

Local Radio Project in Viet Nam, 2000–2003

**Phan Anh
Tran Nhung
Tran Nam Binh**

Local Radio Project in Viet Nam, 2000–2003

**Phan Anh
Tran Nhung
Tran Nam Binh**

Sida Evaluation 04/35

Asia Department

This report is part of *Sida Evaluations*, a series comprising evaluations of Swedish development assistance. Sida's other series concerned with evaluations, *Sida Studies in Evaluation*, concerns methodologically oriented studies commissioned by Sida. Both series are administered by the Department for Evaluation and Internal Audit, an independent department reporting directly to Sida's Board of Directors.

This publication can be downloaded/ordered from:
<http://www.sida.se/publications>

Authors: Phan Anh, Tran Nhung, Tran Nam Binh.

The views and interpretations expressed in this report are the authors' and do not necessarily reflect those of the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Sida.

Sida Evaluation 04/35

Commissioned by Sida, Asia Department

Copyright: Sida and the authors

Registration No.: 17/43

Date of Final Report: December 2004

Printed by Edita Sverige AB, 2004

Art. no. Sida4403en

ISBN 91-586-8497-2

ISSN 1401—0402

SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY

Address: SE-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden. Office: Sveavägen 20, Stockholm

Telephone: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Telefax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64

E-mail: sida@sida.se. Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>

Table of Content

Foreword	3
1. Context	5
1.1. The National Radio (VOV)	5
1.2. Local Radio System	6
1.3. Vietnam-Sweden Radio Broadcasting Cooperation and the Local Radio Project	6
1.4. Local Radio Project in Vietnam Second Phase (2000–2003)	7
1.5. Requirements of Project Evaluation	8
2. Methodology and Scope of Project Evaluation	8
3. Project Evaluation	9
3.1. The realisation of the assumptions presented in the LFA matrix	9
3.2. Availability of resources and issues related to project implementation	11
3.3. Comparison between achieved outputs and expected outputs	12
3.4. Comparison between beneficiaries' capacity before and after project has been implemented	13
3.5. Comparison between project's beneficiaries and the other ones	14
3.6. Relevance	14
3.7. Impacts of the project to local radio system	15
3.8. Effectiveness and efficiency	15
3.9. Sustainability	16
3.10. Cross cutting issues	16
4. Good Practices and Lessons Learnt from Project Implementation	17
5. Recommendations for Preparation of the Vietnam's Radio Capacity Strengthening Project at Grass Roots Level 2004–2006	19
6. Conclusions	20
References	22
Annexes	
1. Review Team Working Schedule	23
2. Lists of Persons Consulted by the Review Team	24
3. Terms of Reference (ToR) for Project Evaluation	25

(This report includes independent assessments and recommendations, which do not necessarily reflect official viewpoints of the concerned agencies: Sida, Ministry of Culture and Information, the Voice of Vietnam, provinces and local radio stations.)

Abbreviation

LFA	Logical framework analysis
MoCI	Ministry of Culture and Information
PMB	Project Management Board
PPC	Provincial People's Committee
Sida	Swedish International Development Agency
VET	Vietnam Economic Times
VIR	Vietnam Investment Review
VNA	Vietnam News Agency
VOV	Voice of Vietnam

Foreword

So far, very few international cooperation activities have been carried out in the Vietnam's system of mass media. For newspapers, only three examples: the weekly Vietnam Investment Review (VIR) in the 90s was a product of a cooperation contract between the *Dau tu* (Investment) newspaper of the Ministry of Planning & Investment and an Australian partner; the *Thoi bao kinh te Vietnam* (Vietnam Economic Times) has been cooperating with a Swiss company to produce a monthly magazine; and the daily Vietnam News of the Vietnam News Agency (VNA) has recently co-worked with a Thai partner in order to improve the official daily Vietnamese newspaper. All the three products of cooperation are print media in English.

In broadcasting, Sweden has been the only donor country that has a big development project in cooperation with Vietnam's radio system. It is really a unique and creative project that has been implemented for quite long and has provided the Vietnam's radio system with a full support in all aspects: broadcasting equipment transfer; human resources development; introduction and application of modern broadcasting skills and thus, improvement of information quality of the local radio programmes.

The 30 MSEK Sida funded *Local Radio Project* started its pilot period in 1993 and has fully been implemented since 1997 by the Voice of Vietnam (VOV) and the Swedish Radio (SR). After 2 phases of implementation within 10 years, 30 provincial radio stations have directly benefited from project's outcomes and most of the rest have been indirectly influenced by the positive impacts brought by the project. Based on the success of the project, Vietnam and Sweden are designing a new cooperation activity: *Vietnam's Radio Capacity Strengthening Project at Grass Roots Level 2004–2006*.

After the completion of the 8M SEK Local Radio Project second phase (2000–2003), at the request of Sida office in Hanoi, in December 2003 the Project Management Board (PMB) considered and selected an independent Vietnamese review team, which was assigned to carry out an evaluation for this implementation phase of the project. The review team finished all the required tasks in February 2004 and produced this report as an independent assessment.

The report includes some main contents:

- Methodology and scope of evaluation (part 2)
- Project evaluation (part 3)
- Good practices and lessons learnt from project implementation (part 4), and
- Recommendations for preparation of the Vietnam's Radio Capacity Strengthening Project at Grass Roots Level 2004–2006 (part 5).

The review team would like to thank Swedish International Development Agency, Ministry of Culture and Information, Radio the Voice of Vietnam, Provincial People's Committees, local radio stations, and especially the Project Management Board for their supportive cooperation during the mission.

1. Context

1. Upon the current socio-economic context, Vietnam's radio system has been well thought-out by the Government and has been invested more favourably than other types of mass media. Radio, to some extent, still has its advantages compared to television and print media thanks to a wider range of coverage and low cost for the users, particularly in remote areas and for the poorer targeted audience. Most of the recent assessments show that radio has been playing an extremely important role in socio-economic life of the Vietnamese, especially in rural and mountainous areas. The people have highly appreciated radio and have seen it an affordable daily reliable medium that can provide them with not only necessary information for their life but a source of entertainment that has not been easily substituted.
2. Besides the favourable investment from the state budget, Vietnam's radio system has benefited from its own efforts and newly offered opportunities for easier access into international modern broadcasting technology and skills. For the latest years radio broadcasting programmes have been innovated towards a higher quality and more attractive contents and appearance. The change has initially started from the central level then spread to local radio stations in every province, even districts and communes.
3. So far, Vietnam's radio system has been developed at four different levels:
 - Central (VOV),
 - Provincial (provincial radio or provincial broadcasting station with radio and television),
 - District (district radio stations), and
 - Commune radio (neighbourhood loudspeaker systems).

1.1. The national radio (VOV)

4. *The Voice of Vietnam* is defined as a government-managed agency. VOV broadcasting range has covered all over the country including border areas and islands. VOV has 1,600 staff working at its headquarter in Hanoi and 5 domestic permanent offices (HCMC, Can Tho, DakLak, Son La, Da Nang), 5 overseas liaison offices (Paris, Bangkok, Moscow, Peking, Cairo). VOV is now broadcasting 191 hours a day in 6 channels via a network of 25 short and medium waves and FM transmitters, with total capacity output of 8,000 KW.
5. Although most of the radio broadcasting programmes are ready-recorded (especially for the features), VOV has several live programmes broadcasted daily in a stable producing process. The live broadcasting programmes are not limited in Vietnamese language but also in English and French. Live programmes and live talk shows are regularly produced and quite professionally broadcasted on the occasion of national and international big events of the year.
6. VOV has also delivered professional, technical management services, instruction, and trainings for local radio system.

