

First Cadastre Project in Moldova

Training Technical Assistance Project

**Ulf Kihlbom
Mike Cheremshynsky**

Department for Europe

First Cadastre Project in Moldova

Training Technical Assistance Project

**Ulf Kihlbom
Mike Cheremshynsky**

Sida Evaluation 06/54

Department for Europe

This report is part of *Sida Evaluations*, a series comprising evaluations of Swedish development assistance. Sida's other series concerned with evaluations, Sida Studies in Evaluation, concerns methodologically oriented studies commissioned by Sida. Both series are administered by the Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit, an independent department reporting directly to Sida's Board of Directors.

This publication can be downloaded/ordered from:
<http://www.sida.se/publications>

Authors: Ulf Kihlbom, Mike Cheremshynsky.

The views and interpretations expressed in this report are the authors' and do not necessarily reflect those of the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Sida.

Sida Evaluation 06/54
Commissioned by Sida, Department for Europe

Copyright: Sida and the authors

Registration No.: 2005-001186
Date of Final Report: 2005 May
Printed by Edita Communication AB, 2006
Art. no. Sida32321en
ISBN 91-586-8242-2
ISSN 1401—0402

SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY
Address: SE-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden. Office: Valhallavägen 199, Stockholm
Telephone: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Telefax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64
E-mail: sida@sida.se. Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>

Table of content

Executive Summary	3
1 Introduction and Project Background.....	5
1.1 Project Background	5
1.2 International Projects	7
2 Evaluation Methodology	10
3 Main Findings and Project Results	12
3.1 Evaluation of Project Achievements.....	12
3.2 Fiscal Cadastre Project Development.....	12
3.3 Training Activities	13
3.4 Development Strategy and Business Plan	14
3.5 Satisfaction of the Recipient Organisation.....	17
3.6 Relevance, Cost-effectiveness of the Project Support.....	18
3.7 Sustainability of Project Results	22
3.8 Project Planning, Implementation and Reporting.....	23
3.9 Cross-cutting Issues.....	24
4 Lessons Learned	27
5 Recommendations for Continuation of Support.....	27
5.1 Goal and Objective of Future Support	27
5.2 Recommended Activities	28
5.3 Cooperation with the World Bank.....	33
6 Conclusions	33
Appendix 1. Terms of Reference	35
Appendix 2. List of persons met and interviewed during the visit to Moldova	39
Appendix 3. List of Project Documents Reviewed	40
Appendix 4. Gender and Access to Land.....	41

Executive Summary

Sida have supported a technical assistance to *Moldova: First Cadastre Project, FCP*, since its beginning in 1997. The first stage of this assistance has been successfully completed in 2001. According to Sida's decision from 2001-11-05 the technical assistance was extended through the project "*Moldova: First Cadastre Project – Fiscal Cadastre and Training*". This report evaluates the achievements of this project and gives recommendations for a possible continuation of Sida's support. Most of the planned project activities were completed at the time for our evaluation.

The main goal of the Swedish support has been to assist the National Agency Cadastre Land Resources and Geodesy (NACLRG) ¹ in the implementation of the First Cadastral Project. The first stage of Sida's support was successfully finalized in 2001. Following the first phase the Swedish support was extended till December 2003. In March 2004 another prolongation of the Swedish support was made until August 31, 2005. The main objectives of the continued technical assistance were:

- To support the development of a real estate registration that will supply information of ownership and values of real property to the taxation authorities;
- To develop and carry out advanced courses for a wider spectrum of stakeholders and;
- To develop the business plan for the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC, and the TCOs in order to support the sustainability of the unified cadastral system established in Moldova.

In summary almost all planned project activities were carried out professionally and according to plan and have met with the intended objectives and results.

The consulting companies carrying out the project since 1997 have been Swedesurvey AB and HIFAB International AB cooperating closely with the Moldavian counterpart – State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC.

A number of activities have been planned and properly implemented during the Project time. The results and achievements of the Project were presented in an International Seminar held in Chisinau at the end of September 2004. The Project has contributed substantially to the implementation of the World Bank financed First Cadastral Project and to an overall success of the unified cadastral system in Moldova.

The project activities were organised on a basis of short-term visits of consultants, which provided assistance and technical support to the Moldavian experts as well as prepared guidelines, recommendations, training courses and seminars etc. According to our opinion the cost effectiveness of short-term consultancies is not proved; longer stays of less number of consultants would have been more efficient and appreciated by the client.

All together 196 technical reports and 72 administrative reports were prepared during the project time by the consultants. The reports contained descriptions of the situation in the cadastre and related areas, as well as recommendations, methodologies and guidelines. Most reports describe what activities have been carried out without deeper analysis and discussions. For a long term projects like this it is important that there also are a few more summarising and analysing reports and recommendations compiled as separate documents, at least on a yearly basis.

¹ The NACLRG was renamed in 2001 into the State Agency of Land Relations and Cadastre of Republic of Moldova. SALRC

The project implementation has established a good basis for further development of the Fiscal Cadastre:

- Recommendations and methodologies for different types of properties valuation are drafted and discussed,
- Proposals for data structure and exchange of information are developed,
- Pilot-projects to test different methods of data collection are implemented,
- Different methods of data collection for property valuation were also tested in different pilot projects.

The training component has directly contributed to human capacity building and increased professional level in the cadastral organisations. The project has supported many international seminars in Moldova, study visits of Moldavian experts to other countries, training courses etc. Modern training facilities are also established with the support of the project at the premises of State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC. Implemented activities give a new vision and facilitate the development of a strategy for the cadastral sector. The long-term training program Master of Science in Land Management for Moldavian students and experts is successful and its continuation is also recommended.

The general conclusion of the project evaluation mission is highly positive both regarding the project itself as well general development in cadastral sector in Moldova. Despite highly positive achievements of the establishment of a unified cadastral system, especially in comparison with other countries of the region, Moldova faces a lot of challenges in the land management sector. These challenges are related to the fact that only the first steps are made in the creation of a completely new institution, lack of professionals in this area, proper experience, traditions and culture in the land management sector and the severe economic situation in the country.

One of the most critical challenges to address is the sustainability of the development of the unified cadastral system as the important element to establish land tenure security in the country. For this reason Moldova needs the extension of support and assistance in the land management sector.

The project supported the preparation of a strategy for the cadastral sector and development of a Business Plan for Legal Cadastre in Moldova. The developed Business Plan is a comprehensive document and the measures proposed are directed to convert the cadastral system into a self-financing organisation. However, the Business Plan does not give the full answers to the financial development of the organisation.

The Business Plan is weak in the description of the financial business ideas; it is more a presentation of the present situation. There are estimates on the financial outcomes and projections until 2007. For 2006 and 2007 the net results are minus 80-84% of the total income, which means that the organisation will need additional external funding or it will go into bankruptcy, see Business Plan Table 22. Information is said to be available for the financial projections also for 2008–2010, showing that the organisation might be self-financing without external funding. This information should be included in the report and the final Business Plan must show how and when the organisation will be sustainable and self-financing. Additional work is required to make the present Business Plan a more effective document and it should include a set of measures showing how self-financing will be achieved during a set of years.

The approval and proper implementation of this plan will be significant step forward in the strengthening of cadastral system and securing its sustainability. However, the financial sustainability of the cadastral organisation depends to a great extent of the ability of the recipient to implement the measures proposed in a Business Plan and political support.

For future support we recommend that Sida continues the financial support and propose that the project extension should include four main components:

Component 1 – General technical assistance of the extended First Cadastral Project;

Component 2 – Support in further development of the fiscal cadastre;

Component 3 – Human capacity building and dissemination of information;

Component 4 – Project management.

In summary, we consider that the work done in Sida's current Project is very professional and has resulted in most of the activities scheduled and the achievement of goals specified in the project documents. The extension of the support will significantly contribute to the establishment of a secure land tenure system and this will contribute to the general development of the country's economy.

1 Introduction and Project Background

1.1 Project Background

Sida has financed a technical assistance (TA) to Moldova in the area of cadastre and land management since start of the First Cadastral Project in 1997. The main goal of the Swedish support has been to give an overall assistance covering all fields of activity in a manner making it possible for National Agency Cadastre Land Resources and Geodesy, NACL RG, to fulfill the more detailed objectives for First Cadastral Project set up together with the World Bank (WB) and to assist the implementation of the First Cadastral Project. For the evaluation purposes Sida's Technical Assistance program can be divided into two main logical stages:

- First stage 1997–2001
- Second stage 2001–2005

During the first stage 1997–2001, the technical assistance in the form of advice and in-service training of local experts has been provided. According to Sida's decision from 1998 based on the detailed Terms of Reference (ToR) developed by NACL RG and the World Bank the technical assistance includes areas as:

- Project implementation;
- Accounting;
- Procurement;
- IT;
- Digital mapping;
- Legal development;
- Land registration;
- Valuation;

- Training;
- GPS;
- Cadastral survey.

During both stages the consulting companies Swedesurvey AB and HIFAB International AB have been engaged, cooperating closely with the Moldovan client and counterpart – the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC.

Specific objectives have been established in each area of assistance cited above. The objectives of the consulting assistance in the project implementation area have been: (a) to assist with, and ensure, effective project implementation, particularly with respect to coordination of the different project components and the day-to-day demands of project start-up; and (b) to build implementation capacity in the Project Implementation Office (PIO).

The objectives in accounting and procurement areas are to enable the NACLRG to set up and operate an accounting system for goods, services and works, and enable it and PIO to procure goods, services and works under the First Cadastre Project according to World Bank Guidelines.

The objectives in IT area have been to ensure the successful establishment of Information Technology Group and to develop and continuously support cadastral computer systems in Territorial Cadastre Offices.

The objectives of assistance in other areas have been to support the NACLRG in development of proposals for key amendments to legal framework for land registration, improvement of registration procedures, development and introduction of property valuation methodology, training of local staff and implementation of First Cadastral Project.

The detailed description of objectives and activities of the stage one of Sida's technical assistance to Moldova (1997–2001) can be found in the report “First cadastral Project: Mid-term Review” from 2001-02-28 presented by the National Agency for Cadastre, Land Resources and Geodesy, Swedesurvey AB and HIFAB International AB.

In the second stage 2001–2005 the Sida financed project of technical assistance was extended till December 2003 in order to meet expending demands, to build human capacity and competence in the area of land management to ensure successful implementation of First Cadastral Project. Then, at the beginning of 2004, based on a request by the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC, Sida has made another prolongation of the project until August 31, 2005.

The technical assistance in the period 2001–2005 is based on the “*Proposal for Extended Support and Mid Term Review Report on the Institution and Capacity Building Program of the First Cadastre Project in Moldova*” from 2001-05-23. According to Sida's decision on the project extension from 2001-11-05, the technical assistance should be presented through the project named – *Moldova: First Cadastre Project – Fiscal Cadastre and Training*.

The Project covers three main areas of activities – *fiscal cadastre, training of personnel and general assistance*. The project includes also a study on a long-term strategy for the cadastre authority and general technical assistance.

The Project objective of the *fiscal cadastre* is to develop, introduce and implement a real estate registration that will supply information of ownership and values of real property to the taxation authorities. The objective is furthermore to develop the legislative, methodological and informational framework of real estate valuation for taxation purposes.

The Project objective of the *training* is to support of sustainable training including the seminars, training courses, study visits, preparation of course materials and literature and procurement of training equipment.

General technical assistance – includes a continuation of activities of the previous stage of support, capacity building in land registration and legal development, supporting of long-term strategy development for the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, IT development etc.

The objective of the *business plan* for the Territorial Cadastral Offices, is to let the land registration process in the Chisinau Territorial Cadastral Office serve as a blueprint in order to guide the Territorial Cadastral Offices, in the rest of the country to up-grade service functions and related facilities.

The expected results of the Project include:

- Valuation methodology for mass appraisal elaborated, information needs analysed and a database developed,
- Methodology tested and evaluated,
- Influence of the implementation of the new valuation system analysed,
- Proposal for a law on real estate valuation for the purpose of taxation elaborated,
- Detailed regulations and manuals elaborated,
- Implementation plan elaborated,
- Training modules and manuals developed and training of staff started,
- Business Plan for the Territorial Cadastral Offices developed,
 - Long-term strategy developed for the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC.

The detailed description of results and evaluation of the achievements of the technical assistance activities in the period from 2001 until May 2005 are provided in this report below.

1.2 International Projects

The Government of Moldova has a strong support of international and bilateral organizations in the area of land reform and establishment of efficient land management system. Many international projects have been implemented in Moldova in this area with the aim to increase the land tenure security and improve the land management system.

The First Cadastral Project and the activities in the area of land reform and land management in Moldova have got a substantial support from the *World Bank, international and bilateral donor organizations* from Japan, Switzerland, USA, Norway and Sweden. Short summaries of the international projects in the area of land management being implemented in Moldova are presented below.

World Bank

The Government of Moldova requested the World Bank for assistance in the autumn 1995 for the preparation of a project to address the fundamental lack of ownership information and land security with respect to real estate in Moldova.

The Moldova First Cadastre Project (FCP). The First Cadastre project is financed through Moldavian budgetary grants, a World Bank credit and assistance from donors such as Switzerland, Sweden and

Norway. The FCP has started in 1997 and has been implemented by the National Agency of Cadastre Land Relations and Geodesy (NACLRG).

