Deadline for the final report

6. Reporting

The consultants shall submit the following reports:

- A. Inception report commenting and interpreting the Terms of Reference and providing details of approach and methods for data collection and analyses to be submitted in accordance with tender invitation. This shall include a work plan specifying how and when the work is to be performed. Deadline 27 February 2002.
- B. Draft final report in either the English or the Spanish language shall be submitted in four copies to Sida, Swedish Embassy, Development Co-operation Section, La Paz, attention Ulrika Hjertstrand, Av. 6 de Agosto #2577, Edific. Las Dos torres, piso 8, (Casilla 12452). You could also, of course, forward the documentation with direct delivery e. g. via DHL.
- C. Final version of final report (based on comments from both cooperations) shall be in both English and Spanish and not exceed 50 pages and include an executive summary of approximately 15 pages. Four copies and one diskette shall be sent to Sida at the in above paragraph B mentioned address. Subject to decision by the Swedish cooperation, the report may be published and distributed as a publication within the Sida Evaluations' series.

Consultation and dissemination of emerging findings and lessons will be important throughout the study and the consultants are to include a budget for this in their tender.

Abbreviations and Acronyms

Beijing United Nations Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing,

Conference China 4–15 September 1995

CEDAW United Nations Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of

Discrimination Against Women

CDF Comprehensive Development Framework

CG meetings Consultative Group meetings

CIDA Canadian International Development Agency

COSUDE Swiss Development Co-operation agency

DAC Development Assistance Committee of the Organisation for Economic

Co-operation and Development

DANIDA Danish International Development Assistance

DAWN Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era

Diakonia Swedish non-governmental organisation

DFID Directorate for International Development of the United Kingdom

EBRP Bolivian Strategy for Poverty Reduction

ECOSOC United Nations Economic and Social Council

GAD Gender and Development

GTZ German Development co-operation agency

IDB International Development Bank

INE National Institute for Statistics

INRA National Land Reform Institute

MAGDR Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development

NGO Non-Governmental Organisation

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development

PAD Decentralisation Programme

PNEG National Plan for Gender Equality

PRI Institutional Reform Programme

PRE Educational Reform Programme

PRSP Poverty Reduction Strategy Programme

SAG Secretariat for Gender Issues

SEK Swedish Crown

SIIG National Gender Equality Indicators

SIBTA Agricultural Technology Programme

Sida Swedish International Development Co-operation Agency

SNV Dutch non-governmental organisation

SLI Legal Aid Services

SWAP Sector Wide Approach

TORs Terms of Reference

UN United Nations

UNICEF United Nations Children's Funds

UNFPA United Nations Population Fund

USAID United States Development Agency

VAGFF Vice Ministry for Gender and Family Issues

WID Women in Development

Bibliography

General documents

Fourth World Conference on Women, Beijing, China 4–15 September 1995, Platform for Action 1995.

The Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against women, 1979.

National Documents

Bolivia 5 años después de Beijing, 2001.

Three National Plans for Gender Equality in Bolivia, 2001.

Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper for Bolivia, 2001.

Swedish Co-operation Documents

Sida's Policy for Sector Programme Support and Provisional Guidelines, 2000.

Striking a Balance-on women and men in development co-operation, 1999.

La Cooperación de Suecia con Bolivia una estrategia para 1997-2001, 1999.

Sida at Work, Sida's methods for development co-operation, 1998.

Sida prompt Sheets, Woroniuk and Schalwyk, 1998.

Sida Looks Forward, Sida's Programme for global development, 1997.

Sida's Action Programme for promoting equality between women and men in partner countries, 1997.

Mainstreaming: A strategy for achieving equality between women and men, Woroniuk, Thomas and Schalwyk, 1997.

Sida Handbook for the Integration of a Gender Perspective in the Education Sector, 1997.

Dutch Co-operation Documents

Gender Mainstreaming: A strategy for Quality Improvement, Department for the Co-ordination of Emancipation Policy, Ministry of Social Affairs and Employment, 2001.

Key gender concepts

Difference between Sex and Gender

The distinction between the two lies in that socially determined characteristics are changing characteristics, whereas biologically determined ones are unchanging (breastfeeding, impregnation, childbearing, genitals) unless an operation is being undertaken.