1.2. Local radio system

7. One of the characteristics of the Vietnam's local radio system is the system of provincial radio stations. Administrative and geographical borderlines created a budget allocation system in which expenditures for provincial broadcasting activities are wholly based on the local government (provincial) budget. This led to the fact that each of 61 provinces and cities has its own radio station or radio-television station.
8. *61 provincial and city radio stations or radio-television stations* every day broadcast provincial radio programmes, relay important VOV programmes, and carry out activities in support of district radio stations. Each provincial radio has few dozens staff. Broadcasting stations of several big provinces and cities have had capacity to produce and broadcast some types of modern radio programmes that can influence beyond the province's geographical borderline. Except few provinces in which radio and television are separately managed, most of the provinces share their staff to produce both radio and television programmes.
9. *Districts have their own 601 radio stations*, serving the local tasks of propaganda and reflection of local activities, relay important VOV and provincial radio programmes. Each district radio use around 9–12 staff including technicians and has capacity to produce simple and short programmes.
10. *The grass roots level of Vietnam's local radio system has 10,000 commune radio stations* simply equipped with neighbourhood loudspeaker systems. Each station only needs 1–2 staff who are paid by the commune. In spite of their simple organisational structure, these stations in fact have played a crucial role in relaying programmes produced by the higher-level broadcasters. The commune stations are utilizing 38 AM transmitters, 57 FM transmitters, and more than 6,400 basis sound transmission stations. Figures provided by VOV show that the radio coverage by the end of 2003 was 86% all over the country, compared to the objective of 95% by the year of 2005.

1.3. Vietnam-Sweden Radio Broadcasting Cooperation and the Local Radio Project

11. Recently, Sweden has been the only donor country that ever has a large-scale official development assistance in radio broadcasting. The 30 M SEK Sida funded Local Radio Project started its pilot period in 1993 and has been fully implemented since 1997 by the Voice of Vietnam (VOV) and the Swedish Radio (SR). After 2 phases of implementation within 10 years, 30 provincial radio stations have directly benefited from project's results and most of the rest have been indirectly influenced by the positive impacts brought by the project.
12. *Introduction and application of live broadcasting technology and skills* are the essential approach that has been utilised by the project in order for assisting the selected local radio stations. The project has organized in-house training courses on modern live radio broadcasting right at the provincial radio stations, at the same time offered a minimum (but complex) set of studio equipment. Teams of local broadcasters while and after being trained will be able to produce daily live radio programmes for the provincial radio stations. In order to absorb well the Swedish assistance the provincial radio stations have to contribute their counterpart funds for extra equipment, studio upgrade, and improvement of salaries for the team (including producers, reporters, and technicians) that produces live programmes. Strong commitment and the counterpart funds for live broadcast by the provincial radio stations are the main criteria for selecting project's beneficiaries. When interviewed by the review team most of individuals and representatives of agencies related

to project implementation process agreed that live broadcasting should be the key criterion to evaluate the local capacity in radio broadcasting.

13. So far the project has completed 3 phases and has achieved main results:
 - Pilot phase (1993–1995): 300 person-times of trainees of the 3 local radio stations (Thua Thien Hue, Hanoi, Can Tho) had been introduced and provided with new broadcasting technology and skills. These radio stations then were able to broadcast live, daily in at least one hour a day. The Can Tho national radio broadcasters' conference late 1995 highly evaluated this model of radio broadcasting and recommended that the model should be multiplied in all over the country.
 - Phase 1 (1997–1999): almost 2,000 person-times of trainees from 12 local radio stations and VOV participated in 70 training courses in Vietnam and overseas (Sweden), with assistance of 400 times of Swedish trainers, Vietnamese assistant trainer and interpreters.
 - Phase 2 (2000–2003): more than 10,000 person-times of trainees from 15 local radio stations and VOV had participated in 40 activities organized by the project and with the participation of more than 150 times of Swedish and Vietnamese trainers and interpreters. Best practice and lessons learnt from phase 1 have been shared and applied.
14. Live broadcasting has brought an inspiration into the mass media life. There has been a remarkably increasing number of radio audiences who interacted with radio broadcasters (via live programmes, mails and telephone calls). Results of audience surveys in Ha Nam, Quang Nam, and Vinh Long provinces August 2002 has shown that the live radio programmes had an absolute advantage in comparison with the recorded programmes. There still exists some extreme cases in which the percentage of radio audience is even higher than that of televisions although television is already available in the areas.

1.4. Local Radio Project in Vietnam second phase (2000–2003)

15. Based on good initial results of the project's pilot phase and phase 1 (about one fourth of the provincial radio stations have been upgraded), the Government of Vietnam (via MoCI) and the Swedish Government (via Sida) has decided to use 8 million SEK (out of the Swedish grant in 2000–2003 agreement on cooperation in culture and information between the two countries) to continue support local radio in Viet Nam phase 2 (2000–2003).
16. Some basic information about the project:
 - Executing Agency: Ministry of Culture and Information
 - Implementing Agency: VOV and selected provincial radio stations
 - Duration: 3 years (2000–2003)
 - Official document: Project document Continuing support local radio in Viet Nam, phase II (2000–2003)
 - On behalf of VOV for implementation: VOV's Project Management Board
 - On behalf of Swedish Radio (SR): The Media Development Office (MOD) in Malmo
 - Financial controller and project supervisor: Sida Hanoi.

1.5. Requirements of Project Evaluation

17. It can be seen that most of the project's results has been reflected in regular reports, national radio professional workshops, conferences, and audience survey reports. However, a systematic analysis on performance of the project is still a need. Development cooperation between Sweden and Vietnam in radio broadcasting may yield good experience for both sides, and especially for ODA absorber. New methods of working and capacity in management and demonstration of modern broadcasting process will certainly be the most important resources for the next stage of Vietnam's radio development. They will also create more opportunities for combination of extra domestic investment and international development assistance resources.
18. Based on the success of the project, Vietnam and Sweden are designing a new cooperation activity: *Vietnam's Radio Capacity Strengthening Project at Grass Roots Level 2004–2006*. It has been a hope that the modern methods of broadcasting will be spread more deeply and widely to district and even to commune levels.
19. After the completion of the second phase (2000–2003) of the Local Radio Project, at the request of Sida office in Hanoi, in December 2003 the Project Management Board considered and selected an independent Vietnamese review team, which was assigned to make an evaluation for the this implementation phase of the project. The review team members are Prof. Dr. Phan Anh, Mr. Tran Nhung (Journalist), and Mr. Tran Nam Binh (MEcDev). The team has finished all the required tasks in February 2004 and produced this report as an independent assessment on the project.

2. Methodology and Scope of Project Evaluation

20. With support of the PMB, the review team has made a number of visits to relevant agencies and meetings with their representatives, including the Ministry of Culture and Information (International Cooperation Department), Sida Hanoi, the Voice of Vietnam, Project Management Board, several local radio stations, listeners and leaders from typical provinces. The team has also implemented some desk studies based on the available documents and reports. Evaluation task has mainly focused on second phase of the project (2000–2003), although some lessons and practices gained from phase 1 have also been examined.
21. In the North, the team visited Lang Son province (where the local radio is a project's beneficiary) and Bac Ninh province (the local radio is not a project's beneficiary). In the Central, the team worked in Quang Ngai province. In the South, Binh Duong province and Ho Chi Minh City were selected. (See *References*, and Annex for *Lists of persons consulted by the Review Team*, *Review Team working schedule*).
22. Assessments and recommendations made by the team in this report are mainly based on responses and feedbacks from project's targeted groups. The team has also considered comparison analysis on the responses from different groups with different approaches, between recent feedbacks and available documents.