A five-year World Bank credit for First Cadastral Project implementation became effective in March 1999. The overall project's aim is to develop and implement a national unified real estate registration program for urban and rural land, and thereby establishes a system of clear and enforceable ownership rights, to promote the privatisation of land and the development of real estate markets in Moldova. The main objective of the First Cadastral Project was to register urban and rural real property, i.e. land, buildings and apartments.

The total cost of the First Cadastral Project implementation for the five years period (1999–2003) was estimated equivalent of about 24.6 MUSD including the IDA credit of an amount equivalent of 15.9 MUSD. Sida, other donors and local funds finance the rest as it is mentioned above.

The project comprised four main components:

Component 1: Mapping Program – production of new maps and updating of existing maps, in five years time, in thirty-six (36) rayons and municipalities. This component supports the first five years of a long-term national cadastral mapping program for urban, as well as rural areas.

Component 2: Urban Cadastral Services Program – provides the institutional basis for registration of ownership rights in urban and rural areas, and storage and administration of ownership information, to be readily available to all potential users. This includes also the reorganization of Bureau of Technical Inventory into the Territorial Registration Offices (TCO) and to establish a legal cadastre system.

Component 3: Rural Cadastral Services Program – financing of activities and investments to provide the institutional basis for registration of ownership rights in rural areas, and storage and administration of ownership information, to be readily available to all potential users. *This includes also Real Estate Registration and Title Issuing Program and establishing of Branch Cadastral Offices (BCO).*

Component 4: Institution and Capacity Building Program – financing of an Institution and Capacity Building Program, supporting institutions, agencies, and individuals actively and competently participating in project activities and to make use of the opportunities provided by the project. The program consists of three main sub-components:

- (a) training, including direct project implementation related training, one-year study visits abroad, and training equipment;
- (b) technical assistance, in special areas of expertise currently not available in Moldova, provided from abroad; and
- (c) establishment of a Project Implementation Office (PIO).

In accordance with the amendment to the Credit Agreement approved by the WB on December 16, 2002, the Project was extended by one year i.e. until February 28, 2005. The cost of the project was also revised and the funds remaining under the categories “Consultancies and training”, “Equipment” “Operational costs”, etc. were reallocated towards “Technical Services” i.e. for the surveying and additional registration of about 94.000 properties.

According to recent WB Aide Memories, despite some governance issues occurred in 2002 the First Cadastral Project implementation is considered as successful. In general the project objectives are fully achieved and the unified Cadastral System for registration of real estate and ownership rights has been established and operates through 12 fully functioning Territorial Cadastral Offices and 28 Branch Cadastral Offices, BCOs, throughout the country (except for Transnistria²). The real estate registration

² Transnistria is a break-away separatist region in the Eastern part of Moldova on the border with Ukraine

system is based on and supported by appropriate legislation comprising the Civil Code accepted in 2002 and the Law on Real Estate Cadastre adopted in 1998. By the beginning of 2005 about 75% of total number of properties is registered in cadastre.

Other achievements of the First Cadastral Project, as presented in the international seminar held in October 2004 in Moldova:

- “The required legal environment for functioning of real estate cadastral system and unified cadastral system for property registration are created;
- The process of citizens’ assessment of property rights on land has accelerated and 99% of owners of agricultural parcels possess the authenticity title of owner’s right on parcel;
- Within the project’s framework cadastral works are being completed at about 500 localities out of existing 1550;
- Geodesic system with the reference to MOLDREEF-99 is created;
- Legal environment is created for a new system of real estate evaluation is being implemented;
- The necessary conditions for private sector development (notaries, cadastral engineers, valuers) in domains connected with registration are created;
- Real estate market is assured by the information about the owner, real estate and right on real estate;

The Project has also strong support from the government. Based on the successful results of the project implementation, the World Bank is considering the extension of the support of cadastral project till June 2007. It is very likely that positive decision regarding the extension will be made soon.

Japan

Japan supported the *Cadastral Pilot Project Implementation* in the period 1996–1997. Implementing organization – ILIS and Hilland. The main achievements of this support are

- Legal environment elaboration in cadastral domain;
- Projecting and testing of “Juridical Cadastre” SIA;
- Elaboration and testing of execution methods of cadastral works;
- Training of local personnel involved in cadastral system creation in Moldova and
- Preparation of the First Cadastral Projects.

Switzerland

Switzerland supported a *Cadastral Cartography Project* in Moldova in the period 1997–2002. Implementing organization – ITV Geomatic, Switzerland. The main achievements of this project are:

- Complete technical modernization at INGEOCAD and maintenance of cadastral project with Modern surveying and cartography basis;
- Creation of analytical photogrammetry and orthophoto production capabilities;
- Creation of new land surveying network based on GPS technologies;
- Local personnel training for maximum use of installed equipment’s capacities.

USAID

USAID has started the program of extensive support of land privatization and titling process in 1997. This program includes three main stages:

- Land market development project (1997–2000);
- Assistance Program for private farmers (2000–2002);
- Maintenance project of Land Privatization Process (from 2003 and ongoing).

Among of the main achievements of the program should be outlined:

- Juridical environment development in land privatization domain and real estate market development;
- Creation of conditions for private sector development providing land surveying services;
- Elaboration of methods for agricultural land parcels mass privatization;
- Completion of property rights transfer process on agricultural land parcels;
- Producing of about 2,500,00 titles for land and primary mass registration of about 2,800,000 agriculture parcels;
- Methodology for correction of errors committed during the mass titling has been elaborated and the correction of errors started.

Norway

Public Informing Support Project was supported by Norway in the period 1998–1999. The project was implemented by the Norway Land Information (NE). The project was concentrated on:

- Public information campaigns including improvement and publishing of booklets, articles and programs about cadastre and its importance in national mass media;
- Supporting of legislative acts in cadastral domain publishing;
- Public awareness campaigns regarding cadastral activities.

2 Evaluation Methodology

The aim of this evaluation report is to give a presentation of the results of the Sida supported technical assistance to the First Cadastral Project in Moldova as well as the recommendations for possible continuation of the support in land management. This evaluation report is based on the findings of the project evaluation mission during the field visits to Moldova and analysis of presented project documents.

Sida currently considers whether or not the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC, should be supported in the future. Sida needs an evaluation in order to have good knowledge about the history when they initiate discussions with the Moldavian counterpart for a possible future support.

The methodological approach adopted for this evaluation mission is based on the interpretation of the Term of Reference (ToR) from 2005-04-14, see *Annex 1*. The aim of methodology has been to make the evaluation of current achievements of Sida support, get appropriate information and feedback from

the project recipients, and assess the needs and requirements as well as to make the recommendations for possible further support in area of cadastre development in Moldova.

The goal of project evaluation mission is to make an assessment of project performance and its achievements during the period of its implementation since 2001 and provide Sida with recommendation for the discussions with Moldavian counterpart for a possible future support.

The evaluation should analyse the results and achieved within the Project carried out by the consulting companies Swedesurvey and HIFAB International in comparison with the planned goals and objectives as regards:

- Support of fiscal cadastre development;
- Development of legislative, methodological and information framework of real estate valuation for taxation purposes;
- Testing and evaluation of developed methodology;
- Training courses for all spectrum of stakeholders;
- Preparation of Business Plan for the Territorial Cadastral Offices;
- Effects on target groups;
- Sustainability of project results;
- Cross cutting issues (gender, environment, corruption etc.)
- Satisfaction among the recipient organisations and other stake-holders
- Relevance, appropriateness and integration in the WB programme
- Documentation and Reporting

This report gives an analysis and the conclusions of the performance of the Sida supported project and includes recommendations on a possible continuation of Sida's support in the area of land management.

The report is based on the findings during a visit to Moldova and comprehensive analysis of Inception and Progress Reports and other documents related with project activities.

The evaluation of the Project has been carried out by the team of consultants consisting of Ulf Kihlblom, Sweden and Mykhaylo Cheremshynskyy, Ukraine. The evaluation mission includes a visit to Moldova, which has been carried out during April 17–24, 2005 by Mykhaylo Cheremshynskyy.

During the visit to Moldova all together some 18 meetings were carried out and 27 key representatives of recipient organisations, key stakeholders and other international projects were interviewed.

The meetings were held with the World Bank Project Implementation Office (PIO), Sida office in Moldova, main stakeholders, State agency for Land Relation and Cadastre of the Republic of Moldova, the World Bank operation officer, municipalities, notaries, Ministries of Finance and of Environment, territorial cadastral offices, and private companies. The list of organisations visited and persons met and interviewed is provided in *Annex 2*.

After the visit to Moldova, the in depth review of available project documents ranging from Sida's decisions, terms of references, monthly activities reports to some seminars and meetings presentations and other documents covering all aspects of project activity and related documents as the World Bank Aide Memoires, etc. has been made.

However, the review of documents was directed rather on getting appropriate information needed for the current mission. This Report is restricted to analysis of findings and conclusions, including recom-

mentations for further development. The List of documents reviewed and analysed is presented in *Annex 3*.

3 Main Findings and Project Results

3.1 Evaluation of Project Achievements

The description of project performance, assessments of results and evaluation of its achievements in comparison with objectives in the terms of references is provided in this chapter. Almost all planned activities of the project in both stages are carried out according to the time schedule. The initial time schedules have sometimes been modified and adjusted according to the wishes of the client without affecting the quality of the activities.

In summary the meetings with representatives of the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, World Bank, Project Implementation Office, Territorial Cadastral Offices, ministries, municipalities, notaries and other project stakeholders have demonstrated their keen interest in the establishment of an efficient cadastral system in Moldova, understanding of benefits of such system for country economy and its different sectors.

The representatives of the stakeholders appreciate very much the Swedish support in the development of the cadastral system and expressed their positive satisfaction of the implementing companies Swedesurvey and HIFAB International. World Bank is also satisfied with the level of cooperation, the Project development and its results, which is reflected in several of the most recent Aide Memoires of the WB.

We can conclude that in general the project was professionally organised and well managed; the project activities are successfully implemented and have achieved their objectives. More detailed evaluation of Project's different components achievements are presented in this chapter below

3.2 Fiscal Cadastre Project Development

The activities in the Fiscal Cadastre included

- Consultancy services,
- Pilot projects on data collection methods,
- Seminars, workshops,
- Assistance in methodology development.

The activities in this component were organised as short one-week visits of consultants in different issues of Fiscal Cadastre. All activities are well documented and include 45 reports about the visit of consultants during 2002–2004. It includes the reports on IT system development an introduction of the ValueCad. The fiscal cadastre is quite a new institution for Moldova and its implementation requires a specific knowledge, trained personnel and development of proper legal basis. According to our opinion the effectiveness of short-term consultancies in this case is not proved; longer stays of less number of consultants directly involved in the development of legal acts and methodologies and everyday routines of cadastre establishment would have been more efficient and appreciated by the client.

The pilot projects to test data collection methods for property valuation in different regions and conditions were carried out in 2002–2003 in the villages Mitoc in Orhei region and then in Chisinau in Riscani and then Straseneni dealing with valuation of apartments. The objectives for these pilot projects were to test methods for collection of market data from transactions for urban as well as rural areas and to test methods for efficient collection of information required for mass valuation as well as to develop manuals for market data collection. These pilot projects resulted in the development of valuation models for commercial properties, apartments and preparation of manuals and recommendations.

The specialised training courses and seminars related to development of fiscal cadastre were also carried out for Moldavian experts, including a course in statistical analysis, seminar on mass valuation and a workshop on conceptual/ data modelling of a sales price database. In 2003 many activities were dedicated to the Information Technology use for the fiscal cadastre, Sales Price Database, development of Value Cad System and use of GIS for valuation and zoning.

The activities of the Fiscal Cadastre component were implemented mainly according to the time schedule and have resulted in the established results and objectives. A good basis for further development of the Fiscal Cadastre is established, the valuation methodology has been drafted and tested for some types of property and recommendations for data collection, use of information technology in property valuation have been developed and discussed in details with client.

Some remarks and recommendations regarding the presenting of the results can be found in the subchapter 3.8 below.

However, the meetings with the Ministry of Finance and Taxation Authority have indicated that there are many issues to solve yet in this sector to establish the system that can efficiently support the property valuation and taxation. The compatibility and conformance of Legal Cadastre data with the Fiscal Register is still a big issue to be solved. The issues of valuation data structure, data exchange between the Legal Cadastre and other official registers as well as the responsibility for data quality also need to be addressed.

3.3 Training Activities

A special block of training activities in the area of cadastre, property registration, use of information technology, IT, in cadastre is implemented in the project. The training activities are well planned and include the support of domestic training courses, organising of international seminars, study visits to other countries, establishment of training facilities and supply of equipment at the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC.

In the period 2001–2004 the project has implemented all together 15 study visits to different countries including Sweden (5 visits), Romania (1), Lithuania (5), Ukraine (1), Russia (2), Georgia (1). All together more that 50 Moldavian experts from cadastral organisations have participated in study visits and seminars. Follow-up discussions were held after several study visits and seminars, to disseminate the information and find the ways of how to implement the experience in Moldova. Based on the results of the interviews it is evident that the study visits were well organised, they covered countries with different experiences in cadastre and gave the participants a broad picture of modern development in cadastre and land management.

Four international seminars about Land Administration and Cadastre were organised also in Moldova in which the experts from the countries of the region, Sweden, USA, Switzerland have been taking part. In a seminar held September 29–October 1, 2004 the results and achievements of the First Cadastral Project and Moldovan experience in the development of unified cadastral system were discussed. It was also held as summing-up seminar for the Sida financed technical assistance project.