Gender is a term that describes those characteristics of men and women that are socially determined, in contrast with sex which is biologically determined, Gender is socially constructed. This distinction between gender and sex is made to emphasise that everything women and men do and everything expected of them, with the exception of their sexually distinct functions (childbearing, breastfeeding and impregnation) can change and does change over time and according to varying social and cultural factors. The existence and interpretation of the term "gender" in different languages presupposes the conceptual existence of the possibility of "change" and "variety" in men and women's roles in a given society. This is a challenge in the application of the term "gender".

Women's Human Rights

The chronology of women's rights development after the second world war has taken the following key turns. 1) In 1952, the convention regarding women's political rights was adopted by the UN General Assembly. The principal object of that convention was to ensure equality between women and men with regard to political rights. 2) In 1979, the Convention on the Elimination of all form of Discrimination against women – CEDAW – was adopted by the UN General Assembly. This convention represents the most complete compulsory legal instrument. 3) In 1993, the Declaration on the elimination of violence against women was proclaimed by resolution 48/104 of the general Assembly. It was formulated on the premises that "women must be as free as men to make choices not only in the political and legal sphere but also in such areas as marriage, the home and family life in general."

Women in Development (WID)

The WID approach seeks to integrate women into development by making more resources available to women. Critics say that this approach has often increased women's workload reinforced inequalities and widened the gap between men and women. The major drawbacks of the WID approach was that it viewed women in isolation from men and from mainstream development. Towards the end of the 1980s, it became evident that women focused development interventions had little or no impact on either women's welfare or their legal or social status. Some bilateral agencies today have opted for a combination of WID and Gender and Development (GAD) sustaining that both are needed to achieve the gender equality goals.

Gender and Development (GAD)

The GAD approach seeks to base interventions on the analysis of men's and women's roles and needs in an effort to empower women to improve their position relative to men in ways which will benefit and transform society as a whole. WID and Gender Equality have been used interchangeably. Programming with a gender focus is often thought to mean with a focus on women. Gender relations focuses on social and cultural mechanism and processes of women's subordination to men. With the emphasis on the nature and reproduction of women's subordination to men, gender as a concept based itself on the socially constructed relationships between men and women replacing the more simplistic paradigm, which conceptualised women in isolation. The emphasis had radical implications for the debate: WID

had essentially not threatened mainstream development at all, being isolated in special projects and units. GAD questioned existing power relation between men and women, not only in projects in development countries, but also in work place and home. As gender roles, gender relations being socially constructed could be changed in all fields.

Women's Empowerment

The concept of empowerment was adopted by development agencies during the 1980s. The approach had developed through the Copenhagen Conference 1980, through women's initiatives which started to question the very nature of development aid, criticising its western-centric approach and non-participatory methodologies. This initiative was exemplified by the network Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era (DAWN).

Its members proposed a new paradigm: the bottom up approach with a focus on beneficiaries for instance by preserving existing farming systems and protect food production³². It was not until the International Conference on Population and Development, held in Cairo in 1994 that the UN talked of the empowerment of women and the role of men in achieving gender equality because in most societies men exercise preponderant power in nearly every sphere of life.

Gender Equality

In 1985, the UN Conference held in Nairobi defined gender equality as a "goal and a means whereby individuals are accorded equal treatment under the law and equal opportunities to enjoy their rights and to develop their potential talents and skills so that they can participate in national, political, economic, social and cultural development, both as beneficiaries and as active agents".

Gender Mainstreaming

In 1995 the Commission on the Status of Women in their preparation for the Women's Conference in Beijing, further discussed the nature of the term "gender", which together with "empowerment" was copiously applied in the Beijing Platform for Action. The platform re-endorsed Gender Equality as a goal. For the first time UN resolutions called for gender mainstreaming.

In 1997, ECOSOC agreed with reference to the Beijing Platform of Action that the UN system should promote an active and visible policy of mainstreaming a gender perspective. It defined gender mainstreaming as "the process of assessing the implications for women and men of any planned action, including legislation, making women's as well as men's concerns and experiences integral dimensions in the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programs in all political, economic and social spheres so that women and men benefit equally and inequality is not perpetuated." The ultimate goal is to achieve gender equality.