23. The project has been analysed in accordance with the following issues:
- Realisation of the assumptions presented in the LFA matrix,
 - Availability of expected resources when implementing project,
 - Comparison between achieved outputs and expected outputs,
 - Comparison between beneficiaries' capacity before and after project has been implemented, and
 - Comparison between project's beneficiaries and the other ones
24. Analysing financial status of the project is out of the scope of this review. Financial analysis should be made in another activity by a professionally appropriate author.
25. The review team has also considered the evaluation requirements by Swedish and Vietnamese perspectives when analysing the project and made some remarks on several aspects:
- Relevance
 - Impacts of the project to local radio system
 - Effectiveness and efficiency
 - Sustainability
 - Cross-cutting issues
26. Recommendations and suggestions will be made as a development process of analysis.

3. Project Evaluation

3.1. The Realisation of the Assumptions Presented in the LFA Matrix

27. When studying the project documents, the review team has recognised that it is a need to analyse the realisation of the assumptions presented in the LFA matrix. The project would not produce good results if the assumptions were not ensured in reality. For instance, if provinces' commitments were not fully realised, various efforts of partners would become unilateral and the project partners could even get lost with the designed objectives and expected outputs. Following Table 1 will present the realisation of assumptions in the project's matrix of logical framework analysis. The review team added two columns on the right of the LFA matrix: *Reality*, and *Remarks*.

Table 1: Realisation of assumptions in the project's matrix of logical framework analysis (LFA)

	Description	Means of verification	Assumptions	Reality	Remarks
Overall Objective	Improvement of local radio programmes	Audience surveys – 2001 (3 provinces) – 2002 (3 provinces)	Local radio's commitment for change	– Committed – Audience is better off	Objective achieved
Inter-mediate Objectives	1. Development of attractive, practical live radio programmes with good technical quality, and impacts local audience	– Live radio programmes and audience responses will be a part of the project – Audience surveys	– Provincial radio stations want to change and have necessary investment – Reliable audience surveys is implemented	– Commitment shown but lack of budget for investment – Live radio programmes broadcasted as required – Good impacts to audience	– Achieved more than designed intermediate objectives if comparing between benefit and cost – Opportunity to raise local funds for new activities should be taken into account
	2. Build up training capacity to ensure continuing support to local radio stations	– A core group of Vietnamese trainers will implement training courses at local radio stations or at the two training centres in Hanoi and HCMC	– Qualified staff is recruited	– A large number of reporters and editors of VOV and local radio stations that participated in the project has capacity required for a trainer or assistant trainer	– Achieved more than designed intermediate objectives if comparing between benefit and cost – Capability to build up a stable human resource in central and local levels for new activities should be taken into account
	Results	50% of local radio stations begin and maintain live radio broadcasting	Around 30 radio stations including those in phase 1 will broadcast live at least 1 hour a day	Appropriate local radio stations that have good conditions and commitment are identified	– 30 local radio stations have been trained and equipped to broadcast live. They are maintaining 1 hour live programmes per day in average – More than 3.300 times of trainees have participated in 100 short training courses – Hundred times of Swedish consultants, VOV and local assistant trainers have participated in training activities
	Establishment of two live broadcast training centres in Hanoi and HCMC	Two training centres will be equipped and in operation with basic principles	An effective training organization will be established	– 1 training centre in HCMC and 2 in 2 district radio stations in Yen Bai and Thua Thien Hue	Achieved the expected results

Improvement of capacity for radio programmes management, organization and production	– A core group of competent Vietnamese radio broadcasters will run the course – New organization models will be clarified and applied in local radio stations as a part of the project – Exchange of international experience in broadcasting aiming at approaching the latest radio technology, methods and programming	Qualified people will be recruited Leaders of local radio stations implement organization models with support from local government Effective tools for information exchange are used, e.g. Internet Selection of local radio stations to strike friendship	– Hundreds reporters and editors of VOV and local radio stations that participated in the project have capacity required for a trainer or assistant trainer – Support from local authorities and local radio leaders has been made – Modern communication tools have been used. However, limited budget and users' ICT skills are still the issues of local stations	– Achieved more than expected results if comparing between benefit and cost – Capability to build up a stable financial and human resources in central and local levels for new activities should be taken into account
Implementation of audience surveys in order to evaluate project results and provide feedbacks to radio programmes	Implementation of audience surveys in 6 provinces to see if VOV and local stations have capacity in survey, analysis and making appropriate responses	Reliable surveys are implemented	– 9 surveys in 9 provinces has been implemented with support from international consultants – VOV and local stations still lack capacity to carry out audience surveys in service of modern broadcasting	– Achieved the expected results – VOV and local radio capacity in audience surveys should be taken into account

Activities See Progress Report for phase 2 of the project and following items for further details.

28. Analysis in the above matrix shows that most of the assumptions have been satisfied in reality. Thus, the review team agreed that the project was able to achieved expected objectives and results if the project was properly implemented.
29. However, the review team would like to make a notice on common issues, which have been raised in most of the local radio stations:
- A lack of budget to maintain regular activities of live radio broadcast might affect the sustainability. Reasons of this status will be mentioned in the following paragraphs.
 - Although several local radio stations were trained on audience survey skills, there have been quite few surveys implemented by the local radio stations except the ones that have been carried under the project framework. More specifically, it seems impossible for the local radio stations to implement regular survey in coordination with the local statistics offices due to a lack of coordination mechanism as well as required budget.

3.2. Availability of Resources and Issues Related to Project Implementation

30. Availability of input resources is prerequisite that directly affects the project results and quality. The review team has examined all the project inputs such as external and counterpart funds for project activities, international consultants, equipment, national trainers and assistant trainers, interpreters, staff of project management board, staff of selected local radio stations including a live broadcasting team (producers, reporters, and technicians). Making all the inputs available timely would ensure project progress and avoid wasting other resources.

31. The success of project has partly been attributed to good preparation for project implementation. The review team's study results show that all the project partners including those who are in charge of executing and implementing the project as well as the project beneficiaries (selected local radio stations) have actively been involved in the project preparation and implementation process.
32. The project was well prepared and project documents were early adopted. This helped donor side to promptly provide with fund and consultants. Best practices in project implementation and management gained from phase 1 of the project have also been applied in the second phase.
33. Criteria for selection of the local radio stations have been made transparent. These include willingness to change, strong commitment on counter part fund and human resources, professional capacity of staff to absorb the project. A list of registered local radio stations has been carefully considered by PMB and VOV. Appropriate procedure of selection helped the local radio stations act on their initiative when receiving the project.
34. Well-qualified trainers, assistant trainers, and interpreters have been recruited by PMB. Most of the Vietnamese trainers and assistant trainers are well-skilled producers, reporters of VOV and the local radio stations those have been trained in project phase 1 for live radio broadcasting. Interpreters are mainly selected from producers and reporters working in the VOV external service programmes in English. They all have been familiar with both producing and training live radio broadcasting.
35. All the selected local radio stations have well prepared in fund and staff for project implementation and even more. It has been shown that the "bigger" issue is not only preparation for the project implementation period but *building stable long-term resources for maintaining and developing new methods of modern broadcasting at the local level*. Most of the local radio stations have invested in upgrading studios to meet a minimum requirement for a complex process of live broadcast, as the same time offered extra allowances for management and live broadcasting teams, and assigned their best staff to practice the new process.
36. All the international consultants provided by Sweden are skilful in broadcasting profession as well as in training.