The project supported also about 45 training courses carried out during 2001–2004 in different subjects as GIS use for information management, transformation of geodetic coordinate systems, use of GPS, new methods of data collection, cadastral surveying, digital mapping, training on special software use etc. The software GTRANS for geodetic network analysis and transformation of coordinates systems presented to INGGEOCAD is successfully installed and used in daily work. The training activities in cadastral surveying and digital mapping also resulted in the development of guidelines, recommendations, data structures and data exchange procedures, which have impact on the overall development. We believe that the project's support in the training was valuable for the participant provided strong on the job training for experts to increase their capacity and practical experience in different subjects of land management.

The equipment (copier, media projector and additional computers) for training activities has been purchased and modern training facilities were established at the premises of the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC. This has created very good logistic conditions for carrying out training courses and is used for organising local training courses in an efficient manner.

The long-term training program Master of Science in Land Management successfully implemented in cooperation with the KTH University in Stockholm for lecturers and experts from Moldova is very important for strengthening the teaching resources at the Moldovan universities. This program has been ongoing for five years and we strongly recommend that it should be continued.

Based on the Progress Reports and interviews we can conclude that the objectives of the training activities and study visits of the project are achieved. The interviews with stakeholders showed their appreciation of the training activities and understanding of the importance of such activities to learn the experience from other countries and to build the modern vision of development in cadastre.

Thus, we can summarise that the training activities were implemented on high professional level and well according to the plan, well organised and that the training activities satisfy the needs of stakeholders to obtain new experience in the area of cadastre.

3.4 Development Strategy and Business Plan

The Strategy for long-term sustainability for State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre including Territorial Cadastral Offices (TCO) and State Company INGGEOCAD was developed at the request of the Agency and its draft was presented in May 2002. The representatives of the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC, Project Implementation Office, Territorial Cadastral Offices and state owned company Inggeocad have been taking part in the strategy development and its draft was discussed with them.

The Strategy has established the strategic goals for the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC, and its Territorial Cadastral Offices. The strategy reads as follows:

The State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC, with its Territorial Cadastral Offices aims to satisfy the real estate owners' need and the national necessity for accurate and readily available cadastral information of the whole of the Republic of Moldova in the most effective and efficient way.

The May 2002 strategy analyses the status of the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre and its Territorial Cadastral Offices and other organisations in land management, states the actual products and services provided by the system and provides the recommendation for the future. The products and services for the future are defined as:

- Land consolidation,
- Valuation of properties,

- Advisory services for landowners,
- Information source.

The meeting with the USAID project confirms that land consolidation services are of highly requested by many of agriculture companies and businesses.

The May 2002 strategy provides quite detailed recommendations for future development in most important areas including:

- Finances,
- Legal, technical,
- Property valuation,
- Organisation,
- Quality control,
- Public awareness,
- Information dissemination.

However, the document itself is too detailed and too long as for a strategy. The strategic objectives are quite narrow and are established from the cadastral sector point of view but not from the national economy perspective and the role of cadastral system in the economical development and growth of the country. This document was, without any doubts, very useful at the time it was formulated in 2002, to analyse the situation and build the vision for a future. It can be considered as a first step before development of new Business Plan in 2005 for the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC.

Based on the experience of the *development of new Business Plan in 2005*, the strategy should be reviewed from the development of the national economy perspectives. To establish a strategy is a developing and learning process. We should recommend an annual review of the achievements and, if necessary, modifications of the strategy according to the changes in the economic situation, legal environment and organisation, to reach desired results.

The Business Plan development is one of the important objectives of the project. The *Business Plan for Legal Cadastre in Moldova* was under development and discussion with main stakeholders quite a long time and the final proposal is dated May 2005. The purpose of the Business Plan is to outline a future program of cadastre development within the general framework established by the Strategy of Economic Growth and Poverty Reduction approved by the Law in 2004. The Business Plan outlines:

- Current situation of the Legal and Fiscal Cadastre with its accomplishments and problems,
- Analyses of the achievements of the First Cadastral Project,
- Actual organisation structure and proposal for a new organisational structure of the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC
- Suggests solutions to specific problems within the fields of organization, financing, total quality, and within legal and technical issues.

The document contains a detailed analysis of the current situation in Legal Cadastre including existing accomplishments and problems and it proposes solutions to specific problems. The recommendations of the Business Plan are covering

- Organisation and financial framework,
- Operations and quality issues,
- Finalizing of fiscal cadastre,
- Technical inventory, marketing,
- Mass valuation for fiscal purposes.

The Business Plan provides recommendations for an action plan for the period 2005–2007. A detailed analysis of the cadastral system financial situation in 1999–2004, and profit and loss statements for 2002–2004 are provided. The main issues related with the financial sustainability of cadastral system when the First cadastral Project ends are as follows:

- Lack of funding for a continuation of cadastre works and property registration because the revenue from sporadic registration will decrease when all real estate objects are registered and the financing is expected mostly from the registration of transactions fees;
- The Government agencies and local governments do not pay for cadastre information used. The budget transfers should include an element to cover costs of provision of such information.
- The cadastre system is supposed to repay the credit for the First Cadastre Project, which is a heavy financial burden unusual for many countries starting a cadastre system. Normally the investments needed to establish a cadastre system are provided by the state budget, while the operation, updating and maintenance of the system should be a self-financing once the initial system is established;
- The inflation rate is high. The revenue will cover less of the expenditures if fees are not raised to compensate the inflation.
- The existing tariffs for cadastral works and registration are outdated and need the revision to cover the inflation, increased salary rates etc.

To solve these issues and assure the financial sustainability of the cadastre, proposals for the future program until 2007 are provided. The proposals include finalization of the first registration, marketing of information and providing new products for a public and valuation for taxation purposes. The Government of Moldova should find the solution how to improve the financial situation of cadastral system enabling it to afford the credit repayment. Such proposals are already provided in the business plan but according to our opinion they should be elaborated more during the next project period, as it is proposed in recommendations below.

Among the most important measures to achieve financial sustainability of the cadastre is the consolidation of the cadastre organizations into one State Cadastre Enterprise and establishment of a central database. This will assure that the registration system will be built on a sustainable financial, legal and technical base. This is possible only with a strong central management commitment. A framework and structure for a new cadastral organisation is also proposed.

The Business Plan can be used by the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC, for discussions with the government of Moldova of future development of the Agency. When the decision of the new cadastral organisation is taken, the preparation of a more detailed Business Plan for such an organisation as well as an annual review of the plan is needed.

Without proper amendments to legal acts, budget transfers to cover the cost of government's requests of information, implementation of new methodology for tariffs calculation and establishment of a financial management system, the financial stability of future cadastral organisation will still be at risk.

The financial sustainability of the cadastral system will to a great extent depend of political support of the cadastral system development, professional capacity and ability of SALRC to implement the proposed measures and the economical situation in the country. According to our opinion additional technical assistance and support of governmental agencies are needed to implement the Business Plan.

The Business Plan is weak in the description of the financial business ideas; it is more a presentation of the present situation. There are estimates on the financial outcomes and projections until 2007. For 2006 and 2007 the net results are minus 80–84% of the total income, which means that the organisation will need additional external funding or it will go into bankruptcy, see Business Plan Table 22. Information is said to be available for the financial projections also for 2008–2010, showing that the organisation might be self-financing without external funding. This information should be included in the report and the final Business Plan must show how and when the organisation will be sustainable and self-financing. Additional work is required to make the present Business Plan a more effective document and it should include a set of measures showing how self-financing will be achieved during a set of years.

The Business Plan is a comprehensive document well structured and after finalising and passing proper administrative procedures and approvals, it can be used as guidelines for future development of the cadastral system. However, the Business Plan does not contain the references to the Strategy developed in 2002 and it seems that these two documents are not linked.

The Business Plan also does not show how the new cadastral organisation shall become self-financing and sustainable. It only makes forecasts for the period until 2007 when the World Bank credit expires. The prognosis for 2006 and 2007 shows negative net results of 80–85%. The given recommendations do not provide the solution or financial forecasts on how and when the cadastral organisation shall be self-financing.

The Business Plan must show a realistic budget and a more concrete action plan and measures for the coming years after 2007 until the operation, investments, updating and maintenance of the new cadastral organisation becomes self-financing. This is a weakness of the present Business Plan and it needs a revision in this part as proposed in recommendations.

Despite of this and other possible remarks to the content of the Business Plan, it is an important document for planning of future development of the cadastral system.

3.5 Satisfaction of the Recipient Organisation

The interviews with representatives of the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC, main stakeholders, the recipient of the Sida funded support sincerely showed that they all give their very positive impression and satisfaction of the results. The participants of the study tours and training courses stated their great satisfaction with the organisation and the contents of the courses and study visits. They are thankful for the opportunity to participate in the activities and consider the chance to learn about new trends, developments and experience of other countries very positive.

The acting director of the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC, expressed his high appreciation of the project and confirmed that the Sida funded support is very important not only for the Agency but also for the country. According to his opinion the Sida funded support made a great commitment to the human capacity building, success of the unified cadastral system in Moldova and implementation of the First Cadastral Project. He has also stressed that there is a great need to continue the Sida funded support and its extension.

The management of the Territorial Cadastral Offices confirmed that their participation in the planned project activities especially in seminars, study visits and training courses significantly their vision and understanding of cadastre and gave a practical experience useful in their routine work. It gives also better understanding of the economy of the cadastre and the need of restructuring of the organisation

of the system and provides some ideas about possible ways to assure system sustainability after the mass registration will be finalised.

According to the Project Implementation Office representatives the Sida funded support has contributed a lot to the establishment of a professional office and increased the management capacity of the staff. The participation in many of the project activities was a good opportunity for the staff to extend their vision, learn from the experiences of other countries and it was helpful not only for the development of the cadastral strategy but also in the everyday routines and planning.

All interviewed representatives from the recipient organisation stated a need of further capacity building for themselves and the entire organization. They also stated that they would willingly participate in other activities of similar kind and they really consider the project useful and successful. The deputy Project Implementation Office manager mentioned also that they have requests from some countries in transition to visit to Moldova to learn its experience of development of cadastral system. According to Project Implementation Office such success would not be possible without Sida's commitment and the project input and the continuation of Sida's support in this area will be appreciated very much by the Moldovan authorities.

The persons interviewed were quite enthusiastic about the project, and presented some thoughts about the future structure of the cadastre, need of simplification of registration procedures to better serve the public, needs of further capacity building, etc. Based on the interviews and results of the field visit, we can conclude that the recipient organisation is sincerely satisfied with the Project results.

3.6 Relevance, Cost-effectiveness of the Project Support

The discussion of the relevance and cost-effectiveness of the project support in this chapter cannot be separated from the discussion and analysis of the project results and achievements presented in this report as well as conclusions from other chapters.

Relevance of the Technical Assistance Project. The Project of technical assistance supported by Sida should be considered as an *integral part* of the overall process of unified cadastral system development and maintenance, which is named the First Cadastral Project initiated in 1997. The strategic goal of this process, which involves many Moldavian and international organisations, is the establishment of an efficient and transparent unified cadastral system providing public services at affordable costs for the citizens and contributing to the tenure security and economical development of the country.

To answer the question about *the role of the technical assistance* in all this process is feasible to divide it into two main conventional parts – the *production* part and *technical assistance* part. The production part is financed by the loan of the World Bank and includes mapping, establishing and maintenance of registration offices, registration of titles etc. The technical assistance project is dealing mostly with the capacity building and institutional questions and can be considered as supportive activity, which strongly contributes to the success of overall process.

Answering the question about the relevance of the technical assistance project support from this point of view should be found – to what extent the technical assistance has contributed to the achievement of First Cadastral Project strategic goal. This will simultaneously answer the question to what extent the established objectives of technical assistance are relevant to the client needs and the situation in the land management sector.

From another side some the technical assistance can be considered relevant if it satisfies the recipient needs and has a positive impact on the main target groups. The achievement of project goals, assuming their correspondence to the client needs, is also important criteria to answer the question regarding the relevance of support.

The success of the overall process of establishing a cadastral system also depends; to a great extent, of the Project Implementation Office capacity and ability to implement the activities financed by the World Bank. Based on this, the capacity building in the PIO and establishing of local experts group capable to develop the cadastral system are important objectives of technical assistance at this stage of the development. So, the World Bank representatives and PIO satisfaction of the technical assistance project results are also essential for considering the relevance of the Sida's project.

The discussion in the subchapters 3.1-3.4 clearly shows that *established objective and results of the project are achieved in most aspects*. The satisfaction of main recipient SALRC and other Moldavian organisations is discussed in previous chapter and the conclusion is very positive.

The meeting with the World Bank representative confirms that the World Bank is *satisfied with the Technical Assistance* provided by Swedesurvey/HIFAB International. The mid-term review of the First Cadastral Project from January 2004 outlines: *"The technical assistance provided by Sweden is very valuable and has built excellent capacity in the PIO. Visits to other countries and the visiting Swedish advisors have provided strong on the job training and practical experiences in the field of cadastre and valuation. The valuation work is progressing satisfactorily"*.

The World Bank Aid Memoire regarding the progress of the First Cadastral Project from October 2004 also express high appreciation Sida's support and the importance of technical assistance project for the success of implementation of the World Bank First Cadastral Project. The World Bank mission also declared *"that it is important to continue support to the legal cadastre, including IT training and development as well as support for Territorial Cadastral Offices registration when the credit is closed"*.