² Sen and Grown,	1998.	

Programme of Meetings Evaluation of Sweden's and Holland's Strategies for the Promotion of Gender Equality in Bolivia 18^{th} – 27^{th} March 2002

	Monday 18.03	Tuesday 19.03	Wednesday 20.03	Thursday 21.03	Friday 22.03
a.m.	09.30-10.30 Introductory Meeting at the Swedish Embassy with Janette Trujillo (JT) Gender Specialist at the Dutch Embassy and Ulrika Hjertstrand (UH), Officer for Social Programmes 10.30-12.00 Interview 1 Head of Swedish Co-operation, Bo Westman,	09.00-10.00 Interview 5 Mary del Carmen Arias Paz, Vice-minister for Gender, VAGGF 10.00-12.00 Interview 6 Félix Tarifa, adviser, Patricia Loayza, director, María Elena Burgos, expert on legal aspects, Marta Rivera, expert on violence and SLIs, expert on education and expert on good-governance, VAGGF	09.00-10.00 Interview 9 Maria Machicado and Lilia Rojas and Yvon Farah co-ordinators for INE/SIIG 11.30-12.30 Interview 10 Gerardo Roloff, Education Officer, UNICEF, regarding Swedish and Dutch financed female alphabetisation programmes	08.30-10.00 Interview 14 Han-Maurits Schaapveld, Head of Dutch Co-operation 10.00-11.00 Interview 15 JT, Programme Officer for Gender regarding mainstreaming, VAGGF, PROCESO and the Programme as a whole 11.00-12.00 Interview 16 Teresa Baderrama, co-ordinator for Formación políticas mujeres at PROCESO, and three	09.00-10.00 Interview 20 Patricia Alvarez, Programme Officer for Education, World Bank, regarding relationship with Swedish and Dutch Co-operation within education field. 10.30-12.00 Interview 21 Diana Urioste, Coordinadora de la Mujer.
			Lunch Break		
p.m	13.00-15.30 Interview 2-3 Double interview with UH, Programme Officer for Social Sector and HR, Swedish Embassy, regarding main streaming, VAGGF, INE, UNFPA and whole programme. 15.30-17.00 Interview 4 Rebecca Borda, Education Officer, Swedish Embassy, regarding PRE, alphabetisation and relations to World Bank	14.00-15.30 Presentation Roxana Dulón, consultant, who has compared the PRSP and the three national gender plans and the interventions of bilateral and multilateral donors 15.30-17.30 Interview 7-8 Representatives for gender donors: Pedro Pablo Villanueva, UNFPA and Erik Zeballos, DFID regarding Holland's and Sweden's role in Gender work/strategies, Bolivia	13.30-14.30 Interview 11 Paulos Berglóf, Governance Sector Officer at Swedish Embassy 15.00-16.00 Interview 12 Vice-minister for Alternative Education, Iván Tavél, regarding Swedish and Dutch intervention on gender and alphabetisation 16.30-17.30 Interview 13 Eunice Reyes and Maria Renée Bejarano, Co-ordinator and gender expert for PRI programme	14.30-15.30 Interview 18 Johanna Teague, Programme Officer for SRH and Education at UNFPA, regarding Swedish funanced UNFPA project and Swedish and Dutch participation in the donor community in Bolivia 16.00-17.00 Interview 19 Peter de Haan, Governance Sector Official at Dutch Embassy and Carlos Brañez (Indigenous people expert)	13:00 – 14:00 In Diakonia with Elrika Forsberg, Programme Coordinartor. 14:30 – 16:00 ACOBOL, Asamblea Nacional de Concejalas de Bolivia, Merylina Zabala de Alba.