3.3. Comparison between Achieved Outputs and Expected Outputs

37. Comparison between achieved outputs and expected outputs is one of vital indicators to evaluate the level of success of the project. In item 3.1 the review team has analysed and come to a conclusion that most of the assumptions for the project success were satisfied. In addition, Table 1 (Realisation of assumptions in the project's matrix of LFA) has demonstrated the realisation of project (overall and intermediate) objectives and expected results. In some specific areas, the results are even better than expected. For instance, VOV and local radio stations training capacity are now able to continue spreading knowledge and skills needed for live broadcasting.
38. The project includes social aspects and is related to various targeted groups. Therefore, social and/or community impacts and side effects should also be taken into account and analysed in order to evaluate the project's success or failure besides the main expected results as described in the project document. Item 3.10 will discuss in details about some crosscutting issues.

3.4. Comparison between Beneficiaries' Capacity Before and After Project has been Implemented

39. Improvement of beneficiaries' capacity can really be considered an important and overall objective of the project. However, selection of indicators for measuring capacity strengthening will become complicated unless common criteria are already defined. It has been stated in the project document that overall objective is *improvement of quality of the local radio programmes, and audience surveys* has been mentioned as the means of verification. It is thought by the review team that the number of hour of live broadcasting per day at a local radio station and the audience survey results on programmes quality would probably be good indicators apart from others such as the person-times in training courses or the indicators those can measure capability in management and transferring modern broadcasting knowledge among colleagues. However, regular survey results are not available for all the provinces. Thus, available audience survey results in 9 provinces under the project implementation will be used as examples when comparing the change in local radio. In general, this report is rather a qualitative analysis than an analytical work based on reliable quantitative statistics produced by audience surveys.
40. Three surveys in 9 provinces at the time of implementation of the project presented consistent results: very large percentage of audience listened to live radio programmes compared to very small percentage who listened to recorded programmes. In some provinces like Ha Nam and Quang Nam, live radio was even ahead television (although at these provinces television programmes were available).
41. All the local radio stations those implemented live broadcasting have change their way of planning, programming, and preparation of programme contents. Compared to recorded programmes, live programmes have been rewarded by a sudden increase in number of telephone calls and mails from listeners who wanted to interact with radio or to request their favourite topics. This has put forward the broadcasters' working speed, as the same time forced them to be more responsible for the audience, and improved their communication skills when talking with different groups of listeners.
42. Basic skills and modern broadcast technology that the local radio benefited from the project, directly or indirectly, has been a fundamental remedy for the local radio stations for their better response to audience increasing needs and broadcasters' workload. Complexity of equipment (mixers, studios, and other devices for out-door broadcasting) is important, because the complexity of equipment has a close link with the new working process of live broadcast team. After being provided by the project with 2 (basis and advance) training courses and a set of new equipment (less than USD 8,000 each) a local radio has got familiar with the new process, well run the new equipment, and created a new capacity in mastering the process and technology if it would have enough local fund for self-investment.
43. Management and delegation skills have remarkably been improved in accordance with requirements of the new working process. Managers, producers, reporters, and technicians have understood more clearly about their role and functions in live broadcasting process thanks to well-prepared and well-assigned activities and players. Two training courses designed for management levels have been delivered to leaders of 12 local radio stations and demonstrated this result of the project.
44. Training courses provided by the project have improved local capacity in acquiring knowledge and technology of modern broadcast. In addition, capacity in sharing knowledge and skills among local broadcasters has been demonstrated. On the other hand, two trainings for trainers

(applicable for VOV and selected local radio managers, producers, reporters) have strengthened self-training capacity of the Vietnam's radio system in the next period. Interview results show that the number of radio broadcasters who are capable to produce live radio programmes is much higher than the number of radio staff ever directly trained under the project training activities. This side effect is partly attributed to stable formats and an adequate process of producing live radio programmes.

3.5. Comparison Between Project's Beneficiaries and the other ones

45. The review team has examined comparison between project's beneficiaries and the other ones, and found that this comparison is not necessarily a common criterion because there are quite few local radio stations those have the same working conditions.
46. On the other hand, even in the local radios those have not been the project's beneficiaries there has appeared a trend of change in radio programme formats and contents and including application of live broadcasting. Bac Ninh province is a typical example. In this case, the provincial radio has learnt other stations the way to produce and broadcast live, including new process, programme structures, working arrangement, etc. Furthermore, they can access another sources of knowledge and skills by participating in professional live broadcast training courses organised by VOV (out of the project framework).
47. One standing issue that should be paid attention is the local radio capacity in self-upgrading by using local resources together with support by national consultants via national professional training activities. However, for the ones those are not able to access sources of knowledge and skills in modern radio broadcasting, difference in quality, attractiveness of the programmes as well as in self-development capacity are found very large in comparison with the project beneficiaries.

3.6. Relevance

48. The project is implemented during at the right time when local radio stations want and have to make some "changes" that would hopefully save them from being backward and losing audience attention. Thus, the project has been seen very relevant since it has met the needs and development trend of the existing radio system, as well as increasing demand of different audience groups:
 - Needs for innovation in order to strengthen competitiveness due to the aggressive spread of television, particularly in urban areas and some rural areas where living standard is improved thanks to the success of the innovated economy;
 - Development trend for replacement of backward broadcast technology and monotone recorded programmes;
 - Willingness of audience for better media services with higher quality, those can provide them with more chances to pro-actively participate in social management process, to raise their awareness and to develop democracy in grass roots levels.
49. Furthermore, implementation of the project as designed and described in the project document is quite appropriate in the recent context of Vietnam. It is also appropriate to selecting provincial level as the main targeted management level of the project. In the four-level radio system of Vietnam, the national radio (VOV) takes the leading role in new broadcast technology in both management and technical aspects, and provincial level is the crucial level at which the government budget is allocated for local media activities.

3.7. Impacts of the Project to Local RadioSystem

50. The project has had positive impacts to raising awareness of local radio stations on modern broadcasting technology. This helps the Vietnam's local radio system, (especially provincial radio) recognise the needs of change and modernisation of radio broadcasting technology.
51. The project has (directly and indirectly) strengthened the existing capacity of local radio staff. By implementation of the project, the local radio system are now not only able to produce live radio programmes but also capable to identify sources of knowledge and skills necessary for application of new technology. Approaching the sources of knowledge and skills is not limited to the existing national factors but also creating opportunities for international integration.
52. The project has activated a movement of radio broadcasting technology modernisation and raised the competition among the local radio stations via the movement and better conditions for learning each others. The quiet life of the local radio system over the past few years has been warmed up, creating confidence of the local radio staff. Several radio stations have started focusing on process and skills for the one-person live broadcasting with a hope of saving cost and speeding the performance of their radio programmes at the same time.
53. The project has also revealed constrains in capacity of the local radio system (including capacity in organisation, management, and finance, etc.) when they pursuing an ambitious objective: modernising radio broadcasting technology. This impact is really useful for the Vietnam's development strategy in general and development plan for any single local radio stations in the next period.

3.8. Effectiveness and Efficiency

54. Analysis by comparing project's real outcomes to its total financial cost shows that the project is really one of the most efficient capacity building projects those have ever been implemented in Vietnam. Focusing on human resources development for radio system is extremely accurate. Besides, the inspiration and working attitude of Vietnamese radio broadcasters, which were activated by the project, have become a catalyst for the continuing development of these human resources. A bare minimum of project-provided new equipment and devices, however, good enough for the radio staff to get acquainted to the new process of live broadcasting.
55. In this case, the ownership of Vietnamese partners has contributed a lot to the effectiveness of the project. It is found by the review team that the project is one of the very few external funded development projects in which the *Vietnamese by themselves carry out most of their daily work without asking international consultants to render a service*. Apart from the live programmes as main products, the training activities run by the Vietnam's radio system have been remarkably improved in terms of training quality. Since the end of the first phase, Vietnamese trainers and assistant trainers have been competent to shoulder the duties of transferring knowledge and skills, with the less support from international consultants.
56. Other types of support from VOV to the local radio system by organising workshops to exchange experience have also created a stimulus an healthy professional competition over the country, not only in the selected privinces. Tendency of changing working methos and capacity of self-training within the system will therefore certainly be a vital resource that can ensure the sustainability of the project.