The Project Implementation Office, PIO, is directly taking part in all planning and most of the activities. The Project Implementation Office staff is well informed about Project activities, has showed great willingness to participate and requested more training courses and seminars to be carried out in most of the presented subjects and as well as in new areas. The Project Implementation Office is familiarised with all progress reports, documents and other materials produced in the course of the Technical Assistance Project.

The Project Implementation Office, PIO, created in April 1998, plays an important role in the cadastral project implementation and land management system development in Moldova. The role of the Moldovan Project Implementation Office is a little farther than just the role implementation unit of the World Bank financed project as it can be in any other country. Due to the attractive professional opportunities and salaries much higher than in the governmental offices (in SALRC, for example, it is less than 100 USD per month), the Project Implementation Office, PIO, has recruited quite professional and self-motivated experts in the project management, lawyers, IT experts and surveyors (totally the staff of PIO is almost 30 –35 people). They also have got a good training within the frame of Technical Assistance Project and practically the PIO is playing the role of some kind of *knowledge centre* for the land management sector.

The Project Implementation Office, PIO, staff has really contributed to the success of many initiatives and the achievements in the cadastral domain. The Territorial Cadastral Offices, TCO's, are usually busy with the daily production and registration routines and have no time and resources to commit themselves to the research and cadastral strategy development. The existence of such a Project Implementation Office in Moldova is quite beneficial for the cadastral system and for SARLC, keeping in mind the relative weakness and lack of modern experience in the public sector. Naturally the Project Implementation Office is just small element of the system and we should not overestimate its influence and its weight in decision-making in land management domain, which heavily depends of the SALRC and other governmental authorities (like Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Justice etc.).

From another side the Project Implementation Office by its nature is a temporary establishment, which may formally decrease (close) its activity when the World Bank project ends in the middle of 2007. The experience accumulated in this unit and “institutional memory” of the cadastral system can be lost, if no proper measures taken to keep the great competence within the Project Implementation Office within the cadastral organization. This issue has also an economical dimension, as considerable investments in the PIO have been undertaken during the implementation of the First Cadastre Project. The professional capacities of the Project Implementation Office should be available to further develop and maintain the registration system.

The SALRC officials and WB representatives have acknowledged this issue. Some proposals to solve the issue are presented in the Business Plan elaborated by the Swedish consultants, especially in the chapter 4.2, 6.4 and 7 of the Business Plan document.

We agree in principal with the proposal to consolidate the Project Implementation Office, PIO, and the Territorial Cadastral Offices, TCO, into an *integrated cadastral enterprise* aimed to provide public services in the cadastral domain. However, the Business Plan, especially its financial side, needs more deep elaboration and this is one of the reasons to suggest the continuation of support.

Based on the discussion above we can conclude that the Technical Assistance Project is timely and relevant to the development of the land management sector in Moldova. The project contributes in the success of the First Cadastral project, establishment of unified cadastral system and property registration. The support in the development of the Fiscal Cadastre, elaboration of methodologies and guidelines creates a good initial basis for introduction of transparent and fair property taxation.

The training and education of personnel gives increased understanding of trends of cadastral development, building a new vision and strategy in land management and most important to increase a human capacity and professional level of Moldavian experts in land management. The project gives also better use of scarce financial resources of the Government of Moldova.

Cost effectiveness of the technical assistance. The World Bank Project Appraisal Document (PAD) for the First Cadastral Project from March 24, 1998 estimated the funding required for the implementation of the FCP in the amount 24.6 MUSD for 5 years period 1999–2003.

According to the Project Implementation Office, which is tracking all inputs to the First Cadastral Project, the total cost for the implementation during the period 1998–2004 (or almost 7 years period) is about 24.7 MUSD. This amount includes about 14.2 MUSD of funding coming from the World Bank loan, about 3.5 MUSD from the Government of Moldova and the rest, about 7.0 MUSD are the inputs from different donor organizations. Sweden and Switzerland are among the major donors of the Moldavian First Cadastral Project. Sida’s input since 1998 is about 2.9 MUSD and it is very close to the Swiss input, which is the second largest donor for Moldavian Cadastral System.

The financial input of Sida is about 12% of total cost of the system development at the moment. Comparing the expense with achieved results we can consider the Sida funded Project as *cost-effective activity* and all this report, providing a positive evaluation of project, confirms such conclusion. The technical assistance in different areas of cadastre, training and capacity building activities has established a framework of professionals in state and private sectors, which have showed their ability in development of cadastral system.

Despite of some negative issues discussed in this report, Moldova has developed a better unified cadastral system in comparison with other countries of the region. During less than 10 years Moldova succeed to establish a functioning cadastral system and register almost 70% of the properties of the country. Such success is much depending on the well-coordinated technical assistance programs from many countries.

Any conclusions or assumptions about possible scenarios of development without technical assistance program are a kind of guesswork, which cannot operate with empiric facts or figures. But the interviews with recipients and representatives of stakeholders have presented valuable evidences for such exercise and some reasonable assumptions can be based on opinions expressed by the people interviewed.

The representatives of recipients (SALRC, PIO, TCO), expressing their satisfaction of the project, have admitted also that it *“would be very hard or even impossible to achieve such positive results without technical assistance and support”*. Many interviewed people confirmed that participation in training programs and study visits was very helpful in their everyday work to give them to understand a wider vision of cadastre, understand the concept and ways of its implementation. The local experts appreciate very much also the software presented, help in development and implementation of methodologies and regulations, assistance in drafting of legal acts, strategy and business plan etc. They acknowledge that it would be very hard for them to do this alone and it also would take much more time and require more resources. We also share this opinion and can assume that the success in unified cadastre establishment, achieved within so short time, would be not possible without technical assistance program.

The technical assistance is a continuous and developing process and usually there is enough space for improvements. The reduction of the presence of international expert due to the increasing professionalism of local experts and migration to the short-terms consultancy visits is an obvious measure in such a situation. However, the financial efficiency of many short-term visits by the Swedish consultants should be proved yet; future support should not allow this kind of short-term consultancy missions.

It should be feasible to introduce the approach that can be called as *establishing of consultancy dialog* between local and Swedish experts using the opportunities of information and communication technology in combination with consultancy visits, workshops and seminars. Such approach requires more flexible planning based on assessment of continuous needs and the day-to-day monitoring of operations and development in the cadastral sector. Any consultancy visit in this case should consist of three parts: preparation of visit, field visit and monitoring of results. The creation of a *land administration network* is also advisable.

The visit preparation part should include an intensive dialogue between the client and local and Swedish experts regarding the questions and issues to be solved, formulation of problems that should be discussed during the visit. Some minor issues may be clarified and solved even prior to visit and consultancy visit time should be used more efficiently. Than the next part is a consultancy visit itself that can be longer and more focused on assistance for local experts in solution of real problems on site and small issues can be solved during the preparation period.

The monitoring part should include reporting, monitoring of situation and keeping the dialogue with the client and local experts. Such approach can reduce the number of visits; improve their preparation and efficiency as well as to keep continuous monitoring of the situation. Swedish experts should also have some time in the home office to dedicate to the monitoring and preparation. More deep involvement of local experts from private companies or experts from the region is also feasible.

Land administration networking can be also used and it includes the establishing of permanent regional network of experts for keeping dialogue regarding the development in the cadastral domain. It can be organized trough, for example, using regular workshops for experts of land management of the region, international seminars and visits. A good example of such kind of approach on European level is the Working Party on Land Administration.

The bottom-to-top approach can be also used, when more efforts should be concentrated not on the contacts with central governmental bureaucracy, as for example SALRC, but on the Territorial Cadastral Offices, municipalities and local communes, which are dealing directly with people i.e. property owners. Increasing their capacity to use the benefits of cadastral system will contribute not only to the

sustainability of the system, but also to the economy of local communities. It is also necessary to keep in mind that the owners and potential investors are the main users of the cadastral system and it is also very important to keep them informed about benefits of the system and how to use it. Any changes in the approach and improvements require the resources and for this reason they can be carefully considered during project proposal preparation stage.

The World Bank is considering the prolongation of the current First Cadastral Project. According to the PIO the government of Moldova requested the prolongation of the First Cadastral Project for more 1.5 years until June 2007 with a total budget about 3.5 MUS\$D. The approval of the extension was made June 16, 2005. Furthermore, according to the Project Implementation Office, it is expected that at the middle of 2006 the possibility of additional extension of the WB financing and implementation of the new phase of the WB project will be considered. However the WB representatives informed that at the moment the WB is considering the current extension of the project as a last one.

3.7 Sustainability of Project Results

The main goal of Sida technical assistance project is a support to the First Cadastral Project development and a contribution to the unified cadastral system in Moldova. For this reason the sustainability of the project results is linked to the sustainability of the results of First Cadastral Project.

From another side, the technical assistance project contributing to the capacity building, has established, during relatively short period of time, the team of local experts, which have demonstrated their capacity to carry out the cadastre. Only ten years ago Moldova, as any other post-soviet era country, has neither private land ownership institution nor any legal cadastre. Today the system is functioning and a professional environment in this domain is created. Experts from other countries are coming to learn from the experience of Moldova in this field.

The recommendations and methodologies developed within the frame of the Technical Assistance Project will also improve the general performance of the cadastral system and help increasing its efficiency. The extensive training programs in the project, long term training and education at KTH gives local experts opportunities to increase their professional capacity to carry out the system development and creates the grounds for sustainability of the project results and land management system. So, from the point of view capacity building program the results are likely to be sustainable in the nearest perspective.

The sustainability of the overall results of the First Cadastral Project and the unified cadastral system after the World Bank loan will be closed in 2007 is still the issue to be addressed. The Business Plan developed for a Legal Cadastral System within the scope of the project can contribute substantially, if properly implemented, to the sustainability of the cadastral system.

However, Moldova has made only the first steps in the creation of the secure land tenure environment and establishment of a land management system. Despite highly positive achievements in the establishment of a unified cadastral system, especially in comparison with other countries of the region, Moldova faces a lot of challenges in the land management sector. These challenges are related to the fact that only the first steps are made in the creation of a completely new public institution, lack of professionals, traditions and culture in the land management sector and the severe economic situation in the country.

The sustainability of the development in land management cannot be considered separately from the overall economical situation in the country and its perspective of development. The cadastral system functioning depends of the level of property market activity and of the general economic development of the country.

The role of SALRC, PIO and Territorial Cadastral Offices in the cadastral system sustainability should also be carefully reconsidered. The organisation structure of the cadastral system in Moldova and its functions are slightly different from the countries with developed market economy. The SALRC is just a part of state bureaucracy and not a public services oriented authority. The total staff of SALRC itself is only about 40 people. The main functions of SALRC are the control and implementation of governmental policy and it strongly depends of the political situation and decisions. Another problem is very low salaries in the government authorities in comparison with business sector. This fact does not attract professionals and it is also one of the potential sources of corruption.

The cadastral public services are provided by the Territorial Cadastral Offices, TCOs, which are self-financing organisations in Moldova. The problem is that TCOs are acting as separate organisations and their financial stability depends of the region and market activity in the region.

Even the Project Implementation Office, plays an important role in the First Cadastral Project implementation the role of SALRC as the governmental authority should not be diminished. Its role is important in getting political and administrative support for cadastral system, requesting the financing, hire the directors and carry out other administrative functions etc. But the implementation of cadastre needs also high professional expertise and experience in many fields of human activity (law, IT, surveying, mapping, land development etc.) that state servants may not have.

This is a reason why the roles are so important in Moldova of both the Project Implementation Office, as knowledge centre and the Territorial Cadastral Offices as organisations carrying out daily cadastral routines. The acting director of SALRC has confirmed that the technical assistance program made a lot to support the authority and assist them in the development of regulations, legal acts and primary in implementation of cadastral project. He and the TCO representatives have also acknowledged the PIO role in the system development.

According to our opinion the project has been correctly oriented in its efforts to strengthen, not only the SALRC but also the Project Implementation Office, PIO, and Territorial Cadastral Offices as an important elements of the system implementation. If the proposals of the Business Plan will be implemented the experts of the Project Implementation Office, can join the unified vertically integrated cadastral organisation. The establishment of such an organisation is a hard task but it is a strong contribution to the sustainability of the cadastral system. It is evident that to assure the sustainability of the First Cadastral Project results, additional technical assistance and extension of the project is needed as we have recommended.

3.8 Project Planning, Implementation and Reporting

In general the project reporting corresponds to the project documentation requirements and according to our opinion adequately reflects the progress made issues to be solved and project achievements. More than 100 separate mission report were presented for the project valuation mission on different subjects of consultancy, including fiscal cadastre 46 mission reports, training – 14 reports, IT – 11 reports, legal development 7 reports, etc. The progress reports were prepared separately for each consultancy visit. Each report reflects the results of the consultant's visit and contains the information about schedule of visit, meetings and interviews and the progress made in the subject of the visit as well as the recommendations and proposals regarding the issues studied during the visit.

All reports, presentations and other project materials are presented in digital form (MS Word, Power Point formats) in English and translated to Romanian or Russian. The reports are presented to the recipient and Project Implementation Office for review and comments.

However, the reporting is quite cumbersome and it takes quite a substantial time for a reader to outline and analyse real issues and achievements in each separate field of project activity. No intermediate or

final analytical reports summarising the results, issues to be solved in the future, and achievement of consultancy in proper field of activity were presented.

Many planned activities are directed to support the development of methodologies, manuals, etc. and consultant's reports contain a lot of valuable observations, recommendations and methodological approaches but they are all dispersed in many progress report.