Wednesday 27.03	09.00-12.00 Team Debriefing Swedish and Dutch Co-operation, at the Dutch Embassy	Lunch Break	Departure for Denmark
Tuesday 26.03	Team Meeting - Analysis of data collected		Team Meeting Debriefing
Monday 25.03	08.30-09.30 Interview 24 Claudia Choque, Leny Cayú and Susana Choquetopa, Las Trabajadoras de Hogar, (women 's association). 10.00-11.00 Interview 25 FODEI, Doris Hoyos and Patricia Velasco, consultants who evaluated the PRE, in September 2001		14.00-15.00 Interviews 26 Ronald Siebes, Programme Officer for Education, regarding PRE, alphabetisation and relations to World Bank, Dutch Embassy Interview 27: Marten de Boer, Primer Secretario, Especialista Sectorial de Desarollo Productivo Rural, Dutch Embassy Interview 28: Jorge Cortez, Assessor in decentralisation y Desarollo Institucional, Dutch Embassy 15.30 Interview 29: VIPFE, Fernando Ponce de Leon and Ivon Cuba.
	a.m.		p.m.

Recent Sida Evaluations

01/38	Sida's Support to the land Reform Related Activities in Estonia. Mark Doucette, Sue Nichols, Peter Bloch Department for Central and Eastern Europe
01/39	Legal Services to the Poor People in Zimbabwe. Haroub Othman, Dorille von Riesen Department for Africa
02/01	Mainstreaming Gender Equality. Sida's support for the promotion of gender equality in partner countries. Britta Mikkelsen, Ted Freeman, Bonnie Keller et allis Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit
02/01:1	Mainstreaming Gender Equality. Sida's support for the promotion of gender equality in partner countries. Country report Bangladesh. Britta Mikkelsen, Ted Freeman, Mirza Najmul Huda, Sevilla Leowinatha, Jowshan A. Rahman Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit
02/01:2	Mainstreaming Gender Equality. Sida's support for the promotion of gender equality in partner countries. Country report Nicaragua. Ted Freeman, Milagros Barahona, Ane Bonde, Sarah Forti, Britha Mikkelsen, Guadalupe Salinas Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit
02/01:3	Mainstreaming Gender Equality. Sida's support for the promotion of gender equality in partner countries. Country report South Africa. Bonnie Keller, Sarah Forti, Britha Mikkelsen, Susanne Possing, Kgotso Schoeman, Rose-Pearl Pethu Serote Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit
02/01:4	Integración de la Perspectiva de Igualdad de Género. Apoyo de Asdi en los países de Cooperación para el Desarrollo: Informe de país – Nicaragua. Ted Freeman, Milagros Barahona, Ane Bonde, Sarah Forti, Britha Mikkelsen, Guadalupe Salinas Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit
02/02	Water Research Fund for Southern Africa (WARFSA) Project evaluation. Harmut Krugmann Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
02/03	Avaliação do Apoio Sueco à Cultura em Moçambique 1997–2000. Kajsa Pehrsson Department for Democracy and Social Development
02/04	Utvärdering av det svenska stödet till kulturen i Moçambique 1997–2000. Kajsa Pehrsson Department for Democracy and Social Development
02/05	Programa de Desarrollo Local (PRODEL) en Nicaragua. Norah Becerra, Carlos Revilla Zeballos, José Alberto RIvera Castillo, Mery Solares de Valenzuela Department for Latin America
02/06	Research Cooperation between Vietnam and Sweden. Kim Fors Department for Research Cooperation
02/07	Sida Environmental Fund in Vietnam 1999–2001. Eva Lindskog, Vu Ngoc Long Department for Natural Resources and the Environment
02/08	Mobilisation of the Poor – a means to Poverty Reduction. Final evaluation of the Change Agent Programme in Sri Lanka. Kalinga Tudor Silva, Sepali Kottegoda, Dulan de Silva Asia Department. Department for Natural Resources and the Environment

Sida Evaluations may be ordered from:

Infocenter, Sida S-105 25 Stockholm Phone: +46 (0) 8 690 93 80 Fax: +46 (0) 8 690 92 66

info@sida.se

A complete backlist of earlier evaluation reports may be ordered from:

Sida, UTV, S-105 25 Stockholm Phone: +46 (0) 8 698 51 63 Fax: +46 (0) 8 698 56 10 Homepage: http://www.sida.se



SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY S-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden

Tel: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Fax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64 Telegram: sida stockholm. Postgiro: 1 56 34–9 E-mail: info@sida.se. Homepage: http://www.sida.se