3.9. Sustainability

57. A fundamental objective of the project is an improved capacity of the local radio stations in producing and maintaining live broadcasting. However, the capacity in developing resources for live broadcasting should be the first-rate factor that ensures the sustainability after the project is completed. It is proved that this capacity has been taken shape.
58. Nevertheless, sustainability of capacity building for live broadcasting still depends on other factors. The review team would like to notice some factors those can weaken the project sustainability: (i) the uncertain tendency for organisational development of Vietnam's radio system; and (ii) the sufficient and stable budget for development and maintaining live broadcasting.
59. Issue of organisational development of Vietnam's radio system is obviously an important one. However, this issue goes beyond the project scope. Thus, this report just raises some remarks on the relation between project results and the status of organisation and development of the local radio system. During the mission, the review team has recognised that the dissolution of the VOV Local Radio Department is not relevant, especially when another management and coordination agency has not been established. This may easily lead to unprompted status and unhealthy competition among local radio stations.
60. Fragment in government local budget management has led to the fact that development of a local radio is completely dependent on the provincial budget. Thus, a sustainable development of radio broadcasting capacity would become unshaped, particularly in provinces where there are other development priorities than mass media. A more sustainable financial source for local radio is a systematic issue that needs to be carefully considered to ensure the sustainability of modern radio broadcasting.
61. One solution that should be examined: socialisation of radio. Fund for regular activities of local radio would be contributed by groups of listeners in a form of community fee and/or raised from donation and advertisement. It is a fact that fund raised from advertisement for local radio stations has been much less than that for television. However, this poor situation will be changed if radio programme quality is improved. On the other hand, potential fund from fees and social donation for live radio broadcasting requires a better fund raising and fund management skills of the local radio staff.
62. Another solution can be mentioned is combination between radio and television, at least in the provincial levels, in terms of management. This will save operational and investment cost and complement resources to each other's. Many provinces already have a radio-television station, and hence can invest in both. It has been more complicated and more costly for the provinces that have two types of stations. In general, radio has been in a disadvantageous position when attracting audience and sources of sponsors, advertisement, and even fund allocated from the state budget.

3.10. Cross Cutting Issues

63. In the covered areas of the local radio, audience in general and local leaders in particular all have positive feedbacks on the social impacts of the live radio programmes. Audience have been waiting and ready to receive higher quality media services that would help them more proactively participate in process of social management, raising awareness, development of democracy in grass roots levels, and issuance and implementation of the national and local socio-economic policies.

64. Modern radio broadcasting is an effective tool that can *promote the participatory process of social management*. Many live programmes have performed “phone-in” skills to provide audience with opportunities to contribute their opinions. (The highest rate of audience participation belongs to entertainment programmes such as music at requests, however these are not the type of radio programmes the review team mention here). The “guests of studio” are usually the civil officers in charge of concerned issues targeted by the radio programmes. However, there has not really been a high percentage of direct talk show programmes in which discussions between local authorities and audience are broadcasted live due to a lack of readiness of local agencies. Instead, the local radio stations have produced more programmes on spread and instruction of regulations, policies, guidelines promulgated by the national and local authorities. Indeed, *the live talk show programmes, which brought policy makers closer to local citizens, have been the most effective* in the light of all the assessment indicators, and playing a decisive role in competitiveness of radio broadcasting thanks to the in time and prompt and appropriate issues.
65. Several local radio stations have taken full advantage of the radio modernisation process to *support process of democratic implementation at grass roots levels* in the provinces. Some live feature programmes such as Binh Duong station’s “Democratic Forum” and current affairs programmes being broadcasted live by many radio stations have been highly appreciated by local audience and leaders.
66. *Raising community awareness* is also a positive social impact brought into by radio modernisation. Apart from knowledge dissemination programmes, live radio broadcasting has created more chances for audience to direct dialogues with managers, experts, lecturers, and technicians who are specialised in the relevant issues. The knowledge for social and production life right at the location will be an advantage competitiveness of local radio compared to central level radio. However, there is still a need for further improvement of local radio in order to compete with the local television that has the similar improvement.
67. *Support gender equality of opportunity* by live broadcasting is also worth to analyse. Thanks to the more charming formats and contents, radio programmes specialised for the youth, family life, love and marriage have lured women attention and participation. These programmes also help local women affirm their role in the social life. In other programmes, which focus more on political – social – technical aspects, easier and more understandable approach of the programmes created better conditions for women to discuss the issues that used to be thought as men’s matters. If local radio stations are able to coordinate and cooperate with locally implemented (ODA and NGOs) development projects, resonant effect would probably bring into better outcomes, both for the radio stations and for those projects in terms of information and communication and education (IEC) result areas. At the same time, the local radio may absorb a part of above projects’ budget for information and communication.

4. Good Practices and Lessons Learnt from Project Implementation

68. The international development Local Radio Project is *relevant to the Vietnam’s context*. It has demonstrated a positive response to the urgent needs of Vietnam’s short, medium, and long-term development plans from central to local levels. The project has quite general objectives, assisting local

radio stations with equipped process of live broadcasting, methods for producing live programmes, development of human resources, and encourages them to invest for improvement of programme quality.

69. The project has been *effectively implemented*. All the objectives and results have been achieved as and even more than expected. Regarding financial and technical issues, all the selected provinces have promptly contributed counterpart fund to invest in new equipment. The lowest amount of counterpart fund (seen in Quang Ngai for example) has been equal to the Sida financial assistance, and most of the provincial radio stations have invested two or three times higher than that (eg. Lang Son, Binh Duong, etc.) All the stations have organised training courses as planned. Several dozens of key staff in each selected provinces have participated in those training courses. All of them are now able to produce live radio programmes in much better quality, which lure more and more audience to interact with radio.
70. The most important impact of the project is its *contribution to change the way of thinking and attitude in production of local radio programmes*. All the selected local radio stations have performed and reflected an impressive change in thinking way of local leaders, radio station leaders, and radio managers, producers, reporters, and technicians. All the persons consulted by the review team have presented consistent answers, which absolutely agreed on the positive impact brought by the project. Particularly, the live radio programmes in which studio guests are representatives of local authorities have formed an open and democratic atmosphere. The local radio audience since then have had chances to express their viewpoints on any political, economic, social, cultural, and educational issues confronted by the provinces. The project has also influenced the rest of local radio stations, forcing them into the trend of live broadcasting although they have less support.
71. *Development of human resources is the most meaningful lesson learnt*, which will be useful for improvement and upgrade of radio programme quality, not only in live programmes but also in any type of radio production. All the selected provincial radio stations have formed up core groups for live broadcasting production. These groups include competent radio staff that can organise and produce live and feature programmes at high quality. In particular, local pioneer broadcasters who have ever been trained in Sweden have made a great progress in methods and attitude of working. After absorbing advance knowledge and skills of modern radio broadcasting, they have become the missionaries who can inspire transfer to their colleagues the knowledge, skills, and their experience.
72. *Preparation for and selection appropriate local radio stations to participate in the project implementation* are also good practices that should be shared. Beneficiaries of the pipelined Radio Capacity Strengthening Project at Grass Roots Level will be district and commune stations, which are in disadvantageous position due to the limited resources compared to the provincial stations. Thus, ensuring availability of resources before implementing project will be an important condition to the success of the project.
73. *Minimum but complex technical equipment* has set a prerequisite for the local radio stations to broadcast live right at their studios. However, it is not easy at all for live broadcasting in the places where there is no means of communication (telephone line for example). Recently, many provincial radio stations still lack basic equipment. They have been requesting for more fund or equipment, such as telephones, mobile phones and portable radio transceivers so that they can excise outdoor broadcasting. For grass roots level of radio broadcasting, this request is also relevant because it is seen an effective way to promote participation of people and community to media and social management.