According to our opinion it would be useful for the recipient as well as for Sida if such recommendations should be concentrated in separate documents for each field of consultancy. For example the recommendation for digital cartography and ArcCadastre use are spread in 4-5 different reports produced over two years, similar situation with recommendations on IT system for Fiscal Cadastre, legal development, etc. It would be feasible to compile all recommendations at the end of each subject into one document.

All project activities are properly planned and the time schedule is met in most cases. The recipient and the Project Implementation Office are involved in the planning procedure of all activities.

However, some delays and alterations of original planning are found. According to the Project Proposal 5 international seminars in Moldova were planned and finally only four seminars were carried out.

The first seminar *Integration of the Informational System of Cadastre with other Informational Systems* planned for September 2002 was delayed for one year. The Seminars Geodetic basis for cadastre and Geodesy and Cartography in cadastre originally planned for weeks 7 and 15 respectively as separate seminars, were combined into one seminar, which was carried during week 15, 2003. The changes in time and scope were agreed with the Project Implementation Office, so the seminars are carried out in accordance with wish of PIO.

We have not got any remarks or reservations from recipient regarding such changes of plans and can assume that they did not affect the entire process of training activity. The summing-up seminar held at the end of October 2004 was also delayed due to the prolongation of the project time. These changes are quite normal and all training activities are carried out, so this is not a severe remark.

We can conclude that in general the project planning was made in high professional level. Despite of such positive conclusion there is enough room yet for improvements in reporting and documenting of activities for a *long term* (more than 2 years) and *multi-component projects*. We would recommend introducing some changes in the project reporting what can improve the quality control and allowing better access to the information for evaluation purposes.

The improvements should include the project report for every year or for every single component, compilation of recommendations as separate documents, combination of presentations and training materials in separate compendiums on CD media, preparation of inception reports and more careful planning of training activities.

3.9 Cross-cutting Issues

The terms of reference for the evaluation mission requested to evaluate the impact of Project activities to the environment, the gender aspects of the project and potential corruption problem in cadastre. According to the proposal for the Sida supported project extension approved by Sida 2001-11-05, the project does not include direct aspects on gender and it has no negative effects on the environment. The project reports have not included any gender questions.

The short time of the evaluation mission does not allow making any detailed assessment of these crosscutting issues in addition to what is not included in Sida supported project, but some remarks based on the results of the meetings can be made.

Environmental issues. In general the cadastre as any information system containing the ownership data for the land and information about the features of the surrounding world can serve also as an instrument to help in the solution of some environmental problems. The meeting with representatives of the Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources indicated their concerns about potential problems with the environment protected zones and reserves. Such environmentally protected zones, about 368 in Moldova covering 1.96% of the territory, are owned by the state and the law requires proper documentation for them. The information about the boundaries of such zones is not yet entered into the property register and it is not available for the third persons. According to the Ministry representative such a situation covers the potential risk of privatization of such objects and potential further transfers for business use and their destruction.

The registration of such objects in the land management system can create additional legal protection for them. For this reason is feasible to develop a methodology and if necessary regulations regarding the registration of the environment protected zones and reserves in the land management system to provide them better protection.

The effect on the target group (Gender specific). Considering this question the clear difference should be made between the effect of the cadastral system per se on the target groups, effect of the First Cadastral Project for the economy and the effect of the Technical Assistance Project. Sida's contribution according to the decisions of 1998 and 2001 consists of technical assistance covering many areas of activity in cadastral domain and is mostly oriented to the capacity building for professional acting in the land management area.

Based on Sida's decision from 2001-11-05 the target groups of the technical assistance project for the period 2001–2005 should be defined as follows: staff at the SALRC and the regional offices and the actors on the land market, including tax authorities, municipalities, brokers, estate agents, insurance companies, private surveyors. The Sida supported project does not include direct aspects on gender and the terms of reference for the consultant company do not specify any activities to analyse or deal with the gender issues. The project implementation does not include any gender questions. However, the target groups are not clearly enough defined in mentioned decisions.

The technical assistance project aimed to the capacity building among professional of the land market has no direct impact on the landowners. However, from another side the technical assistance project can have a huge indirect positive effect on the landowners. The well-trained professionals with wide vision, good understanding of the social significance and economical impact of their activity can develop more efficient cadastral system, which will propose better services at low cost for the landowners. Such an efficient system, improving tenure security will contribute to the amelioration of investments climate in the country and contribute to economic growth.

In general the landowners and all groups of society can benefit to a great extent from the efficient cadastral system. The efficient and well-functioning cadastral system, which has achieved a high public confidence, contributes significantly to the increase of tenure security especially for vulnerable groups of society including women, small landowners and poor owners of property. Such system providing the ownership evidence and better protection to registered landowners helps these groups to protect their property rights, facilitates mortgaging and improves their economic situation.

In principle, land development and land administration projects and programmes are expected to positively influence the socio-economic and physical environment of societies. Gender differences in land tenure should be recognized if land objectives, such as increasing land productivity, providing affordable housing, or promoting sustainable resource management, are to be met. There is a need for land tenure policy frameworks that explicitly address gender inclusive access to land. Without specific attention to gender inclusiveness, important segments of society may be excluded from the benefits of

land administration and management. In many societies there are great gender inequities in access to land, housing and basic infrastructure. Providing secure and effective access to land for women can benefit families, communities, and nations through:

- Increased economic opportunities;
- Increased investment in land and food production;
- Improved family security during economic and social transitions;
- Better land stewardship.

To create gender equity, whether on the basis of human rights or for reasons of economic efficiency, then the principal challenges for land administration are:

- Understanding and acknowledgement of the complexity of property rights regimes as they relate to the dynamic roles of both men and women;
- Provision of effective institutional structures that can protect and strengthen equitable access to land within the framework of a society's particular land policy goals.

These benefits can only be fully realised if the strategies adopted for improving women's access to land work in practice and if decision-makers are aware of those strategies that do and do not work. They need to know about the quality and distribution of rights in land, the economic and cultural impediments that limit women's effective and secure access to land, and the benefits that can be achieved by enhancing women's access. They also need to know what options for improving equitable access to land exist and be able to evaluate the full range of implications of these options.

There is increasing evidence that outcomes of land reform and land administration activities have different implications for men and women. Traditionally, the involvement of men as the *de jure* heads of households as primary beneficiaries in such programmes was viewed as sufficient to ensure that other household members would equally enjoy the benefits of the projects as dependents. Today, it is increasingly being recognized that such assumptions cannot be made.

The World Bank First Cadastre Project in Moldova has a fairly big impact on gender issues. In the work with laws and regulations it has been several occasions to pinpoint that man and women shall have the same right to real property. The World Bank project has planned for a future sociological study of the impacts of the project. This study will treat, amongst others, poverty and gender issues.

To address the gender issues in a future Sida financed project we would recommend to include to the project activities a study and preparation of recommendations on how the cadastral information can be used to address gender issues in the case of Moldova. Some principle issues for a future gender study can be found in *Appendix 4 Gender and Access to Land* produced by FAO.

Corruption issues. In general the cumbersome and not transparent property registration procedures, lack of public control and access to the property information, low security of cadastral data and so on can potentially create the possibilities to use the cadastre for illegal arrangements in a property market and grounds for introduction of corruption schemes.

The interviews with the stakeholders did not reveal visible problems in this area but more deep study is needed. Some remarks about the need to simplify and speed up the registration procedures were made. It is obvious that long and cumbersome registration procedures, as well as the lack of transparency can be a ground for the corruption arrangement in cadastral offices on providing the preferences for some customers in obtaining the information faster and other illegal arrangements with the property. The issue of corruption is very sensitive, depends of many factors as entire level of public legal educa-

tion, situation with law enforcement in the country, level of professionalism of registrars etc. and can be treated only together with the issues of corruption in other sectors of economy and government organizations.

To assess the situation with these issues in a future project is recommended within the study of crosscutting issues to find out how the cadastral register and its information can be used for increasing the transparency of the property market and eliminating of possible corruption schemes in this area.

4 Lessons Learned

The analysis of the institutional background and political environment for project implementation, its achievements, issues to be addressed and similar projects experience in the countries of the region allows us to draw up some lessons discussed below:

Need of strong political support and strategy of institutional strengthening of the cadastre. Moldova has made only the first steps in the area of unified cadastral system establishment and sustainability of the system is still the issue, even if Moldova have achieved better results when compared with other countries of the region. The sustainability of the cadastral system and project results will need additional financial resources and approval of new legal acts and regulations. The success also heavily depends of the political support.

Achieving of public confidence in the cadastral system and reorganisation of the system to meet the public needs are key elements of success. The public confidence (including all main customers of the system as banks, real estate companies, property owners etc.) is an important element of all system sustainability. It will depend of the ability of the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC, to implement the Business Plan and assure the efficiency of the registration system, which could provide sustainable and reliable registration services at affordable costs and within short time. Any failure in this area will provoke financial problems and delay the overall development of the land management system.

Cross cutting issues should be carefully considered in every project to assure the holistic approach to its implementation. The land management projects are related with many crosscutting issues like gender, environment etc. and these issues should be carefully considered in the project preparation and implementation stages.

Response to the client's requirements and establishment of close cooperation links with other projects is vital for project success. The Project is appreciated by the project recipients not only as the result of project team efforts of project implementation but also because it is responding to the requirements of client and covers the real needs in the area of land management.

5 Recommendations for Continuation of Support

5.1 Goal and Objective of Future Support

The establishment of a secure land tenure system is quite a long process that requires the allocation of proper resources and high level of expertise to minimize possible errors that may have long-term negative impact and outcomes. When planning for future support we have to bear in the mind that a lot is already done from the international community to establish a sustainable cadastral system in Moldova.

The First Cadastral Project resulted in the establishment of a functioning unified cadastral system. However the sustainability of the system is still a question and the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC, is facing many new challenges related to

- Finalizing of the first registration,
- Assuring better access to the property information,
- Establishing fiscal cadastre.

For these reasons we recommend a continuation of Sida's support as technical assistance in the area of land management and in parts of the activities in the implementation of the First Cadastral project. The support should be adjusted with the prolongation of the WB project.

The continued Sida support should include technical assistance and capacity building during two years till July 2007 and than more one additional year of follow-up support to secure the positive tendencies and the consultancy in the solving of issues appearing after the end of World Bank project.

The goal of Sida support for next 3 years should be formulated as a contribution to the sustainability of established unified cadastral system and improvement of tenure security. Such support should also contribute to the realization of the objectives established by the Government of Republic of Moldova in the *Economic Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper 2004–2006*. This document defines main medium-term objectives in cadastre as:

- Improvement of unified national system of real estate registration;
- Completion of land privatization in order to facilitate the development of the real estate market;
- Implementation of new system of mass appraisal for taxation;
- Ensuring the financial and institutional sustainability of national cadastre.

Following the intensions given in the Strategy Paper, further Sida's support in land management should include:

- Continued general technical assistance and human capacity building;
- Continuation of the support of the implementation of the First Cadastral Project
- Contribution to the sustainability of the cadastral system.
- Assistance in the implementation of a Business Plan for the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC

The implementation of many measures proposed in the Business Plan, developed within the scope of the current Project, require special skills and professional experience in different fields as financial, marketing, information security, business development, etc. The assistance in the implementation of the Business Plan for the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC, should be also provided.

5.2 Recommended Activities

To meet the goals and objectives presented above, Sida's Technical Assistance support should consist of 4 main components:

Component 1 General technical assistance of the extended First Cadastral Project;

Component 2 Support in further development of the fiscal cadastre;

Component 3 Human capacity building and dissemination of information;

Component 4 Project management.

The recommended activities have been discussed with several persons of the client organizations and the World Bank. The recommendations are based on the findings of the evaluation mission and they cannot replace the project proposal document, which should be additionally developed.

Component 1 General technical assistance of the extended First Cadastral Project

This activity should be oriented to give a continuous support to the development of cadastral system and contribution to its economical and institutional sustainability.

The activities of this component should include the consultancy support and assistance in:

- Development of management proposals in forming of the new organisational structure of the cadastral system, including financial, technical, quality and other aspect of the establishment of a new organisation structure able to provide cadastral services after the World Bank loan has expired;
- Proposals for a building of financial management system including accounting and billing for the new cadastral organisation as an important component of its financial sustainability;
- Development of a total quality concept for a new cadastral organisation, discussions with the management and 3-4 training courses on processes and quality including, amongst others, the concept of processes and influences on all activities.
- Development of strategy for the cadastral services and information marketing as well as the proposals for the development of new products based on the cadastral data and information;
- Implementation of the measure described in the Business Plan (after improvements of the Business Plan presented in May 2005), improvements of financial part of it and review of the Strategy for long-term sustainability for the State Agency for Land Resources and Cadastre, SALRC;
- Development of a proposal and methodology how to use the cadastre information for solution of environmental issues and for registration of environmental protected zones and natural reserves;
- Establishing of a quality control system and proper use of digital technologies for cadastral surveying, geodetic and mapping activities to increase the economic efficiency in this field and create more competitive environment;
- Development of detailed ITC solution for the secure and reliable central cadastral data base and considering the opportunities of close cooperation in this field with other governmental authorities that already have established nation-wide data bases (like the former Department of information technologies) and possibilities of joint use of data base management services;
- Study on how the cadastral information can be used to address crosscutting issues in the society, especially in addressing of gender issues in the Moldova context, increasing the transparency of property market and elimination of possible corruption schemes and arrangements in this area;
- Continuation of the IT study from last year on establishment of a central cadastre database and provision of cadastral services for some groups of clients and the public using internet and communication technologies from a total quality aspect to serve the future cadastre activities.
- Development of the design of the information system for a unified cadastral enterprise.