74. *Combination between project budget and local counterpart fund* is a success and a good experience of the project. The selected local radio stations have well performed their ownership by actively seeking extra fund for investment. Assistance by the project has affected as a catalyst that can encourage mobilisation of local budget for live broadcasting. For instance, local investment for live radio broadcasting in Lang Son province is twice of the project, and in Binh Duong is even much higher. However, this experience is not applicable for grass roots level since district budget for media is too small and the commune radios only have one or two part-time staff who are paid with a tiny allowance to run the commune neighbourhood loudspeaker systems. Anyway, there is still possible to mobilise other social resources than the state budget. The participation of local citizens and communities in radio broadcasting, therefore, can be strengthened and resources will be complemented.
75. *Providing local radio staff with knowledge and skills in participatory approach to work with community and in raising and management of fund* would make local radio programmes more attractive. This would also create more chances to mobilise resources from the society and community for radio broadcasting. If local radio broadcasting is socialised and people in communities recognise their role in a participatory process, many local potential resources will be utilised, especially in the areas where economic growth and income are being improved.

5. Recommendations for Preparation of the Vietnam's Radio Capacity Strengthening Project at Grass Roots Level 2004–2006

76. During the mission, the review team found that all the persons consulted by the team have agreed on the positive outcomes of the project, and expressed a willingness to have a continuing assistance that can help upgrading Vietnam's radio system with complex equipment, training radio staff, and providing financial support to further improve the radio programme quality.
77. Based on the reality of the four-level radio system of Vietnam and lessons learnt from the Local Radio Project, the review team recognises that *improving capacity of district radio stations is necessary*. District radio has a certain role in the Vietnam's radio system. This is the lowest level that can provide source of information in the form of radio programmes (commune radio has just transmitted radio programmes produced by higher levels). However, up to now the mandate of district radio stations have not been clearly defined. Their functions, responsibilities, size of staff, and budget allocation have not been adequately assumed. Therefore, capacity building for a number of district radio stations will be a breakthrough action that can activate the radio system at grass roots level. All the latest references show that designing an effective model for district radio has been the biggest concern of radio broadcasting policy makers.
78. To implement the radio capacity strengthening project at grass roots level 2004–2006, *domestic resources should play a key role in a combination with financial and technical support from Sweden*:
- Radio staff at central level, provinces, and some districts has been qualified for live broadcasting in terms of working methods, organisational capacity, and professional skills. This vital resource can be utilised to transfer modern broadcasting methods and skills to the whole radio system all over the country. Training centres in Hanoi and several provinces has been capable to organise and deliver short term and/or in-house training courses for local radio staff;

- Radio technology and equipment are more important for the grass roots level. Fortunately, affiliate companies of VOV and several provincial radio stations have been capable to produce and equip a complex set of broadcasting equipment for district and commune radio stations;
 - VOV and PMB of the Local Radio Project have experience and well-qualified staff that can organise and implement a large-scale project such as the Radio Capacity Strengthening Project at grass roots level 2004–2006, the one related to 6,000 communes in the whole country;
 - Application of modern radio broadcasting at grass roots levels is needed to meet increasing intellectual standards of people. For organisation of trainings for grass roots level radio stations, Vietnamese consultants are capable to take a key role, while Sweden can contribute financial, technical support, and professional radio experts.
79. The greatest challenge to local radio, and in particular to grass roots level under current socio-economic context, is the issue of *financing for local radio broadcasting*. There should be investigation for more relevant financial sources. So far, a number of issues for local radio capacity building has not been clarified: the role of local radio in the national development strategy for radio system; budget allocation for local stations and regulations on regular salary/allowance for radio staff at the grass roots levels. Thus, it is suggested that socialisation of radio broadcasting would be piloted in order for improvement of radio budget at the lowest levels.
80. To ensure the project momentum, *VOV should take the leading role in coordination* of activities related to local radio capacity strengthening. Within ten years of implementation of a Sida funded project, working methods and attitude have been remarkably improved in more than 30 local radio stations and positive impacts have been found in the whole system of Vietnam's radio.

6. Conclusions

81. The second phase (also called the Continuing Support to Local Radio in Viet Nam Phase 2 in 2000–2003) of the Local Radio Project has been completed. The followings are some conclusions by the review team after the evaluation mission:
- 1 – The project has been successfully implemented. All the objectives and outputs have been achieved as and to some extent more than expected. This achievement has been attributed to well-prepared activities, appropriate selection of project partners and beneficiaries, and effective and efficient implementation;
 - 2 – The PMB, Sida, VOV, and the selected provincial radio stations have actively implemented the project by ensuring financial, technical, and human resources. This made a prerequisite for a smooth implementation of the project;
 - 3 – The project has produced positive impacts to a sustainable development of Vietnam's local radio system, at the same time contributed to the improvement of radio information quality, making radio more attractive to audience and increasing interaction between audience and radio;

- 4 – Through implementation of the project, radio programmes (live programmes in particular and other feature and current affair programmes in general) have had powerful social impacts, which lure more people to express their opinions and willingness on political, economic, social, cultural, and educational issues. This has shaped a new pattern of interaction between people and local authorities; and enhanced the role of people in supervising social and community management agencies;
- 5 – A lack of sustainable sources of financing for maintaining live radio broadcasting at local levels has been recognised as a critical obstacle faced by local radio stations. The current inadequate budget for local radio operational cost has been severely based on the local state budget allocated for broadcasting, while extra sources of financing (out of the state budget) have not been mobilised. This led to the lack of studio equipment, the low rate paid to live broadcasting staff (for example, total paid for producing an (one and a half hour) live programme is just VND 200,000 or USD 13.33 in equivalent). Radio broadcasters, therefore, are not encouraged to participate in broadcasting live in a long time;
- 6 – Sustainable development of local radio has been depended on several conditions those are out of control of the project. These include: the local radio organisational system that goes together with allocation fund for radio from the local state budget; acknowledgement by local authorities on development priority of radio broadcasting; and socialisation of radio to raise another types of funding for radio;
- 7 – It has been found from the implementation of the Vietnam Local Project (1993–2003) that it should be the most favourite scenario when domestic resources are effectively and efficiently utilised in combination with Swedish financial assistance and expertise;
- 8 – District radio stations have played a certain role in the Vietnam’s four level radio system. However, the mandate of radio stations at district level has not been clearly defined, and hence their sizes of staff and required budget have not been adequately provided. Thus, there is a need for capacity strengthening in district radio stations in the next period;
- 9 – Due to the limit of state budget for radio broadcasting, socialisation of radio should be considered and piloted in order to salvage all the resources for development of local radio stations (advertisement, donation from associations, civil societies, organisations, and enterprises, etc.);
- 10 – VOV with good experience and resources should take the leading role in coordination of activities related to grass roots level radio capacity strengthening to ensure the project momentum.

References

- Project document: Continuing support to local radio in Viet Nam Phase 2 (2000–2003), *VOV – March 2000*
- Project phase 2 final report (2000–2003), Continuing support to local radio in Viet Nam, *PMB – November 2003*
- Draft proposal: Vietnam's Radio Capacity Strengthening Project at Grass Roots Level 2004–2006, *VOV – March 2003*
- 10 years Vietnam-Sweden radio cooperation, *VOV – 2003*
- PMB report on performance of Vietnam-Sweden radio cooperation, *PMB – December 2003*
- A performance analysis on Sweden support to Vietnam's media development, *Madeleine Elmqvist & Gunnar Fredriksson – 2003*
- Audience survey results in Ha Nam, Quang Nam và Vinh Long in August 2002, *Dennis List – October 2002*
- Minutes and notes from workshops and meetings related to implementation of live radio broadcasting in Vietnam, *PMB*
- (Draft) Development strategy for Vietnam's media 2001–2010, *MoCI – 2002*
- (Draft) Development strategy for Vietnam's radio 2001–2010, *VOV – ???*

Annex 1. Review Team Working Schedule

Time/date	Task	Responsibility	Address/ communication
Preparatory works:			
Wed 17 Dec 2003 11:00–12:00	Meeting with PMB: – Introduction of review team – Agreement on mission requirements	PMB, Review Team	PMB Office, 35 Nguyen Đình Chieu
Fri 19 Dec 2003	Deliver relevant project and mission documents to review team members	PMB	
Sun 21 Dec 2003 10:00	Complete Review Team working schedule and Mission Report Outlines for agreement between team members (before 12:00 Mon 22 Dec 2003)	Draft: Binh Comments: P.Anh & Tran Nhung	Email
Mon 22 Dec 2003 16:00	Delive Review Team working schedule and Mission Report Outlines to PMB	Binh	Email
Mon 22 Dec 2003 –Fri 26 Dec 2003	– Desk study – Complete interview questionnaires for different groups to be consulted	Review team	Email
Fri 26 Dec 2003 16:00–17:00	Meeting with PMB: – Agreement on Mission Report Outlines – Persons and agencies needed to consult with – Methods and content of interviews	PMB, Review Team	PMB Office, 35 Nguyen Đình Chieu
Meetings/Interviews			
Fri (13:00)– Sat 2–3 Jan 2003	Working with some northern provinces	PMB, Review Team	Bac Ninh PPC and radio station; Lang Son PPC and radio-tv station
Wed (13:00) 07 Jan 2004	Meeting with Mr. Vu Hien, VOV Director General	PMB, Review Team	VOV58 Quan Su
Thu (17:00)– Fri 12–13 Feb 2004	Working with some centrel provinces	PMB, Review Team	Quang Ngai PPC and radio-tv station
Fri–Mon 13–16 Feb 2004	Working with some southern provinces	PMB, Review Team	Binh Duong and HCMC PPC and radio-tv station
Wed 03 March 2004	Meeting Sida representatives	PMB, Review Team	Ms. Ngo Phuong Dung 2 Nui Truc HN, mrs.dung@sida.se
???	Meeting MoCI representatives	PMB, Review Team	???
Drafting report:			
Mon 16 Feb 2004 (before 12:00 Fri 20 Feb 2004)	Complete draft mission report (in Vietnames) with team member comments	Draft: Binh Comments: P.Anh & Tran Nhung	Email
Mon23 Feb 2004 10:00	Delive revised draft mission report to PMB	Binh	Email
Wed 03 March2004	Meeting with PMB to agree on the revision of draft report	PMB, Review Team	35 Nguyen Đình Chieu
Wed10March2004	Deliver final report to PMB and seek further comments from relevant partners	Binh	Email
Thu 25March2004	Complete final report (in English & Vietnamse), deliver to PMB	Binh	Email

Annex 2. Lists of Persons Consulted by the Review Team

No.	Name	Position	Agency
1.	Vu Hien	Director General, Editor-in-Chief	VOV
2.	Đinh The Loc	Editor-in-Chief of VOV News, and Project Director	PMB
3.	Hoang Hong Đức	Director of Local Radio Department, Project Vice Director	PMB
4.	Nguyen Duc Phu	Secretary	PMB
5.	Vu Đức Trong	Vice Director	Bac Ninh radio-tv station
6.	Van Phong	Vice Director	Bac Ninh radio-tv station
7.	Nguyen Phu Bao	Head of Personnel Division	Bac Ninh radio-tv station
8.	Nguyễn Thời Trình	Trưởng phòng Kỹ thuật	Bac Ninh radio-tv station
9.	Vu Minh Tang	Director	Lang Son radio-tv station
10.	Vu Ngọc Bích (Mr.)	Vice Director	Lang Son radio-tv station
11.	Vu Ngọc Bích (Ms.)	Head of Editorial Division	Lang Son radio-tv station
12.	Truong Quang Tan	Vice Director	Quang Ngai radio-tv station
13.	Đang Hung	Vice Director	Quang Ngai radio-tv station
14.	Thai Anh	Head of Current Affairs Division	Quang Ngai radio-tv station
15.	Le Thi Chieu	Head of Technical Division	Quang Ngai radio-tv station
16.	Nguyen Van Hiep	Vice Chairman	PPC Bình Dương
17.	Nguyen Duy Hieu	Director	Binh Duong radio-tv station
18.	Nguyen Đức Truong	Vice Director	Binh Duong radio-tv station
19.	Le Thanh	Vice Director	Binh Duong radio-tv station
20.	Huy Trong	Dep. Head of Radio FM Division	Binh Duong radio-tv station
21.	Vo Hong Phong	Vice Director (technical)	Binh Duong radio-tv station
22.	Ngo Phuong Dung	Programme Officer	Sida
23.			MoCI

Annex 3. Terms of Reference (ToR) for Project Evaluation

Outline of Project Evaluation

“Continued support to local radio stations in the 2000–2003 period”

1. Introduction

1.1. Background of 10 years of Vietnam-Sweden Cooperation in the Broadcasting Industry

Pilot phase 1993–1995

Phase I (1997–1999)

Phase II (2000–2003)

1.2. Reasons for Evaluating the Project, Phase II

Reviewing advantages and difficulties in the implementation of the project, Phase II.

Success of Phase II – the basis for continued implementation of the project in the 2004–2006 period

2. Objectives and Approaches to the Evaluation of the Project, Phase II.

2.1. Objectives

The evaluation of the project is aimed at consideration of whether the project has met its overall and specific objectives.

Overall objective:

- The overall objective of the project is to improve the quality of broadcasting programs in local radio stations in Vietnam

Specific objectives:

To promote the results of Phase II of the project, maintain and expand the new broadcasting technology to 15 provinces nationwide with new training methods in which, Vietnamese trainers will play the important role, with consultancy provided by Swedish experts. A modern broadcasting model, inheriting experiences from Sweden will be selected and applied in accordance with Vietnam's specific situation.

To offer training in live broadcasting for key staff from Radio Voice of Vietnam and local radio stations so as to provide enough supporting trainers for the remaining 30 local stations. This will help renew and improve the quality of daily broadcasts.

The evaluation also aims to draw lessons in order to improve institutions, renew management skills, and reinforce the capacity of live broadcasters from local radio stations. The evaluation of phase II will serve as the basis for the continuation of the project in the 2004–2006 period, particularly at district radio stations, which are facing constraints of financial and human resources when compared with provincial stations.