Meetings with the PIO, SALRC and company INGGEOCAD showed that some important issues with cadastral data integration (especially collected during mass registration) should be solved with the high-

resolution orthophoto imagery, which is also important for unified cadastral database establishment and cadastral information management. The Moldavian experts repeatedly expressed the need of proper aerial survey and orthophoto maps for all the territory of the country. So, within the frame of this component we would also recommend the study to develop the program for aerial survey including terms of reference, financial part and identification of possible sources of financing of such program.

Component 1 should be oriented to the Territorial Cadastral Offices, the Project Implementation Office, SALRC and subordinated organisations.

Component 2 Support in further development of the fiscal cadastre.

This component should be considered as the continuation of the support and technical assistance in development of a fiscal cadastre and establishing of a ValueCad system. It would be economically feasible to include the following activities:

- Continued assistance to support the construction and implementation of the fiscal cadastre including legal, technical and organisation aspects of the system;
- Assistance in the development, testing and improvement of a methodology for valuation of different types of property objects including commercial properties, land parcels etc. and a methodology for property reappraisal;
- Assistance in the improvement of the legislation, identification of a new legal acts necessary to establish a consistent legal framework for cadastral and property valuation activities;
- Further development of the information exchange rules and specifications for legal and fiscal cadastre and improvement of fiscal cadastre data structure;
- Assistance in development of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) strategy and applications to improve and simplify the procedures of property valuation and valuation data use for property taxation;

Component 2 should be mainly oriented to the Territorial Cadastral Offices, Ministry of Finance and the Tax Authority.

Component 3 Human capacity building and dissemination of information

This component should include the support of international study visits, international seminars in Moldova, training programs and organizing information campaigns as well as long-term training.

Study visits: Up to 5 study visits should be carried out to countries with similar institutional arrangement of the cadastral system, countries with long traditions in cadastre and registration as well as to countries with recent experience of a cadastral reform.

Every study visit should be organized to study the experience in a specific field of land management. The participants for the study visits should in principle be a combination of key experts from different authorities related to the subject of study visits. The subject of the study visits should be selected in the way to give the participant from different fields of activity a new experience and developing new common vision for the development of their cadastral system. The preliminary topics of to study visits should be as follows:

- *Visit one.* Experience in improving of public services delivery in the area of land management, economic sustainability of the cadastral system, fiscal cadastre, cadastral data use, simplification and speeding-up the registration procedures; establishment of cooperation links with main customers, governmental bodies, notaries, banks etc.

This visit should be organized for the group of 5–6 high officials from the cadastral, taxation authorities, ministry of finance to familiarize them with new trends in cadastral services and provide

the background for discussions about the ways of cadastre improvement and getting common visions of future development.

- *Visit two.* Use of Information and Communication Technology, ICT, for improvement of delivery of cadastral services and public access to cadastral data; economic sustainability of the system and providing services financially affordable for customers.

This group for this visit should include 7–10 key experts from the cadastral authority, Ministry of Information Technology, municipalities, notaries etc.

- *Visit three.* Property valuation system, its organization structure, experiences of simplification and increasing of effectiveness of valuation procedures.

This visit should be organized for 7–10 representatives of cadastral authority dealing with fiscal cadastre development, taxation authority dealing with property taxation, ministry of economy, real estate agents etc.

- *Visit four.* Study of the methodologies of property valuation and use of information technology and geographic information systems in the process of property valuation.

This study visit should include 7–10 persons and be aimed to show the opportunities of the use of information technologies for property valuation and will be oriented to the valuation and technical experts from cadastral and taxation authority and the experts from the real estate companies

- *Visit five.* This study visit should be for 7–10 experts from the cadastral authority, education etc. to study the new approaches to the preparation of cadastral, valuation and registration, new development in the education etc. This can serve for the development of new curricula for the professional education and training in the domain of cadastre, registration, property valuation and property market.

International seminars. Three to four international one-week seminars should be held in Moldova to discuss the main topics and achievements in the domain of cadastral development in the country in regional and international context. Experts from neighbouring countries, representatives of international projects and international experts should be invited to such seminars/workshops.

The preliminary topics for seminars should be:

- New trends in cadastral development and experience of Moldova;
- Use of information and communication technologies for improved provision of cadastral services;
- Methods and technologies for property valuation. Regional experiences;
- Cadastre as a source of information to solve crosscutting issues in society, environmental and gender aspects.

Training program and information dissemination. Support should be also provided to organise specific training courses for technical personnel as well as management. The program for training should be developed based on the additional assessments and in cooperation with both the client and the World Bank.

The training courses should cover, in particular, the issues of

- Financial management of a cadastral organisation,
- Business processes,
- Total quality control concept,

- Use of information and communication technology in cadastre,
- Registration procedures improvements.

The program for training should be developed to cover also the needs of local government officials, notaries and other actual or potential user and customers of cadastral system. Such approach will promote the cadastral services and create proper environment for extension of the user's network. The plan of information dissemination should be also prepared to spread the knowledge on possible use of cadastral information in the most efficient way using available funding.

The program should also include training on property taxation consultation and training for local governments, national and local tax officials. The dissemination of information about principles and rules of property taxation and creation of public awareness regarding this issue in order to increase understanding of the population at large of the nature and purpose of property taxation and its relation to improved public service delivery. This improves the chance of success in implementing property taxation at the local levels.

Long-term training. The long-term training program Master of Science in Land Management successfully implemented in cooperation with the KTH University in Stockholm for lecturers and experts from Moldova is very important to strengthening the teaching resources at the Moldavian universities. This program has been ongoing for five years and we strongly recommend that it should be continued.

Component 3 is oriented to a wide range of recipients including the professionals of land market (notaries, realtors etc.), landowners as well as state officials from SALRC, Ministry of Finance and other authorities.

Component 4. Project management

This component should include support to project management activities. It should be also feasible to apply Quality Control and Evaluation procedures for this long-term project as well as midterm Project evaluation. The Inception Report prepared at the beginning of the proposed stage of the Project in close cooperation with PIO and recipient organizations should allow establishing more exact schedule of all activities and better adjust it to the client's needs.

If approved the future activities will be organized as a long-term project, which needs careful planning and reporting. We recommend also that the project reporting should be arranged as follows:

1. It would be feasible to prepare the Project Report by the end of each year that should not only establish the facts of activities, but should be as a comprehensive analytical document presenting project results, achievements in each area of consultancy and recommendations. Such a document should summarise the activities reflected in separate progress reports, during the year, results of the year, provide the summaries of evaluation by recipient, project impact on the sector development, achievements and challenges, lessons learned and problems to be solved, recommendations for further development, etc.
2. The recommendations, methodologies developed by consultants should be compiled into separate documents for each field of activity within project and not dispersed in a number of progress reports. Such approach will make it easier to use this valuable information for the recipient and others and increase the positive impact of all consultancy efforts.
3. The project presentations, reports and training materials are a valuable recourse for future "in-house" training and preparation of such presentations and training material is time consuming. For this reason it is feasible to compile all such training materials to the CD, distribute them to the recipient and make available for more people interested in such materials. In such a way the resources can be used more efficiently in a human capacity building activity. If the material is used only for their own use, there should not be any copyright claims and discussions.

4. Planning of project activities, especially training seminars should be more careful at the beginning to reduce to minimum possible alterations during project implementation period especially for long-term project. During the preparation of the Inception Report more careful discussion of all activities with the project recipients is feasible and we also recommend more intensive use of so called “recipient participation approach” in all project planning.

5.3 Cooperation with the World Bank

The World Bank is likely to decide in early June 2005 about the extension of the First Cadastral Project till July 2007. The World Bank has repeatedly outlined the need of continuation of Sida’s support in the Bank’s reports and at our meetings with them. The World Bank missions have indicated that it is important to continue the support to the legal cadastre, including IT training and development as well as support for TCO registration when the credit is closed.

The links established among the participants of the World Bank project and Sida’s financed project are based on the close involvement of the PIO into all project activities starting from the planning stage to the implementation and reporting. The good results of the technical assistance are seriously much appreciated by all stakeholders. The support from Sida in land management should continue during all this period until July 2007.

The continuation of Sida’s financed project should keep the close cooperation with the World Bank project and PIO. The cooperation should include joint preparation of terms of reference, planning of activities, establishing of agreed schedules, direct participation of the PIO staff in the review and discussion of project reports, joint review meetings, etc.

We can summarise that in this project in Moldova the experience of cooperation with the World Bank is positive and relevant. The project proposal for extension as well as the Inception Report for project extension should be discussed and endorsed by the client and the Project Implementation Office.

6 Conclusions

Based on the finding of the evaluation mission, analysis of and evaluation of Project Documents we can conclude that the *Moldova: First Cadastre Project – Fiscal Cadastre and Training* has been professionally implemented and has reached established goals and objectives. The technical assistance program is relevant to the situation in the land management sector in Moldova and is highly appreciated by the recipient as well as by the World Bank.

The Project activities have been tailored according to the recipient’s needs and the Project in general has contributed a lot to the implementation of the World Bank financed First Cadastral Project. There is an overall success of the establishment of the unified cadastral system in Moldova as well as in the establishment of a highly professional Project Implementation Office, which actually is the driving force of many undertakings in the cadastral domain at the national level.

The Project has established a close and fruitful cooperation relation with the World Bank financed cadastral project and other international project in the area of land management and has got a full support from the World Bank Project Implementation Office, which is actively participating not only in the planning but also in carrying out of all the Project activities. Some issues regarding the reporting and planning are presented in separate chapters of this Report.

When analysing the land tenure system in Moldova it is necessary to bear in the mind that the country is just finishing the first stage of its establishment of a land management system. In spite of a good success in building of unified cadastral system in Moldova, it is still a lot to do in this land management area before a complete and efficient operational system is ready.

Important issues that still remain to be done within the World Bank financed project are

- Finalising of properties registration,
- Making the legal cadastre system more efficient and responsive to the customer needs,
- Simplification of registration procedures,
- Establishing of fiscal cadastre,
- Improving the legal basis of the land tenure system,
- Implementation of mass valuation on the nation wide scale,
- Reorganisation of cadastral offices and assuring their sustainability.

To properly implement these measures within the World Bank financed project, directed to the improvement of the land tenure system and increase of the tenure security, Sida support for technical assistance and human capacity building is needed.

The Economic Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper 2004–2006 of the Government of Republic of Moldova considers the establishment of an efficient and transparent cadastral system as one of the priorities. The policy oriented to the accession to EU, requires the understanding of EU requirements in the area of land management and capacity to respond to them.

To respond to these needs, we recommend in this report further technical assistance and human capacity building measures supported by Sida. The capacity building should be aimed to prepare experts capable to improve and make sustainable unified cadastral system that can efficiently provide public services at affordable cost for customers. To build such a system and to implement the Business Plan developed within the scope of this Project, further Sida assistance is recommended.

The ongoing project has established good cooperation links with the World Bank financed cadastral project and Sida's support in this area is considered as relevant to the client needs. The World Bank appreciates very much the technical assistance provided by Sida for the First Cadastral Project and asks for the continuation of support in this area. We recommend that Sida should prolong the technical assistance support till the end of the extended First Cadastral Project in July 2007.

A future Sida supported project should develop and consolidate the cooperation with the World Bank as well as the Project Implementation Office. The activities with other bilateral project in land management should also be carefully coordinated.

In summary, we consider that Sida current project is professionally implemented and has resulted in most of the activities scheduled. The goals specified in the project documents are achieved. The extension of support in this area will significantly contribute to the establishment of a secure land tenure system and to the general development of the country's economy.

Ulf Kihlblom

Mike Cheremshynsky

Appendix 1. Terms of Reference

Background

The National Agency for Cadastre, Land Resources and Geodesy (NACLRC) was established in order to facilitate the land reform by registration of real property. In 2001 the name changed to State agency for Land Relations and Cadastre of the Republic of Moldova (SALRC)

The Moldovan First Cadastre Project (FCP) started in 1997 and is implemented by SALRC. Sida has supported FCP from the beginning.

Sida supported activities in the first phase covered advice and in-service training covering accounting, procurement, IT, digital mapping, legal development, land registration, real estate valuation.

In 2000 the SALRC requested Sida to finance:

1. Extended TA for the establishment of fiscal cadastre.
2. TA to develop and establish sustainable training for all actors on the land market.
3. To develop a business plan for the Territorial Cadastre Offices (TCO)
4. To carry out a study on a long-term strategy for the SALRC

In November 2001 the decision was taken to continue the support with the same consultants, Swedesurvey and HIFAB. Apart from the requested support the project included a component of continuation of previous activities in capacity building.

Project/Programme Objectives

The development objectives of the FCP are to facilitate and stimulate privatisation of land and the development of a real estate market in Moldova.

Objectives for Sida financed activities:

The project objective of the fiscal cadastre is to develop, introduce and implement a real estate registration that will supply information of ownership and values of real property to the taxation authorities. The objective is furthermore to develop the legislative, methodological and informational framework of real estate valuation for taxation purposes.

The project objective of the training is to develop and carry out advanced courses and courses for a wide spectrum of stakeholders.

The objective of the business plan for the TCOs is to let the land registration process in the Chisinau TCO serve as a blueprint in order to guide the TCOs in the rest of the country to upgrade service functions and related facilities. The objective of the study is to develop a long-term strategy for the SALRC.