Regarding the overall objective, specific tasks for the evaluation are defined as follows:

- Analysing in detail all activities of the project, Phase II, in comparison with previous periods to draw lessons and experiences that could enhance the Vietnamese side's role (in training, finance, and other activities), as well as their impact on the results of the project.

- Proposing to relevant Government agencies and local authorities appropriate means of fast-tracking the development of the local broadcasting network
- Evaluating the sustainability of live broadcasts in localities based on the results of audience surveys as well as experts and authorities' opinions
- Proposing orientations and solutions to implementing the project in the 2004–2006 period at district-level radio stations.

2.2. Evaluation Content

After ten years of implementation, is the project suitable for the development of Vietnam's broadcasting industry?

- Did the project meet the demands of the beneficiaries? What were the positive and negative impacts on beneficiaries? Has the project attained its objectives? How was the project budget utilized to achieve these objectives? How is the sustainability of live broadcasts in the localities?
- How does Swedish support and this project affect the development of Vietnam's broadcasting industry at all levels? What achievements have been obtained and what are short-term and long-term objectives to be reached?
- Activities of the Project Management Board, Radio Voice of Vietnam and its co-operation with the Sida Office in Hanoi, parties involved and project organisation.
- How the effectiveness of the project affect social aspects including gender equality, poverty reduction, bureaucracy and corruption etc...
- Results and proofs of progress obtained.

2.3. Evaluation Methods

The main method is to compare stations benefiting from the project, with those which were not involved in the project, to realise good points as well as weaknesses and draw necessary lessons for the future. This method is based on official documents, items already broadcast on the radio, opinions collected from interviews and consultations. Interviewees and consultants include officials and experts involved in mass media such as:

- Officials from the Ministry of Culture and Information, Radio the Voice of Vietnam, and People's Committees from provinces involved in the project
- Representatives from Sida and the Swedish Embassy in Vietnam, Swedish consultants and trainers
- Officials, editors and reporters from project beneficiaries
- The Project Management Board of Radio Voice of Vietnam
- And those who took part in training courses within the project framework

2.4. Expected Locations for Surveys

Expected locations for surveys include Yen Bai, Thua Thien-Hue, Quang Ngai, Phu Yen, Can Tho, and Binh Duong provinces. These provinces benefited from the project in the pilot phase, Phase I and Phase II. In addition to the provincial-level, Van Chan district in Yen Bai and Quang Dien district in Thua-Thien Hue were also involved in the project. They were the first and only districts to benefit from the project "Continued support for local radio stations in Vietnam" funded by Sida.

2.5. Contents for Surveys

For State officials

- Awareness and conditions offered regarding policies and mechanisms to secure sustainable live broadcasts
- Viewpoints on the project “Enhancing broadcasting capacity at grassroots level in the 2004–2006 period” in Vietnam.

For provincial officials and directors of local radio stations

- Awareness of the broadcasting industry, particularly live broadcasting
- Local policy toward the broadcasting industry in general and live broadcasting in particular
- Issues relating to the broadcasting industry and the development of live broadcasting

For district officials

- Awareness of the broadcasting industry, especially live broadcasting - Local policy on the broadcasting industry in general and live broadcasting in particular.
- Issues relating to the broadcasting industry and the development of live broadcasting.

For VOV Project Management Board

- Successes and pending issues in the implementation of the project

2.6. Project Evaluation Team

The project evaluation team should meet the following criteria:

- In-depth understanding of the media background in Vietnam
- Experiences in journalistic training
- Experiences in journalism
- Fluency in English
- Teamwork capacity

Subsequently, the following experts are recommended for the evaluation team:

- Professor-doctor Phan Anh, 64, Director of the Research Center for Electronics and Telecommunications and Vice President of the Vietnam Electronics Association
- Master of Economics, Journalist Tran Nam Binh, 37 Journalist Tran Nhung, 55, Head of the International Affairs, Army Newspaper

3. Results Need to be Gained

The evaluation report of the project “Continued Support to Local Radio Stations in Vietnam”, and lessons for the project “Enhancing the broadcasting capacity at grass-roots level in Vietnam in the 2004–2006 period” deal with the above:mentioned issues.

4. Plan and Estimated Expenses

4.1 Plan

Activities	Week						
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Formulation and approval the outline							
Formulation of interview forms and questionnaires							
Surveys in the North							
Surveys in the Centre							
Surveys in the South							
Writing and completing report							

4.2. Estimated Expenses

Activities	Amount (in US\$)	Remarks
Formulation of outline, questionnaires, writing report (03 persons x 40 hours/week x 2 weeks x US\$15)	3.600	
Translation (50 pages x US\$8/page)	400	
Surveys (05 tickets x US\$300/ticket)	1.500	
Perdiem/accommodation (20 days x US\$33 x 03 persons)	1.980	
Unexpected cost	300	

Recent Sida Evaluations

- 04/23 Performing Arts under Siege. Evalutation of Swedish Support to Performing Arts in Palestine 1996–2003**
Kajsa Pehrsson
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 04/24 National Water Supply and Environmental Health Programme in Laos. Joint External Evaluation**
Inga-Lill Andrehn, Manochit Panichit, Katherine Suvanthongne
Department for Natural Resources and Environment and Department for Asia
- 04/25 Apoyo Sueco a la Iniciativa de Mujeres por la Paz (IMP) Colombia 2002–2003**
Åsa Westermark, Jocke Nyberg
Department for Latin America
- 04/26 Reading for Life. Evaluation of Swedish Support to Children's Literature on the West Bank and Gaza for the period 1995–2003**
Britt Isaksson
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 04/27 Assistance to Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs) in Indonesia**
Emery Brusset, Birthe Nautrup, Yulia Immajati, Susanne B. Pedersen
Department for Co-operation with Non-Governmental Organisations and Humanitarian Assistance
- 04/28 Swedish Support to the Access to Justice Project in South Africa**
Stan Kahn, Safoora Sadek
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 04/29 Mozambique State Financial Management Project (SFMP)**
Ron McGill, Peter Boulding, Tony Bennett
Department for Democracy and Social Development and Department for Africa
- 04/30 Cultural Heritage for the Future. An Evaluation Report of nine years work by Riwaq for the Palestinian Heritage 1995–2004**
Lennart Edlund
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 04/31 Politiska prtier och demokratibistånd
Översyn av stödet genom svenska partianknutna organisationer till demokratiuppbyggnad i u-länder och länder i Central- och Östeuropa.**
Magnus Öhman, Shirin Ahlbäck Öberg, Barry Holmström
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 04/32 Environmental Remediation at Paddock Tailings Area, Gracanica, Kosovo**
Anders Rydergren, Magnus Montelius
Department for Infrastructure and Economic Cooperation
- 04/33 Swedish Support to Decentralisation Reform in Rwanda**
Merrick Jones
Department for Democracy and Social Development
- 04/34 Strengthening Public Employment Services in Armenia, Georgia and Moldova**
Alexandra Wynn, Torsten Wind, Karin Attström, Christian Boel, Peter Sidelman
Department for Europe

Sida Evaluations may be ordered from:

Infocenter, Sida
SE-105 25 Stockholm
Phone: +46 (0)8 779 96 50
Fax: +46 (0)8 779 96 10
sida@sida.se

A complete backlist of earlier evaluation reports may be ordered from:

Sida, UTV, SE-105 25 Stockholm
Phone: +46 (0) 8 698 51 63
Fax: +46 (0) 8 698 56 10
Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>



SWEDISH INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT COOPERATION AGENCY
SE-105 25 Stockholm, Sweden
Tel: +46 (0)8-698 50 00. Fax: +46 (0)8-20 88 64
E-mail: sida@sida.se. Homepage: <http://www.sida.se>