The expected results include:

- A valuation methodology for mass appraisal elaborated, information needs analysed and a database developed,
- The methodology tested and evaluated,

- The influence of the implementation of the new valuation system analysed,
- A proposal for a law on real estate valuation for the purpose of taxation elaborated,
- Detailed regulations and manuals elaborated,
- An implementation plan elaborated,
- Training modules and manuals developed and training of staff started,
- Business plan for the SALRC developed.

Important Stakeholders

The local counterpart is the State Agency for Land Relations and Cadastre of the Republic of Moldova.

Other important stakeholders are TCOs, tax authorities, municipalities, brokers, estate agents, insurance companies, private surveyors.

The World Bank is currently supporting the sector in Moldova.

Implementing Organisations

Implementing organisations are Swedesurvey and Hifab International.

Disbursements

The budget for the year 2001-2004 was for fees, 8.6 MSEK and reimbursables, 7.6 MSEK. The project has been prolonged.

Timing of Evaluation in Relation to Project Phases Etc.

The World Bank project was late last year extended till the end of 2005 because of delays in implementing the FCP. Sida then extended Swedesurvey's contract after request but only in time and not in budget. Their budget this year amount to 2,3 MSEK.

Many of the activities have been finalized and remaining work includes:

General technical assistance has not ceased yet.

The Business Plan was originally planned for the TCOs but is now for the whole cadastre organization. The plan is not finalized but processed.

Purpose and scope of the evaluation

Sida currently considers whether or not the SALRC should be supported in the future. Sida needs an evaluation in order to have good knowledge about the history when we initiate our discussions with the Moldovan counterpart for a possible future support.

Cooperation with the World Bank

Cadastre is a part of the PRSP but not among the highest prioritized objects by the Moldovan Government. The WB has two scenarios and support to Cadastre year 2006 will only be considered if the High Case is reached. The Bank will most likely support cadastre either later or in case another project drops, or if the Moldovan government and the Bank reclassify cadastre as high priority.

A WB mission will visit Moldova most likely in April to evaluate their Cadastre project and outline possible future support.

Sida and the World Bank cooperate closely in some of the Balkan countries. This setup is something that could be considered also in Moldova if both Sida and WB still continue the support. For this reason it would be advantageous if the Sida evaluator could time his/her visit to Moldova with the not yet confirmed date of WB mission.

Recommendations regarding possible continuation of the support

A decision on possible continuation of the support will be based on the results from the evaluations and discussions with the stake-holders (incl. the implementing agencies and the Project Implementation Units).

The assignment (issues to be covered in the evaluation)

Relevance

Has the project been relevant? How would the cadastre sector and land consolidation have developed without the project?

Achievement of Objectives (Effectiveness)

The evaluation should analyse the actual results in comparison with the expected results.

Effects on Target Group (Gender Specific)

Has the cooperation with the direct beneficiaries been effective? To what amount has local capacity been strengthened?

What effects has the project (the registration) had on the land owners? Have landowner benefited differently? Large – small, poor – rich? The evaluation shall also assess to what extent the project has benefited both men and women and study any gender analyzes made within the project.

Cost-effectiveness

Could other ways of support have achieved the same results in more efficient ways?

Sustainability of Results

Have the implementing parties enough capacity, resources and will to sustain the achieved results? Is the institutional environment stable?

Cross-cutting Issues

The evaluation should collect information on other donors supporting cadastre and the relevance of these activities for a possible continuation of the support

One issue of importance for Sida's decision on future support is if the Swedish support could be more integrated in the World Bank programme. The evaluation report should therefore present different options regarding forms and modalities of such possible continued cooperation, as well as recommendations to Sida.

Another issue that should be discussed is the timeframe of Sida's support. Sida has been supporting the cadastre sector since 1997 and a possible continuation of the support should preferably be linked to an exit strategy.

Methodology evaluation team and time schedule

The assignment shall include one visit to Moldova in the mid or end of April 2005, coinciding with the World Bank missions to Moldova (date not yet set).

The Assignment shall be carried out in close dialogue with representatives of the implementing agencies, the Project Implementation Unit (PIU), the World Bank representative as well as the World Bank team leader Xxxx Xxxxxx and Sida. Other donors in the field should also be consulted?.

The consultant shall obtain and analyse all relevant information from the consulting company which has implemented the project; Swedesurvey. In addition, the consultant shall meet and discuss with the project team leader Mr Daninge Danielson.

The assignment should be carried out as described below:

1. desk study of project documentation and other relevant information, discussions with AMS
2. evaluation missions to Moldova
3. elaboration of report and presentation

Reporting

A meeting should be held with Sida Stockholm before the visit to Moldova. Meetings should also be held with the Sida office in Chisinau during the visit. A follow-up meeting with Sida Stockholm should be held after submitting the report to discuss the findings and recommendations.

The evaluation report shall be written in English and should not exceed 25 pages, excluding annexes. Format and outline of the report shall follow the guidelines in Sida Evaluation Report – a Standardized Format (see Annex 1). The draft report shall be submitted to Sida electronically and in 2 hardcopies (air-/surface mailed or delivered) no later than two weeks after the visit to the country has been completed. Within 2 weeks after receiving Sida's comments on the draft report, a final version shall be submitted to Sida, again electronically and in 2 hardcopies. The evaluation report must be presented in a way that enables publication without further editing. Subject to decision by Sida, the report will be published in the series Sida Evaluations.

The evaluation assignment includes the completion of Sida Evaluations Data Work Sheet (Annex 2), including an Evaluation Abstract (final section, G) as defined and required by DAC. The completed Data Worksheet shall be submitted to Sida along with the final version of the report. Failing a completed Data Worksheet, the report cannot be processed.

Annexes 1 and 2 are retrievable from 'Sida-mallar'/Publications/Sida Evaluations.

Appendix 2. List of persons met and interviewed during the visit to Moldova

No	Name	Organisation	Position	Date
1	Gunnar Olvik	Sida	Program officer	18.04.2005
2	Valeri Ginju	WB Project Implementation Office	Vice manager	
3	Vasiliy Diaur	WB Project Implementation Office	Head of Section	
4	Stefan Crigan	Agency	Acting Director	
5	Konstantin Bogatov	National Department of Information Technologies	Deputy Director of Department	
6	Grigory Sharpak	National Department of Information Technologies	Head of Section	
7	Lilia Razglog	Ministry of Finance	Deputy Director of Department	19.04.2005
8	Alexandr Vitanov	National Real Estate Chamber, NGO	President	
9	Sergey Nagorniak	IngGeocad	Chief Engineer	
10	Valerii Filenco	IngGeocad	Director	
11	Michail Pop	Fiscal Inspectorate	Director General	
12	Ion Sturzu	Fiscal Inspectorate	Vice director	
13	Ion Iachim	Fiscal Inspectorate	Head of Division	
14	Val Chodsky	Land Privatization Support Project	Project Manager	
15	Mihai Barac	Private Company Geoinfosystem	Director	20.04.2005
16	Anatoly Moldavan	Primaria Ialoveni	Primarul (Mayor)	
17	Nicolae Ciubotaru	Territorial Cadastral Office, Hincesti	Manager	
18	Danil Tverintev	Territorial Cadastral Office, Hincesti	Archive Manager	
19	Tatiana Ungureanu	Notaries Union of Moldova	President	
20	Karolina Andriuda	Notaries Union	Notary	21.04.2005
21	Dumitru Cretu	Territorial Cadastral Office, Center	Manager	
22	Mihai Sosa	Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources	Head of General Division	
23	Panteley Vladimir	Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources	Senior Expert	
24	Ion Stratulat	Territorial Cadastral Office Chisinau	Deputy Director	
25	Maha Armaly	WB, Infrastructure and Energy Department	Operations Officer	22.04.2005
26	Segey Benzin	Territorial Cadastral Office Chisinau	Registrar	

Appendix 3. List of Project Documents Reviewed

Sida decision about the prolongation from 2001-11-05.

Republic Of Moldova. First Cadastre Project. Staff Appraisal Report. March 24, 1998.

First cadastral Project: Mid-term Review. National Agency for Cadastre, Land Resources and Geodesy, Swedesurvey AB and HIFAB International AB. 2001-02-28

Moldova Land Tenure System. Carlton A Brown. May 2002.

Moldova – First Cadastre Project (Cr. 3061-MD). World Bank Mission. Draft Aide Memoire. January 2004.

First Cadastre Project. Progress Report for the IV Quarter and the Whole Year 2004. SALRC, Chisinau, February 2005.

Proposal for Extended Support and Mid Term Review Report on the Institution and Capacity Building Program of the First Cadastre Project in Moldova. Swedesurvey, 2001-05-23.

Business Plan for Legal Cadastre in Moldova. Swedesurvey, Hifab, SALRC. May 2005.

Strategy for long term sustainability for SALRC including TCOs, CIO, and INGEOCAD. Swedesurvey, Hifab, SALRC. June 2002.

Moldova – First Cadastre Project. World Bank. Aide Memoire, September 27–October 13, 2004.

Evaluation of Cadastral Surveying Component: Moldova Land Titling and Registration Project. Final Report. Grenville Barnes, Cadastral Consultant. May 2002.

Economic Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (2004–2006). Republic of Moldova: Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper. Chisinau, May 2004.

All together about 80 reports have been reviewed including:

Progress reports on cadastral survey – 2 reports. Swedesurvey, HIFAB. 2000 and 2003.

Progress reports on digital mapping – 8 reports. Swedesurvey, HIFAB. 2001, 2002, 2003.

Progress reports on GPS – 6 reports. Swedesurvey, HIFAB. 2001, 2002, 2003.

Progress reports IT – 11 reports. Swedesurvey, HIFAB. 2001, 2002.

Progress reports legal development – 7 reports. Swedesurvey, HIFAB. 2001–2004.

Progress reports registration, Swedesurvey, HIFAB. 2001–2002

Progress reports on fiscal cadastre and property valuation – 35 reports. Swedesurvey, HIFAB. 2002–2004.

Appendix 4. Gender and Access to Land

FAO Land Tenure Studies 4

Susan Nichols and Katalin Komjathy, 2002

Why is Gender an Issue in Access to Land?

Gender differences in land tenure should be recognized if land objectives, such as increasing land productivity, providing affordable housing, or promoting sustainable resource management, are to be met. There is a need for land tenure policy frameworks that explicitly address gender inclusive access to land. Without specific attention to gender inclusiveness, important segments of society may be excluded from the benefits of land administration, management, and development schemes. This is underscored by the findings of the Women's Summit⁴ that, in most of today's societies, there are great gender inequities in access to land, housing and basic infrastructure. Finally, but not least of all, equitable access to land is a human rights issue and, as the UN Economic and Social Council Commission on the Status of Women states, "land rights discrimination is a violation of human rights."⁵

In many countries, there is still a lack of adequate provisions for women to hold land rights independently of their husbands or male relatives. Statutory law often does not provide for women's independent rights and when such legislation does exist, mechanisms to enforce it are often absent. In traditional or "customary" societies, women's direct access to land through purchase or inheritance is often limited, yet they may have greater management and use rights than men. Since women are frequently the major household food producers, there are usually customary provisions for indirect access to land in terms of use rights acquired through kinship relationships and their status as wives, mothers, sisters, or daughters.

These use rights, however, may not grant enough security for women and other dependants when traditional family structures dissolve. Through labour mobility, divorce, separation, or death, an increasing number of women are becoming the heads of households. They are thus making many of the day-to-day decisions affecting shelter, food production, and household economics. Yet only a small proportion of these women hold secure land rights. Similarly, there are societies where access to land stems from the female line, and in this case male partners and children may be disadvantaged as societies change.

Urbanisation is a major factor in such societal changes. The Second United Nations Conference on Human Settlements (Habitat II) noted that people and investments are being attracted to cities and this trend is expected to accelerate in the future. Friedmann⁶ estimates that about 30–40 percent of urban populations are female-maintained, i.e., responsible for food and other household matters. That number can be expected to be larger in many developing countries where more people may comprise a household and thus be the responsibility of women. On the other hand, there are increasing numbers of men and children who are homeless. Such gender-related changes in household and community maintenance need to be addressed in housing and economic development projects which target groups, for example, through special credit or rental arrangements.

Migration to urban centres has resulted in a rapid rise in the number of rural families that have women as the heads of households. Many of these women are those with the least social power (i.e., single parents, widows, divorcees, wives of migrant workers, the aged and the infirm). They are largely without effective decision-making powers, often without a voice in community governance, and increasingly without security as individuals under traditional law. Attempts to assert their rights can cause conflicts at the community or even national levels. Too often, women are left holding whatever rights they have at the will of male relatives. Single, divorced or widowed women can end up dependent on the goodwill of distant family members.

At the same time female-headed households are faced with the responsibility for food production for growing populations. Even in male-headed households, women often have prime responsibility for food production while men commonly concentrate on cash crops. Rural women in particular are responsible for half the world's food production and produce between 60 and 80 percent of the food in most developing countries. In sub-Saharan Africa and the Caribbean, women produce up to 80 percent of basic foodstuffs. In Asia, between 50 and 90 percent of the work in the rice fields are done by women. After the harvest, rural women in developing countries are almost entirely responsible for storage, handling, stocking, marketing and processing.

Making access to land more equitable does not mean addressing only the quantity of rights allocated. To make use of the rights and opportunities, access to land must also be enforceable or secure (for example, against seizure by force or by law). Equitable access to land must also be effective, i.e., by including equitable access to transportation, credit, markets, etc. The support of legal, customary and family institutions are fundamental if more effective access to land is to be improved for men and women.

To create gender equity, whether on the basis of human rights or for reasons of economic efficiency, then the principal challenges for land administration are:

- to understand and acknowledge the complexity of property rights regimes as they relate to the dynamic roles of both men and women in today's societies; and
- to provide effective institutional structures that can protect and strengthen equitable access to land within the framework of a society's particular land policy goals.

This is important given that land is the main source of income and food security for the majority of rural households in many countries.

These are not easy challenges because land tenure arrangements are dynamic and can vary greatly within and among countries. There may not even be any clear consensus, nationally or regionally, on what land policy goals are or should be. Despite these limitations, land administrators need to understand how land reform, land management and land development schemes may impact on access to land from a gender perspective.

There is increasing evidence that outcomes of land reform and land administration activities have different implications for men and women.⁷ Traditionally, the involvement of men as the *de jure* heads of households as primary beneficiaries in such programmes was viewed as sufficient to ensure that other household members would equally enjoy the benefits of the projects as dependents. Today, it is increasingly being recognized that such assumptions cannot be made.

With significant demographic shifts in rural and urban areas, development organisations and professionals have had to seek new strategies to tackle gender issues. In the land sector, this may mean giving women and men, directly or through co-ownership, greater security of tenure and better access to land resources. Greater security of rights to land increases the holder's ability to make decisions regarding appropriate economic strategies that may include diversification from subsistence farming. Security of tenure is a key to enabling individuals and households to participate effectively in economic development.

The timeliness of this new vision is underscored by some experience from the past. As Rocheleau and Edmunds (1997)⁸ comment: "Women who enjoy access to a variety of tree, forest and rangeland resources across the rural landscape may find their access restricted after formal land titling or land tenure reforms have invested greater powers of exclusion in land owners, whether male or female. Even where formal title is given jointly to a husband and wife, a woman may lose decision-making authority over her former domains on and off farm as the household 'heads' take on the full and exclusive responsibility for the management of household land and all the plants and animals upon it."

Another example is given by Lastarria-Cornhiel (1997)⁹: “Among the Mandinka. .. of Gambia both common and individual property rights are recognized: family-cleared land designated *maruo* collectively farmed by the family but under the control of the male household head; and individually cleared land designated *kamanyango* which if cleared by a woman gives her access to land with partial autonomy, controlling the profits and able to transfer land to daughters. In the late 1940s and early 1950s women sought to establish *kamanyango* rights of new rice lands by clearing former mangrove swamps. In 1984, the Jahaly Pacharr irrigation project, designed to increase productivity of the rice paddies by enabling year-round cultivation, recognizing that women were the key farmers on this land, sought to title the land to women. Household heads (generally male) registered the land in women’s names but then designated it as *maruo* land.”

The “Toolkit on Gender in Agriculture”¹⁰ prepared by the World Bank includes the following observation: “Land title and tenure tend to be vested in men, either by legal condition or by sociocultural norms. Land reform and resettlement have tended to reinforce this bias against tenure for women. Land shortage is common among women. Compared to men, women farm smaller and more dispersed plots and are less likely to hold title, secure tenure, or the same rights to use, improve or dispose of land.”

Statistical information is far from complete and, where it exists, lack of uniformity makes comparison difficult. For example, in some cases the definition of “ownership” does not take into account “co-ownership”. Some researchers¹¹ put land ownership by women at less than 10 percent world-wide. Others argue that women may actually have more direct use and management of land than men through lesser rights than ownership. However, the discrepancy between decision-making powers and labour input is compelling in many situations.

As the percentage of population living in households that can be considered *de facto* or *de jure* female-headed household is on the rise,¹² there is a need to re-examine how property rights are allocated and secured. There is also a need to better understand the complex relationships between use, control and ownership of land resources. A simple certificate of title could certainly not reflect the diversity of land rights found in many cultures.

The difficulties of protecting and enhancing access to land is illustrated by Box 1 and the following paragraphs.

Box 1 Major concerns

*Causes of poverty among rural women and their families:*¹³

- women’s lack of access and control over productive resources and services
- serious underemployment of rural women
- persistent inequalities between men and women regarding employment opportunities and compensation
- exclusion of women and the poor from decision- and policy-making
- legal environments that favour men’s rights over women’s rights

New pressures affecting traditional arrangements:

- changing socio-economic conditions, such as increased population, new types of employment and the growing cash economies
- urban and peri-urban migration
- incorporation and/or replacement of traditional tribal and religious institutions by national and local government structures
- changes in inheritance patterns, particularly with increased education and outside employment opportunities
- the changing household structure through death, disability, divorce, and abandonment

*Constraints to secure acceptable urban housing:*¹⁴

- obtaining title that enables formal land registration (and transactions) is unmanageable for the poor, due to cost and time requirements
- dealing with bureaucracy and providing documentation and information when going through official channels is also time-consuming and requires education
- developing land use regulations that negatively affect income generating activities and safety for those working from their houses

Documenting customary tenure. There is increasing interest in several African countries in documenting customary rights (e.g., Uganda's Land Act of 1998). The arguments for registering these certificates of customary tenure are that the processes will:

- provide greater security of tenure on customary lands
- provide a document that can be used as collateral for credit
- provide more information for planning and land management

Despite the merits or limitations of the processes, there could be significant impacts on some land rights. A major difficulty is the fact that such documentation can effectively freeze customary rules that are in place at the time. No account is made, for example, of such future rights as the right of a child to return home and receive a parcel of family land after a divorce. Limited rights such as the right to pick fruit or gather wood on another's property may be eliminated by the documentation. And then there is the question of whose name(s) the certificates or registers will record. For example, will the name be the de facto head of household, who may be a woman whose husband works away from home, or the de jure head of household according to customary law? There are limitations with both of these approaches, including the problem of whether the documents have priority over customary law in cases of inheritance when both names are recorded. In this regard, polygamy is a significant complicating factor when issuing land titles. Unregistered marriages, divorces and polygamy can have a major impact on women's security of tenure.

Dynamic cultural and religious values. Traditional laws and religious laws often protected women and provided for wives, widows, and female children through other means than, for instance, equal land shares on inheritance. Under Islamic law, for example, daughters may receive half the land that sons receive on the death of their father. This is in effect their dowry to bring to a marriage. The sons on the other hand have the responsibility to provide for unmarried sisters and their mother and in theory require more land. Other cultures have had similar traditional laws.

Traditional societies and religious based communities are not immune to the influence of social changes around them. Education of women and greater opportunities for employment and self-sufficiency are affecting many traditional communities. Divorce, desertion, and urban migration may also challenge the traditional safety nets. The devastation of HIV/AIDS and war have further fragmented the extended and traditional family arrangements. At the same time, in the midst of obvious need for changes, who has the right to demand that these changes be made or to force another community to adopt its values? This raises ethical dilemmas for the land professional.

Gender-targeted development projects. International aid organisations have been targeting particular groups such as women and children for special assistance for decades. More recently the protection and enhancement of women's rights to land have become a focus for some land reform projects. One difficulty is that these projects often enhance the economic value of the land which may change how that land is viewed within the community. For example, part of a community may have used parcels of marginal land to raise personal crops. After a land development project, this marginal land may have access to irrigation and to a new road, thus enhancing its value. Will local authorities allow the original

land users to maintain their land rights after the project is over? Experience in housing projects has also shown that making improvements to a house may lead to “expropriation” of rights to the house by more powerful members of the community.

The intention of this discussion is not to discourage gender-related projects and programmes. Instead, it is to demonstrate that making changes does not always result in the benefits originally intended.¹⁵ The situation is complex and requires looking at the existing constraints at the macro-level (legislation and policies), institutional arrangements (mechanisms and procedures for land administration), and local dynamics (prevalent social organizations and related factors in social beliefs, rules, and customary practices).

The Role of Development Organizations

International, national and non-governmental organizations can play important roles in promoting equitable gender inclusion in land administration. Development organizations have been targeting groups, such as women or the landless poor, for special assistance in land programmes to address equity concerns and to increase the effectiveness of some aid activities. Similar trends can be seen in the credit industries in developed countries where female-headed businesses are increasingly recognized as an important sector of the economy.

Gender inclusiveness in land projects is essential if the outcomes are to truly enhance security and effective access to land resources and the benefits from those resources. In order to ensure that project outcomes reflect the initial goals and do not have unintended negative impacts on men or women, the donor community and international organizations, should take on the following responsibilities at minimum.

Improve the environment for gender inclusiveness

Advocate gender inclusiveness:

- Encourage nations to sign international declarations that promote equitable gender status under the law and equitable access to productive resources.
- Urge constitutional recognition of equal access to property. Such provisions provide a strong basis for subsequent legislative initiatives or court interpretations.
- Promote national policies for legal and policy reforms related to land and property that will improve gender equity.

Analyse gender issues:

- Identify areas in national and local land and housing laws and procedures that are constraints to gender inclusiveness.
- Identify areas in customary law and procedures that also serve as constraints.
- Collect gender disaggregated data and making them available to researchers, practitioners, and the public.

Document and publicise gender issues such as:

- The benefits of gender inclusion in land holding and management.
- Violations of rights to land where appropriate.

Information campaigns should be directed “upstream” to policy makers and other leaders, and “downstream” to involved communities, implementers and other stakeholders.

Lead by example by providing demonstrations of gender inclusiveness in their own organizations and activities. Göler von Ravensburg and Jacobsen (1999)¹⁷, for example, suggest that: “Development cooperation can make it a precondition for any intensification of policy dialogue that international principles and law regarding women’s land rights be included into national policy and law, make relevant suggestions in this regard and monitor whether the respective laws are implemented such that men and women indeed obtain equal status in all land matters.”

Improve opportunities for gender inclusiveness

Promote gender integration at all levels of projects and programmes:

- Ensure the full integration of gender perspectives in all future activities as it is required by, for example, FAO’s Gender Plan of Action¹⁸ and the UNCHS¹⁹.
- Ensure gender inclusiveness in project and programme planning and in policy- and decision-making, aiming towards a balanced representation of men and women in these bodies.
- Ensure the participation of both men and women at the local level in land projects and programmes.
- Develop indicators to measure the effectiveness of projects and programmes with respect to gender inclusiveness, including development of long-term monitoring and evaluation schemes.

Promote gender integration through education and sensitisation:

- Ensure that effective and culturally appropriate mechanisms are in place for input, discussions, conflict resolution, and negotiations regarding gender issues.
- Provide opportunities to discuss and explore gender issues related to land in as neutral a forum as possible.
- Provide education and sensitization on gender issues to local leaders in order to build support for the involvement of women and men.
- Provide equal opportunities for men and women in education, training, study trips, etc. associated with any land-related programme to enhance future gender balanced capacity.
- Support the selection of qualified women candidates in key leadership and decision-making roles concerning land related matters.

Promote gender integration through legislation and policy by assisting governments in the development of property laws and land policies that recognize the diversity of household arrangements, and acknowledge both modern and traditionally dominant household patterns.

Promote gender integration by example such as providing role models and gender sensitivity training among project participants where possible.

Reference: http://www.fao.org/sd/2003/IN07013_en.htm

Recent Sida Evaluations

- 06/43 AIDS and Rights Alliance of Southern Africa (ARASA)**
Hope Chigudu
Department for Africa
- 06/44 Projects at the General Statistics Office of Vietnam, 1995–2005**
Ole Stage, Poul Henning Larsen, Pham Thi Bich Hoa
Asia Department
- 06/45 Proyecto de Fortalecimiento Institucional Financiado por Asdi al Procurador de los Derechos Humanos de Guatemala, 2002–2006**
Mayra Alarcón Alba
Department for Latin America
- 06/46 To Good to be True, UNRISD 1996–2005**
Deepal Nayyar, Sten Johansson, Tapio Salonen, Signe Arnfred
Department for Research Cooperation
- 06/47 Fundación Gaia Amazonas en Colombia, 2003–2006**
Anders Rudqvist, Kaj Århem
Department for Latin America
- 06/48 JobsNet An Employment Sourcing and Delivery System in Sri Lanka**
Michael Wheelahan, Lennart Königson
Asia Department
- 06/49 Svenska Handikapporganisationers Internationella Biståndsförenings (SHIA) verksamhet och samarbetsrelationer**
Cecilia Karlstedt, Håkan Jarskog, Anders Ingelstam, Lennart Peck
Avdelningen för samverkan med enskilda organisationer, humanitärt bistånd och konflikthantering
- 06/50 Promoting Media Professionalism, Independence and Accountability in Sri Lanka**
Madeleine Elmqvist, Sunil Bastian
Asia Department
- 06/51 Comparative Evaluation of the Personnel Management Project at Central Level and the Pilot PAR Project in Quang Tri Province**
Yeow Poon, Vo Kim Son
Asia Department
- 06/52 Sida's Independent Guarantee Scheme**
Claes Lindahl
Department for Infrastructure
- 06/53 The Auas High-voltage Transmission Line in Namibia Supported by a Swedish Concessionary Credit**
Karlis Gopperes
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation

Sida Evaluations may be ordered from:

Infocenter, Sida
SE-105 25 Stockholm
Phone: +46 (0)8 779 96 50
Fax: +46 (0)8 779 96 10
sida@sida.se

A complete backlist of earlier evaluation reports may be ordered from:

Sida, UTV, SE-105 25 Stockholm
Phone: +46 (0) 8 698 51 63
Fax: +46 (0) 8 698 56 10
Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>



SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY
SE-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden
Tel: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Fax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64
E-mail: sida@sida.se. Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>